

国学与西学
(国际学刊)

International Journal of
Sino-Western Studies

主编 黄保罗
Editor-in-chief Paulos Huang

Guest Editor for this Volume Jianbo HUANG
本期特邀编辑 黄剑波

**A Special Volume on the 10th Anniversary of
International Journal of Sino-Western Studies**
“《国学与西学国际学刊》十周年纪念”专辑

No. 20, 2021

国学与西学：国际学刊（半年刊）

第二十期：二零二一年六月

主编及出版总监

黄保罗（上海大学特聘教授，芬兰赫尔辛基大学国学与西学北欧论坛主席/博睿《中国神学年鉴》英文版主编）
网络电子版（www.SinoWesternStudies.com）和微信版（国学与西学国际学刊）

副主编：肖清和（上海大学历史系教授）、苏德超（武汉大学哲学学院教授）

执行编辑

包克强（美国：康耐尔大学历史系副教授），英语
陈永涛（金陵神学院副教授、博士），汉语
郭瑞珠（澳大利亚，西澳大利亚大学神学系研究员，珀斯），英语
陈杰（武汉大学哲学系），微信版编辑
K-H, Johanna（芬兰 TD 出版公司编辑），英语
Jørgensen, Knud（挪威神学院兼职教授），英语
丁珊珊（武汉大学哲学系），微信版编辑

学术顾问（以姓氏拼音为序）

陈来（清华大学国学研究院院长、教授）
戴德理（美国：世华中国研究中心主席）
格勒格森（丹麦：歌本哈根大学系统神学教授）
汉科克（英国：牛津亚洲宗教社会研究院院长）
郭齐勇（武汉大学国学院院长、教授）
江怡（长江学者教授、山西大学哲学系资深教授）
赖品超（香港中文大学文学院院长、教授）
罗明嘉（芬兰：赫尔辛基大学系统神学荣休教授）
麦格拉斯（英国伦敦英王学院，神学、宗教与文化中心教授、主任）
南乐山（美国：波士顿大学神学学院前院长、教授）
施福来（挪威：斯塔湾格神学与差传学院教授）
孙向晨（复旦大学哲学学院院长、教授）
田默迪（奥地利维也纳大学哲学博士、澳门圣约瑟大学哲学教授）
王晓朝（中山大学哲学系珠海校区教授）
王学典（山东大学儒家高等研究院执行院长、教授、《文史哲》主编）
魏克利（美国伯克利神学研究院教授 / 香港圣公会大主教之神学及历史研究特别顾问）
杨富雷（瑞典：哥登堡大学教授）
杨熙楠（香港：汉语基督教文化研究所总监）
杨煦生（北京大学高等人文研究院世界宗教与普世伦理中心主任、教授）
张福贵（吉林大学文学院教授）
钟鸣旦（比利时：皇家科学院院士、天主教鲁汶大学汉学系主任、教授）
张志刚（北京大学宗教文化研究院院长、教授）
钟志邦（新加坡三一神学院前院长）
卓新平（中国社会科学院学部委员、研究员、中国宗教学院前会长）

特约评委（以姓氏拼音为序）

爱德华多·丹尼尔·奥维耶多（阿根廷 科技研究委员会研究员、罗萨里奥国立大学教授）
曹剑波（厦门大学哲学系教授、主任）
陈建明（四川大学道教与宗教文化研究所教授、前主任）
陈声柏（兰州大学哲学学院教授、院长）
樊志辉（上海师范大学哲学学院教授、副院长）
高师宁（中国社会科学院世界宗教研究所荣休研究员）
李向平（华东师范大学宗教与社会研究中心教授、主任）
梁工（河南大学圣经文学研究所教授、所长）
刘家峰（山东大学历史学院教授、副院长）
刘建军（东北师范大学教授、社科处处长）
宋刚（香港大学文学院助理教授）
王志成（浙江大学基督教与跨文化研究基地教授、主任）
游斌（中央民族大学宗教研究院教授、院长）
亚达夫，阿润·库玛尔（印度新那烂佛教大学巴利语和佛教助理教授）
张先清（厦门大学人类学及民族学系教授、主任）
赵杰（山东大学哲学及宗教学系教授）
赵林（武汉大学欧美宗教文化研究所教授、所长）
朱东华（清华大学哲学系教授、景学研究中心主任）

封面题款：刘大钧（中国周易学会会长，山东大学终身教授）；封面设计：黄安明；本刊 logo 取自汉砖图案，一首两翼四足一尾的飞龙，象征中国精神体系的实然形象。

引用索引：本刊已被收入芬兰艺术 & 人文学索引（芬兰国家图书馆）、美国宗教学 & 神学提要数据库（www.rtabstracts.org），汤姆森路透新资料引用索引（ESCI, Thomson Reuters）和美国神学图书馆协会数据库（ATLA RDB ©, www.atla.com），the Bibliography of Asian Studies, EBSCO's Academic research database as a part of a collection of Ultimate databases, SCOPUS, Globethics, net library (a journal collection and the Online Chinese Christianity Collection / OCC), ELSEVIER and DOAJ (<http://bit.ly/1IPWhtD>), European Reference Indexes for the Humanities and Social Sciences (ERIH),

International Journal of Sino-Western Studies (IJS)

(Semi-annual)

No. 20 : June 2021

Editor-in-chief and Publishing Supervisor:

HUANG, Paulos (Ph. D. , Th. D. , Distinguished Prof. , Shanghai Univ. , Chairman of the Nordic Forum for Sino-Western Studies, Finland, and Chief editor for Brill Yearbook of Chinese Theology, Leiden & Boston)

Vice-editor-in-chief for Electronic Version (Online: www. sinowesternstudies. com)

XIAO Qinghe (Professor, Ph. D. , Dept. of History, Shanghai University, China)

Vice-editor-in-chief for Wechat Version (Guoxue yu xixue guoji xuekan)

SU Dechao (Professor, Ph. D. , School of Philosophy, Wuhan University, China)

Executive Editors

BARWICK, John (Associate Professor, Ph. D. , Department of History, Cornell University, USA) , English

CHEN, Abraham (Associate Professor, Th. D. , Nanjing Union Theological Seminary, China) , Chinese

GUOK, Rose (Researcher, University of Western Australia, Perth, Australia) , English

CHEN Jie (Researcher, School of Philosophy, Wuhan University, China) , Wechat version editor

JORGENSEN, Knud (Adjunct Professor, Ph. D. , Norwegian School of Theology, Oslo, Norway) , English

K-H, Johanna (Editor, TD Publishing Company, Helsinki, Finland) , English

Ding Shanshan (Researcher, School of Philosophy, Wuhan University, China) , Wechat version editor

Editorial Advisory Board (in alphabetical order)

CHEN Lai (Prof. & Dean, Institute of National Studies, Tsinghua University, Beijing, China)

CHOONG Chee Pang (Previous Principal, Trinity Theological Seminary, Singapore)

CHRISTIAN, Matthias (Prof. of Philosophy, St. Joseph University, Macau/Ph. D, Vienna University, Austria)

DOYLE, G. Wright (Director, Global China Center, Virginia, USA)

FÄLLMAN, Fredrik (Professor, Dept. of East Asian Studies, Göteborg University, Sweden)

GREGERSEN, Niels Henrik (Prof. , Dept. of Systematic Theology, University of Copenhagen, Copenhagen, Denmark)

GUO Qiyong (Prof. & Dean, Institute of National Studies, Wuhan University, Wuhan, China)

HANCOCK, Christopher (Director, Institute for Religion and Society in Asia, Oxford, UK)

JIANG Yi (Prof. & Dean, School of Philosophy, Shanxi University, Taiyuan, China)

LAI Pan-chiu (Prof. & Dean, Faculty of Arts, Chinese University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong)

LAITINEN, Kauko (Previous Director of Confucius Institute in the University of Helsinki / Director & Professor, Finnish Institute, Tokyo, Japan)

MCGRATH, Alistair (Professor & Head, Centre for Theology, Religion and Culture, King's College, London, UK)

NEVILLE, Robert C. (Prof. & Previous Director, School of Theology, Boston University, Boston, USA)

RUOKANEN, Miikka (Prof. , Dept. of Systematic Theology, University of Helsinki, Helsinki, Finland)

STANDAERT, Nicolas (Member of Belgian Royal Academy of Sciences, Professor & Director, Dept. of Sinology, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium)

STRANDENAES, Thor (Professor, School of Mission and Theology, Stavanger, Norway)

SUN Xiangchen (Prof. & Dean, School of Philosophy, Fudan University, Shanghai, China)

WANG Xiaochao (Prof. , Department of Philosophy, Zhuhai Campus, Zhongshan University, Zhuhai, China)

WANG Xuedian (Prof & Executive Dean, Advanced Institute of Confucian Studies, Shandong University and Chief editor for Wenshizhe [Literature, History and Philosophy], Ji'nan, China)

WICKERI, Philip L. (Prof. of Interdisciplinary Studies, the Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley, CA, USA/ Advisor to the Archbishop on Theological and Historical Studies, Hong Kong Anglican)

YANG Xusheng (Prof. & Director, Institute for Advanced Humanistic Studies, IFAHS, Peking University, China)

ZHANG Fugui (Prof. , School of Humanities, Jilin University, Changchun, China)

ZHANG Zhigang (Prof. & Director, Academy of Religious Studies, Peking University, Beijing, China)

ZHUO Xiping (Prof. , Institute for World Religions Studies, China Academy of Social Sciences / CASS Member / Chairman, Chinese Association for Religions Studies, Beijing, China)

Special Reviewers (in alphabetical order)

CAO Jianbo (Prof. , Dept. of Philosophy, Xiamen University, Xiamen, China)

CHEN Jianming (Prof. , Institute for Daoism and Religious Studies, Sichuan University, Chengdu, China)

CHEN Shengbai (Prof. & Dean, School of Philosophy, Lanzhou University, Lanzhou, China)

FAN Zhihui (Prof. & Dean, Faculty of Philosophy, Heilongjiang University, Harbin, China)

GAO Shining (Researcher, Institute for World Religions Studies, China Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing, China)

LI Xiangping (Prof. & Dean, Center for Religion and Society, East China Normal University, Shanghai, China)

LIANG Gong (Prof. & Director, Institute of Biblical Literature Studies, Henan University, Kaifeng, China)

LIU Jiafeng (Prof. & Vice-Director, School of Hisyory, Shandong University, Ji'nan, China)

LIU Jianjun (Prof. & Director, Council of Research, Northeastern Normal University, Changchun, China)

Oviedo, Eduardo Daniel (member of the Argentine National Research Council (CONICET) and Professor at University of Rosario, Argentine)

SONG, Gang (Assistant Professor, School of Humanities, Hong Kong University, Hong Kong)

WANG Zhicheng (Prof. & Director, Institute of Christian and Cross-Cultural Studies, Zhejiang University, Hangzhou, China)

Yadav, Arun Kumar (Prof. Dr. , Department of Pali, Nava Nalanda Mahavihara University, India)

YOU Bin (Prof. & Dean, Institute of Religious Studies, Minzu University of China, Beijing, China)

ZHANG Xiangqing (Prof. & Director, Dept. of Anthropology & Ethnicity, Xiamen University, Xiamen, China)

ZHAO Jie (Prof. , Dept. of Philosophy, Shandong University, Ji'nan, China)

ZHAO Lin (Prof. & Director, Institute for European and American Religious & Cultural Studies, Wuhan University, Wuhan, China)

ZHU Donghua (Professor, Dept. of Philosophy, Tsinghua University, Beijing, China)

Calligraphy of journal title by Prof. LIU Dajun (Chairman of the Chinese Yiching Association, Shandong University). Cover design is by Joonatan Anning HUANG. The logo of journal is taken from a Han Dynasty brick carving. It is a flying dragon with one head, two wings, four feet and one tail and it symbolizes the reality of Chinese thought.

Index: This journal has been indexed by Finnish National Library, Religious & Theological Abstracts (R&TA) , Thomson Reuters the Emerging Sources Citation Index (ESCI) , the ATLA Religion Database © (ATLA RDB ©, <http://www.atla.com>) , the Bibliography of Asian Studies, EBSCO's Academic research database as a part of a collection of Ultimate databases, SCOPUS, Globethics, net library (a journal collection and the Online Chinese Christianity Collection/OCCC) , ELSEVIER and DOAJ (<http://bit.ly/1IPWhdD>) , and European Reference Index for the Humanities and Social Sciences (ERIH) .

目 录

Contents

卷首语 From the Editor's Desk *

Xilin YOU	The Contemporary Transformation of Educational Mechanism for Knowledge Innovation	1
Paulos HUANG	1
尤西林	知识创新教育机制的当代转型:芬兰教育与中国通识教育的对话.....	21
黄保罗		

人学、神学与国学 Humanities, Theology, and Chinese National Studies

Jieke ZHANG	Familial Conversion: A Case Study on the Ethical-Religious Role of the Household in the Mass Conversion of Wenzhou Christians	25
张杰克	家庭归信:户在温州基督徒大众归信中的伦理-宗教角色的个案研究	42
Yan LIU	Culture Reproduction or Value Conflict? The Morally Fraught Experience of Chinese Christians in Virtual Communities	43
刘 焱	文化复制或价值冲突? 虚拟社区中基督徒的道德困境	60

实践神学与中西教会和社会 Practical Theology and Sino-Western Views on Church and Society

Yumeng YAO	Being an Addict and Healing: Narratives and Practices in A Gospel Rehabilitation Center	63
姚雨萌	成为瘾君子与疗愈——一所福音戒毒中心里的叙事与实践	74
Luoying ZHAO	New Urbanization and the Changes of Christian Churches in County Towns and Rural Areas	75
赵罗英	新型城镇化与县域城乡基督教会发展变迁研究——以豫中L县为例	89

中西经典与圣经 Chinese and Western Classics and the Bible

XIAO Qinghe	New Research on Confucian Christian Liu Ning during early Qing Dynasty	93
肖清和	清初儒家基督徒刘凝(1620—1715?)新探	119
Shoulei LI	Study on Christian Belief and Cultural Exchange of Chinese in Northern Thailand	121
Shaoxian XU	121
李守雷	泰国北部华人基督教信仰与文化交流研究:以清莱府满村为例	131
徐绍仙		

教会历史与中西社会 Church History in the West and in China

Xiaojing WANG	“Neutrality is Impossible”: Nationalism, Unequal Treaties and the National Christian Council of China, 1925—1926	135
王晓静	中华全国基督教协进会与废除不平等条约运动(1925—1926)	155
Zhiying GAO	Study on the Interaction of the Sinicization of Christianity and the Reconstruction of	
Donglei WANG	Cross-border Ethnic Minorities' Cultures in Yunnan	157
高志英	论基督教中国化与云南跨境民族文化重构的交互发展关系	172
王东蕾		

比较宗教文化研究 Comparative Religious and Cultural Studies

Xue YANG	Ancestors or Ghosts; the Cult of the Dead in a Bai Village in Southwest China	175
杨 雪	祖先或鬼: 中国西南白族的死亡观	186
BAIMACUO	The Cham ritual of Padmasambhava in Tibetan Buddhism	187
GELINLANGJIE		
白玛措	藏传佛教中的莲花生金刚法舞	202
格林郎杰		

书评与通讯 Reviews and Academic Reports

Mengyin HU	Religion in Social Classification and Social Orders: A Study of Catholicism in A Tibetan Village in Yunnan	205
胡梦茵	社会分类和秩序中的宗教——对云南藏区一个天主教村落的考察	214
SHA Lina	Christianity and the Change of Marriage Style of Lisu People in the Northern	
CAO Han	Part of the Border between China and Myanmar	215
沙丽娜, 曹 韩	基督教与中缅北界傈僳族婚姻方式的变迁——以怒江 K 村为例	230
Helmut Moll	Becoming a martyr in China: The Steyl Missionary Father Paul Buhl (1902—1944)	231
赫尔穆特	在中国成为一个殉道者: Steyl 传教士保罗布赫尔神甫(1902—1944)	
· 摩尔	235

投稿须知 Notes for Contributors

注释体例及要求 Footnote Format and Requirements

* Neither English abstracts nor key words are provided for the foreword from the editor's desk, book reviews and academic reports.

卷首语 From the Editors' Desk

The Contemporary Transformation of Educational Mechanism for Knowledge Innovation

——Dialogue on Finland's Education and China's General Education

Xilin YOU, Paulos HUANG

(Shaanxi Normal University, Xi'an, Shaanxi Province; Shanghai University, Shanghai, P. R. China)

Abstract: In Finland, the knowledge-infusing education has been transforming toward the practical-contextual education. The practical-contextual education is the combination of knowledge innovation and education genesis, which motivates the education of specialized knowledge and endows it the energy of knowledge innovation and education genesis, especially while it is facing the challenges from the electronic information age. The key conditions for the success of Finland system of education are the two, the pedagogical ideas of holistic development of humanity, and the respects for teachers in the whole society. On the basis of this, the practical-contextual education with freedom is different from any other pragmatic education which always view education as some sorts of tools. In contemporary China, the construction of innovation system is the crucial direction for modernization, however, it can not be confined in instrumental rationality and the research of specialized fields, it should be expanded as the reformation of social institution and the building of culture on which the innovation system can rely. General education that provides the cultural cultivation and the cognitive structure of liberal creativity for the education of specialized areas, is the crucial consideration for the transformation from instrumental rationality to holistic development of people. At the same time, it contains the fundamental motivation for the innovation in the future China.

Key Words: Finland's education; China's general education; the practical-contextual education; pragmatic education; the whole person education

Author: 1. You Xilin; Chair Professor of Humanities at Shaanxi Normal University, Director of Teaching & Research Center for General Education at Shaanxi Normal University, China. Add: Mailbox No. 21, Yanta Campus, Shaanxi Normal University, South Chang'an Road 199, Xi'an, P. R. China, 710062. Tel: +86 13379004879, Email: youxilin@126.com; 2. Paulos Huang; Distinguished Professor at Shanghai University and Chief editor for International Journal of Sino-Western Studies and Brill Yearbook of Chinese Theology. Email: Paulos.z.huang@gmail.com.

1. Features of Finland's Education Which is Praised as "Number One in the World"

Paulos Huang (hereinafter referred to as "Huang"); Finland's Education which has been ranked first in the world by the United Nations for many years has attracted global attention especially since its recent announcement that it will gradually cancel the setting of professional disciplines. I have lived in Finland for more than 20 years and have many contacts with the education sector in Finland,

Hong Kong, Taiwan and mainland China, so I pay special attention to the comparison between Finland's Education and China's Education.

On the surface, the main features of kindergartens, primary schools and secondary schools are that they have short class hours, less homework and fewer exams. Their teachings are mainly conducted in a relaxed way that seems like "playing". Students are not encouraged to compete, but to cooperate. At the same time, international organizations after their tests and evaluations have come to the conclusion that the quality of Finland's Education is among the best in education all over the world. As one of the world-famous Nordic welfare countries, Finland's leading competitiveness, integrity, livability, human happiness index, etc. are also indirect proofs of its education quality.

Many scholars believe that Finland's success is mainly due to its education and the construction of national character. I have talked with Ms. Sirkka Liisa, an official in the Finnish Ministry of Education, about the reasons for Finland's achievements. She gave me two reasons. The first is equal access to education, whether it is in the capital Helsinki or in the countryside, everyone receives the same education. Secondly, the Finns' character cultivation is supported by their unique values and social atmosphere.

As a Chinese scholar who is pursuing general education in university, what do you think about these phenomena I have listed?

2. Finland's Education Reform: Returning from the Disciplinary System to the Practical Context

You Xilin (hereinafter referred to as "You"): The educational circle in mainland China has been concerned about Finland's Education reform for a long time. Recent news about Finland's Education reform that it will merge and even to a large extent cancel traditional disciplines, orients to a new educational model that faces problems and life situations. This has caused widespread discussion in the China's Education and cultural circles. Although this news was later corrected that this shift was not as simple as people had thought. However, as you said, this is indeed the basic character and direction of Finland's Education. Therefore, what I am concerned about is the enlightenment of theory contained in such a shift to China's Education.

It is true that both Chinese and foreign countries have educational practices and theories that are close to the surface of Finland's Education reform. More than a hundred years ago, progressive education pioneered by Francis Wayland Parker (1837—1902) in the United States emphasized the organization of curriculums with practical problems as the core and took the students' individual experience and method adoption as the education goal. Its naturalism and pragmatism are much like those of the Finnish reform. In terms of its form, it is also very similar to the traditional China's Education. That is, it pays attention to draw inspiration from practical problems and situations. The teaching of Confucius is also about giving advice and inspiration from specific behaviors and speeches. Of course, they also have core subjects such as "Six Arts", but the education goal of subject learning is "the cultivation of being a man", which is to cultivate human behavior and excellence. This is the common trait of both eastern and western classical education. The education in Greece,

Rome and even the Christian monasteries still maintain the principle of the “Seven Arts” subject to “humanitas” or to freedom and faith. That is to say, the knowledge of subjects in classical education has never been completely independent of the education goals, and the scope of knowledge of subjects is rather a different practice platform for educators to develop the main qualities.

Tao Xingzhi's^[1] life education movement is a modern fusion of Chinese practical education model and American progressive education. Later, I will introduce the reform of the new life education in the basic education sector in Shenzhen in recent years which is to revitalize that of Tao Xingzhi's. This reform is closely matched with Finland's Education reform. It is worth noting that this oriental classical practice or pragmatism is highlighted in the educational thoughts of contemporary China, especially represented by Mao Zedong: education must serve the actual production and education must be practice-oriented. However, the basic law of social development in modern times is that if education is to be practical for production, the most effective one is to be professional and to conduct sub-disciplinary education. After the founding of the People's Republic of China, we learned from the Soviet Union and transformed universities into practical training institutions for professionals. It really did serve the political and economic development of China at that time. This was also the reason why mainland China immediately resumed professional education in university after its reform and opening up. In 1957, the Soviet Union launched its first artificial satellite that stimulated the United States to shift from a pragmatic and progressive educational model to a professional education model, but it was combined with general education at a higher level.

This review enables us see a basic framework, that is, the unity of the relationship between the professional subject knowledge system education since modern times and general education including Finland's Education reform. The revolution in education during the Cultural Revolution, however, shifted from professional education to anti-intellectualism. This is exactly where the profundity of the problem lies. Why should Chinese contemporary education refocus on practical situation education after resuming professional subject knowledge system education for several decades? There are related issues that need to be carefully sorted out and analyzed.

The direct cause is of course the drawbacks of China's exam-oriented education that have being criticised by the public for decades, but the origin of exam-oriented education is professionalism education (note: professionalism education is different from professional education). In the 19th century, Humboldt established the University of Berlin in the fiasco of the Franco-Prussian War, and introduced the modern scientific research institute represented by Newtonian Physics into the university with a tradition of self-cultivation. The modern professional universities formed in this way therefrom became the university paradigm in countries like the United States and China. But almost at the same time, general education movement that was unveiled in the Yale Report (1828) became the balance of professionalism education. Under the background of electronic computer technology taking increasingly more professional knowledge education, the make-up of general education for professional education has become more prominent as the leading direction of

[1] Tao Xingzhi(1891. 10. 18—1946. 7. 25); a famous educator in China and thinker who created a model of China's modern education.

education. Traditional professional education faces a profound crisis in the era of knowledge economy. It needs not only the orientation of cultural values, but also to return to the situation of knowledge generation to activate innovative mechanisms.

It is precisely in the above-mentioned context that it is necessary to look at the significance of the era of Finland's Education reform and return to practice, and to understand the local context of China's attention to general education and the Finnish model in the new era. In short, the contemporary general education reform, including Finland's Education reform, is a response to the classical education at a higher level in the contemporary context. The Finnish reform represents the trends of practice in Europe and, to some extent, all regions and countries where mature modern civilizations exist. They are reversing the teaching system that is based on professional disciplines which are formed since modern times to the practical problem situation before the differentiation of professional disciplines. To be more profound, it is to return to the context of education nomenclature.

China has a tradition of emphasizing on practical education. It requires a distinction between the cutting-edge education model of Finland today that returns from the knowledge system to the context of practical problems. Finland's Education is based on the accumulation of knowledge in the science disciplines of the West since modern times, as well as the liberal democratic traditional culture of autonomous interaction between teachers and students during the teaching process and its civilization. In particular, one of the more direct considerations is the strong individual freedom created by the special relationship between Finland and its Protestantism. The social and political meaning of the elective courses in European and American general education is essentially the pedagogical embodiment of individual freedom to choose rights, which also becomes the cultural condition of individual differences required for technological innovation. The accumulation of these modern civilizations and the cultural background of modernity have no corresponding mature form in China. Therefore, Chinese tradition of "education for practical services" and "based on practice for education" is in essence a focus on technology and utilitarianism, which is pointed out by Li Zehou^[2] in his statement about Chinese tradition of "practical rationality". This utilitarian orientation of technology is, however, precisely the opposite of modern scientific knowledge and professionalism. The reform and opening-up subverted the extreme non-professional practice of the Cultural Revolution and returned to scientific expertise. Thus, the scientific professional knowledge system and its tradition received unprecedented courtesy. The combination of extreme respect for professional knowledge and lack of a tradition of freedom has shaped the prevailing recording and exam-oriented attitude of contemporary Chinese students. It essentially has transformed the authoritative political worship of Cultural Revolution into a knowledge system and its education system worship. Contemporary exam-oriented education worships professional divisions and their knowledge systems and the Chinese tradition of experience pragmatism. They form two poles in China's Education. But fundamentally they are still pragmatic and they all reject the spirit of scientific innovation.

These two poles are not part of Finnish practical-contextual education. Finnish practical-

[2] Li Zehou: a famous philosopher who was engaged in the study of Chinese modern ideological history, philosophy and aesthetics.

contextual education is not a kind of pragmatistic education. It is a paradigm shift that the modern scientific paradigm has accumulated to the continued development of science itself. This requires a review of the history and origin of science. Although modern science and its technology have the drawback of subjecting to market economy, the increasing departmental system of science has become an obstacle to scientific development. However, it is still rooted in the Greek concept of truth. The Latin etymology of modern science concept including science not only leads to Greek abustani, but it is also consistent with the philosophy of philosophia. Therefore, they have a profound metaphysical background of truth pursuits, and are by no means a practically driven result. On the contrary, it is precisely after changing the practical techniques of ancient Egypt and Babylon that the mapping and astronomical observation techniques in these areas were transformed into philosophia and astronomical science by philosophia. These are what people in modern China, including those in the May Fourth Movement unaware of when accepting the concept of science. The worship of science in the late Qing Dynasty was due to the worship of the practical effects of technology. They only saw the practical function of the ship and cannon in strengthening the national power, but did not see the pursuit of truth behind it, not even the root of the faith. In recent years, Chinese scientists and thinkers have begun to translate and write about the above-mentioned philosophia and religious origins of science on a large scale. Its essence is the contemporary deepening of the May Fourth Enlightenment.

3. Three Dimensions of Finland's Education

Huang: Thank you, Professor You. Your observations and analysis are quite profound. I remember when Imperial University of Peking was established, Emperor Guangxu made a famous speech in which he expressed the threat of the Western firearms to China he had deeply felt. He also felt the incompetence of the traditional “Master-saying” education. In other words, Imperial University of Peking valued modern education was established in order to deal with the challenge of instrumental rationality. Therefore, the formulations of “learn from the advanced technologies in the West in order to resist the invasion of the Western powers” and “traditional Chinese values aided with modern Western ideology”, etc., are actually forced direction and thinking of education in contemporary China. This is the first point you have just mentioned that the education in contemporary China starts with practical rationality or instrumental rationality being its focus. Obviously, Finland's Education reform underway is not based on practical rationality.

Indeed, when our education starts from instrumental rationality and aims at practical rationality, there will be key subjects, non-key subjects, useful subjects, useless subjects, major subjects, sub-disciplines, good majors and bad majors etc. that are based on the choices conducted by practical rationality. In contrast, Finland's Education now advocates phenomena, situations, and thematic education as the core. It does not start from instrumental rationality or practical rationality. Newton's reflection from the landing of apples is an exploration of physical phenomenon as the deep nature of the universe and nature. This kind of exploration is based on the love of essence of truth and thus transcends utilitarianism. Therefore, if we re-examine the study of Western basic subjects, we will

find that the most important thing is precisely the philosophia feelings of the researchers. The scientific activities are carried out for the pursuit of super-utility of “philosophia”, which is purely for the pursuit of truth. I believe that when it comes to Finland’s Education, it cannot be known well until this point is clear. And you have pointed it out very deeply. This is what I am quite agree with.

However, there is another point. Finland’s Education reform leaves us the impression that it seems to break the classification of disciplines and transcend modern instrumental rationality, just as the classification of general education and professional/specialized education in China. Then, does this mean that Finland stresses on general education rather than professional/specialized education? Such understanding is consistent with the context of Finland’s Education to a certain extent but not exactly. My observation is that the core of Finland’s Education is to educate the person as a person, rather than a talent or technician. Therefore, the principal goal of Finland’s Education is, in the case of an child in a kindergarten, nursing which refers to build up the body of the child and his mind by giving him a sense of security so that he can grow up easily. Based on this, the so-called knowledge will be added. This is the same case with education in primary school stage in Finland. That is, it does not only pay attention to the student’s physical body and technical knowledge but also the deeper things of being a human. There is even a third spiritual dimension that involves beliefs and values. Therefore, the issue of whole-person education that stresses on the three dimensions of body, mind and soul or soul body is very important. Then, to be precise, it is after graduation from junior high school that there will be a preliminary diversion of training different people into talents or technicians that some go to vocational schools or specialized schools to learn skills. In high school, some people will enter the transitional stage of professional studies such as medical schools, business schools and law schools beforehand. However, high school education is mainly preparing for ultra-utilitarian university life and the pursuit of wisdom for wisdom. Therefore, in university education, apart from the obvious link between several majors and employment, there is basically no direct relation between them in the overall department of humanities. This is the second point worthy of special attention that I have seen in Finland’s Education.

Thirdly, one of the topics in Finland’s Education that I particularly like to discuss is its focus on “cultivating students as human”. Is it consistent with the idea of general education that have been raised in mainland China today? Moreover, is there any comparability between this and the Chinese tradition that Emperor Guangxu would like to get rid of? Or is the general education advocated by mainland China taking back the things that Emperor Guangxu would like to get rid of? Will these problems be solved by reviving Chinese studies? Could Professor You analyze from these aspects?

4. Finland’s Education and General Education Reform in China

You: Dr. Huang, the questions that you have just raised are quite compound as it involves many important issues. Although it cannot be cleared up in this discussion alone, we can still outline it roughly.

As you have just mentioned, Finland pays special attention to the cultivation of human integrity in the basic education stage, as well as this conscious intention to abandon or isolate utilitarian

educational intentions, which is in stark contrast to China's Education. Today, there is a very popular slogan in China, that is, "Don't let your child lose at the starting line" Where is the starting point of this line? It starts at the age of three for kindergarten children. With more than fifteen pages of off-campus tutoring materials to gain admission to prestigious kindergartens, the child is placed in the competitive track of future elite schools and their majors, and also future superiority. Not only is the orientation of utilitarianism and market economy, but even extreme competition still exists at the cultural and psychological level, and it is far-reaching to dominate China's Education and people today. You mentioned that Finland "does not encourage competition among students, but emphasizes cooperation". This is very important, for it guarantees from the educational design the modern civilized law of education for all people. It is the education policy of contemporary China that education is for all people being educated. However, from the ranking in kindergarten to the college entrance examination, it is the elimination system that is implemented in China's Education, which leads to de facto unequal education. The practice of excluding poor students from the school so as to chase relatively higher average score and ranking, is in essence the deprivation of their rights to education. Worse still, it may cast these teenagers into the underclass directly or indirectly and thus they become anti-social members. A more far-reaching impact is that education has become a source of the vicious competition culture of contemporary China, and so the Chinese national character has been internally distorted. One of the superficial meanings of general education is to correct one-sided specialization of education, but the public meaning of being general does not only concerns with intellectuality but also sociality. It requires universal education for all educated people, which is well defined in its original Latin expression "Studium generale" ("Participants from all sides participate in learning") when the monastery was transformed into a university (Universitates; Grand Assembly). Before the 19th century, general education generally referred to the general term for primary and secondary education. In the early 19th century, Packard (A · S · Packard), an American first made certain its sense in higher education in the relationship with college professional education. However, general education is not only a category of higher education in the narrow sense thereafter, but also retains all the pedagogical significance in a broad sense. The reform of Finland's Education has highlighted the latter as the frontier of all educational developments in the era of globalization, including higher education, basic education and amateur learning.

Although the criticism of the above-mentioned practices is strong, it tends to focus on general humanistic discussions rather than social scientific analysis based on China's social structure. For the nation-states with a long history of oppression, it is a regular phenomenon to compete for education. In East Asia, South Korea is a case in point. But South Korea has already reflected on its far-reaching damage to its national quality and began to change it with "happiness education". The driving force for China's transition to modernization comes from the survival and development since modern times. This historical background has positioned education as a competitive tool for nation-states. Although this position has its historical legitimacy, it is bound to limit the humanity of education. The large population of China and the rapidly expanding education scale since the 1990s have internalized this international competition into the competition of domestic social class stratification. Education has been the main flow mechanism for Chinese people to change their social status since the Sui and Tang Dynasties, and has evolved into a cruel battlefield for survival contemporarily. Such

social reality is bound to make it impossible of equality in education, and also the cultivation of human integrity, and the belief in the true, the good and the beautiful. Division of arts and sciences in high school stage is neither a technical vocational education diversion as Europe's legitimate social division of labor, nor a gymnasium that is part of liberal liberal arts education in Germany and France. Rather, college entrance examination as the director stick of education in China is the structural tampering of the basic goal of quality education for the national basic education.

Therefore, under the above crisis, the cultural quality education that began in China in the 1990s and the unprecedented appeal to general education in 2015 have the incomparable heavy and urgent significance of Finland's Education reform. The education crisis has become one of the key issues in the modernization of China. This is also the background that a group of Chinese first-class intellectuals who have broken through their majors and undertaken the general education since the 21st century.

General education is not simply a remedy for the lack of humanities education. Although general education is often taken as merely a kind of humanistic education, a key neglect is that the concept of "humanities" is not the "arts" in the "literary arts" and "science" categories that gradually formed after the fourteenth century. The "Seven Arts" of *humanitas* in the era of Cicero included both the rhetoric that is regarded as a liberal arts today, as well as the music of art, the "sciences" such as astronomy and geometry that are separated from modern specialisation. However, they were actually neither "literary arts" nor "science", but rather an educational activity that must be accepted as a civilized "free man" who is different from the barbarians. It was similar to the "Six Arts" in the pre-Qin Dynasty of China. There were not only "shooting" and "driving" that were actually the spiritual cultivation of etiquette and temperaments which seemed to be the tool training on the surface but also the historical reading of knowledge that stimulated the sense of destiny and the thinking training of amazing Zhouyi^[3] thought. This is what Confucius called "the teaching of whole person" which has no beginning and end. The so-called "device" is to place one's own learning to the instrumental purpose. "bachelor in a way"^[4] is to place one's behavior in the pursuit of truth. This meaning is similar to the word *philosophia* that refers to Greece loves wisdom.

Therefore, China's "general education" is not a cultural imitation or transplant of the American education model. It is based on its own local experience. The immediate background of the unprecedented rise of general education in contemporary China in 2015 is the recent specific situation of competition among nation-states. That is, the Chinese government and top leaders have clearly realized in recent years that the Chinese economy, as the world's second largest world economy, has been exchanged for its low labor and environmental pollution. These two resources are no longer sustainable. Therefore, we must change the economic growth model at the downstream of global economic chain, and strive for the upstream of technological innovation. The pursuit of technological innovation upstream depends directly on the innovation of the university itself as the mother of modern technology. General Secretary Xi Jinping proposed at the Fifth Plenary Session of the 18th

[3] also known as *The Book of Changes*, it is said that it was written in the Western Zhou dynasty, is the theoretical source of natural philosophy and human practice in Chinese traditional ideology and culture

[4] those who study are interested in learning and practicing the teachings of the saints.

Central Committee: “We must insist on innovation and development, and put innovation at the core of the overall development of the country, and constantly promote innovation in all aspects such as theoretical innovation, institutional innovation, technological innovation, and cultural innovation. Make innovation all through the party and the state, make innovation become more common in the whole society.” Speaking at the National Conference on Political and Ideological Education in colleges and universities (2016-12), he put innovation more directly into college education: “Our need for higher education is more urgent than ever. The desire for scientific knowledge and talents is stronger than ever. The strategic decision made by the CPC central committee to accelerate the construction of world-class universities and first-class disciplines is to improve the level of China's higher education and enhance its core competitiveness.”

The question that needs to be considered in depth is: Can the mechanism of professional innovation be acquired by the limitation of strengthening the profession itself? China's innovative national policy today should not only be understood as directly related to the support of professional conditions, not to repeat the strategy of instrumental rationality since modern times, but must be extended to innovative social institutions and cultural and ideological environments (for example, freedom as the most intrinsic part of the innovation subject). Therefore, it is impossible to fundamentally cultivate innovative mechanisms, even technological innovations in specialized disciplines, to achieve goals only by equipments or funds. Innovation as a driving force for human civilization, especially modern civilization, is far from the implementation of policy. It requires a comprehensive study of natural sciences, social sciences and humanities. I refer here only to the motivation of science. From Galileo to Newton, the rise of modern physics has a profound background of beliefs. Christian natural theology regards nature as the work of God and firmly believes in its laws, which has become the background of the rise of modern natural science. Whitehead's *Science and Modern World* that has become a classic has a systematic discussion of it, whereas the Chinese intellectual circle remains unclear about it and still rely mainly on the technological needs of the market and the promotion of economic profits, which is one-sided and superficial. They ignore an important fact that the original motivation of scientists is not for practical purposes, but for the pursuit of truth. We can see from Einstein's theory of relativity and his equation of mass energy interchange that he only marveled at its beauty and symmetry, but these purely scientific discoveries which initially had no utilitarian factors became the fundamental theories that significantly changed the production of modern society. If we do not understand the spiritual realm of scientific originality, and think that scientific and technological invention is a professional technical interpretation, we can never enter the state of innovation. This analysis also includes humanities and philosophy. Contemporary Chinese humanities scholars are also involved in the utilitarian competition of the title to earn a living, and lack the individual's sincere meditation on the truth (this corresponds to the highest structure of the modernity of the individual directly confronted by the Lutheran revolution in the Finnish Protestant region, It becomes the premise of the belief in the concept of enlightenment.) It is also a social limitation that historical works cannot be expected to produce in contemporary Chinese humanities.

In 2015, an article by Professor Chen Zhiwu of Yale University which was widely spread on the Internet pushed general education into the focus of the comparison between China and the United

States. This article mentioned that China had taken over from South Korea and Japan the position of the world's low-end processing plants, while the United States had strengthened its general education more firmly. The foundation of American technological innovation lies in its general education, which especially emphasizes the suppression of specialization tendency in the undergraduate stage so as to enable students to obtain a complete training in terms of imagination, intuitive judgment, speculation and value stance, thus providing them with a deep foundation and a source of creation in the professional stage. Released in 2015, UNESCO issued the "Education 2030 Action Plan". It is worth noting that this education program for all mankind and with a special focus on the third world and the lower society is aimed at the structural unemployment caused by the era of knowledge economy. Responsive vocational and technical training has been transformed into lifelong education, and its content has not only included specific technical professional learning, but also emphasized thinking training and emotional aesthetic quality education. This shows that the contemporary educational reform represented by general education has covered all areas of education, not just elite innovation education.

Therefore, compared with the general education spontaneously promoted by scholars since 2005, the general education background emerged in China in 2015 has been added directly with more national strategic factors. In November 2015, Peking University, Fudan University, Tsinghua University and Sun Yat-sen University established the "Four-School General Education Alliance". In June 2016, six prestigious universities in China including the Chinese University of Hong Kong joined the alliance and established the "Ten-School General Education Alliance of China". Since then, Chinese universities have successively established general education institutions. In March of the same year, China released the outline of the 13th five-year national development plan, which put forward for the first time "implement the system of classifying academic and applied talents, a combination of general education and professional education, strengthen practical teaching, and focused on cultivating students' creative innovation and entrepreneurship", "accelerate the construction of a learning society". Only combined with the above background can these national policies be understood.

Since the rise of general education in the United States in 19th century, it has always contained two meanings. One is to strengthen cultural cohesion by criticizing and reflecting on modernization. The other is to provide an innovative mechanism for the development of modern science and technology. This is also the two basic points of the university since the 19th century. Newman's university philosophy and Humboldt's founding of the University of Berlin represent the former and the latter respectively. Today's general education in China still includes these two aspects. General education should educate Chinese youth with complete personality, including inheriting the essence of traditional culture and cultivating all aspects of modern citizenship. This cultivation includes two aspects: on the one hand, it is the source and impetus of scientific innovation that support the government's most urgent nation-state competition, which is metaphysical; on the other hand, it directs to a more fundamental goal that surpasses the nation-state competition, which is mentioned by Dr. Huang and represented by Finland that the higher reflection and promotion is based on the modern civilization, and the development of the nation-state lies in the happiness and freedom of the people. Such social development goals necessarily require corresponding education goals: to aim at the

full development of human beings, rather than to regard people as an adjunct, machine or part of a future competitive market and profession. This is also the idea that Marx always adheres to. In China, there is still a big gap between this concept and reality. The combination of educational utilitarianism and career-oriented professionalism is a virtual discussion of this humanistic concept. Therefore, even if they do not object to it orally or in writing, the actual education model is to exclude Marx's idea of all-round development of humanity.

Now, I am going to enter a question that has not been expanded yet. It was originally proposed that the Finland's Education reform showed a grand historical change, and it was necessary to return from the modern sub-specialty education a comprehensive phenomenon of practical problems and practical situations as a practical education in the context of embryology. What is the social background and historical background behind such a transformation? The difficulty of scientific development in modern times with the increasingly fine branching specialization is that the finer the research object and the more specific the division of labor, the more alienated the interconnectedness and overall existence of real things. Thus, overall system connectivity requires intersection and integration between disciplines. This call has been popular since the middle of the twentieth century. A series of interdisciplinary subjects have been identified as the direction of the discipline. Regarded as the most cutting-edge and leading discipline in the 21st century, cognitive science integrates six major disciplines including philosophy, psychology, linguistics, anthropology, computer science and neuroscience and generates eleven new interdisciplinary disciplines. This makes cognitive science a hub of contemporary scientific innovation and crossover. The modern physics revolution, which was based on relativity and quantum mechanics, changed the philosophical basis of the subject and object, spirit and material separation of the professional disciplines that laid the foundations of modern physics. Cultural studies and its contemporary electronic communication have become a contemporary field in which traditional humanities such as language, literature, history, ethics, and religion are integrated. In particular, the artificial intelligence represented by computers has replaced human traditional activities at an unprecedented speed, which makes the unique nature of people a major issue. The humanities (spiritual science: Geisteswissenschaften), which was coined in the late 19th century, has unprecedentedly shown its pivotal position in the integration of natural sciences and social sciences in general education. The in-depth exploration of the spirit of the subject not only makes the traditional concept of the soul a domain of religious theology revitalization, but even becomes a frontier subject of empirical science.

The "scientific revolution paradigm" (Thomas Kuhn) of contemporary professional disciplines is changing at an unprecedented rate, though in an uncertain state which prevents us from transforming into teaching materials. However, it has a practical embryology that can be shared between technological innovation and educational innovation. That is, returning from the knowledge inheritance of the professional division to the original problem situation of knowledge generation and innovation. The problem situation constitutes the original point of knowledge generation. For example, the natural ecological crisis is a problem encountered by our contemporary people. This comprehensive problem involves the requirements for multidisciplinary practice integration. We are faced not only in geography, climatology, and human ethology, but also in the political interests of nation states and their distribution. The Kyoto agreement finally becomes a game between the

nation-states that emit carbon dioxide. They make us realize that the overcoming of the natural ecological crisis involves even international political science. In this way, our students naturally ask for the learning and mastery of professional knowledge from the practical situation facing a specific problem and from the standpoint of practice integration. This is not only the practical motivation for professional learning, but more importantly, they see the roots of innovation in professional disciplines in the practice of embryology. They will enter political science, climatology, geology, some comprehensive disciplines including ecology, as well as agriculture, soil science, etc., to carry out their professional studies. At this time, their learning is no longer the traditional knowledge infusion and recitation, but the active quest for problem-solving. This kind of learning inevitably activates professional knowledge including the classics of the library. In this activation, as it is confronted with contemporary problems, they entered the endless cultural inheritance and renewal of hermeneutic meaning, thus refreshing the professional disciplines they have entered. This has enabled the development of contemporary science and technology and its traditional education in the sub-discipline to gain the vitality of inheritance and renewal. Returning to the basis of original problem and knowledge generation, and then re-entering the professional learning with innovation and professionalism, this constitutes an innovative education system. The undergraduate education reform announced by Stanford University in 2016 encourages continuous study in universities and social practice, and can span up to 20 years.

The transformation from the knowledge system to the practice requires the comprehensive transformation of education mode. The personal experience and the consciousness of problems will restore its maternal status at the higher level of human knowledge innovation. It consists of a series of things. For example, the perception and reflection of body consciousness becomes the starting point of intrinsically understanding the philosophical history of concept propositions, and the observation and understanding of the local knowledge of the place of life becomes the basis of the world's geography and history learning, and so on.

What is important is how teachers can introduce professional learning in a timely and appropriate manner when faced with problem situations. In the 1990s, when I visited Zhongyuan University in Taiwan, I communicated with Professor Lin Zhiping and Professor Wang Huangsan about the integration of holistic education in humanistic significance and professional education. They cited some examples. For example, of computerized education, ethics can be interspersed, such as cautiousness; there is also the issue of not attacking others on computer networks, the issue of legal awareness, and the human criticism of "viruses" in the teaching of computer technology. However, there is still a need to form a more general logic system or pedagogical system.

5. Reform of Finland's Education on Cancelling and Merging Some Disciplines

Huang: Professor You just made a very good speech. The problem of knowledge originating and situational education that you mentioned is a focus of the recent education reform in Finland. You mentioned the problems of environment and natural ecology, the Helsinki Education Bureau takes this Baltic sea environmental issue as a teaching theme in many elementary schools in Helsinki and

asks the schools to organize courses. They basically take “the environmental changes in the Baltic Sea” as a theme. Then, the teacher divides the students into two groups, and asks them to explore the problem on their own initiative by consulting biologists, meteorologists or oceanographic experts, visiting the Maritime Museum, and even creating and displaying pieces of art out of rubbish from the Baltic Sea, etc. As you just mentioned, the role that Finnish teachers have to play is that they take a step back, push the students to the front, and then give them various clues to solve the problems on their own initiative. According to your analysis, it can be said that Finland's Education is precisely the combination of knowledge generation and learning, which may be the most attractive part of Finland's Education. At this point, please talk more about the important features or contributions of this kind of education.

You: What you have just said gives me a more specific understanding of Finland's Education. In fact, it also confirms one of my long-distance speculations and observations, that is, through the problems faced by the contemporary people and times, the practical attitude of solving this comprehensive problem naturally appeals to the help of science and knowledge, thereby promoting students study with the motivation to solve problems. In such a learning process, the role of teachers is much higher than that of indoctrinated education. Between the problem consciousness in the practical situation and related disciplines, the teacher has restored the enlightening and guiding role of the intermediary in the original meaning of the word teacher (or the “lighter” in Buddhism). But the question that still arises is, to what extent does such professional learning go? This is what I am more interested in. For example, is the teaching going to take for a long time? As problems fade or are resolved, professional learning will naturally diminishes or stops? I don't think so. In order to solve the problems on the Baltic coast, a student gradually enters the relevant disciplines. His direct motivation is to solve the specific problems that arise from practice, but this may well be a cause that leads him to science which may fascinate him about the subject itself. It is entirely possible for him to continue to learn and delve into and become an expert or scientist in this field.

Huang: Yes. Taking the Baltic pollution as an example, it is exactly what you said that it is to solve problems and cultivate students' interest. This exactly confirms the differential correlation between the knowledge generation in the purpose and motivation of the modern tool and utility rationality and the learning acquisition as you just mentioned. For example, the research on the Baltic environmental pollution just mentioned, on the surface, can be understood as a utilitarian and pragmatic act to solve environmental problems. However, it is far from the essence of Finland's Education.

This is also reflected in another experiment. What does the school ask the students do? It allows the students to go to the forest to observe. Why do the leaves change color in autumn? Why they become so beautiful and colorful? Students are led to the forest with mobile phones and take pictures. There they collect all kinds of leaves, and then contact biologists, botanists and meteorologists with their questions, or they collect leaves and branches to make a work of art. In this experiment, students simply marvel at the beauty and magic of nature and explore why nature is like this with scientific methods. When scientific methods do not work, they continue with historical methods. When historical methods do not work, artistic means will further be used to experience, transcend and innovate. Through my life in Finland for more than 20 years, I have observed closely

by participating in the education of my children through attending the parent conferences and interacting with teachers, other parents, professors and education experts, as well as children, I found out the power of Finland's so-called "innovative" education that its innovation is not stimulated by a utilitarian purpose such as making a fortune or solving practical problems, it is derived from the marveling at the magic and beauty of the leaves. It is not for utilitarian purposes, the resulting metaphysical, utilitarian and instrumental benefits are just its by-products.

You: I am very grateful to Dr. Huang for the second example, which is very profound. The marvel at the discoloration of the leaves and the beauty of the natural scenery is at a different level from the solution to a specific utilitarian practice of the Baltic. Although both have problem situations. However, the former is confined to the practice of utilitarian goals, while the latter is about people's closeness and love for nature by which the aesthetic consciousness developed is far higher and more fundamental than the former, and the far-reaching shaping of the human soul and spirit. From this point on, it will cause Newton's surprise and contemplation on the falling of apples as you mentioned. Without such childlike innocence and curiosity and appreciation for nature, we can see many apples falling every day but is indifferent. This is the difference between a customary utilitarian thinker and Newton. And a true future scientist, or someone who can really come up with new discoveries in the field of professional divisions, should start with such a kind of admiration and appreciation for the discoloration of the leaves. Therefore, such cultivation is, in my opinion, extremely important and fundamental. I will pay close attention to, collect and design such issues.

By the way, you have been asking about the comparability of the general education in China today and the education reform in Finland. General education, as I have already described, has its own background in its rise in China. From that statement, you can see that it is somewhat different from the current educational reform in Finland. In fact, the education reform in Finland is representative of the higher stage of mankind, which the general education in China is still difficult to achieve. Like the general education in the United States, the rise of general education in China, is under the pressure of market economy and the competition of nation-states, and the resulting cultural identity and quality decline require the support of education reform. In the Second World War, the rise of the Nazis threatened the recognition of Western culture itself. The history of Western civilization was included in the compulsory courses of general education in the United States at that time and became an issue of national culture and humanistic value identification. General education almost assumes the mission and responsibility of preserving national culture and cultivating the wisdom of humanity. In the transformation of China's modernization, the ancient traditions and new traditional cultural values were abandoned, which led to value nihilism and hedonic money worship, as well as similar problems. The general education reform of Sun Yat-sen University and other universities in the 1990s, especially relying on the cultural immersion of traditional culture and classics-reading, is obviously the same idea. Although Hutchins, the president of the University of Chicago, placed the classic eternalism and cultural inheritance on the scientific and technological innovation in a Newman's standpoint. General speaking, the cultural civilization education and technological innovation in American general education are not in opposition. This model is precisely what China particularly agrees with today.

Huang: Thank Professor You for your supplementary explanation of the comparability of the

education reform in Finland and general education in China. This understanding and analysis is very important. In my opinion, the general education that China is pursuing now has been well popularized in many aspects in Finland.

Now, let's go back to the innovative issues caused by the phenomena, situations, and thematic education just mentioned. This may be closely related to the development of artificial intelligence you just mentioned, such as VR. Some people predict that in a few decades, half or more of our jobs will disappear; what type of new jobs will be there? We may not know. In the face of the competition between humans and robots, I think that the education in Finland can grasp exactly the subjectivity, flexibility and unpredictability of human beings, that's where innovation comes from. This may be a special concern for future education. Otherwise, according to the development of artificial intelligence, the machine will take you away once humans set a certain procedure, just like driving a car and going to a certain destination according to the target set by GPS. There is not much innovation here. However, if we rely on this way and let people compete with the machine, we are bound to fail. Machines are capable not only of statistics, but also of analysis and reasoning. However, the machine does not have the concept of "soul" that you have just mentioned as to be revived from tradition, and that's the essence which makes man human, which distinguishes him from the machine and from the object. This may be what Finland's Education strive to get back to, to cultivate a student as a person as opposed to adding a little bit of literary in the humanities or sciences and so on which we have just said about general education in general. This, I think is very interesting. If you have nothing to add to this question, I would like to turn to another one.

In such a context, for example, in China, many parents, teachers, and students are complaining about the obvious utilitarian exam-oriented education. However, no one dares to take their children as test subjects. It is understandable that high school students not try reform, for they will soon face the college entrance examination. Many parents would not be willing to reform if the reform ruined their children's access to college education. However, now not only high schools dare not to reform, even kindergartens can not get rid of the threat and injury of this exam-oriented education. This depresses me. Against this background, context and specific circumstances, Mr. You, what do you think we can do? Specifically, what can moral education do in order to cultivate students to be human?

You: Moral education is an ancient Chinese tradition. As a principle of "ruling the country by virtue," no matter how different the content of "virtue" is, it remained basically unchanged. Even the revolution of the Cultural Revolution was the highest moral education they understood. Therefore, moral education is no stranger to the Chinese. However, it is precisely today that mainland Chinese when in contact with people at home and abroad, will generally make others feel a kind of recognized anger. Of course, there are social reasons for this anger. When civil society is not mature enough for people to enjoy the dignity and treatment of its citizens, they will defend their own interests in a primitive way. But the virulence as a cultural significance goes far beyond self-defense. It is even manifested in the so-called "Competition on Huashan Mountain" style of fighting for the possession of the right of truth peculiar to Chinese academic circles.

However, there are various modes of moral education today. Lifestyle and social interaction at every historical stage naturally requires and spontaneously produces moral and ethical functions. Without its protection, individual freedom and social organization cannot exist. Moral education not

only points to the ethics between people, but also highlights people's awe of nature and even belief in the experience of modern ecological crisis. It is a goal of general education to reverse and overcome the domination and division of nature shaped by modern professional education. This brings us to a higher level. In the distinction and discrimination between human and machine, it actually requires to constantly return to the core principle of the highest educational philosophy, that is, the fundamental point of irreplaceable human nature. It is not only a theoretical proposition of a college, but also a focus of deep intention of all people's living behavior that cannot be eliminated. If you fail to recognize this focus, there will likely be a great deviation and mistake of the teaching aim and curriculum design. Without respect for human nature, moral education often degenerates into oppression. Once I was asked to develop a code of ethics for university teachers, and I explicitly refused it. Because the moral life of modern civilized society is based on natural demonstration and learning imitation mechanism, it should not reward or punish the external compulsory supervision by administrative means. Therefore, for such a kind of moral control and education, I even hold a negative liberalism position that Isaiah Berlin said.

Is there a need for moral education as an education subject? In my opinion, it should be immersed in various subjects. Not only traditional humanities such as philosophy, ethics, education and other subjects need to consciously highlight moral education; even in the knowledge transfer of natural sciences, it should be accompanied by moral education. When doing scientific experiments, students should be able to understand the sublimity and fundamentality of scientific experiments, and not create data for their publication. Examples of Madame Curie, who died of cancer at the cost of discovering radioactive elements, should be introduced so that young people can appreciate the noble realm of scientists' dedication. Such moral education should be integrated into all disciplines. Jean Piaget (1896—1980), the leader of the Geneva School, has confirmed this in his research on epistemology and child psychology. The sociality of anthropology makes even the simple perception of the individual implies a minimum of ethical intention.

Huang: That's right. Thank you. What are the challenges teachers have encountered in China's exam-oriented education? Especially the teachers in primary and secondary schools, they are under pressure from parents, students, school evaluations, rankings and so on. The teacher plays a crucial role in making a real and radical difference in education. If the teacher in this context loses himself or loses the right educational philosophy, education may be more difficult. In this case, how can we start with concrete actions bit by bit, not just asking teachers to be noble emptyly?

You: This involves the relationship between education and its social system. The educational reform in Finland is actually in the background of a mature modern civilization. Therefore, the institutional arrangement of human relations and occupations, including personal income and social rewards and punishments, is basically fair, or it tends to be more natural and reasonable. Teachers in Finland enjoy a higher social status than social elites such as ministers, entrepreneurs and so on. I was moved to hear that Finnish teachers were exempt from evaluation because "He has become the best person as a teacher. Does he need to be evaluated again?" However, there is no denying that in China, not only in basic education but also in all education industries, there are evaluations that makes teachers miserable. You didn't mention the practices in universities just now. Actually they can only be harsher. The suicide of several young and talented university teachers in 2015 was just a

case in point. Such cruel competition cannot be seen as normal. It necessarily requires an institutional reflection. The difficulties of China's education reform also lie here. It is not a simple epistemological issue, but a game of interests. By saying this, it is not meant to put the teachers' own efforts and education reforms aside and wait for the radical changes in the social system. On the contrary, I have said this on different occasions, including the inaugural meeting of General Education Center of Shaanxi Normal University. "We don't have to wait for a perfect social system or education system to provide us with all the prerequisites for general education reforms, because the general education reform that we are carrying out is itself a practical promotion and change for a more perfect social system and its education system." Education reform is not only an education system, but also an extension to social system reform. Therefore, I really appreciate the idealistic actors in the field of basic education in Shenzhen, who quoted the verse "It is better to light the candle than to curse the darkness." when I first met them. I have quoted this poem twice in a WeChat group that I chair in general education. Some people misunderstand that I am diverting criticism of negative realities into the romantic discourse of literati. Actually it is not so. This is a two-fold problem. Our reflection and criticism of realities should not lead to negative cursing after complaints, but should act positively. In the early twentieth century, in the chaos of warlords, pioneers such as Yan Yangchu^[5], Tao Xingzhi, and Liang Shuming^[6] carried out bottom-up education reforms from village to county. A group of young educators, such as Ye Wenzhi from Shenzhen Education Research Institute and Xue Duanbin from Jintian Primary School in Luohu District, proposed to inherit Tao Xingzhi's construction of new life education to save children six years ago from exam-oriented education. A painstaking and groundbreaking transformation has taken place in every link from curriculum design to extracurricular activities. Today, the trend of Shenzhen citizens including those of Guangzhou sending their children to schools in Hong Kong has been reversed. The children of these schools are not only feeling happier, but also begin to grow into high-quality humans. It was my honor to witness this movement and being touched. (Zhao Songguang, a famous education philosopher over 80 years old and former President of Xinghai Conservatory of Music, demonstrated and conducted the experiment for the third-grade math reform of Jintian primary school with the aid of double crutts). At present, only a few such educational reforms in China have appeared in marginal institutions or private schools, such as the experiment of general education reform in Beijing's famous private Yizhuang Primary School. However, with the popularization of general education, the origin of exam-oriented education will be significantly changed, and the mechanism of pushing back will be formed to reform basic education. The word "backforce" is also a key word in the experiment of the special economic zone at the beginning of China's reform.

Huang: Thank you. Your words reminds me of the fact that it is said some parents in China are now doing American-style home schools. Instead of letting their children go to schools, they teach them at home, or have some parents united to teach. Although they have made such an attempt, there is also a risk of doing so, that is, how should their children face the college entrance examination and

[5] Yan Yangchu (1890. 10. 26—1990. 1. 17): an educator in China who advocated to educate the masses, first of all the peasants, through the establishment of civilian schools, so as to create new citizens.

[6] a famous Chinese thinker, philosopher and educator who mainly studied the problems of life and society, also known as the last great Confucian in China

other issues in the future.

I also want to talk about the class teacher system in China, which does not seem to have a completely similar system abroad. Finland also has the role of class supervisor, similar to that of class teacher in China, but with a much smaller function. For example, under the pressure of teachers in various disciplines as we just mentioned, the class teachers must carry out the achievements of their own disciplines, as well as moral education and so on. So, to put these aspects together, can the class teacher bear the buffer or have a chance to try? For example, they have to deal with the relationship with the principal, with the teachers, with the parents, and with the students. Is there a unique condition for class teachers? For the educational philosophy and education reform we have just talked about, how can class teachers play a lot of possible roles without being able to expect a perfect system or social environment?

You, Dr. Huang, in fact, you have raised two questions. The first is how to see the trend of returning to traditional private school or family education. After entering modern times, the speed of human socialization has accelerated at an unprecedented rate, far beyond the limited time and space experience of ancient life. The new socialized experience and its intellectual inheritance can no longer be borne by individuals or families, but by socialized educational institutions and schools and their educational systems. As for the abuse of school education system or the crisis in the contemporary era, will it encounter a radical rebound? Is it possible for individuals to return to their homes for family education and even succeed? This, of course, does not rule out success stories. However, I think there is a clear view that it cannot be a model for promotion.

The second is about the class teacher system. I agree that there must be a discretion. Can a modern society place adult freedoms or human rights in the hands of one person? When I was in academic exchange at the Chinese University of Hong Kong in the 1990s, I was sensitive to this awareness for the first time. They refer to “counselor” as a brotherly companion rather than an administrator. This counselor is really important. From a pedagogical point of view, there is a very important law of the educational positive direction when age difference is repeatedly mentioned. That is, the age differences between the students and the counselor should not be big, rather they should be close to each other in age, like the relationship between the older children and the younger ones. If so, the younger will be influenced by the older and there will be a natural learning and imitation of the latter. The older children should be chosen from excellent college students, graduate students or young teachers. Now some college students go to primary schools in remote mountainous areas to do volunteer work. They not only undertake courses in teaching subjects, but actually act as counselors, and those children become their little friends while they become the big brothers or sisters of those children. Such an educational role, if we are to universally implement it, needs to be justified and institutionalized with reasonable social rewards. Then we should choose such excellent young people to be the class counselors of college students. They not only serve as bridges and intermediaries for professional education and thus as teaching assistants, but also include practical problems, life issues and emotional counseling. In this sense they are veritable mentors. This is actually close to the mentoring system in the organization form of general education. There are other similar functions. For example, some universities in China learn from the Chinese University of Hong Kong in their conjunction of general education and establish the college system in which students with different

professions and grades live together.

Huang: Thank you. The kind of counselor or tutorial system that you just mentioned mainly involves universities. If we look down, what about primary and secondary schools? This class teacher is obviously different from the counselor we just talked about. Do you have any suggestions for the the class teachers in primary and secondary schools?

You: To be sure, the class teachers in primary and secondary schools are more important. Because the students in these schools are still under age, and their outlooks on life are more malleable. The shaping of their ways of life and behavior as well as the cultivation of taste has a close relationship with the class teachers. The teachers in primary and secondary schools are far closer to the role of class teacher than those in universities. They actually have closer contact with students. In fact, they assume the role of life counselor, psychological counselor, or management counselor invisibly, but it does not involve more spirit and morality. If there is, they tend to be administrated and externalized. It is high time we raised this to a higher level of spiritual and personality cultivation. It is indeed extremely important to have courses and training for class teachers in this respect and be promoted. Because they in some sense take on the role of parents, especially for those children live on campus. Take myself as an example, I grew up in a boarding school, and the memory of the class teacher is hard to die.

Huang: Could you give some advice on how to be a good class teacher? Or what can we do in this context of globalization and future challenges? We have no way to change the overall situation, but in what aspects can we do in order to be a good class teacher?

You: I suggest the best way to train class teachers is, as I just mentioned, to choose some excellent representatives from the primary and secondary schools that have carried out life education reform like Shenzhen Jintian primary school or Luohu district foreign language school.

They have the forefront and in-depth experience of activities at basic level to communicate. Theoretical training and improvement of teacher education experts need to be based on this exchange of experience.

Huang: From the perspective of theoretical discussion, the class teacher is one of the phenomena. Nowadays, education officials, teachers and researchers from many countries come to Finland to learn from the Finnish model of education. However, experts in Finland have made it very clear that the Finnish experience and model cannot be transferred to another country but only some of the important elements can be introduced. Since we have talked so much today, what elements of Finland's Education do you think can be used in China?

You: I think the most striking thing is of course the organization of courses in the problem situations, including the two levels represented by the two examples you mentioned.

One level is the design of problems based on practice. This is different from the more abstract thematic curriculum organization in universities (for example, the "Life and Death" multidisciplinary teaching at Chung Yuan Christian University in Taiwan). Of course, for the children in primary and secondary schools, it may not design environmental problems on the Baltic coast, but it seems more appropriate to design more routine topics, such as disputes with classmates, how to communicate and interact with teachers, and direct experience from affairs like how to improve the traffic order of the neighborhood. The latest goal of Jintian Primary School is to expand the "life" platform of life

education from schools to families and communities. However, it includes a combination of academic and intellectual germination. Therefore, this kind of curriculum organization based on practical situations or situational problems enables children to have a natural and healthy attitude towards knowledge from the very beginning, and weaken the sense of strangeness or even opposition of knowledge system.

Second, what interests me most is the course organization that first with the observation, curiosity towards and collection of natural phenomena, and the desire to knowledge learning naturally occurs, then teachers or counselors guide them to visit the corresponding museums or classrooms to study. Of course, this procedure can also be alternated. I still remember the visit of my son to dinosaur fossils and other biological specimens at the Natural Museum in Beijing before he entered school that led to his later habit of collecting and making biological specimens. His room was nailed with a lot of insect samples. Once he picked up a stone and it seemed to have a strange trace, he insisted that there were ancient creatures in it, and forced me to take him to the biology professor for inquiry. This hobby may not last long, or a certain practical situation and the problem may disappear, but the curiosity towards nature and the spirit of scientific inquiry will be internalized into his cognition, personality and cultural psychological structure, and thus the “transfer” as one of the core concepts of general education takes place, which is an important goal of general education. This is also the theme of my speech at the inaugural meeting of China Ten-School General Education Alliance at Tsinghua University in 2016.

中文题目:

知识创新教育机制的当代转型:芬兰教育与中国通识教育的对话

作者:1. 尤西林:陕西师范大学人文学院资深教授,通识教育中心主任,信箱 21 号,雁塔校区南长安路 199 号,西安,陕西省,中国,710062. Tel:+86 13379004879, Email:youxilin@126.com. 2. 黄保罗:上海大学特聘教授,中欧人文研究与交流中心主任,for International Journal of Sino-Western Studies 和 Brill Yearbook of Chinese Theology 主编. Email: Paulos.z.huang@gmail.com.

摘要:享誉世界的芬兰教育正在从专业知识传授教育转向实践情境教育。实践情境作为知识创新与教育发生学的结合母体,使电子信息时代面临困境的专业知识教育获得了知识创新与教育发生学的活力。人性全面发展的教育理念与全社会对教师至高尊崇的文明,是芬兰教育成功的核心。由此奠基的自由探索的实践情境教育深刻区别于手段地位的实用主义教育。作为中国当代核心方向的创新机制建设,不能仍然基于工具理性囿限于专业学科自身的攻关研究,而必须扩展为创新机制所依托的社会制度与文化建设。通识教育对专业教育提供的主体文化素养与自由创新认知结构,是从近代以来富国强兵的工具理性转向信仰与热爱科学真理并以人的全面发展为目的的教育枢纽,也是包括专业学科在内的中国社会创新机制建设的基础动力。

关键词:芬兰教育;中国通识教育;实践情境教学;创新机制建设;实用主义教育;人的全面发展教育理念

This number is a special volume to celebrate the tenth anniversary of International Journal of Sino-Western Studies, which was started in 2011 and the guest editor for this volume is professor Jianbo HUANG, the director of Institute of Anthropology at the Normal University of East China in Shanghai.

In the column of Humanities, Theology, and Chinese National Studies we have published ZHANG Jieke's "Familial Conversion: A Case Study on the Ethical-Religious Role of the Household in the Mass Conversion of Wenzhou Christians" and LIU Yan's "Culture or Faith? The Morally Fraught Experience of Christians in Virtual Communities".

In the column of Practical Theology and Sino-Western Views on Church and Society, we have published YAO Yumeng's "Being an Addict and Healing: Narratives and Practices in a Gospel Rehabilitation Center" and ZHAO Luoying's "New Urbanization and the Development of Christian Churches in County Town and Rural Areas".

In the column of Chinese and Western Classics and the Bible, we have published Thomas Qinghe XIAO's "New Research on Confucian Christian Liu Ning during early Qing" and LI Shoulei's "Study on Christian Belief and Cultural Exchange of Chinese in Northern Thailand".

In the column of Church History in the West and in China, we have published Marina Xiaojing WANG's "'Neutrality is Impossible: Nationalism, Unequal Treaties and the National Christian Council of China, 1925—1926" and "Study on the Interaction of the Sinicization of Christianity and the Reconstruction of Cross-border Ethnic Minorities' Cultures in Yunnan" by GAO Zhiying and WANG Donglei.

In the column of Comparative Religious and Cultural Studies, we have published YANG Xue's

“Ancestors or Ghosts: the Cult of the Dead in a Bai Village in Southwest China” and BAIMACUO’s and GELINLANGJIE’s “The Cham Ritual of Padmasambhava in Tibet Buddhism”.

In the column of Reviews and Academic Reports, we have published HU Mengyin’s “Religion in Social Classification and Social Orders: A Study of Catholicism in a Tibetan Village in Yunnan”, SHA Lina etl’s “Christianity and the Change of Marriage Style of Lisu People in the Northern Part of the Border between China and Myanmar”, and “Becoming a martyr in China: The Steyl Missionary Father Paul Buhl (1902—1944)” by Prof. Dr. Helmut Moll.

人学、神学与国学
**Humanities, Theology,
and Chinese National Studies**

Familial Conversion: A Case Study on the Ethical-Religious Role of the Household in the Mass Conversion of Wenzhou Christians

Jieke ZHANG

(Divinity School of Chung Chi College, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong)

Abstract: This article explores the familial conversion which has cumulative impact on the mass conversion of Wenzhou Christians after 1949. Acknowledging the dramatic revival of Christianity in Wenzhou following reform and opening in China by no means precludes recognizing the hidden upsurge of conversion events before 1978. Through a case study on the congregation of Qingpu Church in Heyang area of Wenzhou, I hope to demonstrate that the familial aspect of conversion in the form of household units, rather than individual conversions, is the key to understanding the conversion of Wenzhou Christians. The article argues that the oneness of family derived from the emotional and responsible relationships within it, along with the process of the conversion ritual, constitute the ethical-religious role of the household, which contributes to the emergence of familial conversion. This preliminary study attempts to draw more attention to family, an essential ethical and even existential cultural factor in Chinese society. It is through the family that we may come to better understand the indigenous development of Christianity in China.

Key Words: familial conversion; mass conversion; Christian family; Conversion Ritual; Iconoclasm

Author: ZHANG Jieke, Master of Divinity, Divinity School of Chung Chi College, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong. Tel: +8613588448728; email: hmugu2005@gmail.com

1. Introduction

Since the 1980s, the massive conversion of Chinese to Protestant Christianity has sparked considerable interest. The so-called “Christianity Fever” has tended to be understood as a phenomenon unique to the period after the initiation of economic reform and the opening-up of China. Wenzhou Christianity has come to our attention through its significant bearing on the Christian revival precisely in this particular epoch with large political-economic changes^[1].

[1] Alan Hunter and Kim-Kwong Chan, *Protestantism in Contemporary China*, (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 2, 8, 67, 274; David Aikman, *Jesus in Beijing: How Christianity is Transforming China and Changing the Global Balance of Power*, (Washington, DC: Regnery, 2006), 170-192. See also Xiao Zhitian, “Gaige, kaifang yu zongjiao wenti—Wenzhou jianwen de sikao” [Reform, Opening and the Problem of Religion: Information from Wenzhou], *Zongjiao* [Religion], no. 2, (1987), 1-6. Cao Nanlai also observes the development of Wenzhou Christianity as an urban phenomenon in the context of the renewed political-economic modernity. See Cao Nanlai, *Constructing China’s Jerusalem*, (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2010). For Wenzhou Business Christians’ cultural roots in rural Christianity and the popular religions in China, see Chen Jinhan, *Jianshe Zhongguo Yelusaleng de xiandai shanggu* [The Modern Merchants Constructing China’s Jerusalem], (Hong Kong: Bachelor Thesis in the Divinity School of Chung-Chi College in the Chinese University of Hong Kong, 2017).

However, the recognized resurgence of Christianity in Wenzhou by no means precludes recognizing the hidden upsurge of conversion motivations and practices which also occurred before the late 1970s. The rapid increase of Christians in Wenzhou between 1949 and 1978 is also apparent and^[2], along with development after 1978, represents a movement of mass conversion which was unprecedented in the eighty-year history of missionary activity in Wenzhou prior to 1949^[3].

There have been a number of studies on Wenzhou Christianity, but they never thoughtfully recount how mass conversion could be possible. However, studies on conversion phenomena in other regions of China have suggested several noteworthy explanations. Some have regarded the religious freedom policy and the relaxation of the political environment as generating the Christian revival in China. It is tempting to locate the resurrection of religion within the structural and political framework, as clearing the way for individual tendencies toward conversion^[4]. Still, this explanation focuses only on macroscopic external conditions, while ignoring the fact that mass conversion consisted of numerous individual conversion events, each playing an essential and cumulative role.

In contrast, many researchers have noted the significance of the micro-level conversion process. The following are two accessible explanations from the micro perspective. First, plenty of regional studies of Christianity in China have explicitly focused on the impact of illnesses and misfortunes on the spread of

[2] According to the city records of Wenzhou, in 1949 the number of Christians was 83000, which accounted for 41.5% of all Christians in Zhejiang Province. In 2007, the number rose significantly to 860000, which did not include believers from the congregations of the True Jesus Church and uncounted believers from various house churches. Today we lack accurate data on the number at the end of the Cultural Revolution. However, based on materials in a local church history in Ruian of Wenzhou, the years between 1949 and 1978 experienced a rapid increase of Christians from 9370 to 44125. If we calculate loosely in proportion, then in 1978, the number of believers in Wenzhou as a whole was about 390,000. Therefore, from 1949 to 1978, Wenzhou Christians grew by more than 300,000, and by 470,000 more from the end of the Cultural Revolution to 2007. For concrete records of number of Wenzhou Christians, see Fuk-tsang Ying, "Zhongguo jidujiao de quyu fazhan: 1918, 1949, 2004" [The Regional Development of Protestant Christianity in China: 1918, 1949 and 2004], *Hanyu jidujiao xueshu lunping* [Sino-Christian Studies], No. 3, (2007), 172; Zhang Zhongcheng, "Cong wenzhoujiaohui de muqixianxiang kan jiaohui de muyangguanli" [A Study on the Pastoral Management of Church Mirrored in the Phenomenon of Pastoral District in Wenzhou], *Jinling shenxuezi* [Nanking Theological Review], no. 1, (2011), 58; Ruianxian jiaohuishi (Neibuziliao) [The Church History of Ruian County (Internal document)], 11-20; Cao Nanlai, *Constructing China's Jerusalem*, 1. Additionally, the fact that the rapid increase of numbers of Christians in Wenzhou during the Maoist period has been noticed by other researchers, see Zhu Yujing, *Guojia tongzhi, difang zhengzhi yu Wenzhou de jidujiao* [State Rule, Local Politics and Christianity in Wenzhou], (Hong Kong: Ph. D. dissertation in the Chinese University of Hong Kong, 2011), 100; and for more detailed discussion, see Wang Xiaoxuan, *Maoism and Grassroots Religion: The Communist Revolution and the Reinvention of Religious Life in China* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020), 95, 102, 119-123.

[3] I invoke the definition of mass conversion from Yang and Tamney as "the phenomenon of religious conversion happening to many individuals in a society within a relatively short period of time." See Yang Fenggang and Joseph B. Tamney, "Exploring Mass Conversion to Christianity Among the Chinese: An Introduction," *Sociology of Religion*, 67, 2, (2006), 126. The concept of conversion as used in this paper refers to a shift from a particular religion or a state of irreligion to another religion, which involves joining a new religious group, practicing a new religious lifestyle, and adhering to the creeds and rituals of the new religion. In the context of Chinese Christianity, conversion is often expressed as "believing in Christianity" (xinjiao), "believing in Jesus" (xinyesu), "believing in the Lord" (xinzhuzhu), "entering the Church" (rujiao), see Joseph Tse-Hei Lee, *The Bible and the Gun: Christianity in South China, 1860—1900*, (New York: Routledge, 2003), xxviii. The statement of conversion by Wenzhou Christians is no different from that of Chaozhou Christians.

[4] For the discussion of this macro-level explanation, see Katrin Fiedler, "China's 'Christianity Fever' Revisited: Towards a Community-Oriented Reading of Christian Conversion in China," *Journal of Current Chinese Affairs*, 39, 4, (2010), 79-80, 84. Fiedler's research focuses on the process theory of conversion, trying to combine several micro-level explanations. It is of note that she highlights the meaning of the community in the Christian religion. However, what she argues, namely, the communality of Christian practice, which fills a gap opened up by the change in traditional familial and social structure, does not touch on the fact that the new form of family represented by the Protestant congregation is probably still quite marginal in the traditional family-centered moral order in local society, and its implication of "family" is not without influence from the traditional conception of the clan.

Christianity in rural areas, suggesting the influence of specific individual needs arising from deprivation^[5]. This mode of conversion tends to be driven by utility, even though the practical considerations of converts may eventually be transformed by deeper understanding of the unworldly concerns of the Christian faith^[6]. In another approach, some scholars give more heed to the function of social networks in proselytization. Several scholars recently used this paradigm, referring to the concept of “Guanxi” (关系) to illustrate the conversion process to Christianity among Chinese. For example, they stressed the influence of generosity, sharing, hospitality, and compassion of members in a religious organization as key factors in conversion, as well as the effect of introductions from relatives or friends^[7].

These two micro-level explanations can of course, apply to the conversion process of Wenzhou Christians. However, they do not fully explain the way in which mass conversion takes place. If religious conversion for practical reasons implies that the converts are sick, divorced, infertile, and otherwise unfortunate whether they are active seekers or not it is difficult to imagine that these sorts of individual needs would bring about a mass conversion to Christianity. Although social networks of acquaintances make the spread of Christianity more probable and efficient, the conversion theory based on networks still centers on individual religious experience and secular considerations. In short, both explanations are based on the premise of individual conversion.

To my mind, the mass conversion of Wenzhou Christians does not result from an accumulation of multiple individual decisions, but rather from an accumulation of multi-familial conversions^[8]. In this article, “family,” when it is connected to Christianity, strictly refers to the “household.” I will highlight the case of the congregation of Qingpu Church to show how first-generation believers convert in the form of a household unit. Familial conversion includes the factors of individual needs and social networks, but, more importantly, it stems from the indigenous idea of family. The purpose of this article is to show the ethical-religious role of the household in the mass conversion of Wenzhou Christians.

2. The Church and Statistics: Background

Qingpu Church is in the Heyang area of eastern Wenzhou. It is a member of Heyang Pastoral

[5] See Han Heng & Wang Ying, “Xuqixing guixin he xidexing guixin; nongcun shuren shehui de jidujiao guixin” [Need-oriented Conversion and Acquisition-based Conversion: Christianization in Rural China], *Beijing shifan daxue xuebao* [Journal of Beijing Normal University], no. 5, (2014), 143-44. See also Jin Ze & Qiu Yonghui, eds, *Zongjiao lanpishu; Zhongguo zongjiao baogao* [Annual Report on Religions in China], (Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe [Social Science Academic Press], 2010), 192.

[6] Cf. Li Huawei, “Kunan yu gaijiao; henan sandi xiangcun minzhong gaixin jidujiao de shehui genyuan tanxi” [Suffering and Conversion: The Exploration on Social Causes of Peasant’s Conversion to Christianity in Henan Province], *Zhongguo nongye daxue xuebao* [China Agricultural University Journal], no. 3, (2012), 81-91; Gubo Qi, Zhenhua Liang and Xiaoyun Li, “Christian Conversion and the Re-imagining of Illness and Healthcare in Rural China,” *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology*, 15. 5 (2014), 409; Zhou Lang, Sun Qiuyun, “Yinbing xinjiao nongmin de zongjiao xinli jiqi yanbian” [The Psychology of Peasant Religious Conversion for the Purpose of Disease Control], *Shehui* [Society], no. 4, (2017), 14 ff.

[7] E. g. see Christie Chui-Shan Chow, “Guanxi and Gospel: Conversion to Seventh-day Adventism in Contemporary China,” *Social Sciences and Missions*, vol. 26, (2013), 167-198; Joseph Tse-Hei Lee, “Guanxi and Gospel: Mapping Christian Networks in South China,” in Albert L. Park & David K. , eds, *Encountering Modernity: Christianity in East Asia and Asian America*, (Honolulu: University of Hawai’i Press, 2014), 71-94.

[8] Leung Ka-lun, *Gaigeikaifang yilai de zhongguo nongcun jiaohui* [The Rural Churches of Mainland China Since 1978], (Hong Kong: Alliance Bible Seminary, 1999), 229. However, Leung did not yet make a further discussion on this topic.

District along with twelve other churches^[9]. A deceased native elder states in his memoir that CIM (China Inland Mission) missionaries had already left their footprint in Heyang as early as 1881. At the turn of the 20th century, Heyang was one of the main areas of CIM missionary efforts. Because of the fast growth of inquirers and converts in this area, Mrs. Grace Stott, who was in charge of the work in Wenzhou at that time, decided in 1899 to build a new chapel in Heyang's Changxia as an outpost to serve emerging pastoral needs^[10]. The Changxia chapel became a center for worship services and Bible learning as well as for evangelical extension to other parts of Heyang. The establishment of Qingpu Church served a congregation comprising believers from three villages: Yantou, Miaohou, and Xiahua. The earliest convert was a woman named Wang Aimei, who had married Yantou and was proselytized by her father ten miles away in another village in 1935. In 1958, Changxia Church was shut down under the political campaign of "great leap in religious work" executed by local governments^[11], and several believers began to meet in Aimei's home and then in Lin Qingming's house, after he and his family converted in 1965 for the sake of his wife, who suffered from a strange skin disease. With a steady increase in the number of believers, the congregation gradually formed. In 1981, when Changxia Church reopened with the restoration of religious property and church ministry, the believers from Yantou, Miaohou, and Xiahua began religious life there again. Throughout the 1980s, the scattered congregations in Heyang gradually established another twelve churches in succession, including Qingpu Church, which was founded in 1988. Thereafter, Changxia Church was no longer the center of religious life but became one member among several churches in one pastoral district.

According to Qingpu Church's intramural statistics, by 2017 there were 534 households on the register. In Yantou, the statistics counted 152 households and 555 persons in total, among whom were 140 baptized believers. Of the 152 families, one third were first-generation Christian families. Only one household converted in the 1950s. In the 1960s, that number grew to three. Ten, twelve, and eleven families respectively turned to Christianity in the 1970s, 1980s, and 1990s; and since 2000, there have been five families who started to believe in Jesus. After the first-generation families who experienced the conversion process, the remaining hundred or so families are all descendants of the original convert families. To represent the start of their belief in the Lord, they always filled out the registration form with the words of Zhi-you (至幼, from infancy), Cong-xiao-xin (从小信, from childhood), Chu-sheng-qi (出生起, from birth onwards), Yi-chuan-xin (遗传信, inheriting parent's belief), Mu-fu-xin (母腹信, from the womb) or Jia-chuan (家传, familial heritage). This implies that they did not receive their religious identity through their own decision; rather, they inherited the faith of their parents or grandparents. Thus, the surge of Christianity in this village by over five hundred

[9] It is necessary to notice that the Heyang Pastoral District is a self-governance organization, while it also keeps a tight relationship with the local TSPM and is recognized by the local Religious Affairs Bureau.

[10] Anonym, "Tidings from the Provinces," *China's Millions*; North American Edition, (Philadelphia: China Inland Mission, 1898), 70; George H. Seville, "Progress in the Work at Wen-chow," *China's Millions*; North American Edition, (Philadelphia: China Inland Mission, 1907), 66; Edward Hunt, "C. I. M. Work in the Prefecture of Wenchow," *China's Millions*; North American Edition, (Philadelphia: China Inland Mission, 1912), 110-111.

[11] For details of the "great leap in religious work" and its aftermath in Wenzhou, see Wang Xiaoxuan, *Maoism and Grassroots Religion*, 98-105. As Wang pointed out, the violent campaign against Christianity in Wenzhou in 1958, which stems from the tension between local cadres and church members before that time, was an unintended consequence of the Great Leap Forward.

converts in about 70 years is in large part related to familial heritage. In the process of inheritance, religious identity is always ascribed^[12]. This is based on the linking of Christianity with the family and is premised on familial conversion.

3. The Household as a Christian Family

The use of “household” as a unit for counting the number of believers is quite a common practice in Heyang Pastoral District and even in other traditional churches in Wenzhou, whether they are official churches or house churches. According to the local tradition in Heyang, the household is the smallest part of a paternal Chia (家, usually refers to an extended family), and its independence is related to the system of the division of Chia^[13]. For instance, if a family has three sons and the elder brother gets married, as long as his new family eats separately from his parents and his two other unmarried brothers—that is, if he begins to have what the locals call *ò-zè* (锅灶, cooking stove), even if they are still living together in one Chia—the division is considered complete and there are two households^[14]. If, after marriage, he does not separate from his parents but remains in the parental household without division, then his father is still the head of the family, and they are one household. If the three brothers all get married and divide the Chia into three parts, then there are naturally three households. In this case, the parent usually lives with the elder brother’s new family. Therefore, even if Chia is a fundamental element when we understand Chinese society, the household, which comprises two or three generations in one family, is the smallest unit in the social structure^[15].

The Christian family as a household is similar but not identical to the religious family in traditional Chinese society. The good life in a traditional Chinese family, as C. K. Yang stated, “was not entirely within human control, but needed the blessing of spiritual forces.”^[16] People would seek well-being through ancestor worship and the cult of gods in their clan and village community, and the various parts of the house were also associated with different deities, making the home space the center of cult practices. Among other traditions, ancestor worship was a family religion in the real

[12] Xiao Zhitian had discovered this feature in the conversion of Wenzhou Christians. See Xiao Zhitian, “Gaige, kaifang yu zongjiao wenti” [Reform, Opening and the Problem of Religion], 3. Several researchers see this phenomenon as a result of the interactions between families. They emphasize that family members usually convert secondarily due to their acknowledgement of the Christian values and practices held by other family members converted before. For instance, see Han Heng & Wang Ying, “Xuqixingguixin he xidexingguixin” [Need-oriented Conversion and Acquisition-based Conversion], 144-45. However, this view always ignores that “believing” (xin) is a self-evident action for those children in the Christian family, for whom, the religious identity is fundamentally ascribed rather than acquired.

[13] See Hsiao-tung Fei, *Peasant Life in China: A Field Study of Country Life in the Yangtze Valley*, (London and Henley: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1939), 27-55.

[14] The dividing of the stove is an economic and religious symbol in the practice of family division in traditional Chinese society, see Arthur P. Wolf, “Gods, Ghosts, and Ancestors,” in Arthur P. Wolf, ed., *Religion and Ritual in Chinese Society*, (Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1974), 133.

[15] Cf. Zeng Yi, “Kongzi gaizhi yu rujia zhi xiaodao guannian” [Confucius’ Reformation and the Confucian Concept of Filial Piety], in Wu Fei, ed., *Hun yu sang: chuantong yu xiandai de jiating liyi* [Marriage and Funeral: The Traditional and Modern Familial Etiquette], (Beijing: Zongjiao wenhua chubanshe [Religious Culture Press], 2012), 51. It should be stressed that the morality of exchange in everyday life in Wenzhou precisely revolves around the household.

[16] See C. K. Yang, *Religion in Chinese Society*, (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1961), 28.

sense, integrating and maintaining the family as a basic unit of Chinese society^[17]. It was the religious system, dominated by ancestor worship and supplemented by the worship of other gods, made the traditional Chinese family a religious family^[18]. However, the “family” here was not only a household represented by the so-called nuclear family; instead, it was a continuum, which could be extended to the family within wufu (五服, Five Mourning Grades to represent five generations), to the larger clan, and even to the entire nation^[19].

In contrast to this extendable religious family structure, the Christian family reflected in the analysis of statistics on Qingpu Church is explicitly a household. A family’s religious identity profoundly shapes the religious identity of a person in that family. The most obvious example of this is the change in women’s religious adherence. Traditionally, a Chinese woman’s status in the sacrificial cult was dependent on her husband’s family rather than her father’s family^[20]. This phenomenon applies equally to the daughter of a Christian family, who generally will turn to the popular Chinese religion when she marries into a non-Christian family. The reverse is also true^[21]. Hence, the female’s changing religious identity in the movement between two families with different religious beliefs suggests that Christianity is mostly connected to the paternal family within the broader religious locality.

However, the technique of counting believers around the household reveals a hidden feature: Regardless of how individuals understand the Christian faith, whether baptized or not, they are still counted as within the total number of believers. This approach shows a different understanding of how one obtains a Christian identity. As Ying Fuk-Tsang has noted, Christian identity was recognized based on the receipt of baptism according to “Christian tradition”^[22]. For example, we can see this statistical technique in *The Christian Occupation of China* written by the Special Committee on Survey and Occupation in 1922, which distinguished between inquirers and communicants in its counts. Consistent with this tradition, missionaries were concerned with the conversion of a particular individual, and baptism was the result of a test of personal morality (not smoking opium, living an upright life, and so on) and religious life (especially not worshipping idols), and only those who passed the test were formally accepted as members of a Christian congregation^[23].

Even if most of the traditional churches in Wenzhou also underline the significance of baptism for the individual communicant’s identity, the fact is that in their statistics they consider a large

[17] Ibid., 29-31. See also Jordan Paper, *Chinese Religion and Familism: The Basis of Chinese Culture, Society, and Government*, (New York: Bloomsbury, 2019).

[18] See Paper, *Chinese Religion and Familism*, 54.

[19] See Michio Suenari, “The ‘Religious Family’ Among the Chinese of Central Taiwan,” in George A. DeVos & Takao Sofue, eds., *Religion and the Family in East Asia*, (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1987), 169-184.

[20] Paper, *Chinese Religion and Familism*, 14.

[21] Of course, the opposite phenomenon also happens, albeit relatively rare. That is, when the daughter from a Christian family marries into a non-Christian family, the husband follows her Christian identity. And the reverse is also true. It is a product of the changes of the family order in the modern historical flux, especially that after 1978. It is not just about the increased independence of the nuclear family after family division, but also about the tendency of the private emotional relationship between husband and wife to move away from the ethically obligatory relationship between father and son. See Huang Jianbo, “Sirentang” jishi [The Story of “Si Ren Tang”], (Beijing: Zhongyang minzu daxue boshi lunwen [Ph. D. dissertation in Minzu University of China], 2003), 55-56.

[22] Fuk-tsang Ying, “Zhongguo jidujiao de quyue fazhan: 1918, 1949, 2004,” 159, 170.

[23] E. g. see W. E. Soothill, *A Mission in China*, (Edinburgh and London: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1907), 81-91.

number of unbaptized people as believers, regardless of the frequency of their attendance at Sunday services^[24]. This suffices to show that a family's strong Christian identity is not considered negated when a particular family member, often a husband or son, plays truant from church; this is the case even when he does not accept the Christian faith as true. Apart from the statistics, other reasonable evidence of this fact is that regardless of their degree of recognition of Christianity, all members of a Christian family qualify to attend the annual Christmas feast held by the church, which is seen as the most important festival of the congregation. The collective presence at the feast is regarded as a reunion or returning home^[25].

The emphasis on the household seen in techniques of statistics reflects the value placed on family by the Chinese people in their understanding of Christianity as their religious adherence^[26]. Why is it that the household, and not extended family or an individual, is considered the unit of religious identity? This widespread cultural phenomenon cannot be explained solely in terms of Christian doctrinal expectations about the turning of a whole family to the Lord, as they interpret the Bible literally; but more prominently in terms of the ethical-religious implication of the household entailed in their conversion process.

4. “For the Sake of...”: Family as a Community of Shared Life

The possibility of familial conversion primarily depends on the ethical aspect of the household. Through random and intensive interviews with interlocutors in Qingpu Church in the summer of 2018, I encountered 39 cases of conversion. The 39 families involved in these cases were scattered in various districts in Heyang. Among them, four families converted before the 1920s and three in the 1930s. The remaining 32 families converted in the decades after 1949. Because conversion stories before 1949 are extremely scarce, the analysis will center on cases in the post-1949 period.

Apparently, familial conversion is concerned with individual needs and social networks. The local congregation uses two categories to distinguish the types of conversion: *wā-nā-sān* (患难信, conversion in a situation of adversity) and *bīng-ō-sān* (平安信, conversion in a situation of wellness). *Wā-nā* is always related to illness or mental disease, both considered as problems of the body. *Bīng-ō* has nothing to do with physical and mental suffering; nevertheless, it is also concerned with various frustrations of everyday life. Among all 32 cases, there are only six who converted in the situation of *bīng-ō*. They turned to Christianity because of loneliness, the desire to have a son, the ritual burden of superstitious practices, a son's irritable temper, and a daughter's divorce. In comparison, the remaining 26 cases all involved varying degrees of adversity, such as persistent

[24] The statistics on believers in Changxia Church more clearly reflects this situation. In 2015, there were 1866 believers counted in this church in total, among which 638 persons never attended the Sunday worship.

[25] In 2019, in his speech before the banquet celebrating Christmas, Ling Congli, the pastor of Qingpu Church, said, “God is our father and Jesus is our brother; today we come back home to celebrate Jesus' birthday.” This statement, which sounds very much like the call of God and Jesus in the Tai-Ping Kingdom, also appeared in the local church's Christmas discourse.

[26] It's worth noting that some churches in the Wenzhou City area have begun to use “individual” instead of “household” as the unit used to count believers. However, the importance of household in their perception of religious identity has not completely changed. The change in statistical practice stems in large part from the increased mobility of believers between churches and is no longer confined within the scope of the congregation community originally rooted in the village.

headache, handicap, car accident, children's premature death, blindness, cancer, psychasthenia due to demon-possession, etc. We should note that, in spite of the distinction by those local believers^[27], both categories involve practical considerations and are related to particular deprivations in everyday life, as many researchers have discerned.

Meanwhile, social networks also served as a crucial role in conversions. Most of these cases indicate that evangelical efforts and introductions from relatives or neighbors provided opportunities for exposure to Christianity. Furthermore, a small number of instances show that other social occasions could function to spread Christianity, such as being evangelized by a doctor in the hospital or by a business friend^[28].

However, the reasons for familial conversion do not merely stem from internal personal existential crises and outside religious provision, but more significantly from the diffusion of the sense of crisis among the family. From interlocutors' narratives, there are seven cases of conversion for an individual's own sake, and the remaining 25 conversions were for the sake of their families. But even in the former case of individuals who were motivated by their own needs, their families also converted with them. An interlocutor and her/his families are in an intersubjective relationship. One turns to Christianity for oneself; at the same time, her/his families take the step of conversion for the sake of her/him too.

For instance, the story of Lin Yandi, a villager living in Yantou, illustrates attunement of those within a family. Lin converted in 1961 when he was 30 years old. It was the time of the Great Leap Forward, and he was responsible for building a new reservoir in Heyang. However, he was suddenly stricken with aplastic anemia, which made him bedridden and poor in health. As there was no available cure from other medical treatments and local religious methods, an older woman from adjacent Xiahua village introduced him to Christianity and persuaded him to convert. He did so, and his wife converted too. His daughter-in-law, while telling of the conversion story of this family, emphasized not Yandi's personal need and his conversion, but that her "mother-in-law believed in Jesus for the sake of my father-in-law."

This is not an isolated case. In all 32 stories, there are eight very similar to the story above. All indicate that the illness of a male householder brought about the conversion of a whole household^[29]. Like Yandi's daughter-in-law, these interlocutors also spoke of conversion for the sake of their husband or father. In these narratives, we do not hear the decision to convert made by the male sufferer himself, who has authority on other families, but rather the families' desire for the

[27] This distinction is not insignificant, but rather a reflection of the locals' emphasis on the intactness of the individual body and its connection to the integrity and impunity of the family. Even more, people usually endow those believers who converted for adversity with higher assessment in terms of their persisting the faith; by contrast, those who converted in the situation of wellbeing, although they converted for certain needs, are seen as dabblers who do not really understand the meaning of suffering and God's salvation, therefore are apt to sway.

[28] Although the conversion stories before 1949 are nebulous, there are two cases in the 1920s which indicate that the conversion was due to the elder's illness in the family. In addition, Wang Aimei's parents' home turned to Christianity because of her father's being taken ill and her aunt's introduction. It can be seen that so-called individual need and social network also were important factors for villager's conversion to Christianity before 1949.

[29] The year of conversion and the individual need for each of these eight cases is as follows: 1950 (bad health), 1963 (bad health), 1963 (persistent fever), 1965 (appendicitis), 1966 (bad health), 1971 (encephalitis), 1987 (cancer), 1995 (cancer).

sufferer to get better. In other words, their conversion is not the result of a demand from the authority but represents the power relation as a natural emotional and responsible connection between husband and wife; father and children.

Similarly, adult female and unmarried offspring in a family also experience conversion of their families for their sake, as manifested respectively by thirteen cases for the former^[30] and ten cases for the latter^[31]. The conversion of Wang Xianglan's family and that of Fan Ailing's family illustrate these two situations separately. Wang converted in 1975 because her mother-in-law suffered a demonic possession at the age of 43. Wang's father-in-law, Lin Qingxiang, was a law-officer in a county of Wenzhou during the Cultural Revolution. Once, he sentenced a teenager to death for stealing, and a few months later, he died of cancer. Wang's mother-in-law asked a local medium for an explanation of her husband's disease and was told that the condemned teenager had turned into a ferocious ghost due to the injustice done him. It was the teenager who sickened her husband. Three months later, her husband passed away, and she began to have trouble sleeping at night as her health deteriorated, an effect which was attributed to her being followed by the ghost. Lin Qingxiang was the elder brother of Lin Qingming, who had converted with his family ten years ago in 1965. It was Qingming's wife who introduced the gospel to them. According to Wang's account, she believed in Jesus "for the sake of my mother-in-law."

Fan's family turned to Christianity in 1999. Before she got married, her mother-in-law had been converted for many years. But she and her husband did not follow their mother's religious identity. The turning point occurred when her elder son finished his college entrance examination and began behaving strangely, barricading himself indoors. After fruitless attempts to seek medical treatment, Fan heard some "superstitious people" saying that there were many ghosts in her family that caused her son's problem. She was terrified and turned to belief in Jesus at the persuasion of her mother-in-law, with her husband and son following her choice.

These three stories all evidence conversion for the sake of families. In most cases, this leads to familial conversion within a whole household^[32]. This fairly common occurrence implies that so-called "deprivation" is never only a personal crisis, but rather a social fact, which is seen as abnormal

[30] The years and the motivations for the thirteen cases of conversion in adult females are listed below: 1950 (infertility), 1953 (bad health), 1958 (bad health), 1965 (skin disease), 1970 (strange disease), 1975 (demon-possession), 1975 (bad health after giving birth), 1978 (eye disease), 1980 (psychasthenia), 1980 (ritual burden of superstitious practices), 1982 (bad health), 1984 (seeing phantom wandering while sleeping), 2014 (daughter's divorce).

[31] The following are the years and the motivations for the ten cases of conversion in children or juveniles: 1950 (infant's premature death), 1955 (bad health), 1960 (son's stomach disease), 1964 (infant's leg broken shortly after birth), 1973 (daughter's bad health), 1976 (daughter's blindness), 1988 (son's hepatitis), 1990 (son's bad temper), 1999 (son's mental disease), 2006 (son gambling).

[32] Among all cases, there are three indicating that the conversion took place as an individual rather than a familial event. One is a woman who converted in 2014 because of her daughter's divorce. Her husband had died before her conversion, and she was living alone. The remaining two cases are respectively on conversions in 1987 and 1984, and the converts are adult females, one of whom converted for her eye problem, and the other converted because she was scared in sleeping by a phantom wandering at the bedside. Their husbands and parents-in-law obstructed their conversions. However, both families turned to Christianity later, separately because of a husband's illness and a father-in-law's belief in the existence of a ghost in the house. The two stories indicate the relative low position of a young woman compared to the authority of her husband and parent in the paternal family. Furthermore, both reflect that not all families have an attunement and intimate relationship between members. The power relationship is still the motive of any emotional and responsible relationship in Chinese family.

in terms of the local collective consciousness. Suffering of an individual is never understood as part of a normal and happy state that a family should possess but represents unhappiness and a disruption of the shared life.

Therefore, it can be seen that the attunement of individuals to one another within families is an extension of their ethical life. The traditional culture of the Chinese family leaves a deep mark here. Confucianism, as Yang indicated, rationalized ancestor worship, a family religion with a supernatural cult, as a set of ethical norms and rites based on emotional and responsible relationships such as filial piety and love within the family^[33]. The family, here, is a community of shared life consisting of three categories of relationships according to the traditional Commentaries on Mourning Apparel in Ceremonial Etiquette (《仪礼·丧服传》): the relationships of one body between father and son, between husband and wife, and between brothers; along with the larger oneness of the family which is also seen as one body. The integration of all members in a family endowed the attunement in their interrelationship with a sense of moral imperative.

Even if the traditional family can be extended to the kinship system, the family as a household still has its own peculiar boundary. On the one hand, the distinction of etiquette between relatives within and outside of a household highlights the independence of the household as a community of shared life. For example, in traditional Chinese society, the gradations of mourning obligations according to the intimacy of the kinship relation with the dead expressed the different degrees of social obligations^[34]. As Yang writes, “The closer the kinship with the dead, the greater the degree of grief required by convention. Children of the deceased were expected to weep in the most heartrending manner, eat the coarsest food, wear the roughest mourning garments, and observe mourning rules for the longest period, which was generally three years^[35]”. However, nephews or grandchildren of the dead were not obliged to obey these moral and ritual imperatives.

On the other hand, the division of the family also testifies to the boundary of the household. The division is primarily manifested as a separation between the new family and the old family in terms of livelihood; namely, separation of economic life^[36]. Even though a household participates in the exchange system between family circles, its independence as a unit is still distinct. The household exists as an economic entity, within which the interdependence between various members implies a relationship of responsibility in the sense of sharing weal and woe.

In short, the fact that one family member converted for the sake of the other demonstrates the care and concern for the suffering family member, representing a shared bearing of adversity. Individual suffering, thus, is also familial suffering. In this sense, the distinction between conversions in the situation of wà-nā and bīng-ō more explicitly refers not only to the matter of the individual but to the wellbeing of a whole family. The sharing nature and morality of the family is precisely the ethical foundation of familial conversion.

[33] Yang, *Religion in Chinese Society*, 48

[34] See *Ibid.*, 46-47.

[35] *Ibid.*, 36.

[36] See Fei, *Peasant Life in China*, 66-69.

5. Conversion Ritual and Patriarchal God

A community of shared life is an ethical ideal of the family. Even if it has played a pivotal role in the familial conversion movement among Wenzhou Christians, we find many people who have never been to church, and even question Christianity. This means that not everyone in a household is committed to Christianity as true or as a path toward salvation. However, their family members who are more enthusiastic, usually adult females, see them not as unbelievers but as lacking knowledge of the faith, and Christianity is still considered the religion of the whole family. This situation is a result not only of the ethical role of the household but also the relationship between the household and God contained in the conversion ritual. The religious role of the conversion ritual profoundly expresses the converts' understanding of God and of the conversion itself.

Kēisī and the Role of Iconoclasm

It is quite common to attribute villagers' decision to convert to the effectiveness of the healing God. Many people regard the religious experience of the miracle of being healed as a vital sign of the power of God. In Heyang, some miracle stories are prevalent. The same applies to Yantou and other nearby villages. Yandi's healing story is one example. After his conversion and mainly (as he thought) because of the prayers of his family and other Christians coming to his home, his anemia was gradually cured. I have heard this story from many people during my fieldwork, and it was in every case considered a clear demonstration of God's almighty power and the hospitality and love of the Christian community. However, the anemia described by Yandi himself became leukemia in the mouths of his daughter-in-law and others. Healing stories always become more miraculous in circulation and were an inducement for villagers to convert to Christianity.

To be sure, effectiveness has crucial implications for acceptance of a powerful God, and to some, indeed, the ineffectiveness of the Christian God was a reason for leaving and even for speaking disparagingly of Christianity. Still, the view that a miraculous event is the prerequisite of conversion is never identified with the local congregation's basic understanding of the conversion itself.

For the congregation in Qingpu, conversion is not merely a personal inner decision, but a public ritual that always precedes miraculous events. It has been common local knowledge that in order to be healed by God, one needs consistent petitionary prayers with a pure and hallowed heart, which is premised on confessing one's sins. This technology of self is a result of the recognition of self as a sinner, and the transformation of self-awareness initially takes place in the conversion ritual.

The locals call the ritual *kēisī*, which means deciding to believe in Jesus^[37]. The word *kēisī* in the dialect derives from the word *kēisí* (开始, beginning), but with a different pronunciation. The small change of one syllable connotes a practice of defamiliarization, particularizing the conversion as an occasion with a ritual boundary. It usually happens at the moment when someone desires to turn to Christianity. The ritual process generally goes like this: several churchmen or prestigious persons among the local congregation go to a family and confirm the commitment of an individual and his/her families to believing in Jesus. At the same time, the churchmen ordinarily spell out the Christian

[37] The saying of *kēisī* is only used in Heyang and is not familiar to those in other areas of Wenzhou. However, the conversion ritual itself is of no variant.

doctrines of the sinful nature of humankind, the ethical relationship between humans and God, the cunning of Satan, the falsehood of idolatry and its detrimental effects, and the efficacy of confession and prayers. In order to avoid conflicts resulting from the possibility of ineffectiveness, they clarify that the decision to convert does not necessarily bring healing and peace and that what matters is the salvation of souls and eternal hope. Even so, they still tell the family that it is easy for God to do anything they need, assuring them of God's almighty power and leaving room for human effort in terms of religious and moral imperatives. If the family makes up their mind to convert, the churchmen start a sinner's prayer, help them clean up their idols, and put a li-bai-dan (礼拜单, a paper with a red cross and a calendar) on the door or wall in the front hall, to certify that they have accepted Jesus as their God^[38]. Lastly, they pray a final blessing. In this way, a conversion ritual is completed.

The core of *kēisi* is iconoclasm. Zhang Zhongliang, an elder of Qingpu Church who has taken pastoral care of local believers since the later Cultural Revolution, told me that if a family does not first take down all idols from their household, the churchmen will not conduct a *kēisi* for them, and thus, other believers will not come to pray. This means that assistance from the congregation and effectiveness of prayer relies on the family's complete rupture with idolatry.

Two practices in the process of iconoclasm are particularly striking. The first is the activation of a diabolizing stance toward indigenous religious practices, persons, and materials, all of which are seen as the work of the devil^[39]. The diabolization can be traced back to the missionary semiotic ideology of the 19th century, although its teaching has a strong basis in the Bible, which is usually cited by local believers as God's command. The other practice is that the rejection of idols is often carried out in the form of public humiliation. The idols should not only be removed, but also be burnt or smashed in public. The devil's agency dwelling in the idols makes the public humiliation more symbolic. The practice of destroying idols is precisely a proof of the converts' sincerity of conversion and wholeheartedness toward God through the violent abandonment of those false objects they worshipped before.

This iconoclasm is not created by the local congregation; rather, it was prevalent during the missionary period^[40]. Most of the Protestant missionaries who came to China were concerned about the religious life of the Chinese, considered China an idolatrous nation, and made the salvation of the

[38] I was told that the form of Li-bai-dan became popular among the congregations after the recovery of church life in the 1980s. Before that, there was another sign of a red cross drawn on the wall representing a family's Christian identity.

[39] Because of space limitations, this article cannot dwell on the logic of diabolization of those spirits to which local people worshiped before as helpful and intimate. Simply put, it is rooted in the prevailing practice of translation of the devil and demon to Chinese mo-gui (魔鬼, monster and evil ghost) by missionaries and the experience of gui in Chinese everyday life, especially in rural areas. For a useful discussion of this issue, see Richard Burden, "Translating Spirits: Protestants, Possessions, and the Grammars of Conversion in Shandong Province," in Richard Fox Young & Jonathan A. Seitz, eds., *Aisa in the Making of Christianity: Conversion, Agency, and Indigeneity, 1600s to the Present*, (Leiden; Brill, 2013), 53-79. See also Paper, *Chinese Religion and Familism*, 44.

[40] E. g. see Gu Weimin, *Jidujiao yu zhongguo jindai shehui* [Christianity and Modern Chinese Society], (Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe [Shanghai People's Press], 2010), 51, 127 and 169-170; Chris White, *Sacred Webs: The Social Lives and Networks of Minnan Protestants, 1840-1920s*, (Leiden and Boston; Brill, 2017), 62ff. Eric Renders, "Shattered on the Rock of Ages: Western Iconoclasm and Chinese Modernity," in Fabio Rambelli & Eric Renders, *Buddhism and Iconoclasm in East Asia: A History*, (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2012), 89-133.

Chinese from idolatry the focus of their evangelical enterprise^[41]. Idol worship and faith in Jesus were completely incompatible. As Grace Stott wrote, one “could not be a disciple of Jesus and eat the rice of idols”^[42]. This revulsion in the Christian camp for the Satanic expressed a dualism between God and Satan in terms of the alteration of religious identity. Abandoning idols not only severs the believer from the traditional setting of religious life and its categories of spirits, but more importantly, undermines to a certain extent the religious bonds of social cohesiveness. The act of repudiating a long-term relationship with the spirits means amputating social obligations and offends the local moral order. This is why conflicts between indigenous Christians and villagers caused by the practice of public destruction of idols have recurred in the history of Christianity in China^[43]. Furthermore, this dualism has played a fundamental role in marking a clear boundary between the local congregation’s perception of a good life versus an evil life. A popular saying among them says this: “Once an idol comes in, the Holy Spirit does not work.” Even though acceptance of this saying varies, its use reflects that God is perceived as hating and shunning the evil. In this way, God is understood to have a more wrathful temperament directed against tangible evils such as idols and the action of idolatry. This is why idolatry has been seen as a sinful life in the past. It is not only evil but also a matter of sin, from which a good life must keep distant.

In this case, iconoclasm is the key to the conversion ritual and a prerequisite for healing and peace afterward. It means not only severance of links with the devil but also an overcoming of idolatrous and sinful habits from the past. Only in this way can a convert start praying to God. If a family does not clear out all idols in the house, the churchmen who come to *kēisī* would feel uncomfortable, fearing the anger of God upon them. The pre-existence of the conversion ritual provides us with an understanding of why the congregation never deems those who leave Christianity due to ineffectiveness as “unconverted,” but rather as “undedicated” and “unchosen;” while those who secretly harbor idols at home in the *kēisī* are “deceivers”^[44]. Churchmen always bring the behaviors of backsliding and tricks of harboring idols into Christian discourse, regarding these faults as violating the decision of conversion and practicing insincerity toward God.

An Ethical God to the Household

The point most crucial to our topic is that idols destroyed within a house during conversion rituals are always within the immediate household of those seeking to convert. The ethical boundary of a household implies its spacial boundary. The division of Chia shows not merely a kind of independence of livelihood, but the reallocation or rebuilding of the residence space. As long as there

[41] The conception that idolaters must not enter into the heaven but rather go to hell was of prevalence in missionary discourses. See Zhou Weichi, *Taipingtianguo yu qishilu* [Taiping Heavenly Kingdom and Revelation], (Beijing: Zhongguo shehui kexue chubanshe [China Social Sciences Press], 2013), 224-249, 259.

[42] Grace Stott, *Twenty-Six Years of Missionary Work in China*, (New York: American Tract Society, 1897), 33.

[43] For instance, Grace Stott recorded a violent event initiated by villagers due to a public iconoclasm around 1895 in Bing-yie, a county under jurisdiction of Wenzhou. See Stott, *Twenty-Six Years of Missionary Work in China*, 345-350.

[44] This sort of discourse reflects the local congregations’ idea of God and a subtle technology of imputation. On the base of dualistic cosmology of “God-Devil,” which is evident in the perception of a conversion ritual without iconoclasm as a cause of God’s wrath, the interpretation of the behavior of harboring idols as an act of deceiving, is to impute responsibility to the one who wants to convert and meanwhile intentionally harbors some idols, and recognize those churchmen who conduct conversion ritual and give prayers as innocent.

is one idol in a household during the *kēisi*, it must be cleared out^[45]. In this act of conversion (for the Protestant God is never like the gods of Chinese religions with their tangible images) God's ethical quality is protruded and extended to connect with the ethical community of a spacial household. In other words, the household is regarded as the carrier of God's blessing according to the members' religious and moral actions. The goodness and salvation of God as antithetical to the evil and sin of a person, in this sense, plays a crucial part in the ethical-familial community as a body, so that Jesus who is welcomed into the household becomes the spiritual patriarch or "ruler" who enables the household's harmonious everyday life. Thus, the difference between a Christian family and a family who does not believe in Jesus is the difference in the spiritual objects to whom they entrust a happy life. We can understand why, when churchmen clear away the idols in one household containing some who do not wish to convert, it could easily cause frictions. This usually happens when churchmen do not first ascertain whether a Chia is divided or not, and then directly conduct iconoclasm in a whole ancestral house where different families live together, even though they have been divided economically.

An ethical patriarchal God, therefore, is the terminus where a conversion ritual ends; a terminus who rejects all other spirits as the devil. This cultural discontinuity produced by the ritual creates a new Christian family attached to a Christian God and a community of brotherhood via the virtue of love. In particular, this transformation of religious identity substantially separates the family from the traditional, expandable religious family; mainly in the sense of distance from the diabolized living world, forming a subculture along with other Christian families in the local area.

At this point of discontinuity, we find that the ethical and responsible boundary of the household continues to be the foundation of the conversion. Two cultural phenomena can be manifestations of this. In the first instance, it is a common notion among local congregations that the sinful conduct of individual members in a family can bring misfortune to other members. Even if many people believe that misfortunes are a result of the devil's attacks—a belief inseparable from their experiences with ghosts in the past—they find it difficult to deny that, in doctrinal terms, God is more powerful than the devil. From this viewpoint, a person's misfortune cannot originate only from evil power but is also associated with the sin of an individual, who may be the person herself/himself or others in the family. The possibility of joint responsibility stems from the local conception that a person's sinful conduct removes the patriarchal God's protection of the family, thus leaving a gap for the devil to attack; in the words of the locals, it is a *pā-kau* (破口, crevasse) left by one's sinful conduct for Satan's evil action. The *pā-kau* is never applied only to an individual, but rather to a family^[46]. In this way, insistence on the doctrinal claim of a powerful God is combined with the origin of misfortune from the devil, and at the same time, this expresses the responsible relationship among families, associating one's own happiness with another's conversion and her or his religious and moral conduct. Breaking down idols in the household and urging the whole family to leave the traditional

[45] For the similar phenomenon in history, see White, *Sacred Web*, 69; Reinders, "Shattered on the Rock of Ages," 100.

[46] Apart from the family, the word is often used in prayers on occasion of Sunday worship when one publicly prays for God's presence in the congregation and for his help to block the *pā-kau* in order to protect from the Devil's attack. So, the use of this word refers to a kind of *universitas* which is comprised of many individuals as one body with its own boundary. In this sense, the church congregation is, at least formally, similar to the family, and is incorporated in the local moral order.

religious life is the first step in not giving place to the devil and establishing an ethical relationship with a loving and gracious God.

Another instance is that congregations hold the view that wishes of solicitude and blessings from the closest family members, rather than from others beyond the boundaries of the household, can affect God more, and therefore bring more effective results. The story of Lin Shufang is a case in point. She is from Yantou and converted in 1975 for her mother when she was seven years old. At the time when her family decided to believe in Jesus, some elderly churchmen who came to pray asked her to kneel too, to pray in tears to God, the Savior, for the recovery of her mother. Shufang spoke of this matter and told me:

Our believers always say that the prayers from the closest family members are best, and others are there to help you. Those servants come and pray, and they still leave when they finish. At last, you should shut the door by yourselves. This means that the responsibility remains with you.

This phenomenon has been widespread in the religious life of Christian families over the past generations. It obviously indicates a moral principle that differentiates the particular responsibility inside the family community from the outside. Even if the congregation has been seen as a new family, a community of brotherhood, the story of Shufang gives prominence to the identification of the ethical relationship between humans and God with the local ethical order. In other words, the perceived action of the Christian God, to some extent, is dominated by the traditional Chinese moral principle.

We may see from the above discussions that the conversion ritual endows the independence of the household with ethical boundaries. It is through the cultural discontinuity and the Christian diabolization of the traditional religious life and its social consequences—offending of traditional gods and villagers—brought about by this ritual, that so-called “dedicated” believers mostly lose the path back to traditional religious worship, while their blessings and misfortunes in life begin to be incorporated into the system of local Christian meanings. Furthermore, a patriarchal God implies that conversion of a family is not only meant to seek the salvation of, but more crucially, to gain blessings for the whole family^[47]. Therefore, conversion means that a family needs to direct their fate in life in a new way.

6. Conclusion

We have observed that the emotional and responsible relationships among families and the process of the conversion ritual are essential for familial conversion. The ethical-religious role of the household contributes to its emergence. It is these multi-familial conversions that have produced such a large conversion movement in Wenzhou after 1949. Here, what is essential in the familial conversion is not merely the value of individual salvation, but the fact that through the religious

[47] See also Huang, “Sirentang” jishi [The Story of “Si Ren Tang”], 55.

conversion of the whole family, this community of shared life can be kept under the safeguard of a patriarchal God.

Although this article only deals with one case in the Heyang area of Wenzhou, the phenomenon of familial conversion is very common in the whole city^[48]. I should emphasize that my aim here has not been to explain why the mass conversion of Wenzhou Christians happened after the establishment of the Communist Regime, which would be a huge project involving a much broader historical context and its changes. My aim is only to discuss the way in which the mass conversion took place. The reason for the importance of this preliminary study lies in its efforts to reveal the complexity of Chinese conversion events, a complexity that is usually ignored by the two most widely accepted views.

First, many researchers think that the end of the Cultural Revolution led to a particular historical period favorable for the development of Christianity in rural China^[49]. This widespread view not only ignores the fact that the number of Christians in specific regions actually grew rapidly between 1949 and 1978, but also obscures the continuity and stability of local cultural history by a dominant epochal division based on a macro-political and economic discourse. Actually, the dynamics of conversion did not vary with the changes or concurrent conditions of epochs. The repeating model of familial conversion spans two divided periods of the first three decades (1949-1978) and the remaining four decades (post-1978) and even extends to the time before 1949. It is rooted in the order of the traditional Chinese family whose value was and is still a dominant power in the local society, even though the structure of clan with its significance in social organization has been in decline since the time of the New Culture Movement.

Another view, the individual conversion theory, sees only the pragmatic attitude of the Chinese people toward their life, but overlooks the significance of the collectivism of the family. This article hopes to point out that in order to understand individual conversion of Christians in China in the past century, it is first necessary to observe and analyze conversion within the context of the family as a community. Familial conversion does not primarily seek the individual religious experience and salvation that missionaries valued in their emphasis on the sincerity of conversion, and even lacks the transformative power that Christian moral individualism could bring to the society^[50]. In contrast, the Christian family forged by familial conversion is concerned with, above all, happiness in their worldly life and how to adapt themselves to traditional moral principles. The primary pursuit in Christian life practices is that God may give blessings and love in return for compliance with religious and moral imperatives, which are related to the discourse of sin. Here, individual conversion, which is mainly represented by the problem of unbelief of individual members within a Christian family and recurs in the discourse of “rebirth,” is better understood as a re-conversion within the context of

[48] For similar phenomenon in other region of China, see *ibid.*, 59, 69-70.

[49] See Leung Ka-lun, *Gaige kaifang yilai de zhongguo nongcun jiaohui* [*The Rural Churches of Mainland China Since 1978*], 23, 29-30, 110, 198-201; Ouyang Sutong, *Zhuanxing shiyexia de zhongguo nongcun zongjiao* [*Rural Religions in the Transformation of China*], (Beijing: Zhongguo shehui kexue chubanshe, 2009), 221-222.

[50] Peter van Rooden, “Nineteenth-Century Representations of Missionary Conversion and the Transformation of Western Christianity,” in Peter van der Veer, ed., *Conversion to Modernities: The Globalization of Christianity*, (New York: Routledge, 1996), 69; Webb Keane, *Christian Moderns: Freedom and Fetish in the Mission Encounter*, (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2007), 149.

that familial conversion.

It is clear from the above reflections that the familial aspect of conversion is the key to understanding the mass conversion of Wenzhou Christians. We can see that the family, rather than the individual, is the unavoidable ethical and even existential factor by which we may better grasp the indigenous development of Christianity in China. I believe that only when we comprehend the family and its powerful and nuanced history and values within Chinese society will we come to understand the meaning of Christianity to Chinese people and their practices of faith.

中文题目:

家庭归信: 户在温州基督徒大众归信中的伦理-宗教角色的个案研究

张杰克

香港中文大学神道学硕士

地址: 中国浙江省温州市龙湾区永中街道罗东北街 31 号

电话: 13588448728

电邮: hmugu2005@gmail.com

摘 要: 学界一般将中国的基督教热视为文革后的现象, 然而温州基督徒的大众归信可追溯至文革结束之前。家庭归信是温州基督徒 1949 年后大众归信之所以可能的关键因素; 是一个个的家庭归信积累成了大众归信的浪潮。本文通过对温州河阳地区的青浦教会群体的田野调查与个案分析, 试图揭示温州基督徒的家庭归信模式, 也就是以户为单位、而非以个人为单位的归信, 是我们理解温州基督徒的归信时需要留意的重要现象。本文认为, 正是家人间的情感与责任关系所塑造的家庭的同一性, 以及地方基督教的归信仪式, 共同构成了户的伦理-宗教角色, 并且推动了家庭归信的出现。这项初步的研究, 试图引发我们更多关注家庭这一中国社会中在伦理上与生存论上相当根本的文化因素; 家庭, 是我们理解基督教在中国的本土化发展不可避免的。

关键词: 家庭归信, 大众归信, 基督教家庭, 归信仪式, 破除偶像

Culture Reproduction or Value Conflict?

The Morally Fraught Experience of Chinese Christians in Virtual Communities

Yan LIU

(The Catholic University of America, 20064, Washington D. C. ,US)

Abstract: Based on Robbins' understanding that both Durkheimian and Weberian approaches could help the study of social morality, this paper explores the dynamics of cultural reproduction and value conflicts in Chinese Christians' communication on the WeChat platform. It evaluates ten religious WeChat groups' norms and activities and categorizes them into four typologies according to their group inclusiveness and interactivity. It collects group chats from the WeChat platform and reveals the forming dynamics of group verbal abuse, and further explores the Chinese Christians' morally fraught experience in the virtual communities. This research shows that Christian values as an external force encourage Christians to fulfill their gospel mission and seek their group identity. Christians exhibit their discursive power through group norms and group behaviors. Cultural authoritarianism and religious fundamentalism are the ideological factors that underline the exclusive group behaviors of the Christian virtual communities. The contradiction between exclusive and inclusive group cultures reflects the incompatibility between Chinese authoritarian tradition and the call for a more open society. Under the current social structure and cultural environment, particularistic ethics and exclusive practices would still be dominant in Chinese Christian virtual communities for a comparatively long time.

Key Words: Inclusiveness; Interactivity; Morality; Verbal Abuse; WeChat Group

Author: Yan LIU, School of Theology and Religious Studies, The Catholic University of America, 20064, Washington DC, US; tel: +1-2403706015; email: 75liu@cua.edu

There has long been a dispute between the two typical paradigms of the study of morality. The first is the Durkheimian approach, which sees culture or collective life as morally charged and considers all routines or normative social actions as moral and reproductive. The other approach, as Laidlaw explained, when taking freedom and choice as essential criteria of the moral domain, not everything people do would be considered as a moral activity; in contrast, it is the reflective choice and decision making rather than the reproduction of the social practice that makes room for moral existence and development.^[1] Robbins argues that, in different contexts, both approaches are helpful. He quotes Dumont's hierarchical value model saying that different values rank in a pyramid of values, with the paramount value at the top and the less important values at the bottom. Through the internal exchange of values within the hierarchical value structure, cultural reproduction achieves

[1] Joel Robbins. "Between Reproduction and Freedom: Morality, Value, and Radical Cultural Change." *Ethnos* 72, no. 3 (September 1, 2007): 293-314.

harmony. Robbins contrasts this model with Weber's model, in which different values conflict with each other without reconciliation. For Weber, value is like a black or white choice that cannot compromise. It is under these circumstances that the person comes to see the self as a decision-maker and moral agency with free will.

Based on the interpretation of Dumont and Weber's models, Robbins makes a typological distinction between "stable conflicts that are an enduring part of the culture and those conflicts that arise as a result of change."^[2] Moral changes occur when the places of different values in the hierarchy change or exchange, or, in other cases, new values from outside the culture system come in and replace the old ones. To explain the dynamics of culture change, Robbins goes into the details of a single ethnographic case of the Urapmin of Papua New Guinea. The Urapmin is a group with around 390 people. They converted to charismatic Christianity in the late 1970s. The traditional Urapmin society values relationalism as a bond of the interdependence of livelihood and interest distribution. After the Urapmin society accepted the Christian value of individualism, they tended to view the seeking of new relationships as a sin. The conflict between traditional and Christian values makes their existence morally fraught. Their way of social production and structure remained the same, whereas their value system turned upside down. Therefore, the Dumont version of the hierarchical model of moral value would not work in them. In contrast, the Weberian conflict value model explains the tension and anxiety in their social life. Robbins considers that there could be no equilibrium of values reached within the Urapmin society until the social structure and the way of production could finally get in line with Christian individualism.

Data and Methodology

To test Robbin's unbalanced games of values in the Chinese context, the author observed more than 20 Christian WeChat groups for three years. This research examined ten groups with steady group members and interactive frequencies. Membership in these groups ranged from 50 to 500. There are about 2800 people involved in these ten groups in total. The group leaders of the ten groups are Christians of different theological traditions. Four of the group leaders are Catholics, and six of them are Protestants. Some of the group leaders are conservative, and some are more liberal-minded. The faith backgrounds of these group members are mixed. Some of the groups welcome members of different faiths, and some are not open to people of certain religions. Among the ten WeChat religious groups observed, nine of them fall into theological or cultural debates from time to time. Still, only two of these groups encounter disputes with abusive language repeatedly.

According to Habermas, a valid social norm and a noncoercive intersubjective commonality are the characteristics of a healthy society. In an ideal society, people will treat others' humanity never as a means but as an end. The members of a community establish moral norms through interaction and put one another under moral obligations. They perceive the others "as members of an inclusive community no person is excluded from."^[3] Based on Habermas' model of an ideal society, this paper

[2] Ibid.

[3] Jürgen Habermas. *The Future of Human Nature* Cambridge, England: Polity, 2003. p. 56

adopts inclusivity and intersubjectivity as the two variables to evaluate the moral status of virtual Christian communities. It uses the method of content analysis to assess group notices and chats collected from the WeChat groups. The author also calculated the frequency of interactivity of these groups on a daily or weekly basis and discussed with some Christian group members about their value outlook and their understanding of the possible moral change in Chinese society.

Based on the observation of the ten Christian virtual communities on the WeChat platform, the author argues that Robbins's conclusion can help understand the present conflict of values in the Chinese context. Both Durkheimian and Weberian approaches could explain part of the change of social morality in China, while the equilibrium of values can hardly be achieved among Christians when China's social structure and the way of social production remain the same. With the development of modern technology, Christians preach the gospel on social media and encounter religious others in virtual religious communities. Christians' attitude toward religious others tests the Christian teaching of universal principles under one God and the freedom of religious belief. During this process, Christians in virtual religious communities inevitably encounter morally fraught experiences when inconsistent rules and values are applied to the rights of Christian groups and religious others. Also, Christians with different theological traditions may face hostility and attacks from each other, and they may face the choices of tolerating or excluding the religious others. Though they may feel like retreating from the real or virtual society, their sense of the Gospel mission still encourages them to act out Christian values as universal care for human beings and respond to the religious others in equal terms. They work as the agency of Christian morality in Chinese society and bring about possible moral changes in the future.

Norm, Inclusiveness, & Interactivity

In the little society of the WeChat groups, the group notices usually express the group leader's understanding of desirable social order and norms, and the rules of a group serve as the guidance of group members' behavior. An exclusive announcement will usually encourage antagonism against other social groups, while an inclusive rule often ushers in kindness, respect, and trust among people. Many WeChat virtual groups are established to exchange faith-related information as well as to evangelize the unbelievers. For example, Father Jia^[4] is the leader of the group "The Courses of Religious Culture and Classics." He attended a Protestant Theology school about 20 years ago and later became a Catholic Church priest. He had many years of experience working with Christians of different faith backgrounds. Tired of the conflicts among churches and church followers, he gave up his official position in a church and began to run his own business and sell snacks. Father Jia knows well the advantages and disadvantages of different religions and theologies, and he never forgets his mission to call for the unity of the Christian churches. He has been giving a series of lectures on religions since the founding of his WeChat group. His group announcement says:

[4] This paper replaced the real names of the people in this research with their initials or pseudonyms for the protection of their privacy.

This group focuses on sharing religious classics and explaining Western philosophy of God, Confucianism, Buddhism, and Taoism. You can share in the group two links or pictures per day, and the content shared shall be relevant to the topics of religion and philosophy. I hope that you could respect and tolerate each other. Personal attacks, obscene words, commercial advertising, political announcements, and forced conversion are not allowed in this group.

Another group named “Olive Spring” is established by a woman in Hongkong. Her hometown is in mainland China, and her husband is a priest in Hongkong. She invited Christians of different traditions into her group. The group announcement warmly invites the seekers to join the online Bible study. Later, with the help of another young man serving in a Catholic church in Dalian, she updated her group announcement and clarified that her group should conform to reach the unity of the Catholics and Christians in Jesus Christ.

Holding the Holy Bible as the common ground for group discussion seemed to be a consensus among group leaders of different traditions. A group named “Church and Holy Trinity” hosted by a British-born Chinese Catholic follower posted some Bible verses as their group notice. By quoting Timothy 2: 15-16, it suggests the group member should avoid profane and vain talk. By quoting Romans 14 : 3, it warns the group members not to judge others, for it is God who makes the final judgment; and by quoting Timothy 2: 23-25, it asks the group member to be gentle and patient with others, and to instruct those who oppose themselves in humility. One cannot tell if it is a Catholic or Protestant Group only by reading the group notice.

Another group named “Love Each Other in Christ” also expresses similar stances and concerns. Its group announcement says: “Welcome home; don’t rush to leave. You are welcome to participate in our Bible discussion. Regardless of gender, race, ethnicity, party, sects, or church, we are in the home of God. As long as we are in the Triune God, we shall unite to fight against the anti-Christ, and prepare for the kingdom of God.” Most groups make it clear that the group leader and administrator can remove the member from the group, while the leader of a WeChat group named “Everyone talks” claims that the group leader will not exclude anyone from the group. The group notice says that “the group welcomes all friends who are not anti-Christian and can chat rationally. You can share what you think, and if you don’t like the values treasured here, you can choose to leave. God gives everyone the right to speech. The group owner and the administrator should not kick anyone out of the group.”

There is a Bible study group named “Good news English learning.” The group leader is a Christian scholar who has published many books on different religious traditions. According to the announcement of the group, the purpose of this group is to read the Holy Bible (English Standard Edition, ESV) together with the group members and to guide Bible study. A teacher will read the Bible verses in English with voice messages in the WeChat group on weekdays and then interpret the Bible in Chinese. This 15-minute Bible reading guidance has started every morning since 2018, and a group of seven teachers takes turns to serve the group and lead the reading. With their efforts, more and more young people joined them for the English Bible study, and many formed many 500-persons WeChat groups. According to the rules of this group: “It is not allowed to bring any topic other than

the Bible verses to the group chat (including advertisements, articles, pictures, and comments). The managers of the group would remove anyone violating the rules.” Another Chinese Christian scholar who owns a WeChat public account also established similar rules for his WeChat group “Cypress Discussion.” His group rules encourage discussion and critics of content released on the group leaders’ WeChat public account, but it forbids information irrelevant to the group leaders’ articles. The group announcement encourages mutual respect and trust among the readers. Those who violate the rules will be removed from the group.

The “Justice Academy” is a reading group that focuses on the Bible’s truth, the redemption of Christ on the Cross, and Christian homeschooling. The host of this group is a Christian freelance writer who published his book of politics and law comments. On the one hand, this group holds the principle of “Sola Scriptura” and tries to establish the Holy Bible as the source of norms for the group members; on the other hand, this group hopes to bridge the differences between different Christian churches with the Word as the common foundation for discussion. They also tried to keep a distance from sensitive political topics. According to the group announcement, this group is a strictly closed community:

The group discussion shall be rooted in the Holy Bible and avoid the comments on different churches. For the unity of the Christian Church in truth and the Holy Spirit, any critics of churches shall only quote the Holy Bible; any non-biblical references are not allowed. Those who violate this rule shall leave the group voluntarily once and for all.

Rachel is a student in a Protestant theology school in mainland China. She sets up a WeChat group to share the Bible and the experience of God. According to the group announcement:

This group is for people who have visions for God’s kingdom or have served the church for many years. New believers, atheists, and seekers might not be suitable for this group. Please try to respect and love each other during the group discussion. Those who use vulgar words, quarrels, or curses will be moved without notice. This group is not open to Muslim friends at present, but if there are Muslim friends around you, please pray for them.

A group named the “Holy Family” is one of the most representative cases of group exclusiveness. The group leader is a university teacher in Guangzhou; he used to be a Protestant church follower. After converting to Catholicism, the group leader became a hard-core defender of the Catholic faith. To convert more Protestants to Catholicism, he keeps inviting people from Protestant WeChat groups to his group. He identifies his group as a conservative Catholic group that embraces traditionalism, and he released a group announcement saying:

This group is open to those interested in the Catholic Church’s truth, especially those who are well-educated. This group does not welcome those who are hostile to

Catholicism and those who advocate faith and ethical teaching opposite to the Catholic church. Any Protestant links and Protestant terms are strictly prohibited. Anyone who ignores this alert will be removed swiftly.

To find out the factors that might have contributed to different group cultures, this paper compares the theological and social backgrounds of these WeChat groups. The ten groups are categorized into four types according to the degree of group exclusiveness and interactivity (See Table 1). Type A includes group 1 and 2, type B (group 3 to 5), type C (group 6 to 8), and type D (group 9 and 10).

Table 1 Inclusiveness and Interactivity of Different WeChat Groups

	Type	Group Name	Tradition	Identity	Inclusiveness	Interactivity	Excludes those who
1	A	Religious Classics study	Comprehensive	Former priest	Very High	High	Break the group rules
2		Olive Spring	Catholic	Pastor assistant	High	High	Break the group rules
3	B	HolyTrinity	Catholic	Student	High	High	Act or speak rudely
4		Everyone talks	Protestant	Staff	Very high	Median	None
5		Love in Christ	Protestant	Freelancer	Very high	Median	None
6	C	English Bible Study	Protestant	Professor	High	Low	Group theme, group leader's authority, the rules of the group
7		Cypress Discussion	Protestant	Professor	High	Low	
8		Justice Academy	Protestant	Freelance Scholar	Median	Median	
9	D	Rachel's Friend share	Protestant	Student	Low	High	Faith, idea, value
10		TheHoly Family	Catholic	University teacher	Very Low	Very high	Church affiliation

Type A. Inter-religious, High Inclusiveness & Interactivity

Type A groups are the most inclusive among the ten groups, and the interactivity of the groups is very high. The number of people in these two groups is 180 and 330, respectively, and there are usually 10 to 20 of them actively involved in everyday group Chat. Christians of different traditions, Muslims, Buddhists, and Taoist followers share their faith traditions on the WeChat platform. Only religious extremists or fundamentalists will be removed from the group. The leaders of the two groups are in their 40s or 50s. They belong to the middle-lower or lower class of the society, and they do not have as much access to various social resources as those who work with the government or work as public officials. They have access to different religious institutions, and they have many years

of experience serving in churches and getting along with people of other faiths. They know the sin of human beings, and they are ready to love those sinners in their everyday lives.

Type B. Interdenominational, High Inclusiveness & Interactivity

The leaders of group type II have some formal or informal experiences of theological training. The number of people in these two groups is between 70 to 180. They are in their 20s or 30s, and they are representative of the younger generation of Christians with a strong sense of Gospel mission. They do not set up strict rules for the group, and their group notices are inclusive and inviting to people of different faiths. When some newcomers talk rudely, the group leaders usually don't know how to respond since it is not written in their group notice that they could remove those aggressive newcomers from the group chat. The frequent speakers in their group are not always the same active ones. With the changing of topics, different people will initiate or respond to conversations.

Type C. Scholarly, Formatively High Inclusiveness & Low Interactivity

Groups six to eight are hosted by scholars age between 45 to 60. They all have their own publications, and the number of people in their groups ranges from 350 to 500. The group leaders released more than 80 percent of the total contents in the WeChat group. Though the group norm welcomes people of different backgrounds to join them, only very few people talk in the group chat. The content shared in these groups is highly focused on the designated topics and themes; different theological or social ideas are usually discouraged or criticized. Those who talk about unrelated matters or inappropriate topics will be swiftly removed. Although the numbers of people in these groups are big, the interactivity of these three is pretty low compared to other groups.

Type D. Single Tradition, High Exclusiveness & High Interactivity

The hosts of Group No. 9 and No. 10 are theologically fundamentalists, and they are in their 20s or 30s. Both of them are exclusive to some specific traditions and social groups. There are about 70 people in the protestant group (No. 9) and about 450 people in the Catholic group (No. 10). Both groups' interactive frequency is pretty high, and people in these two groups are highly like-minded. Once there are different ideas and opinions, many group members would stand out to refute them. Therefore, the higher interactive frequency in these two groups does not mean a higher chance for different thoughts to be communicated. The messages repeated most frequently in the group are the ideas and thoughts allied with the group leaders.

From the above-listed facts about the ten different groups, we see that both the most inclusive and exclusive groups enjoy high interactivity. The groups with inclusive norms encourage religious others to join them, and their interactions are between individuals of different faith communities. They encourage followers of different religions to listen to each other and be open to the various interpretations of the Holy Bible. In contrast, the group with exclusive norms blocked different ideas from the very beginning. The group leader's all-or-none thinking resonated with the group members, and very soon, only one stance will take over in the group discussion.

In summary, group Type A is the most inclusive and interactive type. They usually have a Catholic background, and they have a sense of responsibility to promote the unity of different faith groups. Both the two type A groups put great emphasis on social norms. Type B could be either Catholic or Protestant traditions, and the leaders are inclusive of different faith traditions. Their

group notices express a willingness to understand others, but they do not have a clear norm for group management. Elites, professors, or writers are the leader of the type C group. They welcome listeners to their groups, but they do not welcome topics and ideas irrelevant to their concerns. Type D are the youngest groups, they have a strong identification with a particular tradition, and they are exclusive to other religions or denominations. (See table Two)

Table 2 Typologies of Different Groups

Type	Tradition	Social Class	Inclusiveness	Interactivity	Management Style	Group Members
A	Catholic	Middle or Lower	High	High	Representative Democracy	490
B	Catholic or Protestant	Middle or lower	Median	High	Democratic	500
C	Protestant	Elite, middle class	Median	Low	Authoritarian	1200
D	Catholic or Protestant	Middle or lower	Low	High	Totalitarian	600

Given Habermas' principles of inclusiveness and interactivity, group type A exhibits positive and normative characteristics. This type of group culture could possibly cultivate the moral progress of society. However, considering the limited social status and resources of the group leaders and members, their influence on society as a whole could still be limited. Anyway, they belong to the marginal social groups of the middle-class Chinese. Groups type B readily express their respect for people as a moral choice, but they do not have a good sense of normative management. When inappropriate behaviors or words appear in their groups, they do not have adequate measures to bind those group members. The leaders demonstrate a friendly attitude toward religious others, but they are not effective in promoting group morality as a whole. The elites-led group type C has good access to various social resources, but once the elites become an authority in some field, their authoritarian impulses will take over. There could also be less room for moral progress in their group because what they had demonstrated to the group members is similar to any other authoritarian social group. Group type D, the fundamentalist faith groups, could hardly bring the morality of mutual respect and love into the virtual community.

If interpreting the characteristics of the four types of groups with political terms, representative democracy, democratic, authoritarian, and totalitarian politics could be their analogies, respectively. In group type A, there are representatives from different religions to help with the group's management, and the representatives can implement the group rules independently without the group leader's consent. In group type B, the democratic group fully respects the group members' free speech rights, but the group rules are not binding enough to the group members. When abusive or offensive statements appear in the group chat, the group leader has no way to counter them. In group type C, all the members fully respect the group leader's opinions. They are attentive listeners of the group leader and follow the group leader's direction in every way. In group type D, the group leader has a strong will to power, and he decides to keep or remove people from his group, and he motivated the group to fight along with him against the dissidents. As for the group's size, 990 people joined the

more liberal groups (type A and B), and 1800 people rallied in the more authoritarian group (type C and D).

Group Discourse and Group Culture

The next part of this paper introduces some typical scenarios in Group No. 1 and Group No. 10, respectively, and explains how group norms shape the inclusive and exclusive culture group culture. Usually, the group leader is the key to the forming of the group rules and group culture. A more inclusive group leader will forbid the use of abusive language in group discussions and maintain a pleasant atmosphere in the group chat. On the contrary, an exclusive group leader may encourage offensive language among people of different faith traditions, and (s)he may be the one who takes the lead to launch an attack on others.

Since the establishment of group No. 1, “Religious Classics Study,” the Catholic and Protestant Christians have been criticizing each other’s church doctrines, Bible translations, and traditions. The group leader, Father Jia, always encouraged both sides to express their understandings rationally. He explained to both sides the historical and contextual reasons for the differences between Catholicism and Protestantism. Mr. Yi, the group leader of group No. 10, “Holy Family,” was an active speaker in Father Jia’s group. He time and again called Martin Luther a wicked apostate who had intentionally split the church and condemned Protestantism as a heresy. Feeling harassed deeply by the talks of Mr. Yi, a Protestant Ms. Bin in Father Jia’s group volunteered to serve as the group manager, and she won the support of Father Jia. Whenever Mr. Yi disparaged Protestantism, Ms. Bin would remind him about the group rules that no one shall force others to believe or to convert. Soon after that, a Catholic, Ms. Ding, volunteered to be the group manager on behalf of the Catholics. She got Father Jia’s support too, and she posts information about Catholicism in the group daily. The followers of the Orthodox Church, Islam, and Buddhism in the group also readily share the links of articles about their traditions. Father Jia used either text or voice messages to communicate in the group, and the group members gradually formed a consensus that people of different faith traditions shall respect each other and love each other. Exclusivists like Mr. Yi were usually criticized by the group members when he tried to make fun of the Protestant followers. Finally, one day, Ms. Bin removed Yi from Father Jia’s group.

In contrast, the atmosphere in Mr. Yi’s group is entirely different. In Yi’s WeChat groups, disputes among followers of various faith traditions usually result in verbal abuse. Evans defined verbal abuse as words that attack or injure and words or attitudes that “disempower, disrespect, or devalue the other.”^[5] Evans sorted the ways of verbal abuse into five levels: 1. denial and avoidance; 2. Angry addiction and name-calling; 3. Orders, threats, and intimidation; 4. Undermining attacks; 5. Withholding. All these levels of verbal abusive frequently appear in Yi’s WeChat groups.

Denial is one of the most commonly used methods to trivialize and discount religious others. In Yi’s group, the Catholics express their pride over the Catholic apostolic tradition, and they deny the

[5] Patricia Evans, *The Verbally Abusive Relationship: How to Recognize It and How to Respond* Updated ed. Avon, Mass.: Adams Media, 2010.

Protestant Church as a church. They deride the music and ritual of Protestant churches as rustic, and they think that the Protestant Bible is full of mistakes.

Name-calling and abusive anger are what people usually encounter in some of the extremist religious groups. Some people enjoy calling other religious traditions by insulting names or express their anger to religious others. For example, in Chinese, the academic term for Protestantism is Xin Jiao (新教), which literally means “the New Religion.” This translation is to differentiate Protestantism from the old Roman Catholic tradition. However, in Yi’s WeChat group, the Catholics only call the Protestantism “Shifan Jiao” (誓反教), which suggests that Protestants are those who swear or defy death to fight against the Roman Catholics. Some of them claim that the Protestants do not deserve to be called Christians, for they are the Catholics’ heresies. As Boyarin discussed, an injurious name derogates and demeans the other party. It also brings the other party into a menial existence; thus, it could arouse counter offense action. [6]

Order and threaten are also commonly found in Yi’s WeChat group chat. Yi keeps a close eye on the content of the conversation in his group. Once a Protestant term appears in group chat, he would immediately warn them and threaten to remove them from the group. In his group, everyone is supposed to use the terms in the Studium Catholic Biblicum, which is the only Chinese Catholic Bible officially recognized by the Vatican. The Studium Bible was translated to Chinese from the Hebrew and Greek Bible, and the Union Christian Bible was translated to Chinese from the English Bible. Therefore, the transliteration of proper names in the two Bibles is quite different in Chinese. For example, in the Chinese Protestant Bible, “God” is translated as “Shang di” (上帝 the Supreme King) or “Shen” (神 the Deity), and Abraham as Yabolahan (亚伯拉罕). In the Chinese Catholic Bible, “God” is translated as “Tian Zhu” (天主 The Lord of Heaven), and Abraham as Yabalang (亚巴郎). In Yi’s group, anyone who uses the term “Shangdi” or “Yabolahan” will be warned and threatened to be removed. Yi would tirelessly remind the group newcomers about the taboos and ask them to follow the translation of the Studium Bible. Whenever Yi warn the newcomers, many group members would rally with Yi and express their contempt for the Protestant Bible. Many Protestants questioned this rule, while Yi insisted that there is no other way to keep the purity of the Catholic discourse. One of the Protestants criticized Yi’s rule, saying that “the Protestants hold the Sola Scriptura, and your group of Catholics hold Sola Studium Bible. Ironically, you narrow the teaching of the holy catholic church into the translation of the Chinese Studium Bible.” As Michael Signer suggested, followers of different religious traditions need to understand that language is used symbolically. The vision toward the absolute truth goes beyond what terms and names seem to be, “Therefore, a coincident logic requires elevating the intellect above the force of words rather than insisting that they possess only one-dimensional meaning.” [7]

In Yi’s group, disputes also arise in the form of mutual criticizing. One side usually accuses the other side of immoral motivation and of distorting the nature of things. Yi considers that most group

[6] Boyarin, Daniel. *Border Lines : the Partition of Judaeo-Christianity* Philadelphia, Pa: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004. p. 9.

[7] Michael A. Signer. “‘Seeing the Sounds’”: Intellectual Humility and the Process of Dialogue. Firestone, Reuven, James. Heft, and Omid Safi. *Learned Ignorance: Intellectual Humility Among Jews, Christians, and Muslims*. New York, N. Y: Oxford University Press, 2011. p. 58.

members are not well-educated; they cannot distinguish the right teachings from the wrong ones. Therefore, whenever Yi gets a chance to criticize Protestantism, he will always repeat the importance of excluding Protestant terms, concepts, historical figures, and teachings to prevent the group members from being captured by false ideas. Yi's assertions arouse discontent among the Protestants in the group from time to time, and they criticized the historical mistakes and the teachings of the Catholic Church in return. Thus, the debates between Catholics and Protestants never reach a consensus due to the gap between different traditions and individuals' understanding. As time passes by, the anti-Protestant voice dominant Yi's group. Evans listed withholding as the highest level of abuse and explained that some religious groups withhold from others as a form of shunning to punish those who don't conform.^[8] Cyber technology makes the measure of withholding very easy. The group leader and group manager just need a click on the screen to remove people from the group conversation. This way of social-emotional deprivation could create depression, anxiety, and other symptoms in the abused party.

Evans considered that both verbal and physical abuse cases are the abusers' control tactics or a means of holding power over others. They act indifferent to others' feelings and views and are inexpressive of warmth and empathy to others. Most importantly, they tend to control and manipulate. Through accusing dissidents, the accuser accumulates their moral authority and gains status in front of the witness by showing discursive power over others.^[9] When the community members follow the opinion leaders to assault dissidents, abusive group behavior became a tool to confirm one's theological understanding and group identity. As Boyarin discussed, the discourse of religious orthodoxy as an independent category of human identification may not serve the interests of certain economic class, "but they do serve in the production of ideology, of hegemony, the consent of a dominated group to be ruled by an elite."^[10] Charles Tilly explained a similar mechanism in violent rituals. He used the example of a ritual before the football game as an extreme case of activating boundaries and excluding the others, which "incorporate all the relevant actors and social sites into a single connected set of performances."^[11] Among virtual religious communities, the process of group debate and casting out of different ideas, languages, and religious others exhibit a similar mechanism suggested by Tilly. First, they differentiate the boundary between "them and us" by those symbols and further clarify within-boundary and cross-boundary interactions. Next, they push the uncommitted or moderate actors toward one or the other extreme. If the newcomers do not abide by the group rules, they take the risks of being cast out of the group and may allegedly lose their tickets to heaven. In these groups, the abuser reinforced these stances with the competitive display of continuous signals. By correcting terms and translations different from the Studium Bible, they get to unify their identity as Catholics. Finally, they monitor constant surveillance over the virtual

[8] Patricia Evans. *The Verbally Abusive Relationship: How to Recognize It and How to Respond* Updated ed. Avon, Mass.: Adams Media, 2010.

[9] Qing Li, Donna Cross, Peter K. Smith (Eds.) *Cyberbullying in the global playground: research from international perspectives*. Wiley-Blackwell, 2012. p. 8

[10] Daniel Boyarin. *Border Lines: the Partition of Judaeo-Christianity* Philadelphia, Pa.: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004. p. 27

[11] Charles Tilly. *The Politics of Collective Violence* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003. Chapter 4.

community's discussion and eventually nullify the Protestants. The abusers justify their actions with religious reasons like maintaining the community's purity and preventing ignorant followers from being cheated by heresies. In the name of justice, absolute truth, or solemn purpose, they load their narratives with exclusivity, hostility, and hatred. As Moyaert explained, by strengthening the other's negative image, the internal division could be covered. "The more others are othered, through exclusion and marginalization, the more one's own identity is preserved as elevated and exalted."^[12]

Girard's interpretation of the scapegoat also helps to understand the abusive culture of religious groups.^[13] The act of searching for scapegoats serves as a protection of the religious community. When the outsider is cast out, the harmony of the community resumes, and the social fabrics are reinforced. The newcomers of a social media group usually lack a social link with other members of the community. Thus the old group members are easily assembled to expel the dissidents with harsh words without fear of reprisal. Especially when the outsiders are cast out from the virtual community, the outsiders do not automatically stand a chance to take revenge. As Girard put it, "the whole of human culture is based on the mythic process of conjuring away man's violence by endlessly projecting it upon new victims. All cultures and all religions are built on this foundation."^[14] The Chinese culture and Chinese Christians are no exceptions, as the examples of exclusive group behavior in this research showed.

Group Culture & the Individual Moral Choice

One interesting thing about the religious WeChat community is that many people join different WeChat groups simultaneously. Among the ten WeChat groups in this research, some people could belong to four or five of the groups. Many people are group members of both groups No. 1 and No. 10. Some of them could be very active in one group but keep silent in another group. To investigate the factors that influence individuals' moral choices on the WeChat platform, I asked some group members about their understanding of different group cultures.

Mr. Wu is one of the active speakers in both groups. The first time I talked to him was about two years ago when he was standing as an ally with Mr. Yi in the "Holy Family" WeChat group. When I shared some of Augustine's writings in this group, Mr. Wu commented that what I shared smelt like a foxtail of Protestantism. However, just two months later, when I saw him again in the "The Religious Classics" group, he criticized the moral defects of both Catholic and Protestant churches. He even claimed himself an advocator of the ecumenical movement and said:

The disputes between the Catholics and Protestants are not doctrinal problems but rather the issue of human sin. Some Protestant and Catholic churches were corrupted. They turned the churches into a family business. I know a Catholic who indulged in alcoholism, gambling, and prostitution, though five members in his family are priests. After seeing those, I decided to become a Protestant.

[12] Marianne Moyaert. "Making Space for the Other: From Religious Ideology to Narrative Hospitality." Polyakov, Emma'Donnell. *Antisemitism, Islamophobia, and Interreligious Hermeneutics: Ways of Seeing the Religious Other*. Leiden, Brill/Rodopi, 2019, p. 39

[13] Girard, Rene, and James G. Williams. *The Girard Reader* New York: Crossroad, 1996, p. 118

[14] Girard, Rene, and James G. Williams. *The Girard Reader* New York: Crossroad, 1996, p. 162

Later, when I saw the evils done by Protestants, I converted to Catholicism. Both Catholics and Protestants criticized the government. However, they could not allow any criticism within the church. They are another partisan organization. Once they come to power, they might be worse than the present party.

I was surprised to see this sudden shift in Wu's position. I was wondering what provoked his change from a conservative Catholic to an ecumenical advocator. To find the answer, I talked to Mr. Wu via WeChat in private. I asked Wu if it because of Father Jia and his WeChat group that brought him different perspectives. Mr. Wu said:

Father Jia is not the only reason. I also have to thank a sister who taught me a method of spiritual practice. Under the present social circumstances, Christians are polarized, being radical liberal or fundamentalist. Those who truly adhere to justice may face enormous suffering in the soul. I'm not working in my name but inspired by the Holy Spirit to do the work.

Actually, in the past several months, I saw that Mr. Wu has been working hard to promote mutual understanding between different WeChat groups of different faith traditions. When I asked about his view on Mr. Yi's group, he said:

To groups like this, you can choose to leave or escape. The Persian Empire, the Babylonian Empire, and Egypt were all like Sodom and judged by God. Lot decided to leave the city of Sodom. In today's China, God's purpose is to let the righteous people to "escape." It was a struggle to refuse the evil and promote the good.

Wu seemed to suggest that there is no point in arguing in the WeChat group, for you can never change people's minds if they have made their decision. He used, again and again, the story of Lot's wife, who looked back to Sodom and was turned into a salt pillar, to explain that there is no hope for Chinese culture to change. Wu explained that people are obsessed with inviting disputes in the WeChat groups, and there is no difference between them and Lot's wife.

Chinese Christian intellectuals hope that the gospel could change China. In the WeChat group chat, two of the most frequently mentioned topics are "only God can change China" or "God will let this land be destroyed." When I asked Wu's opinion on the possibility of moral change in Chinese society, he was still pessimistic: "Are you sure that those people do not believe in an idol called 'God'? How many of them can follow the way of Jesus? Not all baptized people are Christians. I feel that God sometimes does more work on unbelievers than on believers." Wu's narration echoes the scenario of the good Samaritan in the Holy Bible. Those who never heard of the gospel could exemplify humanity and tolerance to different thoughts and traditions. Instead, some Christians justify pride and prejudice in the name of faith, and some use the name of God to fulfill the individual and group desires. I asked Wu, "Do you mean that general education is more important than faith to China?" Wu answered:

Christians kept fleeing from their hometown and motherland. To survive, they must continuously change careers and acquire skills and knowledge. In this sense, Christian education has the characteristics of general education. Practically, survival is general knowledge; spiritually, the purpose of education is to know and experience God. God's people will not be controlled by the Persians who treat them favorably or Egyptians who oppress them.

I was deeply impressed by what Wu said. Culture or faith, which will win in China? It is the question that underlined this conversation. I saw that Wu was very disappointed with Chinese society and Chinese Christians' present status, and he was also not optimistic about the future of China. He said that Chinese society could turn a person into a devil, and there is no chance for faith to win under the present cultural and political circumstances. However, when talking about general education, he suggested that it could not be complete without recognizing God's presence.

Wu himself has experienced morally fraught conflicts during his stay in these WeChat groups. When entangled with the disputes among different religious groups on the WeChat platform, he sometimes was unkind to others. He tried to keep away from the quarrels on the WeChat platform. However, when disputes arose, Wu would quickly jump out to preach the gospel to both sides. To prevent himself from becoming a devil in the current culture and society, he even thought of giving up his well-paid and steady job. He said that when he encounters the morally fraught moments and finally makes a hard decision, he felt like renewed spiritually. Six months after this conversation, Wu left China and accepted a Catholic monastery teaching position in south-east Asia.

Cultural Roots: Authoritarianism and Fundamentalism

Smith identifies the sense of self-identification of fundamentalist Evangelicals in America.^[15] These Christians have a clear sense of identity, and they maintain a sense of tension with the broader society to keep their evangelical identity. They have a strong sense of boundaries, which distinguishes them from other social groups. They believe that they hold the ultimate truth revealed by the Holy Bible. They have a clear sense of evangelical mission, and they hope to testify and convert people and change the world. They hold practical moral superiority over other groups, believing that the truth can shape individual life and society. These characteristics of the fundamentalist groups are not unique to American Evangelical groups. The more conservative churches of different traditions in China carry similar traits. A Chinese Christian, Garfield, introduced her experience of debating online with some fundamentalist Christians. Those Christians posted much false information about Catholicism; they registered many online accounts to join a debate, giving people the impression that they were a big group of the same mind. Garfield explained:

Both extreme and moderate fundamentalists are exclusive. They view things as

[15] Smith, C., 1960, & Emerson, M. (1998). *American evangelicalism: Embattled and thriving*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

either black or white. They attacked other religions as if they were superior to others, and they are the only ones who know the truth. They considered that for so-called eternal life, lies and dirty means should be tolerated. From the ordinary followers to the church leaders, the fundamentalist Christians would always justify cheating in the gospel's name. ^[16]

The prevailing conservative and fundamentalist teaching among Chinese Catholic and Protestant churches have their roots in history. The flourishing of Christian fundamentalist teaching among the Protestant churches in China paralleled the Christian Fundamentalist Movement in the United States since the 1920s. ^[17] During the fundamentalist-modernist controversy in the US, Dr. Watson Hayes established the North China Theological Seminary (华北神学院), a fundamentalist seminar in 1919. It became the "Westminster Seminary of China" and played an essential role in training and providing financial support to the Chinese fundamentalist churches in the 1930s. This academy cultivated some of the most influential pastors and leaders for the Chinese churches from the 1930s to 1960s, whose influences are still dominant in the house churches in China today.

After 1949, the Chinese Catholic Church was put under the Chinese government's supervision and the Chinese Catholic Patriotic Association (CPA). It did not accept the primacy of the Papacy. Not willing to submit to the CPA's leadership, the underground Catholic Church managed to survive and established an underground system. Thus, both the official and some underground Catholic churches cut themselves off from the Roman Catholic Church's official teachings. Most Chinese Catholics nowadays do not know about Vatican II documents, and many still follow the Catholic teachings of the 19th century. Many Chinese Catholics reject Vatican II's teaching and view it as a surrender to modernism and other religions. Mr. Yi once commented on the Vatican II document, *Dignitatis Humanae* (Declaration of Religious Freedom), saying:

I think that the Catholic Church did not want to recognize those heresies and false religions. This document is no more than a diplomatic gesture. Since only the Catholic Church holds the truth, there is no need for the Catholic Church to make this unnecessary pacifying gesture. Moral relativism and pluralism will only mislead people and harm the Catholic Church as a whole.

Yi's understanding also has its roots in the soil of traditional Chinese patriarchal and authoritarian culture. Jiang analyzed the authoritarian crisis of the Chinese churches; he considered that monopoly of authority, pyramidal centralization, and the emphasis of absolute obedience to the

[16] Garfield 大黄傻猫. "Resigned from Christianity after 23 years of journey" 结束 23 年基督徒生涯, 辞别基督教. March 4, 2009. Accessed on May 22, 2020. <https://exchristian.hk/home/article/show/159>.

[17] Zhenmig Wang 王政民. "The Origin and Resound of the Conflict between Chinese Fundamentalist and Liberalist Christians in the 1930s" 三十年代中国基督教基要派与自由派之冲突的起源与回响. *Gospel and Modern China* 福音与当代中国. Aug 20, 2018. Accessed on May 23, 2020. <http://www.gospeentimes.cn/index.php/portal/article/index/id/45611>

church's superiors are the three major problems of Chinese Christian Churches.^[18] The 2000-year old authoritarian cultural tradition had permeated into every household and integrated into Chinese people's way of life. Chinese churches and virtual religious communities are not immune to such influence. The Chinese Communist party's rule and repression against religious organizations in the past 70 years only reinforced the Christian churches' backlash to the government and other religious groups. The binary ideology of the CCP government toughens the friend-foe and insider-outsider mindset among different social groups in China.

According to Yan, the discriminative in-group and out-group moral reasoning is still dominant in China today, which could be entirely counterproductive in an open and mobile society. The mutually beneficial behavior among Chinese people is mainly based on past favors and social exchanges. "Such a relation-based morality is particularistic in nature and highly flexible in practice; many of the behavioral norms and moral values do not apply to people who are outside one's network of social relationships."^[19] When Christians on the WeChat platform call each other brother and sister intimately in the all-ranked and differentiated Chinese society, the WeChat platform becomes an agency to break the discriminative rules. However, the Chinese traditional culture gene tenaciously grows via different norms and practices of social groups. In the cases of this study, the social elites hold content-based discriminative rules. The younger generation of fundamentalist group leaders accepts discriminatory rules based on church traditions, discourse, and doctrines. When people suffer discrimination on the WeChat platform, they may take it for granted and discriminate against others.

Social injustice could also contribute to the formation of an exclusive culture. After 1949, the Chinese Party-state exacerbated the culturally formed social inequality with its institutional measures. For example, the Hukou registration system divides people into urban and rural residents. The rural population can not enjoy food, housing, pension, education, and other social welfares as the urbanites. The Hukou system cultivated a strong sense of superiority of the urbanites over the rural population and a habit of ruthless exploitation of the "lower-end" population.^[20] It supported the us-them and insider-outsider mindset with institutional means by distributing dignity and social wealth unjustly among city and rural citizens.

Living in ablatantly exclusive culture, people's dissatisfaction with the unjust social institution can develop into aggressive behavior toward a stranger. Many WeChat users usually talk about how national security officials visit them for releasing inappropriate information on social media. Many of them encountered the shutdown of their WeChat accounts for using sensitive terms or violating the national security rules. For example, the police and party secretary in Mr. Yi's university warned him repeatedly for releasing inappropriate information on WeChat and finally removed Yi from the teaching podium. The examples of fundamentalist Christian communities in this research are the epitomes of surveillance in China today. The members of the religious WeChat group exhibited similar traits of particularistic communitarian

[18] Dengxing Jiang 江登兴. "The Authoritarian Crisis of Chinese Christian Churches" 中国教会的专制主义危机. *Church China 教会*. Nov. 2018. (74)6, Accessed on May. 22, 2020. <https://www.churchchina.org/archives/061101.html>

[19] Yunxiang Yan. "The Moral Implications of Immorality: The Chinese Case for a New Anthropology of Morality." *Journal of Religious Ethics* 42, no. 3 (September 2014): 460-493.

[20] Mo Zhixu. "In Beijing, Who Is and Isn't a 'Low-End Person?'" *China Change*, December 14, 2017. <https://chinachange.org/2017/12/14/in-beijing-who-is-and-isnt-a-low-end-person/>.

ethics. Just as the government has excluded them, they control and exclude the religious others.

Conclusion

All four types of religious WeChat groups in this research contributed to the preaching of the gospel. Among them, type A, B, and C could promote mutual respect and understanding in different ways. In contrast, group type D could more often trigger disputes and conflicts among various religious groups. On the one hand, among the WeChat groups observed in this research, the number of groups advocating tolerance and mutual respect is the majority. If the samples of this research could represent the distribution of value stances of the faith groups on the WeChat platform, an inclusive culture could progressively prevail in Chinese society.

On the other hand, the private chat on the WeChat platform is invisible to the public, and we do not know what consensus formed between individuals. Anyway, an exclusive virtual community could easily find resonance from people living in an exclusive society. When the social structure and resource distribution system remain the same, social morality could hardly improve only because of information exchange technology development. As Laidlaw (2014) quoted Bourdieus to explain that, “Whatever one thinks one is doing, one is always, in fact, playing a maximizing game in such a way as to reproduce the structures in which one is placed.” Society is always reproducing itself according to the dynamics of the material structures and the interdependent agency. It would be a miracle if society could change without reforming its political institution and economic foundation.

By comparing the two polar groups’ activities and behaviors, we see that group values, norms, discourses, and practices all play a role in cultivating the group culture. The group culture may further shape the outlook and practice of the newcomers. Though preaching about the same God, the four types of groups exemplified very different approaches. When people come to different groups for information and spiritual support, they may be bewildered about Christianity’s nature. Is Christianity an ecumenical faith tradition, or is it just an instrument to achieve individual power or group interests? It is a choice an individual has to face now and then in the virtual communities. An instrumentalized Christianity can hardly change the culture but instead being distorted by various cultural forces.

In conclusion, the Durkheimian paradigm of value reproduction dominates, and Dumont’s value exchange between different social hierarchies works to some extent. Simultaneously, the Weberian paradigm of value conflict also exhibits in Mr. Wu’s example. It is still too soon to jump to a conclusion to the question of “which culture or value will win China?” With the human agency of Christians actively communicating values of inclusiveness and love in their daily lives and on virtual platforms, Chinese society’s morality might improve slowly. Echoing Robbins’ diagnosis of the Urapmin society, if the legal and judiciary institution and the Chinese society’s political and economic structure remain the same, the individual Christian’s effort could still be nothing more than a drop into a bucket. It might take tens and hundreds of years for Chinese people to accept universal values and norms.

中文题目:

文化复制抑或价值冲突? 虚拟社区中基督徒的道德困境

刘焱, 博士, 电话: +1-2403706015; 电子邮箱: 75liu@cua.edu

摘要: 罗宾斯认为, 涂尔干和韦伯的理论路径都能有效解释社会道德变迁。基于这一认知, 本文探讨了微信平台上华人基督徒群聊中的文化复制和价值冲突动态机制。本研究评估了十个宗教微信群的群规和互动内容, 并根据其群体包容性和互动程度将其分为四种类型。通过从微信平台上收集的群聊内容, 揭示了群体语言暴力的形成机制, 并进一步探讨了中国基督徒在虚拟社区中的道德困境。研究表明, 基督教价值观作为一种外部力量, 可以鼓励基督徒践行福音使命并寻求群体认同。基督徒通过团体规范和团体行为实践话语权; 虚拟社区中基督教排他性群体的行为具有文化威权主义和宗教原教旨主义的意识形态特征。在微信平台上, 排他性和包容性群体文化之间的矛盾反映了中国威权社会传统与时代对开放社会需求之间的不匹配。在当前社会结构和文化环境下, 特殊化伦理和排他性实践仍将在相当长的时间内在基督教虚拟社区中占主导地位。

关键词: 包容性; 互动性; 道德; 语言暴力; 微信群

实践神学
与中西教会和社会
Practical Theology and
Sino-Western Views on Church and Society

Being an Addict and Healing: Narratives and Practices in A Gospel Rehabilitation Center

Yumeng YAO

(Institute of Anthropology, East China Normal University, Shanghai, P. R. China)

Abstract: As a social problem, addiction is especially troublesome in the southwestern border areas of China. This research explores how they became addicts and how to deal with it based on six months of ethnographic research in a gospel rehabilitation center in Yunnan. In rationality analysis and discussion, personal choices of drug users are often held accountable. However, it is necessary to take the geographic factor and historical background into consideration when reflecting on their way of being addicted. Besides, this study would, through personal narratives of drug addicts, attempt to introduce the irrationality factor of desire to analyze from the perspective of the subjects how their drug use experience is related to the society through desires. And then, by using participant observation of their daily practices in the center, this study makes an in-depth exploration of how such desires are handled through healing treatment at the Gospel Rehabilitation Center. And how they through healing practices to realize rebirth.

Key Words: drugs; addiction; desire; gospel rehab; healing

Author: YAO Yumeng, Institute of Anthropology, East China Normal University; No. 500, Dongchuan Rd, Minhang, Shanghai 200241, P. R. China. Tel: +8613122100927. Email: yaoyumeng@live.com

Between March 2017 and August 2017, I conducted an ethnographic study of heroin addicts in a Gospel Drug Rehabilitation Center in the southwest of China. Launched in 2007 in Yunnan and also known as “Rebirth Center” among the local people, the Drug Rehabilitation Center primarily serves local addicts, although accepting some referrals from other churches outside Yunnan. The center mainly rehabilitates three categories of patients: drug addicts, alcoholics, and people with mental illness. Often with a high severity of heroin abuse, most of the drug addicts populating the treatment center have experienced an unsuccessful period of treatment before. Many of them admitted they have encountered some crime-related experiences. people, all men at an age of 19 to 65, stay at the center on any given day. Despite the wide age range of the rehab population, the drug addicts researched in this study would be 28 to 40 years old.^[1] As to the ethnic composition of those admitted to the center, roughly one-third is minority groups and two-thirds are Han people. Due to the voluntary feature of the drug rehab center, although patients are asked to stay there for at least one and a half years, they still can leave if they insist. The primary funding is sourced from the local church.

[1] Most of the addicts are between 28 to 40 years old in the center.

Besides, when admitted to the center, a patient needs to pay a 5000-yuan deposit, which would be refunded when the patient is discharged. However, if one asks to leave and give up the treatment, the deposit would be confiscated. After discharged, one can choose to study at church school or work at the “Halfway House” (mainly for planting and farming work).

In terms of substance use categories, most of the patients are high-frequency users of heroin No. 4. Unlike other treatment centers, this rehab center provides no medication. Rather, it claims that the patients can only be saved by believing in God. Thus, its therapy practices only include reading Bibles and praying. When I first came to the center, I met Sun, one of the critical reporters. After the formal research ended in August 2017, however, I went back to participate in the 10th anniversary of its establishment in September 2017, when Sun was just discharged. During the research, I experienced two relocations of the center. At the first time, I moved from the drug treatment center in a deep mountain to an old house in the countryside. Because of limited space, I moved to the “Halfway House”, which about 1km away from the center. Halfway House provides job opportunities to those just discharged but not well prepared to return to society. There, I met another reporter, Wu, who had been working at the “Halfway House” for about one year. Then at the second time, we moved from the old house to a new drug treatment center far away from the urban area. Therefore, the research sites include the rebirth center, “Halfway House” and the outside world, and the objects include both those who are undergoing detoxification and those who have experienced the whole process, as well as those who were discharged but chose to stay at the “Halfway House”. All of them were heroin addicts. To be specific, due to the limit of time, I followed several men from their entries into the center, while also tracing some others who were just discharged. In the center, I adopt the participant observation method to record their therapy practices which are embedded in their everyday routine activities. Additionally, out of the center, an in-deep interview allows me to collect their illness narratives and their drug dependency experience.

The main questions are direct: Why is the center called a “rebirth center”? And how does it make “rebirth” possible? In order to answer the question, it is essential to think about how the people here became addicts? How do they deal with their addiction? When they arrived in the center, how they trained their bodies and minds by certain practices in the healing process? The following content will try to answer these questions by focusing on the patients’ narratives and practices.

1. Colonial memory and “Chinese channel”

Both the geographic factor and historical background play essential roles for many reasons. For the research site I chose, it locates at the border between China and Burma, which provides accessibility to drugs much more accessible than other places. Besides, the southwest China regions have always seen drugs throughout the history, delivering many changes in the social pattern. Especially, opium and heroin often spark the recall of the colonial times when these regions became a “Chinese channel” to the world.

The southwest China is one of the frontiers of Chinese territory. When outsiders came here, they

attributed the discomfort and fear of its environment to “malaria”. The fear of malaria also made the European colonists panic. In fact, since the Qing dynasty, the rulers had been trying to find a cure for malaria, and finally the opium was regarded as a useful therapy.^[2] Perhaps because the chilling bodies suffering from malaria can be warmed up due to the function of opium, it became the first choice in the prevention and treatment of malaria. Therefore, with the colonization of these areas, opium began to go across the southwestern border as medicine.

However, it turned to be a new problem as opium smuggling became prevalent. Especially, along the coast, smugglers imported expensive Indian opium and then transport it into Yunnan before gradually spreading to the interior land. At this time, it had a therapeutic value, instead of a new danger. In the 19th century, opium slowly became a luxury consumer product in the coastal societies and was not difficult to find in daily life. In fact, it had then become a symbol of social identities. By the era of the Republic of China, opium poppies had been grown as the main cash crop for people living in border areas, thus making the opium a pillar of local economic development. On the one hand, the profits made from poppy cultivation stimulated border consumptions and cross-border trades; on the other hand, because the state monopolized the opium trades, the tax revenues from opium had become the primary finance source of governments. It can be found that the flows of opium and the changes of its functions resulted in a series of social transformations that are deeply linked to colonial memories in the southwest border regions and even the entire China.

Since the 1950s, the government has started to launch hard efforts to combat poppy cultivation and opium trading. Nevertheless, the types of drugs were also changing; since the 1960s, the world drug market has expanded widely because the demand for drugs goes up, while the drug cooking technology has also been improved. Therefore, heroin appears in people’s lives and goes much popular in a short time. Consequently, by the 1980s, the huge international drug market has driven the birth of three essential drug sourcing places, i. e., the “Golden Triangle”, “Silver Triangle” and “Golden Crescent.” With no exception, China is also affected by the international drug environment. Moreover, after the reform and open-up policy, a new wave of drug abuse brought a resurgence of drugs. Unlike the traditional route for poppy seeds to move from India to Yunnan along southern Xinjiang, the primary source of heroin in China is the “Golden Triangle”, i. e., a triangle area located between the borders of Thailand, Burma and Laos. Especially, Burma, which borders Yunnan, grew into the “world powder” center in the 1970s. Besides, since Yunnan lacks natural barriers along its border, frequent border trades involve a huge quantity of goods and people, including drug dealers. As a result, the so-called “China Channel” was built up,^[3] which is further extended to the mainland China, Hong Kong and Macao. As the entrance of the “China Channel,” Yunnan had seen massive flows of drugs through the border between China and Myanmar.

1. From Myanmar (Menggu, Baseball, Mujie and Nankan) to Yunnan (Wanding and Ruili), drugs are transported to Kunming via Baoshan and Shimonoseki;

[2] 沈海梅 Shen Haimei:《医学人类学视野下的毒品、艾滋病与边疆社会》Yixuerenleixue Shiyexiade Dupin, Aizhibing yu Bianjiangshehu [Drugs, AIDS and Frontier Society from the Perspective of Medical Anthropology], (昆明 Kunming: 云南大学出版社 Yunnan Daxue Chubanshe [Yunnan University Press], 2010), 1-21.

[3] 张绍明 Zhang Shaoming:《禁毒大视角》Jindu Dashijiao [A broad perspective of drug control], (北京 Beijing: 中国公安大学出版社 [Chinese people’s Public Security University Press], 2004), 253.

2. Along the Myanmar border, from Kuogan, Qingshuihe, Hongyan, Modai, Zhenkang, Gengma, Shuide, Shidian, Weishan, Xiaguan and other places to Kunming;

3. From the area near the border of Laos to eastern Myanmar, drugs go from Jinghong to Kunming. [4]

In addition, some drugs are also transmitted into China through the China-Laos border or the China-Vietnam border and further to the mainland.

Although Yunnan functions as a part of the channel, a considerable portion of heroin is still sold locally. In the 1980s, the underground drug consumption market in Yunnan gradually established. Despite the “Strike Hard (严打)” in 1983, the drug abuse in the border area of Yunnan remains severe. According to surveys, the number of drug addicts in Yunnan Province increased sharply from 1982 to 1991, and most of them had switched from traditional opium to heroin. By 1990, the total number of registered drug addicts in Yunnan reached more than 57,000. [5] In 2016, when I was conducting a fieldwork, the reporter Sun suddenly asked me what day that day was, and it turned out to be the day when his cousin was discharged from the drug treatment center. Sun’s cousin also used to take heroin for a long time. Sun told me: “Several men of my generation smoke (heroin), and many of our villages do,” While shrugging and speaking very casually. Nevertheless, I was shocked; as seen in the statistics, given there are many drug users, they should inevitably know that heroin is harmful, but they still to take it. However, Sun explained that it was as common as just daily life in the villages. Maybe they underestimated the effects of heroin. Or maybe their so-called choice was not a choice at all. So, I decided to sit down and listen to their stories about desires and choices. I mentioned the location and colonial history because living here; even such factors are not experienced directly, they remain inescapable. Somehow, it catalyzes for the problem of being an addict for every single individual.

2. Being an addict and pursuing a desire

When it comes to “desire”, people often immediately think of excessive or greedy needs. For drug addicts, accordingly, it is often alleged that the expansion of their personal desires leads them to this unfortunate scene. However, desire itself is not totally negative; as Deleuze believes, it is productive and constructive. [6] Without desires, this area would not have benefited from the reform and opening up policy, nor will there would have been subsequent development and transformation, because it is undeniable that the reform and opening up have brought many benefits to the southwest border and delivered economic development. For individuals living in this region, although with many profit-making opportunities, they have managed to improve their lives, they have also experienced the restlessness of transformation, which may be the dark side of desire.

[4] 牛何兰 Niu Helan:《当代云南禁毒史》Dangdai Yunnan Jindushi[Contemporary History of Drug Control in Yunnan],(昆明 Kunming:云南人民出版社 Yunnan Renmin Chubanshe[The Peoples Press of Yunnan],2012),33.

[5] 牛何兰 Niu Helan:《当代云南禁毒史》Dangdai Yunnan Jindushi[Contemporary History of Drug Control in Yunnan],(昆明 Kunming:云南人民出版社 Yunnan Renmin Chubanshe[The Peoples Press of Yunnan],2012),11.

[6] 高继海 Gao Jihai.《德勒兹的欲望概念》Delezi de Yuwang Gainian[Deleuze’s conception of Desire],《外国文学》Waiguo Wenxue[Foreign Literature],No. 5 (2013).

When rapid economic development triggers the rising of personal desires and reorganizes the social relations, the society is also easy to fall into disorder. “Since reform and opening up, Yunnan government has paid great attention to border governance.” Many programs have been implemented: the action of prospering the border and enriching the people’, the development plan of the ethnic groups with fewer populations, the frontier project of ‘Resolving the Five Difficulties’ to benefit the people, and the “3121^[7] national demonstration site creation project, among others.” These initiatives gave birth to the most fashionable occupation at that time, truck drivers, which is the professional experience that all of the people I met in the center have in common. As they said, “it earns money quickly.” They all caught up with the good chance to make money and enjoyed a better life delivered by the market economy. However, they failed to realize it was a prelude to another life.

Wu described his experience as a truck driver: “At that time, in the 1990s, I could not put up with the boring life here anymore. I like to go around for free.” Just at that time, the government started to develop M city on the border, so he bought a truck with part of money he saved as well as his family’s support and finally became a long-distance transportation truck driver, almost a perfect job then. “With the truck you can go anywhere you want. You don’t know how many people were jealous of me.” Even today, when rethinking about the truck, he is still proud of it. At that time, the construction projects in M city were blossoming everywhere. Wu worked diligently and got a reasonable salary he deserved. “Hey, with money, I thought about enjoying. My friends and I tried a lot of ways to enjoy life, such as drinking, singing, smoking, playing cards, and even with women. . . Work hard and play hard, you know. So I’m not jealous or curious about what the young people are playing now, because I had tried all of them when I was at their ages. Nothing special, you know. Later, I also wanted to try something new, and then I did try.” He said with a gesture of injection, “You know, in M city, No. 4 (heroin) is so cheap that you could buy it on the street. I had been there for a long time.” Wu pointed to Sun and said to me: “We were all consumers. He was the dealer.” People laughed, while Sun was blushed and waved his hands to stop them from joking.

They like to make fun of him, partly because he is the youngest of them; but another important reason is his ironic and unexpected experience as a drug dealer. “My parents are famers. Around 1990, a close friend of mine in the village said that if you want to make money, you must go outside.” Later, Sun found that the beef jerky in his hometown was very popular, so he invited his family and friends to run the business together. He drove a van to transport goods between his hometown and a big city from time to time. “Then one day, when I was driving on my way, a few guys asked a pick-up. I heard they talk about fetching something (heroin). It was my first time to drive for them but not the last time. A few months later, I got acquainted with them. Afterwards, I thought it could be a profitable operation. Come on, just look at what they earned by selling drugs. While I was still selling the fucking beef jerky, I had, of course, changed some of my goods in the van. “ As Sun’s ambition was gradually expanded, he gave up his original small business, and his car was only used to carry his growing desires. “I thought very clearly at beginning. I said I only want to make money. So I definitely

[7] 李诚 Li Cheng、马树勋 Ma Shuxun:《改革开放与云南社会治理》Gaige kaifang yu Yunnan Shehuizhili, [Reform and Opening up and Yunnan’s Social Governan], 《中共云南省委党校学报》Zhonggong Yunnan Shengwei Dangxiao Dangbao, [The Journal of Yunnan Provincial Committee School of CPC] No. 1(2019).

would not try smoking. But... Well, my friends suggested...” Sun thought that he could control himself by playing the role of “drug dealer”. However, eventually he became an addict. “In fact, I didn’t think so much at first. If I didn’t leave for there, it would be fine. But the people who had come out to work earned much more money than farming. Besides, young people thought (work outside) means a good life,” Sun said. Though hesitating, he finally decided to go out. At that time, desire was expected from the market economy. It is true that social transformation is inseparable from rationality, but desire also plays an important role as an irrationality factor, which means that it cannot be calculated or measured. “Economy studies desires, especially those related to victories, which relate to temporary emotions. Besides, others relate to habits and only cause harms from time to time. And some other expectations will never come true.”^[8] On the one hand, desire is an indispensable factor for market economy, although maybe with real harms to people. In this way, we can understand why there were many explosive “heats” in the 1990s, such as stock fever, real estate fever, and so on. For my reporters, they have experienced all these booms and they describe the atmosphere of the whole society then as “full of desire”. As long as they were willing to work through it, they would get profits, or even change their status and identity. However, the so-called choices and changes actually seemed to be overwhelmed by greater external forces; and once the so-called “heats” and desires were over-developed, they would inevitably fall out of control.

The stories with Wu and Sun seem to reflect the personal choices and the fate of the era in a specific context. In their narratives, they all mentioned “1990”, which relates to the reform and opening up policy and the market economy reform in China, while the globalization was advanced in the world. Consequently, in such a small city located on the border, when the new policy encountered the wave of globalization after the 1980s, heroin also began to find its way. When in “1990”, the situation was even worse than before. Thus, while people’s desires were inspired by the market economy here, they plunged into the piles of heroin that eventually caused people to lose themselves.

The colonial memory and “Chinese channel” provide the background of being an addict because location and history have something to do with the easy availability of heroin. Desire, on the one hand, allows an individual to upgrade his live standard. However, on the other way, the inappropriate way of pursuing a desire lead him to the disorder and chaos and finally being an addict, especially in here heroin is notoriously easy to procure. Moreover, being an addict implies that one has little hope for recovery in the frequent detoxification- relapse cycle. Namely, they have tried and failed many times in the methods of detoxification and treatment based on evidence-based medicine and governmental management. Being an addict and accepting the role also the partial reason that one comes to the gospel rehabilitation center.

3. Healing Practice in the center

Whether from the description of the drug addicts themselves or the research surveys, it is not difficult to find that all aspects of the society have made their attempts to explore effective ways of

[8] 马歇尔 Alfred Marshall:《经济学原理》Jingjixue Yuanli [Economics], 朱志泰等 Zhu Zhitai deng 译, (北京 Beijing: 商务印书馆 Shangwu Yinshuguan [The Commercial Press]), 1991, 115.

dealing with addiction. And from the perspective of social management, the effort for detoxification cannot be ignored easily. For instance, after the Ministry of Justice deployed an initiative for the basic model of unified national drug rehabilitation in May, 2008, many cities have begun to explore and improve their local drug rehabilitation efforts in an attempt to find a unified drug rehabilitation model.^[9] In addition to the government's compulsory drug dependency treatment, many local governments have also introduced social work to assess and intervene in the physical conditions, attitudes and performance of drug addicts.^[10] Specifically, there are grouped drug addicts to conduct controlled experiments, so as to explore the impact of nursing intervention on drug withdrawal,^[11] or from a psychological point of view, to explore the effect of Cognitive Therapy on detoxification.^[12] Even intervening surgeons are operated. In terms of medical treatment, the replacement therapy with methadone instead of heroin has always been the mainstream treatment. As one of the mainstream detoxification drugs, Methadone has been used as an alternative medicine to treat drug addiction for more than 30 years at home and abroad.^[13] And research on methadone maintenance treatment is also continuing. Buprenorphine, also an alternative therapy drug, was once expected to replace methadone and change the spatial mode of treatment.^[14] There are also many clinical trials across the world, so as to decide their efficacy and compare them with methadone. In these experiments, however, drug users are all regarded as an objective object to be studied, i. e., to provide therapies that they think can get rid of the addiction. The philosophy behind this idea is: it is the individuals who have made the wrong choice, and the society is providing correction and treatment strategies. But the drug problem is still incessant, and the high relapse rate of heroin addiction is always a difficult problem to solve.

No matter the methadone maintenance treatment or the social management, it aimed to cure their illness related to addiction. However, when I reviewed their personal narratives, I found that heroin addiction is not just a physical dependence, but also a reflection of each vulnerable individual's ups and downs in the torrent of the times. After individuals struggled between the satisfaction and

[9] 新闻稿 Xinwengao [News press]《江苏推行统一戒毒工作基本模式》Jiangsu Tuixing Tongyi Jiedugongzuo Jiben Mushi [Jiangsu Implements Unified Basic Model of Drug Addiction Treatment],《中国司法》Zhongguo Sifa [Justice of China], No. 11, (2019).

[10] 赵芳 Zhaofang, 傅鹏鸣 Fu Liming,《社区戒毒社会工作分类评估研究》Shequ Jiedu Shehuigongzuo Fenlei Pinggu Yanjiu [A Study on the Classified Evaluation of Social Work in Community Drug Rehabilitation:],《社会工作与管理》Shehuigongzuo yu Guanli [Social Work and Management], No. 06(2019).

[11] 何艳杰 He Yanjie,《护理干预对吸毒者戒毒期间的影响分析》Huli Ganyu dui Xiduzhe Jieduqijian de Yingxiang Fenxi [Effect of nursing intervention on drug addicts during detoxification],《世界最新医学信息文摘》Shijie Zuixin Xinxue Xixi Wenzhai [Journal of the world Latest Medicine Information], No. 85, 2019 :67+71.

[12] 张志浩 Zhang Zhihao,《内观认知疗法对女性强制戒毒人员毒品渴求的干预及机制研究》Neiguan RENzhiliaofa Dui Nvxing Qiangzhijiedu Renyuan Dupin Keqiu de Ganyu ji Jizhi Yanjiu [Intervention and Mechanism of Naikan Cognitive Therapy on Drug Carving of Female Drug Abusers on Compulsory Detoxification], (天津 Tianjin: 天津医科大学硕士论文 Tianjin Tike Daxue Daxue Shuoshi Lunwen [Master thesis in Tianjin Medical University], 2019).

[13] 刘杨 Liu Yang,《美沙酮维持治疗患者心理健康及影响因素研究进展》Meishatong Weichizhiliao Huanzhe Xinli Jiankang ji Yingxiangyinsu Ynajiujingzhan [Research Progress on Mental Health and Influencing Factors of Methadone Maintenance Treatment Patients],《临床医药文献电子杂志》Linchuang Yiyao Wenxian Dianzi Zazhi [Electronic Journal of Clinical Medical Literature], 2019, 6 (80):192-193.

[14] 阿德里安娜·佩特里纳 Petryna, A 等,《全球药物》Quanqiu Yaowu [Global pharmaceuticals], 许烨芳 Xu Yefang 译, (上海 Shanghai: 上海译文出版社 Shanghai Yiyen Chubanshe [Shanghai Translation Publishing House]), 2009, 157. 林杰, 徐雨佳, 杜辉, 李洁, 王俊杰, 美沙酮与丁丙诺啡对海洛因依赖者脱瘾治疗效果比较[J]. 国际医药卫生导报, 2006(19):56-58

dissatisfaction of desire, they eventually fell into disorder. When too many similar individual stories continue to superimpose on each other, what is revealed is the depiction of the era, as those individual desires are also the social desires and their personal disorder is also the overall disorder. It can be seen that drug addiction itself covers too many complex aspects. Compulsory detoxification and methadone replacement therapy that only target detoxification itself are not difficult to predict and ultimately achieve the desired results.

Thus, it is necessary to reflect on the tension between cure and healing. “Canguilhem makes an important and necessary distinction: healing is fundamentally subjective and individual, following an etymology that includes protection and security, but also to defend. Cure, on the other hand, reflects forms of internal change adhering to external validation. Cure is the success of change within, verified statistically or otherwise from without. Stated simply, cure is a return whereas healing opens onto something new and previously unfamiliar or unknown. Healing does not restore a previously existing order; it does not return to an old norm.”^[15] For the addicts in this study, after finding the failure of cure, they tried another way—healing to detoxification, which needs to explore something unknown and try to establish new order, while the unknown things are usually irrational and personal.

Moreover, it is time to switch ideas by analyzing the “choices” of drug users from their own perspectives. Desire is one of the important irrationality factors. As disclosed in the personal narratives and the life experience of the respondents from drug use to drug addiction, this is actually a question of how to deal with desire, because drug addiction is a “choice” driven by desire as well as a channel to deal with desire. Rebirth Center is seeking such changes. From this perspective, rather than a question of social governance or medical treatment, the problem of drug addiction is about how to deal with desire, which is not only personal but also social.

When detoxification became a social problem, people also began to work beyond the type of scientific rationality. For example, Professor Zhuang Kongshao of Zhejiang University filmed an anthropology movie, “Tiger Day”, which shows the process of Yi people using folk rituals, i. e., customary law, family support, moral power, etc., to be clean. In the movie, the “headman” was distressed that his family branch would be destroyed by heroin, so with the help of the family branch, he chose “Tiger Day” to hold the ceremony. The so-called “Tiger Day” is the day of war in Yi people; thus, the ceremony means that heroin is regarded as an enemy of the family to fight against, demonstrating the possibility of cultural forces defeating biological diseases. And the resulting “tiger day model” is also regarded as one of the successful detoxification practices in Asia.^[16] The gospel drug rehab center, where my field site is located, is also an attempt outside the mainstream discourse, mainly relying on the power of religion and faith to detoxify. In their words, it means “not relying on drugs, not relying on one’s own strength, but on God.” As mentioned earlier, individuals in society struggle with desire and eventually go out of order; and when they come to the “rebirth center” for treatment, the “rebirth center” provides a way to deal with desire and the

[15] Todd Meyer, *Clinic and Elsewhere*, (Seattle and London: university of washington press), 9.

[16] 庄孔韶 Zhuang Kongshao, 杨洪林 Yang Honglin, 富晓星 Fu Xiaoxing, 《小凉山彝族“虎日”民间戒毒行动和人类学的应用实践》Xiaoliangshan Yizu “Huri” Minjian Jiudu Xingdong he renleixue de Yingyong Shijian [Revelation of the “Tiger’s Day” Initiative in the Yi Ethnic Region of Xiaoliangshan], 《广西民族学院学报》Guangxi Minzu xueyuan xuebao [Journal of Guangxi University for Nationalities], No. 2, (2005), 38-47.

possibility to reorder their lives.

Therefore, the way to deal with the addiction here is a healing process to deal with a disorder caused by desire. To be specific, different from cure, healing means building a new order or pursuing something unknown. The practice in the center is to create the theological order for the addicts. It is not difficult to find in their daily routines and items they used.

Different from thinking detoxification as a kind of “treatment”, the “rebirth center” calls it a “transformation”, which is equal to a healing process. This is actually a different discourse expression under two sets of cognitive concepts. From the perspective of “cure”, drug addiction is regarded as a disease, whether it is a physical problem or a social problem, with a focus on its possibility of getting better or being well. But the staff and addicts in the “rebirth center” do not talk about “cure”, but only refer to “change”, because they believe that if they only came with the purpose of detoxification, they would definitely fail. Instead, they must set a further goal, such as seeking life changes. Getting away from addiction is just something that comes along in the process of such changes. The transformation of life is actually to establish a new order. From the point of view of healing, what happened has happened. Drug users have no way to completely return to life before they used drugs. On the contrary, they need to seek and accept a new order. At the individual level, the core is changed from a human-centered approach to a God-centered one. This is a change in cognitive concepts and a way of dealing with desire. Because of belief, the desire for disorder and restlessness will be calmed down by the God in the heart. The practice of this transformation mainly includes prayer and the establishment of the order of daily life. The former is more valued and is the key to realization of “changes”.

Wu talked about his memories of prayer: “I have been a Christian for a long time. However, I didn’t believe it. It seemed like following other’s steps, you know. My mother believed and I followed. Sometimes I went to church on weekends. However, when I was addicted to heroin, I didn’t go there anymore. When they prayed, I would listen and learn, but just like learning, just like making some noise. Later, I was still praying in the rebirth center and there was really something in my heart that I wanted to say. So I said that the most important thing I learned in the center was prayer, which allows me to know God.” For Wu, the acquisition of prayer is equivalent to accepting another set of cognitive concepts and accepting a set of words. His comportment changed in the center, and he picked up forms of speech with religious means. He used terms like “my weakness” and “lost my faith” phrases, so many of the other patients in the center deployed effortlessly after countless praying sessions. Sun also agreed with Wu’s statement: “It’s my sister-in-law who has belief in God, but I don’t believe it. When I first came here, they told me that faith can help with drug addiction. At that time, praying while having drug addiction was uncomfortable. I did not believe it. But then the teacher gave us lessons about theological knowledge. I think it is good. I asked him what a “good” method was. He said: Well, how can I say that? There is sustenance in my heart. I used to give up myself at home before; and after a while, I was sad. Looking at myself, my life was a mess. It seemed that after I used drugs, these troubles no longer existed. But now it is different. I can talk to God and pray. If not, I can go to the church to find brothers and sisters to pray together. I will not just think about how sad I am. I can pray if I do not feel well. In fact, it is difficult to say how much impression the theological courses in the rebirth center has delivered to them, but the behavioral way of prayer

does reflect the impact and change in life, so that they no longer focus only on their own desire.

In addition to prayer, the schedule of practice in the rebirth center manages the order of daily life, thereby returning the practitioners' bodies to an orderly state. For example, at six o'clock in the morning, when it is just dawning, with the bell, I heard footsteps from the dormitory of the students upstairs, followed by the sound of prayer: from gratitude for last night—"Thank you for your care and conservation overnight", to today's expectations—"Entrust today's life to the Lord's hands, and ask the Lord to lead." Then there were more messy footsteps and washing movements. As can be seen from their daily schedule of work and rest, except for Sunday, which is counted as a rest day, the same work and rest rhythms are repeated every day, with the same content including: Bible reading, spiritual devotion, prayer, etc. Moreover, they have to hand in their mobile phones, computers and other items from the day they enter the center. There is no Internet available, and they are basically in a state of isolation from the outside world. In this state, their daily practice is changing the original living habits. It can, of course, be understood as a kind of discipline. Their daily life behaviors fully comply with the regulations and their body needs to be present at the prescribed time. This itself is a process of discipline for the body. As commented by Sun, "In the (Rebirth Center), you don't need to think about anything. You know what you should do during the day and at night. But when I took drugs, I was unable to distinguish between day and night." Therefore, the order in the Rebirth Center has reshaped their concepts of time. Reordering not only exists as a management regulation, but also stabilizes their bodies through such a sense of order. The mind enables them to gradually get rid of chaos and disorder in their practice day after day, deal with their desires, and adapt to the new order of life.

4. Conclusion

In this article, I'm not going to advocate the success of gospel detoxification. People often say "drug addiction in one day, and detoxification for life." How long after leaving the drug treatment center without drug addiction can it be regarded as a success? Maybe they should track their life for a definite result. I want to explore whether it is possible to rethink drug abuse by introducing irrationality factors (e. g., the desire). In previous researches, there is no lack of discourses about drug abuse and drug withdrawal from the aspects of policy implementation and management methods. From the perspective of managers, it is easy to attribute the road to drug use to personal wrong choices, but this idea fails to understand drug users. And this may be one of the reasons why the measures cannot achieve the desired effect.

When I try to start from the perspective of the subject of drug addicts, I find that the drug problem is actually an issue of desire, which is both personal and social. By integrating the specific historical background and geographical environment of the western Yunnan border with their personal experience of "being a drug addict", we can reach a conclusion that individual choices cannot exist independently of the times and social backgrounds, just as the personal desires are actually the social ones. When society is closely connected, desire itself is social. Especially, after the implementation of the policy of opening to the outside world, Yunnan's geographic location has

become a channel for international drug trade, and individuals living there have been drawn into the wave of the times. Under such a complicated time node, desire is both positive and dangerous. Yes, they eventually “became drug addicts” because of uncontrolled desires, which finally lead to disorders. When desire brings power to social development, it can easily cause individuals and societies to fall into a disorderly state, which may become a dark side under the pain of the transformation of the times.

For addicts, the process of detoxification is actually a program of dealing with desire. They experienced failures after the collision between individuals and the system. Whether as a subject requiring management or correction or a patient in need of treatment, they could not get the treatment that brought a real change in their lives under the traditional approaches. Unlike cure, it is a healing process because they cannot come back to their old order and previous lifestyle. Instead, the addicts in the center need to build a new order to guide the rest of their lives. In order to deal with problems caused by desire, a new order of life may be established on their body and mind by changing the cognitive concept. It is also a response by the locals to the trauma of the times. What is more, the practices of healing is full of the feeling of monastic. In service of recovery and rebirth, they have to follow routines such as praying and reading the Bible. Besides, even everyday rituals of eating, working, and sleeping are expected to follow the rules. During the healing experience, they are meant to establish new forms of behavior, new patterns of being, new performances of every day, a new order of daily life—eventually, rebirth as a new person without addiction.

中文题目:

成为瘾君子与疗愈——一所福音戒毒中心里的叙事与实践

姚雨萌, 华东师范大学人类学研究所, 上海市闵行区东川路 500 号 200241. No. 500, Dongchuan Rd, Minhang, Shanghai 200241. Tel: +8613122100927. Email: yaoyumeng@live.com

摘要: 成瘾作为一个社会问题, 在中国西南边境地区尤为棘手。本研究基于在云南一个福音康复中心为期六个月的民族志研究, 探讨了他们如何成为瘾君子以及如何应对自身的情况。在理性分析和讨论中, 吸毒往往归咎于成瘾个体的选择。然而, 在反思他们的成瘾方式时, 有必要考虑地理因素和历史背景所带来的影响。此外, 本研究试图通过对吸毒者的个人叙述, 引入欲望的非理性因素, 从被试的角度分析他们的吸毒经历是如何通过欲望与社会联系在一起的。然后, 通过使用参与观察的方式, 记录他们在康复中心里的日常实践, 本研究深入探讨了如何通过福音康复中心的治疗来处理这些欲望, 以及他们如何通过疗愈实践来实现重生。

关键词: 毒品; 成瘾; 欲望; 福音戒毒; 疗愈

New Urbanization and the Changes of Christian Churches in County Towns and Rural Areas

—Taking L County in Central Henan as an Example

Luoying ZHAO

(Institute of Ethnology and Anthropology, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing P. R. China)

Abstract: Since the reform and opening up, China has been developing through the stages of old urbanization and new urbanization. In recent years, with the rise of county economy, the new urbanization centered on county towns, as an important way to promote the urbanization of the population transferred from rural areas, has played a significant role in the changes of Christianity in urban and rural areas. Based on the case study of L County in central Henan, this paper analyzes the new trend of the flow of Christian believers and the changes of churches in county towns and rural areas from five aspects: number and population characteristics of Christian believers, church activities and participation of Christian believers, theological personnel training, theological construction and financial offerings. The study finds that the gap between urban and rural churches has further widened. The uprooted settlement of immigrant in county towns has led to a sharp drop in the number of rural Christian believers, a growing aging population, single and simplified church activities, the lost of theological talents, the re-emergence of heretical cults in rural areas, and shrinking financial offerings. The decline and fall of rural churches has become a general trend. Although the development of urban churches is on the rise as a whole, it also faces many challenges and difficulties.

Key Words: New urbanization; County; Rural church; Urban church

Author: Zhao Luoying, Research Assistant, Institute of Ethnology and Anthropology, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences. Tel: + 8618001098662, E-mail: zhaoluoying1984@163.com

I . Background and Research questions

Urbanization refers to the social phenomenon of a large rural population moving into cities to reside, work and live together in the process of modern industrialization.^[1] Since the reform and opening up, China has undergone the largest and fastest urbanization process in human history. According to the data of the National Bureau of Statistics, the resident population in cities and towns increased from 170 million to 850 million from 1978 to 2019, and the urbanization rate increased from 17.9% to 60.60%. By the end of 2019, 280 million people were separated from their registered

[1] 李强 Li Qiang,《主动城镇化与被动城镇化》Zhudong chengzhenhua yu beidong chengzhenhua[Active Urbanization and Passive Urbanization],《西北师大学报(社会科学版)》xibei shida xuebao(shehui kexue ban)[Journal of Northwest Normal University (Social Sciences Edition)],2013,50(6):1-8.

residences, of which 236 million were migrants.^[2] China's urbanization not only profoundly affects the global development in the 21st century, but also has great significance in breaking the long-standing dual structural system of urban-rural gap and segmentation in Chinese history.

Urbanization brings changes not only in people's living style, but also in the production and lifestyle of the whole society. It is a process of social transformation, so it requires the adaptation and integration of multiple generations. During the 42 years of China's reform and opening up, urbanization has gone through different stages of development.

Early urbanization, or old urbanization, is mainly represented by the expansion of urban space, focusing on building houses and facility construction. Spatial urbanization has not brought about population urbanization. Although migrant workers in cities have made great contributions to urban construction, the barrier of household registration system has prevented them from sharing the results of urbanization. While working in cities, they have to complete their household and labor force reproduction in villages, due to their status of "quasi-citizen" that is difficult to obtain citizenship in cities.

Since the 18th National Congress of the Communist Party of China (CPC) proposed to "take a new road of urbanization with Chinese characteristics" in 2012, China's urbanization has entered a new stage of people-oriented, with equal emphasis on scale and quality. In 2014, the CPC Central Committee and the State Council issued the "National New Urbanization Plan (2014—2020)" to promote human urbanization, that is, to promote the urbanization of the population transferred from rural areas and the civilization of economic and social life, which has become an important task in the development of new urbanization. In order to speed up the urbanization of migrant workers, in 2019, the government proposed to loosen the restriction for settling in large cities and lift the ban on settling in small and medium-sized cities. In recent years, with the rise of county economy, urbanization centered on county towns has drawn wide attention and concern from all walks of life. The key tasks of new urbanization and urban-rural integration development in 2020 recently issued by the National Development and Reform Commission require "promoting new urbanization with county towns as an important carrier". A country is safe when its counties are well-governed. County areas account for 89% of China's land area and support 70% of its registered population,^[3] which means they play a key role in the hierarchy administration of the country. On the one hand, the new urbanization centered on county towns highlights the large-scale and intensive benefits of urban construction; on the other hand, it conforms to the characteristics of Chinese people's identification of local culture and can provide them with higher levels of public services such as education and medical care.^[4] Therefore, local and nearby urbanization within the county become an important way to promote the urbanization of migrant workers.

[2] <http://www.qjjsj.com/show70a123823>, 2020-02-28.

[3] 阎国文, 阎若思, Yan guowen, Yan ruosi. 《县域治理是国家治理的基础和重点》Xianyu zhili shi guojia zhili de jichu he zhongdian [County Governance Is the Basis and Focus of Country Governance], 廉政文化研究 Lianzheng wenhua yanjiu [Incorrupt Government Culture Studies], 2019(4): 38-45.

[4] 李强 Li Qiang, 《主动城镇化与被动城镇化》Zhudong chengzhenhua yu beidong chengzhenhua [Active Urbanization and Passive Urbanization], 《西北师大学报(社会科学版)》xibei shida xuebao (shehui kexue ban) [Journal of Northwest Normal University (Social Sciences Edition)], 2013, 50(6): 1-8.

The process of urbanization has greatly changed the social structure of our country. In the stage of old urbanization, the circulating route for migrant workers is from the countryside to the city and then back to the countryside. However, in the stage of new urbanization, they will settle down in the cities, which means the population will be “uprooted” from the rural land. A “non-industrial and non-agricultural” structure has been formed between the countryside and the first and second tier cities.^[5] This change in social structure has a significant impact on the development and changes of Christianity. Taking L County in central Henan as an example, this paper focuses on what changes and impacts the new urbanization has brought to the churches in urban and rural areas of the county, on what kind of differentiation has taken place between urban and rural churches and what challenges will urban and rural churches face in their future development.

II. Introduction of L County Case

1. General Situation of L County

Henan is a province with a large population and a large migrating population. In 2017, the urbanization rate of Henan’s resident population exceeded 50%, realizing a leap from a province with a large agricultural population to a province with a large new urbanization population. In recent years, Henan’s county economy has developed very rapidly. According to the “China County Economic Development Report (2019)” released by National Academy of Financial Strategy, CASS, 8 counties in Henan ranked among the top 100 counties (cities) with comprehensive competitiveness in 2019. In this regard, Henan was the fourth competitive province in the country.^[6] With the rise of county economy, the growth rate of floating population outside Henan Province has slowed down obviously. The migrating population in the province is increasing, as they can take care of their families while working as migrant workers in the county (city, district). This strategy has become the first choice for most migrant workers.^[7]

L County, with a total population of about 760,000, located in the hinterland of the Central Plains, has developed the transportation which can connect the east with the west and the south with the north. Its total economic output ranks first in the city. It has governed over 14 small towns, 2 subdistrict offices and 367 administrative villages.^[8] In 2014, the General Office of Henan Provincial Government announced the “Implementation Plan for Comprehensive Pilot Work of New Urbanization in Henan Province”. L County was listed as one of the 21 provincial pilot projects in cities and counties. In recent years, L County has taken the construction of a medium-sized city suitable for living and business as its goal, and has vigorously promoted the construction of a city’s characteristic commercial district, an old city reconstruction district, an industrial agglomeration

[5] 桂华 Gui hua,《应对城乡“三元”结构的挑战》Yingdui chengxiang sanyuan jiegou de tiaozhan[Solutions to Challenges from Ternary Structure in Urban and Rural Areas],《环球时报》Huanqiu shibao[Global Times](2019年12月27日),第015版。

[6] 中国社会科学院财经战略研究院课题组 Zhongguo shehui kexueyuan caijing zhanlue yanjiuyuan ketizu,《县域经济:国家治理能力现代化的关键》Xianyu jingji: guojia zhili nengli xiandaihua de guanjian[County Economy: The Key to Modern Country Governance Capacity],《中国社会科学报》Zhongguo shehui kexuebao[China Social Science Journal](2019年12月26日),第001版。

[7] http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2019-06/16/content_5400708.htm, 2019-06-16.

[8] <http://www.linying.gov.cn/Item/5865.aspx>, 2020-02-16.

district, a Huanglong wetland reserve, and village in urban reconstruction district. L County's Industrial Agglomeration Zone has attracted a large amount of foreign capital, with 88 enterprises staying in it, bringing together 12 well-known trademark enterprises in China such as Panpan, Xiyinying and Huaguan Yangyuan. It has become a pilot zone to promote the coordinated development of L County's "three modernizations" (new industrialization, new urbanization and new agricultural modernization), driving nearly 50,000 returned migrant workers to work in their hometown. [9]

2. A Brief History of Christian Development in L County

Christianity has a long history of development in L County. As early as 1910, The China Inland Mission sent preachers to L County and set up the Gospel hall. In 1937, the Gospel hall was separated from China Inland Mission and the local priest presided over the church educational administration. The foreign priest left the county in 1941. During the Cultural Revolution, religious activities were banned. It was not until the reform and opening up that the church gradually resumed worship. In 1985, the "L County Christian Association" and the "Three Self" Patriotic Movement Committee were established. Since the reform and opening up, the development of Christianity in L County has gone through three different stages.

The first stage is a period of rapid growth from the 1980s to the end of the 1990s. According to the Annals of L County, in 1989, there were 7,453 Christians in L County, and 4 Christian churches were opened throughout the county. In 1993, the number of Christian churches increased to 34. In 2000, the number of Christian churches continued to increase to 55, with a total of 114 clergy. [10]

The second stage is from 2000 to 2010. With the acceleration of urbanization in the whole country and Henan Province, the number of migrant workers in L County began to increase. According to the introduction of the leader of the "Three Self" Patriotic Movement Committee, Christianity in L County as a whole entered a period of slow growth.

The third phase is the period after 2010, during which L County began to vigorously promote the construction of new urbanization, and the county economy rose rapidly to absorb a large number of local labor force. In addition, the property price in the county was relatively low compared with that in the prefecture-level cities. Like non-believers, more and more Christian believers also work, buy properties, educate their children and seek medical treatment in county towns. It has gradually become a common phenomenon that the whole family of rural Christian believers resettle in counties and small cities. As a result, the number of Christian believers begun to drop on the whole. In addition, the government's special governance of Christianity since 2018 has also influenced the overall development of Christianity in L County.

As a pilot county of new urbanization in Henan Province, L County can be regarded as an epitome of the new urbanization in the whole country and the rapidly development of county economy. L county can thus typically show the new development and changes of urban and rural Christian mobility in the upsurge of new urbanization.

[9] <http://www.linying.gov.cn/Item/6240.aspx>, 2019-09-12.

[10] 临颍县志编纂委员会 Linying xianzhi bianzuan weiyuanhui [Linying County Annals Compilation Committee]编:《临颍县志(1986—2005)》Linying xian zhi[Linying County Annals (1986—2005)],(评审稿 Pingshen gao [Review Draft], 2013), 597-598.

III. The Changes and Development of the Urban and Rural Christian Churches in L County

This part will discuss the flow of urban and rural Christian and the development and changes of Christianity in L County based on the analysis from five aspects: number and population characteristics of Christian believers, church activities and participation of Christian believers, theological personnel training, theological construction and financial offerings. The main churches involved in the survey include two urban churches (the North Church and the Che Church), and three rural churches (Li Church, Ni Church and Gang Church). Gang Church was only mentioned when analyzing financial offerings.

1. Number of Christian Believers and Population Characteristics

Since 2010, with the advancement of new urbanization in L County, a large number of rural population have begun to flock to the county for employment, purchasing properties and settling down. The number of rural Christian believers began to decline sharply, with an increasing ratio of aging people. Meanwhile, the number of urban Christian believers has continued to grow with the age structure of Christian believers more reasonable and the proportion of young and middle-aged Christian believers gradually increasing.

1.1 Rural Churches: the number of believers began to decline sharply, with an increasing ratio of aging people

This issue will be discussed based on analysis of Li Church and Ni Church.

Li Church's last new building was built in 2014. The total number of seats can basically accommodate 800—900 people. However, soon after the Church was built, the number of Christian believers attending gatherings began to shrink, and the shrinkage increased year by year. According to the leader of the church, when the new church was built in 2014, the number of church-goers was 400—500. Now, with the addition of the church-goers after the merging,^[11] only 300 people have been registered. The author visited the Li church twice during Spring Festival in 2019, the number of people attending gatherings in Li Church may be even smaller. The first field observation was conducted on the 6th day of the Chinese Lunar New Year, and only about 200 people gathered on Sunday worship. The second visit was conducted on the 9th of the new year, when the church held a Spring Festival revival gathering,^[12] and the number of church-goers was only about 300. The Spring Festival is the peak period for migrant workers to return home, and we can infer that the number of people who come to the church to attend worship at ordinary times may be less than 200. When talking about the development of rural churches, the leader of Li Church said: "Around 1996, the choir made more than 80 suits of clothes, but during this Christmas, the number of believers attending the choir was only over 40, and they were all members of the old choir with the age of at or above 60 years old. Now the young Christian believers have gone out to work, and those with

[11] In the government's special campaign, some church sites were cancelled and believers were transferred to the merged church sites.

[12] The Spring Festival revival gathering is organized by the the "L County Christian Association" and the "Three Self" Patriotic Movement Committee, which usually lasts for 2—3 days. The "L County Christian Association" and the "Three Self" Patriotic Movement Committee send outstanding theological students and preachers from various churches to preach in various villages and towns.

children have also taken their parents-in-law to city. People are getting older and older. Therefore, the development of the rural church is facing crisis". When the author visited Sun Village under the government of Li Church, a villager said that "8 or 9 out of the 10 households have moved away."

The last new building of Ni Church was built in 2011. The new church was renovated into a two-story building based on the old building. The hall on the second floor can accommodate nearly 600 people. The author attended the Sunday worship of the Ni Church during the National Day in 2019, and found that the number of Christian believers was only about 160. According to Zhang Mei who is in charge of a village gathering site, the number of believers in her village reached 80—90 at the most, but at present there were only less than 20 people, and most of them were over 60 years old. Most Christian believers in the village bought houses in the county.

To sum up, from the fact that the two rural churches were both built after 2010, and the number of Christian believers in rural areas has decreased significantly since the new church was built. It can be inferred that the period around 2010 is an important time point for obvious changes in the number of Christian believers in rural areas, and it is also since 2010 that L County has started to promote the development of new urbanization and rapidly develop the county economy.

1.2 Urban churches: the number of church-goers is increasing and the proportion of young and middle-aged Christian believers is raising

Compared with the rural churches, the number of church-goers of North Church and Che Church in county town is increasing, and the proportion of young and middle-aged Christian believers is raising year by year.

North Church is the earliest church in L County. Its predecessor was the Gospel hall established by the China Inland Mission. Its last new building was built in 2007 with the help of the Christian believers throughout the county, covering an area of about 8.8 acres in Bei Village. The North Church, located in the northeast of L County, used to be the urban-rural fringe. With the development and construction of a new urbanizing project named "two cities, one district and one base",^[13] the county continued to expand outward. At present, Bei Village has gradually developed into a core area of the county. Gulou commercial district, Huanglong wetland reserve and industrial area are all situated nearby. With numerous commercial residential buildings, well-equipped commercial, entertainment, medical and educational facilities, it has attracted a large rural population to work and live nearby.

The North Church is a three-floor building. The first floor is a large parking garage, the second floor a Children Sunday School lobby, and the third floor a gathering hall, which can accommodate about 1200 people. Sunday worship is divided into three sessions: morning, afternoon and evening. According to the author's observation, about 900—1,000 people attend in the morning service and about 500 people attend in the afternoon service. The Christian believers in the North Church are mainly composed of urban residents, surrounding rural farmers and migrant workers. With the increase of young and middle-aged migrant workers in this church, the age structure of the North

[13] "Two Cities, One District and One Base" mainly refers to the new industrial city with an asset of 100 billion yuan, the civilized ecological new city, the new rural construction demonstration district and the logistics and e-commerce bases in the central and southern Henan market.

Church is more reasonable, and the Church has become very lively and energetic. The North Church also set up a special youth gathering on Friday evening, and the worship and praise gathering on Saturday evening was mainly led by young and middle-aged Christian believers. The on-site interaction and atmosphere were very exciting.

The last new building of Che Church was also built in 2007. It was located in the southwest of the county, near Guo Village and Xing Village in the urban-rural fringe. As Xing Village has gradually developed into a distribution center for small commodity markets, this area has gathered a large number of migrant population to do small business here. Moreover, the county government has in recent years renovated Guo Village by constructing a large number of buildings around them. The surrounding educational resources are relatively rich. The best senior high school in the county is located nearby. Many rural residents have bought houses and settled here. The place has gradually become the core area of the county too. The Sunday worship of the Che Church is divided into the morning service and the afternoon service. The author attended a morning service, and the hall was full of people with number of 500—600. The Christian believers were mainly composed of nearby urban residents, small commodity traders, small shop owners, and farmers settled in the county. According to the author's observation, among the believers who sit down, the young and middle-aged account for a large proportion.

2. Church Activities and Participation of Christian Believers

In terms of church activities and Christian believers' participation, the gap between urban churches and rural churches is also widening. This comparative analysis is based on the observations of the North Church in the county and the Ni Church in the village.

2.1 The North Church in the county

The daily activities are very frequently held in the North Church (see Table 3-1 below for details). There are gatherings almost every day. Except for the worship and praise gatherings on Tuesday and Saturday evening, and the prayer gatherings on Thursday evening, there are services from morning to evening every day. The services are composed of praise, prayer and sermon. According to the leader of the North Church, the daily service started in 2007 when the new Church was built, and some Christian believers suggested that this tradition should be preserved. So it lasts until today.

The author participated in and observed several activities. The number of participants in the North Church's daily preach gathering was not very large, with an average of about 10—20 people, 30—40 people at most, mainly the elderly. The number of participants in the prayer gathering on Thursday night was relatively large, totaling about 150 people. On Saturday, there were more people attending the Praise gathering, totaling about 500—600 people, mainly led by 14 young people. There were 8 lead singers, all uniformly dressed. They were also equipped with 3 piano players, 2 guitarists and 1 drummer. The leaders and the congregation also had a lot of on-site interaction. For example, the congregation would be invited to applaud, raise their hands, follow the beat to make movements, etc in an exciting atmosphere. The pastor would also be invited to sermon in the last stage of the praise meeting.

Table 3-1 Activities of North Church

Time	Early Morning	Morning	Afternoon	Evening
Monday	Morning prayer	Preaching gathering	Preaching gathering	Preaching gathering
Tuesday	Morning prayer	Preaching gathering	Preaching gathering	Worship and Praise gathering
Wednesday	Morning prayer	Preaching gathering	Preaching gathering	Preaching gathering
Thursday	Morning prayer	Preaching gathering	Preaching gathering	Prayer gathering
Friday	Morning prayer	Preaching gathering	Preaching gathering	Young Christian Gathering; middle-aged Christian Gathering
Saturday	Morning prayer	Preaching gathering	Preaching gathering	Worship and Praise gathering
Sunday	Morning prayer	Worship and sermon	Worship and sermon	Worship and sermon

In addition, the author also observed and recorded the Sunday worship in the North Church, and found that the Sunday worship in the North Church was carried out in an orderly manner, with special parking guides wearing armbands, and receptionists in uniform at the entrance of the party hall on the third floor. After entering the hall, there was also someone to guide them to their seats. The whole worship is carried out through fairly complete procedures, including Scripture reading, congregation singing, prayer, reading apostle’s epistles, choir performance, welcoming new friends, sermon, reading witness and prayer requests, announcing notification, praying, and blessing (see Table 3-2 below for details).

Table 3-2 Procedures for Sunday Worship of The North Church^[14]

	Procedures	Description
1	The host greets and reads the scripture.	
2	The congregation stand up and sing together	51 New Psalm “It is a blessing to have Jesus.”
3	The host prays on behalf of the congregation.	
4	The congregation read the epistles of the apostles	
5	Hymn performed by the choir	317 New Hymn “Heavenly Family Is Most Beautiful, Jesus Loves You”
6	Welcome new friends	The new friends stand up and the congregations applaud.
7	Sermon	The preacher sings, “Blessed are the Christians”, leading the congregation to pray, read the scriptures, sermon, and pray
8	Read testimony and prayer requests	The host reads out the congregation testimony and prayer requests.
9	Announcements	Reported by host
10	The leader of the church pray	Pray for church and announced prayer requests.
11	The congregation recite the Lord’s prayer	
12	The leader of the church gives the blessing and final prayer	

[14] It is collated based on the Sunday service that the author participated in the observation on the morning of September 29, 2019.

2.2 The Ni Church in the Village

Compared with the North Church in the county, the Ni Church has much fewer daily activities. At present, the activities mainly include Sunday morning worship; Thursday evening Bible study class, Saturday evening prayer gathering and daily Morning Prayer (see Table 3-3 below for details).

Table 3-3 Activities of The Ni Church

Time	Early Morning	Morning	Afternoon	Evening
Monday	Morning prayer			
Tuesday	Morning prayer			
Wednesday	Morning prayer			
Thursday	Morning prayer			Bible class
Friday	Morning prayer			
Saturday	Morning prayer			Prayer gathering
Sunday	Morning prayer	Worship and sermon		

The participation of Christian believers is as follows: about 10–15 people take part in Morning prayer, and about 40–50 people take part in Bible class on Thursday night, and about 20–30 people take part in prayer gathering on Saturday night, and about 150–200 people take part in Sunday worship. However, the participation of rural Christian believers is also affected by the seasons. Generally speaking, compared with the slack season, the number of Christian believers attending gatherings will be smaller during the busy farming season, and sometimes the activities will be cancelled.

The Sunday service procedure of Ni Church is also relatively simple (see Table 3-4 below for details). As a large number of young and middle-aged people leave the village to work, there is no more choir performance in Sunday worship, and the traditional testimony moment has been cancelled in the past two years.

Table 3-4 Sunday Service Procedures of the Ni Church^[15]

	Procedures	Description
1	The host greets and prays	
2	Sermon	
3	The host prays	
4	Congregation singing	“In love I want to declare”
5	The leader of the church blesses and prays	
6	Announcements	
7	The congregation recites the Lord’s prayer	

Through the comparison of urban and rural churches, we found that, in terms of activity frequency, activity content and worship procedures, urban churches are relatively dynamic and their

[15] It is collated based on the author’s participation in observing Sunday service on the morning of October 6, 2019.

activities are well-managed, while rural churches lack vitality and their activities are relatively simplified, and the tradition of “testimony”, which had a long history, has disappeared in the past two years in rural churches. In a word, the rural churches has reduced its attraction to the remaining believers and non-believers.

3. Training of Theological personnel

Almost all theology students of the rural church in L County come from the county Bible training class which was established in 1995. The program lasted one year at first three years, and then changed into two years. There were 4—5 full-time teachers in the class. Other teachers are visiting teachers who usually teach in a short period of time, for 3—5 days. The teaching content of the course is mainly Bible learning, supplemented by some pastoral courses. There were in total 12 terms graduated from the class, each term with 50—100 students enrolled. In 2017, the county Bible training class was closed.

The rural churches in L County generally pay more attention to building facilities than to training theological students. For example, In the Ni church, theology students only have a monthly living allowance of 300 Yuan. As migration becomes the mainstream culture in the local area in recent years, many theology students in rural churches went outside. The theology students who stay in the rural areas were often overwhelmed by the great tension between faith and secular society. A theology student in Ni church said: “I pray for the Lord to prepare a job that can both provide time to serve and earn money. I am still young, if I have been at home all the time, others will gossip.” Another theology student said: “In the age of money, young people all go out to earn money. Migrant workers can earn more than 1,000 Yuan as a dishwasher. It is very difficult to support my life with subsidies from the church. I have to support my families. Sometimes I also want to escape from the service.”

The training and generation continuation of theology students in urban churches are relatively better. Besides the graduates from the county Bible training classes, younger theology students who have a high school degree or higher degree can be sent to Henan Theological Seminary, Zhongnan Theological Seminary or Nanjing Jinling Theological Seminary to study theology undergraduate. For example, in the North Church, there are 4—5 young theology students graduating from the seminaries mentioned above. Moreover, the income of theology students in the urban church is relatively better. A couple of theology students from the Che Church said that they have a monthly subsidy of 3,000—4,000 Yuan, which is fully sufficient.

After the government’s special governance of Christianity in 2018, relevant government departments require that future theology students should be sent to formal seminary qualified by the state, and should meet the requirement for education background and age limit. This will undoubtedly further aggravate the differentiation between urban churches and rural churches in the cultivation of theology students.

4. Theology Construction

The survey found that the beliefs of Christian believers in L County are generally of great practicality and utilitarianism. They pay more attention to the treatment of diseases, the success and blessing, economic income and good work brought by beliefs to families. In public prayers, some words expressing secular success, such as “everything goes well”, and “happiness for a lifetime”, are

often brought into prayers. The testimony read out at the end of Sunday worship is almost all about success in disease treatment, children's schooling, examinations, work, finding a partner, pregnancy, etc. A Christian believer said: "We believe that the Lord must let others see that we are children of God. Believing in the Lord is good for us."

In addition, the church in L County also has the obvious charismatic inclination, characterized by folk religious belief. It is mainly represented in the following aspects. Firstly, in worship and praise, the congregation will clap hands, applaud, dance, speak dialects and laugh. Secondly, it is also common for Christian believers to have strange dreams and to see visions. For example, one preacher of Che Church was told by an elder who can see vision that God had chosen her exceptionally and she should go to study theology. During the interview, the author often heard believers talking about what dreams they had and how God inspired them. Thirdly, it is about curing diseases and driving out demons. When the leader of the church prays for sick believers, they usually make the believers put their hands on the part of the body which is sick and pray to drive out the sick spirit in the name of the Lord. However, The author found that they did not understand or pay attention to what Christianity is really about, neither to the teachings and doctrines of Christianity.

With the reduction of rural church clergy and volunteers, the weakening of pastoral ability, and the lack of discernment and resistance of some elderly believers, in addition to the background of the overall pragmatism of the church belief in L County and the neglect of doctrine, heresy cults have been especially rampant in rural areas in recent years. The "Blood and Holy Spirit" heresy first appeared in L County around 2012, and has began to spread to the rural areas in recent years. A long-term residence has been set up in Hu Village under the government of the Ni Church and the leading quarters of the heresy been set up in another nearby village. They openly "rob sheep" from the churches. And the "Eastern Lightning" heresy has resurfaced in some villages under the government of the Li Church.

In addition to the invasion of heretical cults from outside, the internal pastoral situation of the rural churches is also relatively chaotic. Due to the lack of pastoral talents, some churches indiscriminately absorb learning materials from all over the country. The author participated in the morning prayer of the Ni Church and found that the material they used was a book called "Song of Songs" brought back by a believer from her relatives in Heilongjiang province. The author browsed the book and found it a word by word interpretation of the Song of Songs in bible, full of personal subjective experiences and feelings. It also recorded the words the Holy Spirit said to the church and songs sung by the Holy Spirit. The Ni Church not only promotes and learns this material throughout the church, but also encourages believers to join the organization's WeChat official website and learn other sermons and materials. From this incident, we can get a glimpse of the chaos in the theological construction of rural churches.

However, the sermons of the urban churches is relatively more faithful to the Bible. Moreover, the author discovered that in the youth gathering in the North Church, believers adopted a novel way of group discussion and attached great importance to the interaction between the scripture and the believers. During one field investigation, The sub-theme of the gathering was "looking at your self-worth through the characters in the Bible", and the leaders interpreted deeply to help the believers apply the bible to their personal lives.

5. Financial Offerings

With a large number of rural believers settling down in county, the gap between the offering income of rural churches and urban churches is gradually widening. In the old urbanization stage, rural believers often returned home from time to time after going out to work, and brought their offerings back to their hometown. In particular, the Spring Festival is the peak period for migrant workers returning home, and it is also the period when rural churches receive the most offerings. However, with the development of new urbanization, believers have “uprooted” and settled down in county towns. Offerings from rural areas have been decreased continually, and offerings from churches in county towns have continued to grow. For example, the offerings of the Che church in the county is as high as 250,000 Yuan in just two months, while the Li church’s income in the last quarter is only 36,892 Yuan, in addition to the special offerings of Christmas.

In addition, if we look at the building of the Church, Urban churches are very modern in both external architecture and internal decoration. However, Some rural churches are still very crude, for example, the church building of Gang Church is still rebuilt from the original three-storey tile house. The internal facilities are very scarce. There are neither infrastructure such as holy platforms and projectors, nor special offices and parking sheds. Believers’ vehicles are parked in the alley outside the church. And the alley is still a dirt road, which makes it difficult for vehicles to enter in rainy days.

IV. Conclusion

To sum up, through the analysis of the development and changes of urban churches and rural churches in L County in the past ten years, we think that the differentiation of urban and rural churches is getting worse and worse under the background of new urbanization. Although such differentiation, especially in some aspects, such as financial offerings and theological personnel training already existed in the old urbanization period, even before the rise of urbanization in the late 1990s. However, the wave of urbanization of migrant workers brought about by the new urbanization in the past ten years undoubtedly intensified further the differentiation of urban and rural churches, making the problem even more prominent.

In addition, since 2018, the government’s special governance measures in Henan Province has sharply reduced the number of rural churches, and the number of churches in county town remains unchanged. Some people may think that it is because of the government’s governance measures that the gap between rural churches and urban churches has further widened, but we think that the government’s special governance measures are not the main reason that affects the intensification of the differentiation between rural and urban churches. The urbanization of the agricultural transfer population, and the wave of settlement brought about by the new urbanization are the fundamental reasons.

Judging from the current situation, it is a general trend for rural churches to decline and fall. However, with the implementation of the rural revitalization and development strategy put forward by the government in 2017, if believers who flow to cities or towns can be attracted back to their hometowns to start their own businesses, it may also bring new opportunities to rural churches.

which requires researchers to continue to follow up and pay attention. Although the development of urban churches is on the rise as a whole, it also faces many challenges and difficulties;

Firstly, there is a tension between the increasing number of believers and the limited capacity of the church. With the emphasis of the state on “promoting the development of new urbanization with county towns as an important carrier”, Financial transfer payments and public expenditures will be more transferred to county towns. Predictably, in the next few years, it will continue to attract more migrant workers flowing out of the province back to the county for employment and buying houses. So the number of believers in county towns will continue to rise, but according to the author’s research and observation, the space in the church hall in county has been slightly tight at present. How to cope with the continuous influx of new comers in the future is a problem to deal with as soon as possible.

Secondly, there is a tension between the diversity of believers and the “rough” way of pastoring of migrant workers. Although the educational level, occupational distribution, living background and lifestyle of the believers in the county are not as complicated as those in the first and second tier cities, the identity differentiation between urban residents and farmers settled down in the county still exists. For the farmers, they need to adapt to the new social and church environment. The new urbanization not only asks migrant workers to adapt the mode of modern industrial operation, but also to change to modern civilized lifestyle.^[16] In the future, it is necessary to think about whether the church can play an active role in promoting the urbanization of migrant workers and help the believers from rural areas to integrate into cities and urban churches.

Thirdly, the form of activities is relatively traditional and its attraction to young and middle-aged believers is generally insufficient. At present, the main form of activities of the churches in L counties is still the traditional “preach gathering”, that is, the preachers “speak” and the believers “listen”, and most of the participants are the elderly. Although the worship and praise gathering of the Northern Church and the youth group have certain innovations and attractions in their activities, they are still far from enough. The number of participants in the youth group gathering is not very large, only about 10 people. In the future, with the diversification of the structure of believers, the demand of believers will also take on diversified directions. Apart from economic problems, the demand for paying attentions to psychological and emotional problems will continue to rise. It is urgent for urban churches to continuously innovate their forms of activities according to the diversified needs of believers, so as to attract more young and middle-aged believers to actively participate.

Fourthly, church leaders are characterized by tendencies of aging, feminization and lack of theological education, The phenomom of patriarchy is also very serious. In the early days, the church leaders in L County were older believers who were enthusiastic about church affairs and had certain qualifications and prestige. In recent years, they began to seek intentionally to pass their authority to the next generation, but the replacement was still relatively slow and church leaders have generally become aged. Most of the church directors in L County are 55 to 65 years old, and the director of the North Church is as old as 70 years old. From a gender perspective, in the 1980s and

[16] 李强 Liqiang,《人的城镇化的本意》Ren de chengzhenhua de benyi[The original intention of human urbanization],《北京日报》Beijing ri bao[Beijing Daily](2018年05月14日),第013版.

1990s, the proportion of male church leaders was on the high side, but in recent years, the proportion of female church leaders has become higher and higher, and the proportion has far exceeded that of male. Most of these church leaders did not receive systematic theological training either. Therefore, aging, feminization and lack of theological training have become the main characteristics of church leaders in L County. In terms of governance, patriarchy is also adopted, and democratic consultation governance within the church has a long way to go.

The above discussion is mainly based on the analysis of the development and changes of urban and rural churches in L County in central Henan. Although it is a case study, to a certain extent, it also reflects some new situations and trends in the flow of believers in urban and rural areas in recent years under the background of new urbanization. In the future, with “new urbanization centered on county towns” gradually becoming the development focus and general trend of urbanization in China, the development of county churches still needs more scholars’ attention and in-depth research.

中文题目：

新型城镇化与县域城乡基督教会发展变迁研究——以豫中 L 县为例

赵罗英, 助理研究员

中国北京市海淀区中国社会科学院民族学与人类学研究所

电话: +8618001098662, 信箱: zhaoluoying1984@163.com

摘要: 改革开放以来, 中国经历了旧城镇化和新型城镇化两个阶段。近年来随着县域经济的崛起, 以县城为中心的新型城镇化成为促进农业转移人口市民化的重要方式, 并对城乡基督教的发展格局产生了重要影响。本文以豫中 L 县为个案, 从信徒数量与人口特征、组织活动与信徒参与、神学人才培养、神学建设、经济奉献五个方面具体分析了近年来 L 县城乡信徒流动的新趋势和城乡教会的发展变迁。研究发现, 在新型城镇化背景下, 农村教会与城镇教会的差距进一步加剧。农民“拔根”式的进城定居, 使得农村信徒数量大幅减少、老龄化越来越凸出, 且教会组织活动单一、简化, 神学人才流失严重, 农村异端邪教重新肆虐, 经济奉献萎缩。农村教会走向凋敝已是大趋势, 城镇教会虽然整体处于发展上升期, 但也面临不少挑战与困难。

关键词: 新型城镇化; 县域; 乡村教会; 城镇教会

中西经典与圣经

Chinese and Western Classics and the Bible

New Research on Confucian Christian Liu Ning during early Qing Dynasty

XIAO Qinghe

(Professor, Department of History, Shanghai University)

Abstract: Researches on common Christians in the early Qing dynasty is relatively scarce. This essay tried to uncover and investigate the family, lives, writings, communications and thought of Liu Ning, who was a Christian and also a Confucian adept in studying ancient Confucian classics and Chinese philology and phonology in the early Qing. Some new historical materials prove that Liu was born in 1620, not as some scholars said in 1625; and he died nearly in 1715 when he was 96 years old. He was probably baptized by Prosper Intorcetta (1625—1696) in Nanfeng County or by other missionaries before Liu went to Chongyi County to hold the position of Confucian instructor in 1687. This essay also discusses some of Liu's thoughts, such as Restoring Confucianism and Replacing Buddhism and so on. The last part points out the changes of Christianity's legitimacy from the late Ming to the early Qing dynasties and concludes some main reasons for these changes.

Key Words: Liu Ning (family, lives, writings), Restoring Confucianism and Replacing Buddhism, Communications, Chinese Philology and Phonology, faith

Author: XIAO Qinghe, Ph. D., Director of the Center for the Study of Religion and Chinese Society; Professor, Department of History, Shanghai University. Qinghexiao@gmail.com

Introduction

The number of Catholics in the early Qing dynasty grew rapidly after Yang Guangxian's (杨光先, 1597—1669) anti-Catholicism movement (1664—1669). Before the prohibition of Catholicism by the Kangxi Emperor as a result of the Chinese Rites Controversy, Chinese Catholicism had in fact entered a golden age in the history of Christianity in China.^[1] Unlike the late Ming Dynasty, the social and intellectual environment of the early Qing Dynasty had undergone significant changes. The third generation of believers also differed from the late Ming in their beliefs and ideas. For example, Zhang Xingyao (张星曜), a believer in Hangzhou, explicitly stated that Catholicism could be “complying with Confucianism” (合儒), “complementary to Confucianism” (补儒) and “super-

[1] Nicolas Standaert, *Handbook of Christianity in China: Volume One (635—1800)*. Leiden; Boston; Brill, 2001, pp. 382-383.

Confucianism” (超儒)。^[2] In explaining the legitimacy of Catholicism, third-generation believers also adopted a different strategy from that of the late Ming Dynasty, with the “Restoration of Confucianism” as the main content.

At present, many researches focus on the famous missionaries such as Adam Schall von Bell (汤若望, 1591—1666) and Ferdinand Verbiest (南怀仁, 1623—1688), as well as important historical events such as the Chinese Rites Controversy.^[3] There were few studies on the common believers and their lives and thoughts. In this paper, we take the Confucian Christian Liu Ning (刘凝, 1620—1715?) as an example, and examine Liu Ning’s family, life, and religious thoughts, to explore the faith and thought of the third generation of Confucian Christians in early Qing. The previous studies on Liu Ning were mostly on his contribution to the study of ancient Chinese characters and Chinese phonetics. This paper will first examine Liu Ning’s family, life, and writings, then examine Liu Ning’s contacts and baptism, and then again use the book *Jue Si Lu* (Awakening the Truth, 《觉斯录》) and other works as the object of analysis to examine the characteristics of Liu Ning’s thoughts and beliefs, and finally to analyze the changes of defense on Catholics by these Confucian Christians from the late Ming to the early Qing dynasty.^[4]

On Liu Ning’s Family, Life and Writings

According to the Genealogy of Lius in Nanfeng (《南丰刘氏世谱》) which was an appendix to the Biography of Mr. Shuicun (《水村先生行实》) written by Liu Ning, the ancestor of the Lius in Nanfeng was Liu Jin (刘金), a native of Pengcheng (彭城), who was appointed as the governor of Hao Zhou (濠州) and Chu Zhou (滁州) in Tang Dynasty. The thirteenth grandson of Liu Jin was the well-known Confucian Liu Xun (刘熏, 1240—1319) in the late Song and early Yuan. He was also the fourteenth ancestor of Liu Ning. According to the Biography of Mr. Shui Cun, Liu Xun, with style name of Qi Qian (起潜), was known as Shui Cun (水村):

[2] Nicolas Standaert, *Handbook of Christianity in China*, p. 433; D. E. Mungello, *The Forgotten Christians of Hangzhou*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, c1994, p. 70.

[3] Current researches on these topics, please refer to the Chinese Text Database, which was managed by Ad Dudink and Nicolas Standaert, the website is: <https://www.arts.kuleuven.be/sinologie/english/cct> (cited date: July 13, 2020).

[4] These dictionaries have introduced Liu Ning briefly, such as Huang Kaiguo (黄开国) edited, *Jingxue cidian* (《经学辞典》), Chengdu: Sichuan People’s Press, 1993, pp. 132, 211, 632; Xu Jialu (许嘉璐) edited, *Chuantong yuyanxue cidian* (《传统语言学辞典》), Shijiazhuang: Hebei Education Press, 1990, pp. 246-247. Wang Zhongmin (王重民) was the first to point out that Liu Ning was a Catholic, see Wang Zhongmin, “Ba aiutang ben Yinju tongyi” (《跋爱余堂本隐居通议》), originally published in *Tushu jikan* (《图书季刊》), June 1945, new Volume 6, No. 1 and 2, collected in Wang Zhongmin, *Zhongguo shanbenshu tiyao* (《中国善本书提要》), Shanghai: Shanghai Rare Books Press, 1983, p. 7. Other researches on Liu Ning, see Zhou Yiliang (周一良) edited, *Zhongwai wenhua jiaoliushi* (《中外文化交流史》), Zhengzhou: Henan People’s Press, 1987, p. 55; Zheng Ande (郑安德), “Dousi de zhongguo mingchen: mingmo jidujiao shenming zhi zheng” (《“陡斯”的中国名称——明末基督教神名之争》), in *Tianwen* (《天问》) (Volume of Bingxu), Nanjing: Jiangsu People’s Press, 2006, pp. 24-26; Adrian Dudink, “The Rediscovery of a Seventeenth-century Collection of Chinese Christian Texts: The Manuscript *Tianxue Jijie*”, in *Sino-Western Cultural Relation Journal*, XV (1993), pp. 1-26; Nicolas Standaert, *Handbook of Christianity in China: Volume One (635—1800)*, p. 435; Knud Lundbæk, Joseph de Prémare, 1666—1736, S. J.: Chinese philology and figurism. Aarhus C, Denmark: Aarhus University Press, 1991; Li Zhen (李真), “Liu Ning and Juesilu” (《刘凝与觉斯录》), in *International Sinology* (《国际汉学》), Volume 17, Zhengzhou: Daxiang chubanshe, 2009, pp. 184-195; Ping-yi Chu, “Liu Ning and Liu Xun: The Relationship between Learning from Heaven and Evidential Studies” (《刘凝与刘熏: 考证学与天学关系新探》), in *Xinshixue* (《新史学》), 23 (2012): 57-104.

(He) was very filial to his mother and always glad to do righteous deeds. He was very generous to his friends and sympathized with the poor. He always tried his best to save others from distress and difficulties with no care of the cost. He was content with his states in poor and was not moved by the benefits and official positions. He studied the classic scriptures and ancient history, collected hundreds of books, and wrote papers like a gushing spring. He was thirty-seven years old and the Song Dynasty had fallen, when many literati sacrificed for the country. He worried about that their deeds and names would disappear in history. Thus, he compiled the Book The Poems of Ten Loyalists with Complementary History (《补史十忠诗》). He was well familiar with the society, customs, military strategy and geography and was valued by the great dukes from the north. At fifty-five years old, he was recommended by the officials to hold the position of instructor of the province. He enlightened the students and made constitutions and regulations. He also keen on revering the former saints and honoring their loyalties. The sacrifice in the tomb of Zeng Gung (曾巩) with posthumous name Wen Ding) was longtime abolished. On the day of ceremony of opening of schools, he performed the rituals with students as before through day and night. After seventy years old, he was recommended by Duke of Zang to the imperial court and was promoted to hold the position of professor of Yan Ping. After he retired, he taught other students privately for three years. …… What he wrote included Jingshuo jiangyi (《经说讲义》), Shuiyuncun mingao (《水云村泯稿》), Yinggao (《吟稿》), Aijian sidualu (《哀鉴思华录》), Yinju tongyi (《隐居通义》), Zhonghua fuzaoji (《中华黼藻集》), Xuanding guji shiwen (《选定古今诗文》). …… He died at the age of eighty. The local gentlemen and his disciples proposed his posthumous name as Wen Ding (文定) and was buried in Caijia keng (蔡家坑) of Xianren shi (仙人石).^[5]

Liu Xun's writings such as Yinjun tongyi, Shuiyuncun gao, Bushi shizhongshi were well-known to the world because they were collected by Siku quanshu (Complete Library in Four Sections, 《四库全书》).^[6] Liu Xun was a major representative of the school of the learning of Lu Jiuyuan (陆九渊) in the early Yuan Dynasty. The editors of Siku quanshu said that Liu Xun believed in Lu Jiuyuan as the orthodox of the Confucianism and started the discussion on the "Definitive Conclusion of Zhu Xi" (朱子晚年定论) in his later life which Wang Yangming (王阳明) argued in details in late Ming dynasty.^[7]

Liu Ning's grandfather, Liu Xuan (刘烜), with a style name of Qiyao (启耀), and a pseudonym of Wentai (文台), was a tribute student in the twenty-third years of Wanli Emperor reign, and held

[5] Liu Ning, Shuicun xiansheng zhuan (《水村先生传》), appendix to Shuicun xiansheng xingshi (《水村先生行实》), printed in Qing dynasty, collected in Shanghai Library, pp. 16a-17b. Zhengguo edited, (Kangxi) Nanfeng Xianzhi (《南丰县志》), volume 7, printed in 1685, collected in Shanghai Library, pp. 26a-27b.

[6] Liu Xun, Yinju tongyi, collected in Siku quanshu, Book 866, Taipei: Commercial Press, 1985; Liu Xun, Shuiyun cun gao, collected in Siku quanshu, Book 1195; Liu Xun, Zhongyiji, collected in Siku quanshu, Book 1366.

[7] Research on Liu Xun's thought, see Xu Yuanhe (徐远和), Lixue yu yuandai shehui (《理学与元代社会》), Beijing: People's Press, 1992, pp. 215-231.

the position of instructor (训导) in Ji'an (吉安) county, Jiangxi Province, and then held the position of teacher (教谕) in Minqing (闽清) County Fujian Province.^[8] Liu Ning's father, Liu Guanhuan (刘冠寰), was the third son of Liu Xuan, with a style name of Shangzhi (尚之), and a pseudonym of Shu'an (恕庵) and was a selected tribute student in the second year of Tianqi Emperor reign.^[9] Liu Ning's descendant, Liu Simei (刘斯媚),^[10] the 20th grandson of Liu Xun, proofread and engraved the Shuiyun cunmin gao, with the following Biography of Mr. Shu'an (《恕庵先生传》).

Liu Guanhuan, with a style name of Shangzhi and a pseudonym of Shu'an, was a native of Nanfeng. He had a high moral character and admired former saints. He was particularly fond of talking about the affairs of the world, and was a good teacher and friend. He was modest and eager to learn. Zhu Guang who was a civilian in Sui'an was known for his learning on the study of Li (reason). Fan Dounan, a native of Nanfeng was known for his strategy. Both lowered themselves to follow him as their teacher. He had accumulated tens of thousands of books. He had tried to compile ancient and contemporary poems and named it Shiwen guanglun huibian (《诗文广轮汇编》), like the style of Pajing waizhuan (《葩经外传》). He was recommended as a tribute student by Huang Ruheng (黄汝亨) and Dong Qichang (董其昌) in the second year of Tianqi Emperor reign. After hearing that Ruheng was in the trickle of the Party of the eunuch Wei Zhongxian (魏忠贤), he sighed and said: "can I still be an official?". So, he decided to resign.^[11]

Liu Yun, the eldest son of Liu Ning, also said in "Shu'an yigao xiaoyin" (《恕庵遗稿小引》):

Mr. Shu'an was born in the late Ming Dynasty. He was determined to study poems and literatures. He collected the words of all kinds of schools and philosophers and wrote articles to discuss issues based on other peoples' merits. He was also very good at discussing events and thinking about the plans for the world. He tried to use his plan and thought. However, he was unfortunate to live in the end of Ming dynasty. There were lots of wars and fighting. He did not fulfill his wish at last.^[12]

According to these materials, Liu Guanhuang was friendly with Huang Ruheng (1558—1626) and Dong Qichang (董其昌, 1555—1636). Huang was a disciple of Yang Tingyun's (杨廷筠, 1562—1627) father, Yang Zhaofang (杨兆坊), and was the teacher of Xiong Ming-ru (熊明遇, 1580—

[8] Zhengguo edited, (Kangxi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 5, p. 24a; Volume 8, pp. 1a-b; (Minguo) Minqing Xianzhi, volume 3, in Zhongguo fangzhi congshu, no. 101, Taipei: Chengwen chubanshe, 1967, p. 99; (Tongzhi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 24, printed in the ten years of Tongzhi, collected in Shanghai Library, pp. 20b-21a.

[9] Zhengguo edited, (Kangxi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 5, p. 25a; Mengzhao, Huangyou edited, Jianchang fuzhi, volume 30, printed in 1759, collected in China National Library, p. 21a; (Tongzhi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 24, p. 26b.

[10] About Liu Simei, see (Tongzhi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 27, p. 1a-b.

[11] Liu Guanhuan edited, Liu Simei revised, Shu'an xiansheng zhuan (《恕庵先生传》), appendix to Shuiyuncun mingao (《水云村泯稿》), printed in the year of Dingyou of Daoguang, the edition of Aiyutang, collected in Shanghai Library; Zhengguo edited, (Kangxi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 8, p. 5a.

[12] Liu Guanhuan edited, Liu Simei revised, Shu'an yigao xiaoyin (《恕庵遗稿小引》), appendix to Shuiyuncun mingao.

1650), and he was also a close friend of Gu Qiyuan (顾起元, 1565—1628).^[13] Yang was a well-known Catholic, and Xiong Mingyu, Gu Qiyuan, Huang Ruheng, and Dong Qichang all had contact with Western learning or Western religion namely Catholicism.

Liu Guanghuan had two sons, Liu Hong (刘鸿) and Liu Ning. Liu Hong, with a style name of Jiankui (建奎), was an attached student of the county school. Liu Ning, with a style name of Er'zhi (二至) and a pseudonym of Zhoutang (籀堂), and had the Christian name of Paulus,^[14] a native of Xiyu (西隅) village, Nanfeng county, Jiangkang prefecture. According to the Biography of Mr. Er'zhi (《二至先生传》) which was an appendix to the Shuiyun cunmin gao,

Liu Ning, with a style name of Er'zhi, was a son of Liu Guanhuang. He entered the official school when he was an adult. He was particularly interested in learning and bought tens of thousands of books and he studied these in depth and especially good at classical philology of six categories of characters. …… He was appointed to hold the instructor of Chongyi County as a tribute student. Chongyi County was in the mountains and was empty and music and schools stopped long time after wars. After fifteen years of services, Liu Ning recruited and rewarded people to join the school and these popular became civilized. Chongyi was a built county and started to compile the gazettes. Liu Ning also accept the position to compile the gazettes. He died without illness at the age of ninety. His son, Liu Du was a granary student of the County school, and feed himself by teaching. He gave more than a hundred stones in rent to his brothers. He was good at reading and learning, and wrote books such as Liji jiyao (《礼记辑要》) and Chunqiu huzhuan (《春秋互传》).^[15]

Liu Ning had seven sons, namely Liu Yun (刘允), Liu Yu (刘俞), Liu Du (刘都), Liu Nie (刘臬), Liu Ran (刘然), Liu Xu (刘许), and Liu Yi (刘异). Liu Du, with a style name of Tianbu (天部), was a government student in the County school. He succeeded his father Liu Ning's characters such as having a passion for ancient and rare books. He and his brother Liu Yun compiled the writings of Liu Ning which tilted Er'zhai wenji. According to the Chongke chongzhitang wenji xu (《重刻崇质堂文集序》) by Liu Du in the Gazette of Nanfeng County (《南丰县志》) in Tongzhi Emperor reign,

I feel deeply that the relationship between me and Mr. Tianpu (天仆) was destined by the Heaven. Firstly, I passed the provincial examination in the year of Ding (丁), and Tianpu also passed the provincial examination in the year of Ding (丁); Secondly, I passed the imperial examination and became a doctor in the year of Jia (甲), and Tianpu

[13] Huang Ruheng, "preface", in Yang Zhaofang, Yangshi shuxun (《杨氏塾训》), Siku quanshu cunmu congshu (《四库全书存目丛书》), part of Zi (子部), book 152, Tainan: Zhuangyan wenhua shiye youxian gongsi, 1996, pp. 85-86; Xiong Mingyu, "preface", in Huang Ruheng, Yulin ji (《寓林集》), Siku jinhui shu congkan (《四库禁毁书丛刊》), part of Ji, book 042, Beijing: Beijing Press, 2000, pp. 18-20; Gu Qiyuan, "preface", in Huang Ruheng, Yulin ji, p. 2-4.

[14] Nicolas Standaert, Handbook of Christianity in China; Volume One (635—1800), p. 401.

[15] Liu Simei revised, Er'zhi xiansheng chuan (《二至先生传》), appendix to Shuiyun cunmin gao (《水云村泯稿》).

also became a doctor in the year of Jia (甲); Thirdly, I ranked in the 120th in the list of those who passed the imperial examination, and Tianpu also ranked in the 120th. All these were clearly destined.^[16]

Tianpu namely was Li Changzuo (李长祚), who was Liu Ning's closely friend and from the same village. Li Changzuo passed the provincial examination in the year of Dingmao of Kangxi Reign (丁卯, 1687), and got the doctor degree in the year of Jiayu (甲戌, 1694). However, there was no record of Liu Du's status as a master or doctor.^[17] Liu Du's believed in "destiny" which shows that he seemed to be a Catholic, although there were no direct materials to prove his Catholic identity.

About Liu Ning's life and family, in addition to the Biography of Mr. Er'zhi, the recordings in the Gazette of Nanfeng County,^[18] the Gazette of Chongyi County (《崇义县志》),^[19] the Gazette of Jianchang Prefecture (《建昌府志》),^[20] and the Gazette of Nan'an Prefecture (《南安府志》)^[21] are almost the same. When he was nearly 20 years old, Liu Ning entered the County School and earned the degree of bachelor. In 1675, Geng Jingzhong rebelled and invaded in Nanfeng County. Commander Xu and General Feng led soldiers to resist the rebels. Liu Ning composed the poem titled "Jishi ershi yun" (《纪实二十韵》) to record the history.^[22] In 1677, Liu Ning became a tribute student in the prefecture school.^[23] In the 26th year of Kangxi Emperor (1687), he was appointed to hold the official position of instructor in Chongyi County.^[24]

Chongyi County is located in the southwest of Jiangxi Province, and is adjacent to Hunan Province. It is in a relatively remote location and full of dangerous mountainous. The establishment of Chongyi County began in the Ming Dynasty.^[25] In the 12th years of the Zhengde Emperor reign (1517), Wang Shouren (王守仁), the right censors of Nanjing, suppressed the Xie Zhishan's (谢志山 or 谢志珊, ? —1517) uprising, and set Chongyi County, as a part of Nan'an (南安) Prefecture. When Liu Ning was the instructor in Chongyi, he wrote an article titled "The Outline of the Honorable Wang Wencheng's Governing Hengshui" (《王文成公经营横水方略》, 1693), which praised Wang Yangming's contributions to Chongyi.

When Liu Ning was appointed as Chongyi's instructor, it was just after the Kangxi Emperor had put down the rebellion of the Three Clans (1673—1681). After the wars, "the city was empty and

[16] (Tongzhi) Nanfeng xianzhi, volume 36, pp. 38-39.

[17] Liu Du said that he earned the doctor degree in the year of Jia, however, there is no record in Mingqing jinshi timing beilu suoyin (《明清进士题名碑录索引》). There is no record in (Tongzhi) Nanfeng Xianzhi either.

[18] (Tongzhi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 25, p. 21.

[19] Wang Baoshu, Feng Baoshan edited, Chongyi Xianzhi (《崇义县志》), volume 7, printed in 1867, collected in Shanghai Library, p. 5.

[20] (Qianlong) Jianchang fuzhi (《建昌府志》), volume 46, printed in the 24 years of Qianlong Reign, collected in China National Library, p. 13.

[21] Huang Mingke, Shi Jingfen, Nan'an fuzhi, volume 15, printed in the 7 years of Tongzhi Reign, in Zhongguo fangzhi congshu (《中国方志丛书》), no. 268, Taipei: Chengwen chubanshe, 1975, p. 1343.

[22] Zhengguo edited, Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 11, p. 37.

[23] Adrian Dudink, "The Rediscovery of a Seventeenth-century Collection of Chinese Christian Texts: The Manuscript Tianxue Jijie", p. 19; (Qianlong) Jianchang fuzhi, volume 30, p. 26.

[24] (Tongzhi) Nan'an fuzhi, volume 11, p. 776.

[25] (Tongzhi) Nan'an fuzhi, volume 15, p. 1274.

the choral music had been resting for a long time”. By “recruiting and enticing people, Liu Ning was able to convert them”. During the period of holding the position of instructor, Liu Ning advocated to build schools, and office room which was named Sanyu shu (三余署). Liu Ning led students to hold the ceremony to commemorate Wang Yangming in the end of Autumn and visited all places of Chongyi County. After visiting, Liu Ning wrote some travelogues such as “A visit to Shaxi dong” (《游沙溪洞记》), “A Tale of Niedu shuilou” (《聂都水楼记》) and so on. He also edited the Gazette of Shaxi Dong (《沙溪洞志》), describing the sceneries and stories in Niedu (聂都) and Tonggang (桶冈).^[26] Liu Ning wrote a poem titled Niedu shiliu jing (《聂都十六景》) which was appraised by the Gazette of Nan’an Prefecture (《南安府志》).^[27]

Liu Ning served as the instructor in Chongyi County for 15 years. In 1702, Liu Ning retired and returned home and compiled the Gazette of Chongyi County (《崇义县志》) which was not finished yet. Regarding Liu Ning’s birth year, Dr. Ad Duink believes that Liu Ning was born in 1625.^[28] However, in the year of Bingzi of Kangxi’s reign (1696), Liu Ning said in the Postscript to the Shuiyuncun yingao jianzhu (《跋水云村吟稿后》): “Thinking of the childish years, suddenly the old of maodie (耄耄) have arrived.”^[29] Maodie” generally refers to about 80 to 90 years old, of course, it also refers to the elderly, but inferred from here, Liu Ning may have been born years earlier than 1625. Liu Ning’s son Liu Du in the postscript of the same book said, the manuscript of this book was firstly revised by Liu Ning in the year of Jisi (己巳) of Kangxi Emperor reign (1689) in his office of Chongyi County. Then Liu Ning still copied it in his own handwriting. After copied two volumes, Liu Ning’s eyes felt painful and he could no longer write in small characters. At this time, Liu Ning would be already eighty years old. Then Liu Ning asked his son Liu Du to continue his work. In the year of Bingxu (丙戌) of Kangxi Emperor Reign (1706), on the day before the Lantern Festival, all the copy works were completed, when Liu Ning already retired and was eighty-seven years old. According to this material, Liu Ning should be born in 1620. In Liu Ning’s later years, he was troubled by kinds of family affairs because of his seven sons, such as Liu Du said, “disputes in the family were very frequent”.^[30]

The date of Liu Ning’s death was unknown. Dr. Ad Dudink inferred that Liu Ning died in 1715. If according to the Biography of Mr. Er’zhi, the Gazette of Nanfeng County, which both stated that Liu Ning “died without illness at ninety years old,” he should die in 1710. In the meantime, Joseph de Prémare (马若瑟, 1666—1736) mentioned respectively in 1728 and 1731 that Liu Ning died at the age of 96.^[31] Accordingly, Liu Ning should die in 1715. However, according the Book titled Tianxue jijie (《天学集解》) which was compiled by Liu Ning, the date the articles collected in this book was

[26] See Chongyixian wenshi ziliao (《崇义县文史资料》), volume 8, 1995, pp. 90-92; Hu Yingjian edited, Jiangxi guwen jinghua congshu (《江西古文精华丛书》), volume of travelogue, Nanchang: Jiangxi People’s Press, 1995, pp. 217-220; (Tongzhi) Chongyi Xianzhi, volume 10, pp. 18-25.

[27] (Tongzhi) Nan’an fuzhi, volume 7, p. 498.

[28] Adrian Dudink, “The Rediscovery of a Seventeenth-century Collection of Chinese Christian Texts: The Manuscript Tianxue Jijie”, p. 1.

[29] Zhang Fujian, “Shuiyuncun mingao xu” (《水云村泯稿序》), in Shuiyun cunmin gao, revised by Liu Simei.

[30] Liu Du, “Ba shuiyuncun yingao hou” (《跋水云村吟稿后》), in Shuiyun cunmin gao, revised by Liu Simei.

[31] Adrian Dudink, “The Rediscovery of a Seventeenth-century Collection of Chinese Christian Texts: The Manuscript Tianxue Jijie”, p. 19.

as late as 1711 or 1712. Joseph de Prémare also mentioned that the books of Liu Ning were posthumous writings in his preface of the book of *Jingchuan yilun* (《经传议论》)^[32] and this preface was written in 1710. All of the above suggests that Liu Ning should have died around 1710.

According to the Biography of Mr. Er'zhi, the writings of Liu Ning includes, *Liushuguai* (《六书夬》), *Shuowen jiezi yunyuan* (《说文解字韵原》), *Yinshu tongyi* (《引书同异》), *Shijing benmo* (《石经本末》), *Xiaojing quanben zhu* (《孝经全本注》), *Shiguwen dingben* (《石鼓文定本》) original edition in 1667, reprinted in 1679), *Fanzehu* (《樊合著》), *Jili bianlun* (《稽礼辨论》), *Er'zhai wenji* (《尔斋文集》). In the early Qing, Liu Ning revised his ancestor Liu Xun's book *Shuiyun mingao* (15 volumes) and made the formal edition. In 1667, Liu Ning also revised and printed Liu Xun's *Yinju tongyi* (31 volumes). In 1696, He also revised Liu Xun's *Shuiyuncun yingao*. Liu Ning's books were collected in The Complete Library in Four Sections which included *Jili bianlun* (1 volume), *Yunyuanbiao* (1 volume) and *Shiguwen dingben* (2 volumes).

Liu Ning's writings on Catholicism are not many, and there is not any record of them in the local Gazettes. According to the related materials, his writings on Catholicism are below: "Simo zhenlun xu" (《四末真论序》, 1672), "Jiaoqi helu xu" (《交迷合录序》, 1677), "Taixi roujue xu" (《泰西肉攫序》, 1679), "Dashe jielue xu" (《大赦解略序》, 1689), "Bencaobu xu" (《本草补序》, 1697), *Juesilu* (《觉斯录》, ca. 1680—1700, including four articles, "Yuanbenlun" (《原本论》), "Tianzhu zhiming fei chuangzi xiyu" (《天主之名非创自西域》), "Bian Tiantong miyun heshang sanshuo" (《辨天童密云和尚三说》), "Fusong heshang sanjiao zhenglun bian" (《抚松和尚三教正论辨》), ad *Tianxue jijie* (ca. 1680—1700). He also revised *Moxiang shengong* (《默想神功》, ca. 1700) written by Pedro de la Piñuela (石铎录, 1655—1704).

On Liu Ning's Social-net and Conversion to Catholicism

Similar to Zhang Xingyao,^[33] a Confucian Christian in Hangzhou in the same period, the first half of Liu Ning's life was unknown, and it was very possible that he tried his best to earn literary degrees as the most Confucian scholars did at that time. At the end of the Ming Dynasty, Jiangxi Province was the center of the school of the Learning of Heart-Mind where Western learning and religion were widely spread. Liu Ning's father, Liu Guanhuan, was familiar with Huang Ruheng and Dong Qichang. Huang had contacts with the Catholic Yang Tingqun and other literati of western learning. Dong had close contacts with the Catholic Han Lin (ca. 1598—1649). Huang also held the official position of the governor of Jinxian County in Jiangxi Province and the right counselor of the provincial administration commission of Jiangxi. Liu Guanhuan also had a relationship with Hou Tongzen (候峒曾), who was a relative in-law of the Catholic Han Lin (韩霖), and got the doctor degree in the same year (1625) with Li Jiantai (李建泰) and Huang Jingfang (黄景昉). The teacher of the Catholic Li Jiubiao (李九标), Ge Yinliang (葛寅亮, earned doctor degree in 1601), also served as the right counselor of the provincial administration commission of Jiangxi. Xiong Mingyu and Fan

[32] Joseph de Prémare, *Jingzhuanyilun*, in BnF, *Courant chinois* 7164.

[33] About Zhang Xingyao, see D. E. Mungello, *The Forgotten Christians of Hangzhou*, Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1994.

Liangshu (樊良枢), who had close contact with missionaries and western studies, were all natives from Jinxian County in Jiangxi. The son of the Catholic Li Zhizao, Li Changmao (李长楸), also served as an official in Jiangxi.

During the period of the reign of Shunzhi Emperor, the Catholic Tong Guoqi (佟国器) served as an official in Nangan (南赣), Jiangxi Province, and Catholic Xu Chanzeng (许缙曾, 1627—?) who was from a Catholic family also held an official position in Nanchang, “and met his mother respectably to the office in Nanchang government, built the Catholic Church, and supported the Holy Religion which missionaries mostly relied on”. Liu Guanjuan collected tens of thousands of volumes of books, and Liu Ning himself “purchased tens of thousands of volumes of books”, so in this environment, Liu Ning began to study the ancient Confucian classics and was interested in the philology. In the early Qing Dynasty, many scholars in Jiangxi Province had contacts with missionaries and had a deep understanding of them. Meanwhile, Liu Ning’s father Liu Guanjuan had contacted with these literati. Therefore, the adolescent Liu Ning should have been quite familiar with Western learning and Western religion.

The exact time of Liu Ning’s earliest touch with Western Learning is not known from existing documents. The earliest recorded date was 1659, when Liu Ning was 39 years old. At that time, Fang Yizhi (方以智, 1611—1671), who was a profound scholar of Western Learning, shaved his head and became a Buddhist monk; after three years of mourning of his father’s death, Fang Yizhi “climbed Wulao Mountain (五老峰) in Lushan (庐山), and entered the Xujiang River (盱江), then met with Tang Ci’an (汤赐庵), Liu Er’zhi (刘二至), Huang Weiji (黄维缉), Xie Yuezhai (谢约斋) in Nanfeng County who all were his inmate friends.” This shows that around 1659, Fang Yizhi entered Jiangxi and interacted with Tang Laihe (汤来贺), Liu Ning, and Xie Wenjian (谢文焄, 1615—1681). Fang Yizhi had many contacts with Xie Wenjian.^[34]

In 1664, Liu Ning was 45 years old. In the spring of this year, Xie Wenjian who was a native Nanfeng, “discussed with Liu Er’zhi on the Western Learning, and exchanged ideas with letters for four times and severely criticized him”.^[35] And before that, in 1663, Xie Wenjian began to read and revise *Qike* (《七克》) and renamed it as *Qike yizhilu* (《七克易知录》). He also said that “this time I delete some contents of *Qike*, and all harms of that Religion (namely Catholicism) also were deleted. The left contents were realistic and practical. If put it on the front of the desk, it could be helpful to cure of illness of morality.”^[36] Xie was a well-known scholar of classical studies in early Qing in Jiangxi province. In his early years, Xie studied Zen, then turned to follow the school of Wang Yangming. At last, he focused on Neo-Confucianism of Cheng and Zhu. The key idea of his thoughts concentrated in Revering (主敬) and Practices (笃行).^[37] Although the Biography of Xie said that he severely criticized Western learning, Xie’s attitude towards Western learning was actually quite open. Xie believed that “the learning of Western scholars seemed to be helpful to understand the teaching of our Confucianism of awing Heaven’s mandate and serving God”. Xie took the attitude of

[34] (Minguo) Nanfeng xianzhi, volume 35, printed in 1924, collected in Shanghai Library, pp. 513-514.

[35] Xie Mingqian, Chengshan xieming xiansheng nianpu (《程山谢明学先生年谱》), in Beijing tushuguan cang zhenben nianpu congkan (《北京图书馆藏珍本年谱丛刊》), book 73, Beijing: Beijing Library Press, 1999, p. 278.

[36] Xie Mingqian, Chengshan xieming xiansheng nianpu, p. 276.

[37] Huang Kaiguo, Jingxue cidian, p. 610.

“taking the good and abandoning the bad” towards Western learning. Thus, he deleted the wrong contents of Qike as the tool of moral cultivation.^[38] Xie also accepted the Western Religion’s claims about the existence of God, but “forces out the idea of his incarnation.”^[39] Thus, Xie’s discussion with Liu Ning may have involved the Western beliefs about God’s incarnation and salvation, which Xie considered to be “absurd and superficial.”

Shao Wuyuan (邵吴远, formerly Shao Yuanping 邵远平, also known as Jiesan 戒三), a native of Renhe (仁和), got the degree of doctor in the third year of the reign of Emperor Kangxi (1664).^[40] In 1675, when Shao held the official position of provincial educational supervisor, he wrote the preface of Liu Ning’s book Yinshu tongyi and praised Liu Ning’s learning on philology.^[41] Han Tan (韩葵, 1637—1704), who was a disciple of Shao, ever wrote a preface of the book Gujin jingtianjian (《古今敬天鉴》) which was written by the Jesuit Joachim Bouvet (白晋, 1656—1730) in 1703.^[42]

In 1677, at the age of 58, Liu Ning went to Beijing as a tribute student. In the same year, Liu Ning wrote the preface of Jiaoqiu helu in Beijing. The next year, Liu Ning met Li Laitai (李来泰, ?—1684) from Linchuan (临川) in Beijing, who was very impressed by Liu Ning’s book Zhouxuanwang shiguwen dingben. In 1679, Li ranked first in the second level when he attended the examinations of “Broad Learning and Extensive Scholarship” (博学鸿儒科) and was appointed as the scholar of Academician Expositor-in-waiting (翰林院侍讲).^[43] Li Laitai also wrote an epitaph for Liu Guanhuai.^[44] In the same year, Liu Ning should be still in Beijing and wrote the preface for the book of Yingshuo (《鹰说》) written by Lodovico Buglio (利类思, 1606—1682). In 1681, when Li Shizhen (李士桢) was the governor of Jiangxi Province, Liu Ning submitted his memorials to him and was praised and encouraged. Li Shizhen’s son, Li Xu (李煦), also had contact with missionaries.^[45]

When Liu Ning edited Liu Xun’s Shuiyuncun mingao, he invited Zhang Fujian (张黼鉴) and Wu Fusheng (吴甫生) to write the prefaces. Zhang was a native of Yan’an wei (延安卫), and was the magistrate of Nanfeng County in 1658. Zhang once invited Liu Ning to compile the gazette of Nanfeng.^[46] Wu Fusheng, a native of Xingguo zhou (兴国州, now Yangxin 阳新), earned the degree of doctor in 1694. However, Zhang’s preface was written in 1721, while Wu’s was written in 1664. In these prefaces, both authors mentioned that Liu Ning had edited and published the works of Liu Xun, but the two prefaces were quite far apart. In the preface, Wu mentioned that he got to know Liu

[38] Xie Wenjian, “Qike yixu” (《七克易序》), in Xiechengshan ji (《谢程山集》), volume 14, collected in Siku quanshu cunmu congshu (《四库全书存目丛书》), part of Ji, book 209, p. 251.

[39] Xie Wenjian, Chengshan xiansheng rilu (《程山先生日录》), in Congshu jicheng xubian (《丛书集成续编》), part of Zi, book 77, Shanghai: Shanghai Bookstore, 1994, p. 742.

[40] See Huang Zhaoqiang, Qingren yuanshixue tanyan, qingchu zhi qingzhongye (《清人元史学探研: 清初至清中叶》), Taipei: Daoxiang chubanshe, 2000, pp. 32-35.

[41] Shao Wuyuan, “Yinshu yitong xu” (《引书异同序》), in Zhengguo edited, (Kangxi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 12, p. 52.

[42] Hantan, “Gujin jingtianjian tianxue benyi xu” (《古今敬天鉴天学本义序》), in Xu Zongze, Mingqing jian yesu huishi yizhu tiyao (《明清间耶稣会士译著提要》), Shanghai: Shanghai Rare Books Press, 2006, p. 101.

[43] (Kangxi) Jiangxi tongzhi (《江西通志》), volume 20, printed in 1683, collected in the Tokyo University Library, p. 453.

[44] (Tongzhi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 17, p. 5.

[45] Fang Hao, Zhongguo tianzhujiaoshi renwu zhuan, p. 325.

[46] Meng Zhao, Huang You edited, Jianchang fuzhi, volume 25, p. 41; Zheng Guo edited, (Kangxi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 4, p. 42; volume 6, p. 19; (Tongzhi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 18, pp. 19-20.

Ning because he came to Nanfeng with his father Wu Jingshe, who was the magistrate of Nanfeng County.^[47] In his preface to Liu Ning's *Zhouxuanwang shiguwen dingben* (1667), Wu Fusheng refers to himself as “a classmate and younger brother” of Liu Ning, indicating that Wu and Liu Ning had a close relationship. According to *Er'zhai wenji* collected in the *Gazette of Nanfeng in Tongzhi*,

Wu Fusheng,……his father was Wu Jingshe (, the magistrate of Nanfeng County, with a fame of upright and integrity. Fusheng was very clever and handsome, and eager to learn. His poems and essays were both perfect. He was friendly with Liu Ning. The vulgar scholars mostly mocked Liu Ning's book *Shuowen jiezi guai* (《说文解字夹》). At the beginning, when Fusheng read this book, he still could not read it to the end volume. After he reflected carefully, he finally finished it. He said with emotions that the books in the world should be suspected, then they were trusted; the characters in the world should be abolished, then they were preserved. After he returned home, he passed the provincial exams, then got the degree of doctor and entered the Hanlin (翰林) Academy.^[48]

The above material indicates that Wu Fusheng was friendly with Liu Ning, and had great appreciation for her research on ancient Chinese characters. However, it is also evident from the above quotation that scholars often mocked Liu Ning's research on ancient characters.

In 1683, under the recommendations of the gentlemen of Nanfeng, such as Fu Daye (傅大业, style name of Yong Zi 用兹) and Peng Qi (彭期, style name of Yan Yuan 彦远), as well as the magistrate Zheng Guo's (郑钱) request, Liu Ning began to compose the *Gazette of Nanfeng County*. He worked day and night no matter of hot and cold and finished it after one year. This *Gazette* inherited the style of *Nanfeng zhouzhi* (《南丰州志》), which was written by Liu Xun. Liu Ning was quite confident and proud of his works. The *Gazette* also collected a preface by Tang Laihe (汤来贺, 1607—1688), a famous scholar and Liu Ning's uncle-in-law.^[49] In the preface, Zheng Guo also appraised Liu Ning's contribution. However, in his postscript of 1685, Zheng Guo was more critical of Liu Ning, which said, “following the recommendations of these gentlemen of Nanfeng, I commissioned Liu Ning to do this work. However, I have no time to revise. This is stated clearly in the preface. The author was selfish and made some unreal contents. ……It is my fault”.

In 1687, after Liu Ning became the instructor of Chongyi County, he had contacts with the monk Qishan (岐山) when he visited Shaxi Cave in Nie Du. The monk Qishan, namely Shi Chengsheng (释成升), was a descendant of Zeng Gong (曾巩, 1019—1083).^[50] Liu Ning exchanged poem with him, and visited the Yunfeng Temple with him. After compiling the book *Niedu shaxidong zhi*, Liu Ning invited Wang Sishi (王思轼, 1655—1727) to write the preface.^[51] In 1693, Liu Ning was

[47] Jianchang fuzhi, volume 25, p. 41; Zheng Guo edited, (Kangxi) *Nanfeng Xianzhi*, volume 4, p. 42; (Tongzhi) *Nanfeng Xianzhi*, volume 18, pp. 19-20.

[48] (Tongzhi) *Nanfeng Xianzhi*, volume 31, p. 7; (Minguo) *Nanfeng Xianzhi*, volume 35, pp. 515-516.

[49] Adrian Dudink, “The Rediscovery of a Seventeenth-century Collection of Chinese Christian Texts: The Manuscript *Tianxue Jijie*”, p. 10.

[50] (Tongzhi) *Chongyi Xianzhi*, volume 4, p. 13.

[51] Wang Sishi, “*Niedu shaxi dongzhi xu*” (《聂都沙溪洞志序》), in (Tongzhi) *Chongyi Xianzhi*, volume 12, p. 1.

suffering from eye disease, and visited Tonggang dong (桶冈峒) which was sixty kilometers far from the northwest of Chongyi County. Wang Shouren once fought against the uprising in this place. Accordingly, Liu Ning printed Wangwenchenggong jingying hengshui fanglue. Liu Ning and her friends Chen Weiqi (陈蔚起), Chen Shijun (陈士俊), He Yungyu (何韞玉), and He Dakuang (何大匡) visited Tonggang together.^[52]

Around 1696, Liu Ning finished his book Yunyuan (《韵原》), and invited Xiong Shibo (熊士伯, style name Ximu 西牧, a native of Nanchang) who was a Professor of Nankang Prefecture to write a preface. Xiong praised this book that its explanation was detailed and extensive, and he cited it his own book Guyin Zhengyi (《古音正义》).^[53] In fact, as early as 1684, when Xiong Shibo was the instructor of Nanfeng County, they had contacts with each other, Xiong said that “Liu Er’zhi arrived; I got Qieyun shengyuan (《切韵声原》) of Fang Mishan (方宓山), Xitan jingzhuàn (《悉曇经传》) of Zhao Fanfu (赵凡夫), and Xiru ermu zi (《西儒耳目资》).”^[54]

The longest time to contact with Liu Ning was Li Changzuo, a native of Nanfeng. Liu Ning’s son, Liu Du, said that Li Changzuo had a very good relationship with Liu Ning just like “the fusion of water and milk”.^[55] When Li was a student of the County school, he had discussed with Liu Ning. In 1687, when Liu Ning served as the instructor at Chong’yi County, Li went to Beijing to attend the imperial examinations. Although they were thousands of miles apart, “the letters were often exchanged”. In 1694, Li got the degree of doctor, and was appointed as the governor of Hengshan County in 1700.^[56] In 1702, when Liu Ning was 83 years old, he resigned because of old age and asked his son to send all his writings to Li Changzuo. In 1705, Li Changjo was reappointed as the governor of Xupu (溱浦) County, and reprinted Liu Ning’s Zhouxuanwang shiguwen dingben.^[57]

Li Changjo, with a style name of Tianpu, a native of Nanfeng, was a great-grandson in law of Li Wangshi (李万实, style name of Shaoxu, ca. 1510—1582).^[58] There is a biography of Li Changzuo in the Gazette of Chenzhou Prefecture.

Li Changzuo, with a style name of Tianpu and a pseudonym of Jingting, a native of Nanfeng. He got the degree of doctor in the year of Jiayu of Kangxi and was appointed as the governor of Hengshan County where he ruled very well. The provincial governor Zhao Shenqiao (赵申乔) admired him. In the 44 years of Kangxi, he was reassigned to Xupu County. The first thing he done was to build free schools. …… His virtue and

[52] Liu Ning, “You shaxidong ji” (《游沙溪洞记》), “You tonggangdong chaliao ji” (《游桶冈峒茶寮记》), in (Tongzhi) Chongyi Xianzhi, volume 10, pp. 19-23.

[53] See Zhang Quanmin, Qingdai qianqi guyinxue yanjiu (《清代前期古音学研究》), Beijing: Beijing guangbo xueyuan chubanshe, 2002, pp. 154, 165-166.

[54] Xiong Shibo, “Dengqie yuansheng xu” (《等切元声序》), in Siku quanshu cunmu congshu, part of Jing, book 219, p. 2.

[55] Liu Du, “Chongke chongzhitang wenji xu” (《重刻崇质堂文集序》), pp. 38-39.

[56] Rao Quan, Kuang Minben, Hengzhou fuzhi (《衡州府志》), volume 21, printed in 1875, p. 48; (Qianlong) Jianchang fuzhi, volume 29, pp. 68-69.

[57] Li Changzuo, “Zhouxuanwang shiguwen dingben xu” (《周宣王石鼓文定本叙》), in Siku quanshu cunmu congshu, part of Jing, book 200, pp. 401-403; Xi Shaobao, Xie Mingqian, Xie Mingsheng, Chenzhou fuzhi (《辰州府志》), printed in 1765, collected in China National Library, p. 2.

[58] Li Changzuo, “Chongke chongzhitang wenji xu” (《重刻崇质堂文集序》), in Siku quanshu cunmu congshu, part of Ji, book 112, p. 16.

integrity was not changed as he in Hengshan. After he retired, his baggage was almost empty with only some baskets of books. He died of illness on the way and peoples grieved over his death. ^[59]

There is also a biography of Li Changzuo in the Gazette of Nanfeng County in Tongzhi Period.

Li Changzuo, with a style name of Tianpu, earned the degree of doctor in the year of Kangxi Jiayu and was appointed as the governor of Hengshan County. He repaired schools and built Wenfeng College and invited reputable scholars to teach students. The lands of Mingdao College and Jixian College were occupied by monks. Li Changzuo ordered them to return. The previous decrees required people to pay the miscellaneous fees in addition to the official tax which the fees were several times over the tax. Li Changzuo petitioned to cancel the fees and ordered to engrave it in stone for the future. The higher official agreed with him and practiced in other counties. Then Li Changzuo was reassigned to Xupu County and his baggage was empty only with some baskets of books. After he resigned, he died on the way to home. ^[60]

It is worth noting that this biography mentions that Li Changzuo ordered the monks to return the lands of colleges which showed his dislikes on Buddhism. According to his preface of *Renzui zhizhong* (《人罪至重》), Li began to follow Jesuits to study Astronomy and Mathematics in 1664. Then he read *Qike, Shijie* (《十诫》) and other books written by missionaries. In 1694, after he got the degree of doctor, he met François Noël (卫方济, 1651—1729). In 1698, he wrote the preface to *Renzui zhizhong* written by François Noël. This preface shows that Li Changzuo should be baptized before he got the doctor degree. ^[61] Li also was the proofreader of *Moxiang shengong* written by Pedro de la Piñuela. Although Li Changzuo was a close friend of Liu Ning, according to Joseph de Prémare's statements, Li was a tricky official and stole numerous manuscripts of Liu Ning. However, according to the Preface of *Chongke chongzhitang wenji* (《重刻崇质堂文集序》) by Liu Du, Liu Ning had lots of writings and asked Li Changzuo to print them, but Li Changzuo's official career was not successful. Li Changzuo only printed *Zhouxuanwang shiguwen dingben*. ^[62] Li Changzuo was also a classmate of Wu Fusheng. ^[63]

Another Catholic in Jiangxi was Wu Su (吴宿), a native from Xinchang County. Wu Su, with a style name of Jingshi and a pseudonym of Hantong (汉通), was a tribute student in Kangxi Emepror reign, and was appointed as the instructor of Yushan (玉山) County, then resigned as the instructor of Nanfeng County. He was baptized in 1660 by Jacques Motel (穆迪我, 1618—1692) and in 1661. He assisted Philippe Couplet (柏应理, 1624—1692) in his missionary work in Nanchang. In 1662, Wu

[59] (Qianlong) *Chenzhou fuzhi*, volume 35, p. 20.

[60] (Tongzhi) *Nanfeng Xianzhi*, volume 25, pp. 17-18.

[61] Xu Zongze, *Mingqing jian yesu huishi yizhu tiyao*, p. 62.

[62] Knud Lundbæk, Joseph de Prémare, 1666—1736, S. J.: *Chinese philology and figurism*, p. 143; Liu Du, "Chongke chongzhitang wenji xu", in (Tongzhi) *Nanfeng Xianzhi*, volume 36, p. 39.

[63] Jiang Qingbai, *Qingchao jinshi timing lu* (《清朝进士题名录》), Beijing: Zhonghua Bookstore, 2007, p. 243.

Suu visited Pierre Cunevari (聂伯多, 1594—1675) in Nanchang and made confessions. At the same time, at the request of Nestorius, he reprinted the book *Tianzhu jiangsheng yinyi* (《天主降生引义》) by Jules Aleni (艾儒略, 1582—1649) with a postscript by Wu. In 1698, he wrote the preface of *Renzui zhizhong* by François Noël.^[64]

In 1694, Wu Suproofread *Moxiang shengong* by Pedro de la Piñuela. This book was printed around 1700 by Nanchang Church. The proofreaders of this book also included Liu Ning, Li Changzuo, Zhao Shiyuan (赵师瑗), Zhao Xilong (赵希隆), Li Rining (李日宁), Gan Zuolin (甘作霖). They were Catholics from Nanfeng. In addition, Wu Su together with Cai Tie (蔡铁), Mai Yuxing (凌宇兴), and Li Shi (李奭) reprinted Zhu Zongyuan's (朱宗元) *Dakewen* (《答客问》) and wrote a preface. These four people were from Xinchang, but all were baptized in Nanchang in 1660 by Jacques Motel.^[65] Through activities such as proofreading books and writing prefaces and postscripts, the communities of believers in Nanfeng and Xinchang interacted with each other.

In addition, Liu Ning also maintained close contacts with the Catholic community in Fujian. When Liu Ning was editing his book *Tianxue jijie*, he searched for prefaces and postscripts of Catholic works among Catholics in Jiangxi and Fujian. Thus, the Catholics in Fujian had contacts with Liu Ning, such as Li Sixuan (李嗣玄) who was a Catholic from Fujian sent his writings such as “*Lixiu yijian xu*” (《励修一鉴序》), “*Yu Limaocai bian tianxue shu*” (《与黎茂才辨天学书》), “*Fuzhou chongjian Tianzhu shengtang ji*” (《福州重建天主圣堂记》) to Liu Ning. Most of the prefaces and postscripts collected in *Tianxue jijie* edited by Liu Ning were also from Fujian and Jiangxi provinces.^[66]

There were several missionaries in Jiangxi. As early as the Wanli period, Matteo Ricci (利玛窦, 1552—1610) passed through Jiangxi on his way to the capital. Later, he returned to preach Catholicism in Nanchang, where he established a good relationship with prominent literati such as Zhang Huang (章潢, 1527—1608). *Xiguo jifa* (《西国记法》1595) and *Jiaoyoulun* (《交友论》1595) were also published in Nanchang. Then Ricci went to Beijing, where Jean de Rocha (罗如望, 1566—1623) and Jean Soerio (苏如望, 1566—1607) stayed in Nanchang to do missionary work. Rocha and Gaspard Ferreira (费奇规, 1571—1649) also went to Nancheng for missionary work. In early Qing dynasty, Prosper Intorcetta (殷铎泽, 1625—1696) and François Noël preached in Nancheng and Nanfeng. In 1688, Wan Qiyuan (Paul Banhes, 1635—1700) from Nancheng was ordained as priest. In 1702, François Noël together with Wang Qiyuan, Joseph de Prémare founded the Catholic Church in Lianjiang, Nanfeng. In addition to Jianchang, other places such as Nanchang (Pierre Cunevari, Jacques Motel), Ganzhou (Jacoques Le Favre, 1610—1676; Adrien Greslon, 1614—1695), Ji'an (Jacoques Le Favre), Jiujiang (Francois-Xavier' Entrecolls, 1662—1741), Fuzhou (Jean-Francois Foucquet, 1663—1739) also had Jesuit missionaries.

Among the missionaries with whom Liu Ning had direct contact were Pedro de la Piñuela and Joseph de Prémare. Pedro de la Piñuela was a Franciscan missionary from Spain. He was born in Mexico in 1650 and accompanied John Bonaventura Ibanez (1610—1691) to China in 1671. In 1676,

[64] Adrian Dudink, “The Rediscovery of a Seventeenth-century Collection of Chinese Christian Texts: The Manuscript *Tianxue Jijie*”, pp. 7-8.

[65] *Ibid.*, pp. 10-11.

[66] *Ibid.*, pp. 16-17.

he arrived in Xiamen. In the following year, Augustinus a S. Paschale (1637—1697) who arrived in Fujian before went to Shandong to preach, with leaving Pedro de la Piñuela alone in Fujian. By 1681, Pedro de la Piñuela established 4 churches in Jianning, Fujian.^[67] He also went to preach in Jiangxi which was adjacent to Fujian. In 1689, Liu Ning wrote a preface for the book *Dashe jielue* by Pedro de la Piñuela; in 1697, Liu Ning also wrote a preface for *Bencaobu* by Pedro de la Piñuela. Liu Ning invited Pedro de la Piñuela to write the book of *Bencao bu* to help Chinese people. Liu Ning also panted these herbs of the book in his office in Chongyi County.^[68] This shows that the relationship between them were very close.

Joseph de Prémare arrived in Jianchang, Jiangxi in 1699 and stayed in Jiujiang from 1721 to 1724, after which he left Jiangxi due to the prohibition on Catholicism. During his stay in Jianchang, Joseph de Prémare also traveled to Nanfeng and other places to preach. It is estimated that after 1702, Joseph de Prémare met Liu Ning in Nanfeng. During his stay in Jiangxi Province, he studied Chinese characters, language and literature. In the theory of Figurism which was initiated by Joseph and his colleague and teacher Joachim Bouvet, he tried to find the evidences for ancient Chinese believe in Christianity in Chinese classics. Jean François Gerbillon (张诚, 1654—1707) visited Jiangxi province in 1702 and encouraged missionaries to study Chinese characters for preaching. Thus, Joseph de Prémare spent most of his time in Jiangxi studying Chinese language and Chinese literature. He believes that through the study of ancient Chinese texts, he would be able to make a greater contribution to the conversion of the entire Chinese people.^[69] In his study of Chinese characters, Joseph de Prémare was assisted by Liu Ning. Liu Ning's works on Chinese characters include *Liushuguai*, *Yunyuanbiao*, *Zhouxuanwang shiguwen dingben*, *Yinshu yitong*, and *Shuowen jiezi guai*. In the preface to his *Jingjuan yilun* (1710), Joseph de Prémare mentioned that “he also obtained several volumes of the writings of Mr. Liu Er'zhi of Nanfeng”. He also mentions Liu Ning in his Chinese work *Liushu shiyi* (《六书实义》1721), which said that Liu Ning was an exporter on the study of *Shuowen jiezi* and quoted Liu Ning's ideas directly. In 1728, in a letter to Étienne Fourmont (1683—1745), Joseph de Prémare also mentioned that he had received manuscripts from Liu Ning on the study of Chinese characters. In 1731, in another letter to Étienne Fourmont, Joseph de Prémare mentioned that he had received Liu Ning's manuscript of *Liushu guai*. Liu Ning was mentioned several times in Joseph de Prémare's books.^[70] Although both Liu Ning and Joseph de Prémare were devoted to the study of ancient Chinese characters, their starting points and objectives were different. Liu Ning believed that in order to understand the true meaning of the ancient classics, one should understand the true meanings of the characters at first. Joseph de Prémare's aim, on the other hand, was that “if we show the Chinese that there is a savior in their 'scriptures,' then more than half of the Chinese people will become Catholics.”^[71] Liu Ning's writings on philology such as *Yinshu yitong*, were more for the better studying on the ancient Confucian classics, and the writings

[67] Cui Weixiao, “Shiduolu shenfu de bencaobu yu fangjihui zaihua chuanjiao yanjiu” (《石铎录神父的〈本草补〉与方济会在华传教研究》), in *Shehui kexue* (《社会科学》), 1 (2007): 124-125.

[68] Liu Ning, “Sanyushu ji” (《三余署记》), in (Tongzhi) *Chongyi Xianzhi*, volume 10, pp. 16-17.

[69] Knud Lundbæk, *Joseph de Prémare, 1666—1736*, S. J. : Chinese philology and figurism, pp. 19-20.

[70] *Ibid.* ,pp. 143-144.

[71] *Ibid.* ,p. 160.

of Joseph de Prémare were to prove that there was already a Christian faith in the ancient Confucian classics.

It is generally believed that Liu Ning was baptized in 1687, after he had been appointed as the instructor of Chongyi County.^[72] However, according to the “Simo zhenlun xu” (1672), “Jiaoqi helu xu” (1677), “Taixi roujue xu” (1679) which were collected in *Tianxue jijie* by Liu Ning, he should be baptized before 1687. According to Wang Zhongmin (王重民) and Fang Hao (方豪), when Liu Ning revised and reprinted Liu Xun’s *Yinju tongyi*, he omitted the 30th volume of this book which was related to the superstition of ghosts and spirits. This shows the sincerity of his faith. As early as 1664, there was a heated discussion between Liu Ning and Xie Wenjian about Western learning (or Western religion).

In other words, Liu Ning should be baptized before he went to Chongyi County. Before 1667, Prosper Intorcetta was a missionary in Nanfeng. From 1660 to 1665, Prosper Intorcetta preached in Jiangxi, and “two thousand people were baptized.” It is possible that Liu Ning was baptized by Prosper Intorcetta. But it is also possible that, like Wu Su, Liu Ning went to Nanchang and other places to be baptized by other missionaries.

On Liu Ning’s Thoughts: Restoring Ancient Confucianism and Replacing Buddhism

Liu Ning was best known for his studies on ancient Chinese characters and philology. The author of *Sikuquanshu zongmu tiyao* (《四库全书总目提要》) praised Liu Ning that “he was quite diligent in the study of the three Rites (三礼), but also occasionally dedicated to study of books of Han and Wei periods”. Meanwhile, the author also criticized him that “he liked to cite new and different resources, thus, his conclusions were always wrong” and “his researches were not precise”, “at last he gave a forced interpretation”.^[73] Joseph de Prémare praised Liu Ning that “Mater Liu can be called the elite of the study of characters in our nation, and his study explored these contents which the Confucian did not discuss since Qin and Han dynasties.”^[74]

In his preface of Liu Ning’s *Yinshu yitong*, Shao Wuyuan pointed out that Liu Ning researched on philology because “the true meaning of classics was obscure for a long time”. The classics studies were not prosperous because the philology was not promoted. In Liu Ning’s view, “the classics and the characters were the origins of each other”, and he highly praised Xu Shen’s (许慎) *Shuowen Jiezi* (《说文解字》).^[75] And in order to research philology, one must firstly study six categories of characters. “one does not understand the six categories (六书) of characters, just like someone who wanted to cross the sea abandoned the compass, he would do nothing but watching the sea.” Therefore, Liu Ning “analyzed the six categories of characters to uncover the origins of classics.”^[76]

[72] Ibid. , p. 143.

[73] *Siku quanshu zongmu tiyao* (《四库全书总目提要》), Haikou: Hainan Press, 1999, p. 139 & p. 246.

[74] See Joseph de Prémare, “Jingzhuan yilun xu” (《经传议论序》), in Fang Hao, *Zhongxi jiaotong shi* (《中西交通史》), book 5, Taipei: Huagang chubanshe, 1953, p. 196.

[75] Shao Wuyuan, “Yinshu yitong xu” (《引书异同序》), in Zhengguo edited, (Kangxi) *Nanfeng Xianzhi*, volume 12, pp. 51-52.

[76] Liu Ning, “Liushu guai zixu” (《六书夬自序》), in in Zhengguo edited, (Kangxi) *Nanfeng Xianzhi*, volume 12, pp. 83-84.

The classic studies in early Qing dynasty turned to research the original texts. This tendency was consistent with the strategy of “adapting to the ancient Confucianism” and “criticizing modern Confucianism” adopted by Ricci and other missionaries since late Ming Dynasty. Zhang Xingyao, a Catholic in the early Qing, believed that the so-called Confucianism of today was no longer the true Confucianism, and Catholicism was the true Confucianism. The reason for this was that the Catholicism was trying to revive the ancient Confucianism, while the modern Confucianism had lost its real face due to the influence of Buddhism and Taoism.^[77] Similarly, in his Preface to the *Yinshu yitong*, Liu Ning also stated clearly that “the so-called classics today are not the books of Confucius.”^[78] Although Liu Ning was also critical of modern Confucianism, he differed from Zhang Xingyao. Liu Ning, from the point of view of the changes of characters, argued that since the Qin and Han dynasties, the characters “have been repeatedly changed and gradually lost their authenticity. If Confucius was still live today, he also does not distinguish them at a loss. In addition, people today do not see the old forms of the ancient characters, how dare they discuss their loss or gain on the meanings?”^[79] Therefore, Liu Ning argued that the true and original meaning of the classics can be understood through the ancient meanings of the characters preserved in the *Shuowen jiezi*. This claim is the same as the Figurists such as Joachim Bouvet and Joseph de Prémare.

Liu Ning’s criticism on the contemporary classic studies triggered some scholars’ doubts. A guest inquired that “you said all the so-called classics today are wrong; but what *Shuowen jiezi* said are correct. Then Xu Shen, the author of *Shuowen jiezi* surpassed Confucius?” Liu Ning responded, “Are all the classics today handwritten by Confucius?” The guest said, “The book of *Shuowen jiezi* today are handwritten by Xu Shen?” Liu Ning replied, “Xu Shen checked the characters with six categories, with consistent of sections and parts, so as to make no mistakes. Then I think that Confucius preserved his meanings with no regards of the texts. The ancient Confucians still had to follow the meaning of Confucius when read the texts, because the forms of characters have changed in the process of circulations.” Therefore, Liu Ning had no doubt about the *Shuowen jiezi*. And Liu Ning composed 24 volumes of *Yinshu yitong*, with aims to “respect the ancient meaning, correct the present false, and wish to preserve one thread of classic studies.”^[80]

Therefore, Liu Ning hopes to understand the ancient meaning of the classics through the characters, so as to provide a new way for the development of the classic studies. In other words, Liu Ning believes that the Confucian interpretation of the classics today is more or less problematic. What Liu Ning wanted to do is to use the philology as the gateway to the study of the classics. However, as some have questioned, “it is long time that the remained classics were for the study of past and present people, and for the people to apply for whether in the court or not. If using a different way to explain the classics and insisting on his own opinions, it was too much to pursuit distinctions. Isn’t it despised by the wise scholars?”^[81]

In the thought world of the critics, the Confucian classics and their interpretative traditions were

[77] Zhang Xingyao, *Tianru tongyi kao* (《天儒同异考》), BnF, Courant chinois 7171, pp. 3 & 6.

[78] Liu Ning, “*Yinshu yitong zixu*”, p. 85.

[79] *Ibid.*, p. 85.

[80] *Ibid.*, p. 85.

[81] *Ibid.*, p. 86.

shaped by history and authority. If one tries to “find a new way,” then one is deviating from the mainstream and will not be accepted. However, Liu Ning believes that his purpose was to “deliver the words of former masters”, and “expound the profound ideas of former saints”, “which may be different, but it is only different from the secular and vulgar.” In short, Liu Ning believed that as long as one could reach the original classical meaning and expound the true meaning of the sages, regardless of whether it was the same or different from the secular world, one should do it. Liu Ning said,

I answered with respect that what you said is not right. A person who seeks to be different interpretations too much must favor his own assumptions. Even if they are the same as other people, they are not acceptable, and besides they are different from the saints. If we search the left writings of Confucius in the walls, and expound the teachings of the former sages, we will find that although the same is only one tenth, and the different is nine tenth, the differences are just different from the secular world. How can you say that they are different from the sages? Lu Pi has a saying, “whoever explains the classics is to deliver the words of former masters, not from the ideas of himself.” He should not compromise. If he compromises, the great Dao will be obscured. It likes that the rule and the standard should not be deceived. What Lu Pi said deeply won my heart. ^[82]

Here we can see clearly that Liu Ning’s purpose in studying philology was to “deliver the words of the former masters”. Of course, Liu Ning did not directly explain the relationship between “the words of former masters” and Catholicism. But from Liu Ning’s attempt to work on the original meaning of the ancient classics, it can be seen that he hoped to restore the original meaning of the classics by removing the ambiguities meaning of characters.

The so-called “original meaning”, “true meaning”, “primitive meaning”, in Liu Ning’s case, refers to the meaning contained in the ancient classics in Confucius’ time, rather than the meaning of the classics interpreted by later Confucians from Qin to Ming dynasties. According to Liu Ning, language and characters were the tools “used by hundreds of officials to govern and used by ten thousands of people to reflect,” “so they decide what is right and wrong.” However, the consequence of the changes of characters is that “people blankly don’t know the origins of the characters”. Liu Ning said, “Without Xu’s book, all time would be like a long night.” ^[83]

Liu Ning’s highly admiration for Xu Shen’s *Shuowen jiezi* also lies in his belief that since the Han Dynasty, “different schools had different sayings, every people held his own opinion” and “did not unify their ideas”. According to Liu Ning, “the significance of *Shuowen jiezi* to the study of characters is like the significance of Six classics to the Neo-Confucianism. There is no Neo-Confucianism if discarding the Classics of Confucius; and there is no [study of] characters if

[82] Ibid. ,p. 86.

[83] Liu Ning, “*Shuowen jiezi guai xu*” (《说文解字夹序》), in Zhengguo edited, (Kangxi) *Nanfeng Xianzhi*, volume 12, p. 88.

discarding Xu Shen' book".^[84] Liu Ning highly praised Xu Shen' Shuowen jiezi. However, many people regarded it as "pedantic", and "impractical", "was not helpful to govern and reflect." However, Liu Ning did not agree with it. Liu Ning believed that

I respect the original teaching and the original meaning, just respect they [the characters] what they were. The academic works of people in the world were ignorant of their origins, not only of the characters, but the characters were particularly so. The characters were venerated as the tools of governing and reflecting. The tricky men liked to fabricate and the humble were glad to follow which made the vulgar characters increased and more and more mistakes and misunderstandings. They were initially ruined by Sima Xiangru (司马相如), then ruined by Zhang Yi (张揖), Xiao Ziyun (萧子云). They changed the fonts, that is, even Ling Wang (陵王) used faked character. Then it was more and more terrible with no limits. And there was also an indignation that Hongwu Zhengyun (《洪武正韵》) only picked up the left spits of Huang Zhiweng (黄直翁) and Zhao Weiqian (赵搗谦) which was only followed by people because it was imperially ordered. Thus, the study of characters is profounder than any other studies. It was the fault of Le Shaofeng (乐韶凤) and Song Lian (宋濂) to block the people's ears and eyes and hinder the people's minds in the world. Today the confirmed habits are hard to get rid of. Once restoring the origins, other people instead think you are stupid and impractical and not helpful to govern and reflect. Recommending my sayings to the imperial court, only relies on these topper people!^[85]

Liu Ning severely criticized Sima Xiangru (司马相如, ad. 179—117), Zhang Yi (张揖, during three Kingdoms), Xiao Ziyun (萧子云, 487—549), Zhao Qian (赵谦, 1351—1395), and Song Lian (宋濂, 1310—1381). Liu Ning also criticized Hongwu zhengyin. It was Liu Ning's intention that the present characters had lost its originality, and that without updating the characters, it was impossible to understand the original meaning of the classics. In a tone of expectation, Liu Ning hoped that it would be appreciated by those in high positions so that he could be "recommended to the imperial court".

It should be noted that in Liu Ning's early writings on classical studies and philology, there is little about Catholicism. However, we still find the influences of Catholicism in his writings. As quoted above, Liu Ning pointed out that "the world's academic work were ignorant of its origin". The term of ignorance of its origin was always used by missionaries to mean that people forget the creator namely the Lord of Heaven. If people want to recognize his origin, he need to know the God.

In addition, what Liu Ning sated that the meaning of characters was gradually obscured since Qin dynasty, just likes what Matteo Ricci and the Catholic Yang Tingyun said in their books. Meanwhile, missionaries' criticism on Buddhism and Taoism also influenced Liu Ning. In 1684, Liu Ning was composing the Gazette of Nanfeng County. In the third volume to introduce the temples in

[84] Ibid. ,p. 88.

[85] Ibid. ,pp. 88-89.

Nanfeng, Liu Ning said that, “the theory of calamity and happiness could terror the ignorant masses; and the learning of anutpattika (无生) could touch gentlemen.” Liu Ning also said that “in the past, the honorable Di Liang (狄梁公) thought there were too many temples and shrines in Wu and Chu. He petitioned to the court to fire one thousand and seven hundreds of temples only leaving the four shrines of Xiayu (夏禹), Wu Taibo (吴泰伯), Jizha (季札) and Wuyuan (伍员). It should be followed by us today.”^[86] There were lots of criticisms on Buddhism, Taoism and popular religions in the Gazette of Nanfeng County by Liu Ning.

Liu Ning also criticized the vegetarian and prohibition of killing of Buddhism and Taoism, although he used lots of evidences and materials from the ancient Confucian classics. In *Gujin zhaibian* (《古今斋辨》), Liu Ning clearly argued that the so-called vegetarian today is not the same as the vegetarian of ancient period”. Here the “ancient” of course refers to the period of the Three Dynasties. According to the *Liji* (《礼记》), *Zhouli* (《周礼》), *Zhuangzi* (《庄子》), Liu Ning pointed out that the ancient fast was not only different from today, but also was completely on the opposite. The fast today was totally influenced by Buddhism and contrary to the teachings, “the theory of vegetarian today may be resulted as the teaching of prohibition of killing. Thus, the things were valued, but people were disregarded which was not the original thought of our Confucian to love people and all things. It was the harms left by the Buddhism that made the later people in the world disobey the scriptures and rites of sages, and follow the secular as drifting with the waves. As so far it does not cease.”^[87] Liu Ning also said that, “people fast today changed eating meat to vegetarian. They do not read the Book of Zhouli (《周礼》), or they deeply believed in the theory of Buddhism and thought the Book of Zhouli was not credible. They worship Buddhism but betray Confucianism.”^[88]

In his essay named *Jinniu lun* (《禁牛论》), Liu Ning argued that it should not be forbidden to kill cattle. It was obvious that he used the method of arguments from Catholicism, although he did not mention it. Liu Ning said that, people advocated not to kill cattle, “because they don’t know the purpose of the Heaven to create all things. Things are lowly and people are noble; things are light and people are heavy, things are stupid and people are smart, so these productions of the low feed the lives in the top. Horses were for riding; dogs were for watching gates; roosters were for calling for wakeup in the morning. And the cattle were for plowing. All these are gifted by the Heaven with their natures to be used by human. Nowadays people do not remember that the cattle which was created by the Heaven were for human use. They say that the cattle have merits for people, just like that the grandfather would construct the houses for his descendants, but the descendants don’t remember his grandfather’s contributions. Instead they say that if there were no these craftsmen, how they got the shelter to avoid winds and rains.”^[89]

Liu Ning’s Catholic faith is clearly reflected in his editing of the books *Tianxue jijie* and *Juesilu*. *Tianxue jijie* is now collected in the St. Petersburg Library, Russia. It consists of eight volumes, 569

[86] Zhengguo edited, (Kangxi) Nanfeng Xianzhi, volume 3, p. 42.

[87] Liu Ning, “Gujin zhaibian” (《古今斋辨》), in *Erzhai wenji* (《尔斋文集》), appendix to Liu Xun, *Shuiyuncun mingao* (《水云村泯稿》), collected in Shanghai Library.

[88] Liu Ning, “Zhai bi bianshi bian” (《斋必变食辨》), in *Erzhai wenji* (《尔斋文集》).

[89] Liu Ning, “Jin niu lun” (《禁牛论》), in *Erzhai wenji* (《尔斋文集》).

pages, and is divided into six parts. It contains 284 Catholic prefaces and postscripts from the late Ming to early Qing dynasties, most of which were written between 1599 and 1679.^[90] The book *Juesilu*, on the other hand, is a book of apologetic for Catholicism which includes four articles.

Although the Catholics in early Qing dynasty would like to abandon the frame of Christianity in harmony with Confucianism (天教合儒) to legitimate its staying in China, they still tried to show that Catholicism was in line with the Confucian orthodoxy. In traditional Chinese society, any foreign religions were difficult to survive and develop in China except they were localized by assimilation of local religions especially Confucianism. Although the missionaries disguised them as the Confucians from the West at the beginning of entry into China, the Confucian literati were very alert about the heterogeneity of Catholicism. Confucian literati worried about the foreign and alien Catholicism which would threaten the ideology of Confucianism and destroy the status of Confucians in imperial China. The differences between foreign religions and the local ideology (Confucianism) always made the former lose the legitimacy to stay in China. Thus, like lots of missionaries, Liu Ning tried to argue that the foreign Catholicism was the same as Confucianism. In his essay *Yuanben lun*, Liu Ning cited lots of Confucian literati's words since late Ming to prove that both religions were the same, such as Xu Guangqi (徐光启), Li Zhizao (李之藻), Yang Tingyun, Liu Yinchang (刘胤昌), Xiong Mingyu, Zhang Weishu (张维枢), Feng Yingjing, Wang Bingyuan (汪秉元), Chen Fengyi (陈凤仪), Huang Jingfang (黄景昉), Ye Xianggao (叶向高), Sun Yuanhua (孙元化) and Shen Guangyu (沈光裕). Some of them were Confucian Catholics.^[91]

In Liu Ning's view, what the Confucian literati objected Catholicism included two points. One was the Lord of Heaven; another was the incarnation of the Lord of Heaven. Liu Ning succeeded the tradition of the apologetic of Matteo Ricci in the *True Meaning of the Lord of Heaven* (《天主实义》), namely the Heaven in ancient Confucian classics was truly the Deus [God] of Catholicism, and the Li of Neo-Confucianism was not the original thought from the classics. Liu Ning said that,

The beginning of the book of *Zhongyong* (《中庸》) is to explore the Heaven, and continues with cautions of fear and self-discipline when alone, that is, revering heaven and fearing heaven. If there is not really God coming to you, and only said that the Li should be revered and feared, I am afraid that the revering and fearing would just be for a little while and cease. Since the three dynasties of Tang and Yu, the sages raised up one by one; all carefully took serving Heaven as the true learning and real teaching, without revering Li or fearing Li clearly. The Heaven gifts the Li to human who could study the Li and Nature with extremely so that he would understand his destiny. The later people only know the Li, but they don't know where the Li come from. It is just like that people only know the imperial court has three palaces, but they don't know the emperor is the master of discussing, formatting, testing. Wouldn't that be too confused?^[92]

[90] Adrian Dudink, "The Rediscovery of a Seventeenth-century Collection of Chinese Christian Texts: The Manuscript *Tianxue Jijie*", pp. 1-26

[91] Liu Ning, "Yuanben lun" (《原本论》), in Liu Ning, *Juesi lu* (《觉斯录》), collected in *Yesuhui luoma dangangan mingqing tianzhujiao woxian* (《耶稣会罗马档案馆明清天主教文献》), volume 9, Taipei: Ricci Institute, 2002, pp. 532-535.

[92] *Ibid.*, p. 531.

For the doctrine of the incarnation, Liu Ning argued from the perspective of the Catholic teachings of three ages, namely the age of natural law (性教), the age of commandant (书教), and the age of grace (宠教). Meanwhile, because “the actions of Heaven had neither voice nor smell” (上天之载, 无声无臭), it is necessary of Heaven’s incarnation. If there is no incarnation, people have no way to follow the Heaven, and the bridge between Heaven and human would be broken. Thus, the grace of incarnation was greater than the grace of creation. In response to the question of why the incarnation of God was not recorded in the ancient and modern Confucian classics, Liu Ning believed that on the one hand it was because God was incarnated after Confucius and Mencius. “Confucius and Mencius could not see it, thus, it was not proved by their words.” On the other hand, the Lord of Heaven was incarnated before Masters of Cheng and Zhu. “Cheng and Zhu did not hear of it, and could not unify the sects of the learning of Tao”. Therefore, “it was a great fortune that the western Confucians entered China lonely and revered only one Highness as the dominator which illustrated the lost learning of thousands of saints.”^[93]

Liu Ning’s Yuanben lun also refuted three well-known literati’s views on Catholicism or Western learning. The first was Xiong Renlin (熊人霖, ca. 1610—1680) from Jiangxi province. He was the eldest son of Xiong Mingyu, who had close contact with missionaries and wrote prefaces and postscripts for Catholic writings. Xiong Renlin said that, “The west missionaries only had practices of integrity and chastity. It was not erudite to follow their teachings.” The second was Fang Yizhi from Tongcheng, who also had close contact with Western missionaries. Fang Yizhi said: “the western missionaries only knew the natural sciences [the study of observances], but don’t talk about the philosophy [the study of understanding the fundamental]. The reason was that the missionaries only believed that everything had no connections.” The third was Liu Tong (刘侗, 1594—1637) from Ma Cheng. He said, “The study of western guests was far from Buddhism and Taoism, and close to Confucianism. Chinese called them western Confucian. I once met the followers and examined the teachings which was probably similar to Mo Zi”. The first two mainly criticized the issues of sciences, philosophy and religion of Western learning, while Liu Ning mainly responded from the perspective of the I-Ching, “Only after knowing the Heaven, one can then talk about sciences and philosophy.” Obviously, Liu Ning was not as familiar with Western Studies as Fang Yizhi and others, and his rebuttal was weak. But Liu Ning’s main purpose was to refute the point of that “the western learning was similar to Mozi (墨子)”. Liu Ning compared the Book of Mozi (《墨子》) and Catholicism one by one, and concluded that there were similarities and differences between Mozi and Catholicism. Liu Ning argued that the most similar of Mozi to Catholicism was the chapter of Tianzhi, and other chapters were different from Catholicism. The reason why Liu Ning focused on this point was that in Confucian’s view, the doctrine of Mozi was heterodox and harmful to Confucian orthodoxy. The Catholicism would not be recognized by Confucianism if it was regarded the same as the doctrine of Mozi. Zhang Xingyao, a contemporary of Liu Ning, also refuted Liu Tong’s idea.

[93] Ibid. ,p. 531.

Xingyao commented that Mr. Liu Tongren (刘同人, namely Liu Tong) thought the western Confucian was similar to Mozi. It was because Mr. Liu didn't know the westerner's learning. Actually, it was not so. The school of Mozi didn't know the Origin, but the western Confucian taught people to serve God. Could Mozi understand this? There was the saying like that. Thus, Chinese people started to doubt the true teaching as heterodoxy.^[94]

Liu Ning used the method of philology to argue that the Chinese term of Tianzhu [Lord of Heaven] was not inaugurated by the westerners. Liu Ning cited materials from ancient classics including Zuo zhuan (《左传》), Shijing (《诗经》), Zhuangzi (《庄子》), Guliang zhuan (《谷梁传》), Shiji (《史记》), Hanshu (《汉书》), Guangyuyi (《广輿记》), and Zhouyi (《周易》) to prove that the term of Tianzhu didn't appear in the later period, nor was it translated from the far feigners.^[95] Liu Ning believed that the true teaching of Yao (尧), Shun (舜), Yu (禹), Tang (汤), Wen (文), Wu (武), Duke of Zhou (周公), Confucius (孔子), and Mencius (孟子) was almost obscured in Qin and Han dynasties. "Thus, only when the missionaries entered China, the true teachings of former saints could continue. "If there were no western Confucian who came to China by sea and tried their best to elucidate, the true teachings of Yao, Shun, Yu, Tang, Wen, Wu, Duke of Zhou, Confucius and Mencius was almost extinguished." What Liu Ning tried to prove was that the Catholic doctrine continued the tradition of ancient Confucian. Thus, the Catholicism was not the heterogenous religion from the foreign countries, which was distinct from Confucianism.

In response to the Buddhist criticism on Catholicism, Liu Ning tried his best to defend and refute. Miyun yuanwu (密云圆悟, 1566—1642), a well-known monk of Buddhism in late Ming dynasty, composed the book of Biantian sanshuo (《辨天三说》) to criticize the teaching of Catholicism on the Heaven. In early Qing, Qian Qianyi (钱谦益, 1582—1664), a layman of Buddhism and famous literati, reprinted this book and wrote a preface for it. Qian pointed out that the Heaven was the natural sky and chaos with the air which was in a mess. It was not the dominator. Only my heart [mind] could dominate. "The Buddhist theory of "mind creation" was in serious contradiction to the Catholic theory of "God creation."

At first, Liu Ning criticized Buddhism for its presumptuousness, and accused it as the criminal of the Confucian moral principles and teachings.^[96] Liu Ning believed that "everything including external mountains, rivers, earth, and shapeless souls were created by the Lord of Heaven." Liu Ning argued that the western missionaries were not barbarians which was accused by Buddhism. Liu Ning said that if the western missionaries were barbarians, Buddha was even barbarian. Liu Ning tried to break the worldview of Confucianism which viewed China as the center of the world, and around China were barbarians and uncivilized. He pointed out that so-called the central and the barbaric was relative. "If you look at the barbaric from the central, they are the barbaric; if you look at the central from the barbaric, then they are the central." Meanwhile, "Shun was the man of east barbarian; King

[94] Zhang Xingyao, Tianjiao mingbian (《天教明辨》), book 17, collected in China National Library, p. 37.

[95] Liu Ning, "Tianzhu zhiming fei chuangzi xiyu" (《天主之名非创自西域》), in Liu Ning, Juesi lu, p. 546.

[96] Liu Ning, "Biantian sanshuo xu bian" (《辨天三说序辨》), in Liu Ning, Juesi lu, pp. 573-577.

of Wen was the man of west barbarian. Both didn't care about the barbarians. Why belittle people for this one character firstly?"

Secondly, Liu Ning refuted the Buddhist theory of mind creation. Liu Ming recognized that the theory of mind creation was just a kind of epistemology which was distinct from the Catholic theory of God creation. Liu Ning believed that the mind was "marvelous and limitless" because it could "possess kinds of reason and handle all kinds of things." However, we could not think that the mind was the creator. The function of mind only belonged to the level of epistemology which was not in line with the function of creation. Liu Ning argued that everything including the mind of human was created by the Lord of Heaven. ^[97]

Thirdly, Liu Ning reputed the Buddhist accusation on the incarnation of God by using the historical story of Cheng Tang (成汤) praying for raining with closes of thatch grass. ^[98] Meanwhile, Liu Ning also refuted these points including anyone no matter of good or bad would ascend to the Heaven only if they converted to the Catholicism; the Chinese saints such as Shun, King of Wen, Duke of Zhou, Confucius would be in the hell, because they didn't convert to the Catholicism or they disobey the ten commandants. Liu Ning argued that whoever converted to Catholicism needed to confess, then they were possibly forgiven by God. It was not true that anyone who converted to Catholicism would be forgiven. The convention was only one of the prerequisites. Liu Ning also argued that there were no recordings that Shun, King of Wen, Duke of Zhou, and Confucius were in the hell. It was a rumor to attack Catholicism by these people of anti-Christianity. ^[99]

Liu Ning believed that the Great Tao was covered and kinds of heresies rose up since three Dynasties. The Buddhism took the opportunity and entered China. The Confucianism was polluted by the Buddhism and Taoism. Thus, the Confucianism today was not the same as its original. It was fortunately that the missionaries came to China, and the tradition of Confucius and Mencius and their teachings continued and promoted again. ^[100] Liu's thought was closed to the tendency in the academic field in early Qing. One of the early Qing academic reflections on the Neo-Confucianism during Song and Ming was that it was corrupted by the Buddhist and Taoist teachings, and that it fell into empty talking. It lost its practical functions. Therefore, in the early Qing Dynasty, the Study of Han began to rise. Scholars began to bypass the Confucian writings annotated by the Song and Ming Confucianists and went directly back to the ancient Confucian classics in an attempt to restore the true nature of the ancient Confucianism. And in order to restore the true faces of the ancient Confucian, the studies of philology, phonetics, six categories began to prevail together.

Conclusion: from Complementing Confucianism to Restoring Confucianism

This article shows that Liu Ning was born in 1620 based on some new found materials, and he died

[97] Liu Ning, "Fusong heshang sanjiao zhenglun bian" (《拊松和尚三教正论辨》), in Liu Ning, *Juesi lu*, pp. 580-582.

[98] *Ibid.*, p. 583.

[99] *Ibid.*, pp. 584-585.

[100] *Ibid.*, pp. 585-589.

around in 1715 at the age of 96. He was baptized before he went to hold the official position of instructor in Chongyi County in 1687.

Liu Ning's *Juesi lu* should be written after 1692, as he mentions that "it was lucky to depend on the holy emperor's benevolent reign. He believed that the missionaries were innocent, he recognized the scholarship of missionaries were pure and upright. The emperor specially ordered the ministries to announce that the Catholicism was not heresy which should not be forbidden."^[10] It refers to the Decree of Tolerance (《容教令》) by Kangxi Emperor (1692). He also mentioned Yang Guangxian's anti-Catholic movement which was eventually overturned by Ferdinand Verbiest with the support of Kangxi Emperor. However, the influences of Yang's anti-Catholicism lasted for long time.

Although Yang Guangxian's anti-Catholic movement ended in failure at last, the problem of the legitimacy of Catholicism was not totally solved. The social, intellectual and cultural environment of the early Qing dynasty was very different from that of the late Ming dynasty, and the position of Catholicism was somewhat embarrassing. At first, it was a foreign religion; and secondly, it was distinct from Confucian ideology. Thus, Catholicism in the early Qing dynasty involved two issues of relationship. The first was the relationship between the Great Qing (the Emperor) and the Western states (the Pope). The second was the relationship between Church and State. The Chinese Rites Controversy intensified these conflicts. Then Kangxi Emperor decided to forbid Catholicism which showed that the problem of legitimacy of Catholicism was not handled very well.

From late Ming to early Qing, there were changes in the explanation of Catholicism's legitimacy. The strategy of Catholicism in late Ming was "completing Confucianism and replacing Buddhism (and Taoism)". Lots of missionaries and believers tried to argue that there were no distinctions between Catholicism and Confucianism especially the Ancient Confucianism before Han dynasty. Such as Catholic Deus was namely the Heaven in Confucian classics. However, since Han dynasty, the Buddhism entered China and destroyed the Confucianism which made it lost its original pureness. Thus, the contemporary Confucianism need to be complemented by Catholicism which means that it was necessary to replace Buddhism.

When in early Qing, the Catholics changed to use restore Confucianism and replace Buddhism as its main strategy, which also included the idea of "super-Confucianism". The so-called "restoration of Confucianism" meant restoring the ancient Confucianism, while "super-Confucianism" meant transcending the modern Confucianism. There were some differences between complementing Confucianism and restoring Confucianism. Complementing Confucianism was to recognize the authority of modern Confucianism and make up in some aspects. Restoring Confucianism was to bypass modern Confucianism after the Qin and Han dynasties and returned to Confucius and Mencius directly. Complementing Confucianism was in term of social function; but restoring Confucianism was in terms of the tradition of Tao.

The changes of social environment and cultural context made the Catholics adjust the narrations of legitimacy. In late Ming, when the nation was in turmoil and chaos, lots of rebellions stoke the traditional order. The Confucian moral principles lost the power to control people's mind. Thus, the missionaries and Confucian Catholics tried to argue that Catholicism could complement Confucianism

[10] Ibid. ,p. 589.

which would be helpful and benefitable for the society and imperial ruling. It was clearly illustrated in Xu Guangqi's *Bianxue zhangshu* (《辨学章疏》). In the early Qing, a new dynasty was founded and the society became more and more stable and prosperous. The Confucian ideology was again enforced and promoted in the nation. However, literary inquisitions and mind control narrowed the space of free speech. Confucian literati had to turn their researches from the practical ideology to the philology. The missionaries and Catholics tried to find evidences and materials from the ancient classics to prove that Catholic doctrine was the same as the Confucianism. Besides, Confucianism could restore the Confucianism to the original edition.

However, since Matteo Ricci, Catholics always took the Buddhism as their targets to attack. Indeed, this made some literati converted to Catholicism because they were disappointed to Buddhism and thought that the Buddhism corrupted Confucian and Chinese ethics. Thus, Liu Ning believed that restoring Confucianism namely need to replace Buddhism. The reason of Liu Ning 's conversion to Catholicism was his rejection of Buddhism just like his cotemporary Catholic Zhang Xingyao. Liu Ning argued that only Catholicism could exclude Buddhism and restore ancient Confucianism, "the Heaven blesses China; the missionaries arrived and the teachings of Confucius and Mencius revived and succeeded." "The great Tao was obscured for long time. If the western Confucians didn't enter China by the sea, the true teachings of Yao, Shun, Yu, Tang, Wen, Wu, Duke of Zhou, Confucius and Mencius were almost extinguished."

Another reason why Liu Ning was baptized was his study of ancient classics and philology. He tried to find the original and true meanings of the ancient Confucian classics to re-interpret and re-understand the Confucian classics. He contributed himself to study Chinese characters and the six categories which deeply impacted the Figurism such Joseph Premare. Although Liu Ning has written little on Catholicism, his books of *Tianxue jijie* and *Juesilu* were very significant which left lots of information and materials for researchers to explore the history of Catholicism in early Qing. Liu Ning also actively debated with the Buddhism and defended his faith which contributed his part to the development of Catholicism in early Qing dynasty.

中文题目:

清初儒家基督徒刘凝(1620—1715?)新探

肖清和,北京大学哲学博士,上海大学历史系教授、上海大学宗教与中国社会研究中心主任

摘要:学界有关清初普通天主教徒的研究成果较少。本文则通过相关文献资料对清初经学家、天主教徒刘凝的家族、生平、著作、交往、思想等进行勾勒与论述。本文使用前人所未用的材料,考证出刘凝出生于1620年,于1710年左右去世;并在1687年赴任崇义训导之前即已受洗入教。本文亦对刘凝的“复儒”、“易佛”等思想做了较为深入的探讨,并分析从明末到清初,天主教徒辩护天主教合法性的变化及其主要原因。

关键词:刘凝(家族/生平/著作);复儒易佛;交往;经学;信仰

Study on Christian Belief and Cultural Exchange of Chinese in Northern Thailand

—The Case of the Manchu Village of Chiang Rai^[1]

Shoulei LI and Shaoxian XU

(Kunming University, Yunnan Province, China; Chiang Rai Rajabhat University, Chiang Rai, Thailand)

Abstract: In the process of integration into Thai society, Manchu Village, a Chinese community, has achieved mutual cooperation between civil autonomy authority and national administrative authority. Gradually accepted Thai culture, villagers in Manchu formed a strong national identity for Thailand. Meanwhile, they still inherit Chinese culture and maintained hometown recall and Chinese identity, which have also undergone fission. A variety of beliefs, such as Islam, Christianity, Buddhism, Yitong Taoism, and “Heaven, Earth, Country, Ancestor and Teacher”, coexist in the community. However, the split of the Christian church has not affected the unity and cohesion of the community. The spread and development of Christianity in Manchu presents a macro interaction chain between Thailand and Southeast Asia, between China’s southeastern coast and southwestern frontiers.

Key Words: Chinese in Thailand; religious harmony; Christianity

Author: LI Shoulei, Kunming University, 2 Puxin Road, Kunming Economic and Technological Development Zone, 650214, Kunming, Yunnan Province, China, Tel. 18487258647, Email: shouleili123@163.com; XU Shaoxian, Chiang Rai Rajabhat University, 80 Phaholyotin Rd Muang, 57100, Chiang Rai, Thailand, Tel. 18214191914, Email: xushaoxian90@gmail.com

As an ordinary Chinese village in northern Thailand, Manchu Village located in the core of the “Golden Triangle” bordered by Laos, Myanmar and Thailand. It is only 12 kilometers away from the Thai-Myanmar border city “Mesai”. In the later period of the Liberation War of China, more than 1,000 Kuomintang remnants from Yunnan retired to Myanmar to establish the “Yunnan People’s Anti-Communist National Salvation Army” in northern Myanmar. At its peak, the number of soldiers reached nearly 20,000, and the main people are from Yunnan. “Under international pressure and military strikes, this army was withdrawn to Taiwan in batches. Among them, the Third Army and the Fifth Army were reluctant to evacuate and entered Tangwoin Chiang Mai and Mae Salong in

[1] Research Project; National Social Science Great Research Project (No. 17ZDA231), Philosophy and Social Science Research Base project of Yunnan Province (No. JD2019YB15).

Chiang Rai in Northern Thailand, therefore, they became ‘solitary troops’”.^[2] In 1955, some family members of the Fifth Army came to the Manchu area in Chiang Rai province. Confronted with jungle with wild grass, they cut down big trees with their own hands, reclaimed wasteland, built bamboo huts, engaged in agricultural production, vegetable sales and poultry breeding to build their new home in Thailand. After settling down, these drifting, fate-beaten veterans married Lahu, Arka, Thai, Lisu women and lived here for generations. Located in the north of the village, a beautiful and elegant Sleeping Beauty Mountain embraces and nurtures the village’s peaceful and affluent life in the village. As it was fenced away from war-fire, turbulence and poverty, it is difficult to associate this scene with armed remnants and refugees. At present, there are 135 Chinese families in Manchu, plus some scattered Chinese around, there are about 200 families in total. With Thai, Lisu and Lahu ethnic groups, they maintain the same traditional customs and frequent interactive relationships with each other.

I. Authoritative Structure Changes of Manchu Village

At the beginning of these solitary troops’ settlement in northern Thailand, the Thai government adopted a temporary tacit attitude to their self-government. Later, in order to levy taxes, it was incorporated into the local administrative establishment, following the “chieftain” management method of the mountainous areas in the border areas. The head person is responsible for the internal affairs of the community. The solitary army formed an autonomous system with Duan Xiwen and Li Wenhuan as the chieftains due to its own organizational basis, cultural traditions and living environment. The Chinese Village established an autonomous association to be responsible for the management of community affairs. The “capable man and magistrate” directly appointed by Duan and Li as the chairman, established a management system that is accessible and stratified. The military system and discipline are still deeply ingrained in the ideology of the first and second generations of Chinese. In addition, the Chinese community has always attached importance to traditional moral etiquette such as “three outlines, five constituencies”, “loyalty”, and “filial piety”, which constitute the organizational and cultural elements of the self-government management model. In 1997, the Thai government formally incorporated the “solitary army” Chinese community into the national administrative system and established a formal administrative village system. In 2002, the elected village heads were gradually implemented in these communities in accordance with the Thai internal affairs law, and village committees were formed. In the face of national forces infiltrating into the Chinese community, after confrontation, debugging and integration, the Autonomous Association was changed to “Sandang Boarding Committee”, giving up the community’s administrative management rights, and was specifically responsible for community public assets, marriage and funeral, education, disputes, mediation and other matters. Represented by the chairman of Boarding Committee, the “gentry class” is still the backbone of community management, and the village chief is a bridge between the community and the state. When I first entered the village, I asked the villagers who was

[2] 柏杨 Bo Yang:《金三角·边区·荒域》Jinsanjiao, Bianqu, Huangyu [Golden Triangle · Frontier · Wilderness], (时报文化出版社 Shibao wenhua chubanshe [Times Culture Press] 1982 年版), 第 119-120 页。

the village head. According to their guidelines, I stepped into the house and found out that it was the head of the Boarding Committee. As it can be seen that the village's chief is the local authority. The state-village-gentry interaction model is similar to the rural governance model in the period of the Republic of China.

With a charity hall in Manchu, Shantang as a consortium manage the community's public property, such as Jianhua Middle School, Guanyin Temple, mosque, Activity Center and vegetable market. Shantang has a Board Committee and is composed of more than 30 enthusiastic villagers. It has a chairman and 7 standing committee members. The village head is also one of the standing committee members. Manchu Village's document approval and financial plea for the Thai government are issued in the name of Shantang. The General Assembly of Villagers is the highest power organization in the internal affairs of the community and has the veto power over major affairs. As a permanent organization and executive agency for community affairs management, Shantang's Boarding Committee absorbs village elites such as village heads, school principals, elite of Buddhist temples and mosques, and descendants of military officers. The village chief is the official administrative authority of Manchu Village, with six subordinate groups. The village chief controls the government's administrative resources and has an independent executive organization. The administrative system led by the village chief and the board of directors led by the chairman have clear boundaries in terms of property, personnel and management, but they work together on specific matters to maintain the unity and cohesion of the village.

II. Cultural Inheritance and Manchu Villager's Identification

In the process of integration into Thai society, the Chinese in northern Thailand have gradually accepted Thai culture and have formed a strong national identity for Thailand. At the same time, they continue to inherit Chinese culture and maintain Chinese identity, hometown recall and national identity with China. The Hani (Arka), Lisu and other ethnic minorities who migrated from China and Myanmar have a strong national identity for Thailand. The national identity of the Han people who traveled from China to northern Thailand is complicated. These Han nationalities admit that they are Thais with a Chinese heart and struggling emotion, which contributes to their Chinese education.^[3] The solitary army is dominated by men, and their spouses are mainly ethnic minority women from the Baiyi (also called Thai), Miao, Yao, and Lisu on borders of China, Myanmar, Laos, and Thailand. Mothers play a role as teachers for children to learn the tradition culture. However, women are usually ignorant and dominated by their husbands, with few powers at home. Secondly, as these mountain women are mostly married at a young age (about fifteen or six years old), forming an old husband and a young wife pattern (generally with more than 20 years gap), which is a big problem in life. Broken families leave a negative impact on the next generation. Deeply influenced by their fathers, most of the young despise their mothers and consider them as barbarians. Some are

[3] 马翀伟 Ma Zhongwei:《秋千架下:一个泰国北部阿卡人村寨的民族志》Qiuqianjiaxia: Yige taiguo beibu akaren cunzhai de minzuzhi [Under a swing: The ethnography of an Akha village in northern Thailand], (中国社会科学出版社 zhongguo shehuikexue chubanshe [China Social Sciences Press] 2013 年版), 第 106 页。

even ashamed to admit their mothers with Yelang's arrogance.^[4] Therefore, the Chinese community in northern Thailand does not highlight the characteristics of minority cultures, but prefers traditional Chinese moral etiquette and Chinese culture, which is attributed to its military background, patriarchal social structure and association with Taiwan.

1. Ethnic Inter-marriage Brings Cultural Integration

Most of the first generation married Yunnan minority women or local minority women when retreating to Myanmar, Laos and Thailand. Due to the governance of Thai, these Yunnanese cannot casually leave northern Thailand to Bangkok and other big cities for development. Growing up in the Chinese community in northern Thailand, the second generation forms an internal stable social circle and most of them choose to marry familiar people. The Mainland Disaster Relief Association in Taiwan (also called Savior Committee) has acquired 50 free college admissions for these Chinese people to go to Taiwan each year. They went to Taiwan to study and work with overseas Chinese status and most of them started their families in Kaohsiung. In October 2018, the author interviewed the descendants of withdrawn Yunnan troops and a Yunnan native from Thailand. In the 1980s, she went to study in Kaohsiung from Mae Salong, Chiang Rai, Thailand, and then went to these Yunnan communities to find boyfriends, and finally got married and settled down. After Lee Teng-hui took office in Taiwan, he gradually reduced the quota for overseas Chinese students and finally terminated the free quota in 1991. The educational access to Taiwan narrowed. The Chinese in Northern Thailand have gradually acquired Thai nationality and entered large cities for development. The economic conditions in northern Thailand are improving day by day, and a large number of Chinese remain in the local industry to build their homes. During their integration into Thai society, the Chinese people integrated with other ethnic groups. The third generation of inter-marriage with Thais is ubiquitous. Ethnic inter-marriage has brought about the integration of Chinese culture and Thai culture, thereby promoting the inheritance and changes of Chinese culture. The third generation of Chinese has accepted quite a lot of Thai culture and promoted the integration of Chinese culture and Thai culture to a higher level.

Most of villagers married with Chinese people, and they gradually married Thais. The conservative parents of the first generation wanted their children to marry a Chinese or have a Chinese daughter-in-law. The Chinese village was relatively isolated and had little contact with the outside world. Now that with an ID card, the open-minded young generation has a wider range of contacts and is influenced by the Thai culture. They made a lot of Thai friends and naturally fell in love. Without parents' objection, the third-generation of Chinese and Thais married each other and maintained both Chinese and Thai cultures. Luckily, the Qingming Festival coincides with Thai's legal holiday Songkran Festival and people can go home to sweep the grave and celebrate Thai's festival.

(Interviewed in Villager Chief's home in December, 14th, 2016.)

2. Cultural Inheritance in the Process of Social Integration

The solitary army has always attached great importance to the Chinese education of the next

[4] 林镜初 Lin Jingchu,《再上小村路——重临金三角》Zaishang xiaocunlu—chonglin jinsanjiao[On the small village road again to the Golden Triangle], (宣道出版社 xuandao chubanshe[Xuandao Press] 1992 年版), 第 76-77 页。

generation. As long as the fighting is calmed down during the transition to the border between Yunnan and Myanmar, the learned military officers will teach the children Chinese characters and moral etiquette. After the settlement of in the north of Thailand, each Chinese village immediately set about building a school with the aim of inheriting Chinese culture and maintaining Chinese identity. In 1982, Savior Committee began to provide teaching materials and training teachers to these Chinese Villages in Northern Thailand, and enabled 50 students to learn each year in Taiwan for free. Then, Chinese education in Northern Thailand has been incorporated into the Taiwanese education system, splitting the cultural memory of the hometown (Yunnan) from the Chinese cultural identity (Taiwan). In 1986, the Thai government banned Chinese schools and changed them to Thai schools to promote rural Thai education. While receiving Thai language education, the Chinese Village also continued to adhere to Chinese language education in the name of holding agricultural technology training or being distributed to farmers' homes in turns. By the early 1990s, in order to revitalize the economy, Thailand began to introduce funds from Taiwan, Hong Kong, and mainland China, lacking a large number of Chinese and Thai bilingual talents, and gradually relaxed control of Chinese education. Chinese villages in northern Thailand have restored Chinese schools. Most villages have established Chinese primary schools, and villages with better conditions have established Chinese junior high schools and high schools.

The Manchu is located in plateau with convenient transportation. In the process of restoring Chinese education, it raised funds to establish elementary schools, junior high schools and high schools to recruit children from surrounding Chinese villages. In 1995, Manchu allocated public land and raised more than 4 million baht for constructing high school. Taiwan's Salvation Committee funded more than 9 million. Without government support for Chinese school, they are approved under the name of Thai Vocational and Technical School. The school teachers accorded with the curriculum of the Thai Vocational and Technical School during the day and taught Chinese in the evening. In 2000, the Manchu High School began to enroll students and the teaching materials of Taiwan are used. At present, there are 500 students in the Thai Department and 300 students in the Chinese Department. Many students learn both Chinese and Thai. School funds are mainly collected from overseas Chinese committees, non-governmental organizations in Taiwan (such as Taiwan Fu Guangshan Association), overseas Chinese businessmen in Taiwan, Taiwanese businessmen and local chambers of commerce. In October 2018, locals recalled the chairman of the Manchu Chinese School who led students to tour the Taiwan area to collect donations, while interviewed by me.

III. Manchu's Multi-region and Christian Belief

1. Multiple religions coexist in a community space

As an immigrant settlement community, Manchu has a complex religious background. Coupled with religious exchanges with Chinese in Taiwan, Hong Kong, and Southeast Asia, a harmonious coexistence of multiple religions has formed. The folk beliefs of the "Admiration of Heaven, Earth, Country, Ancestor and Teacher" in Yunnan, Guangxi and other regions in China protected these soldiers and civilians who escaped to northern Thailand to have a wonderful home. Except Muslim

families, each house in the Manchu set a “Heaven, Earth, Country, Ancestor and Teacher” sign, with an incense burner in front and the portraits of the deceased parents on both sides.^[5] The arrangement of the belief space of the family hall includes the ancestor worship, Confucianism, Buddhism and Taoism, which fully embodies the prevalence and tolerance of traditional Chinese beliefs. The dominant religious belief of the villagers is mainly reflected in Buddhist activities. When they first settled here, there were no Buddhist temples. During the Buddhist festivals, villagers spontaneously went to nearby Theravada Buddhist temples of Thai people. As Buddhist festivals have become an important framework for the folk culture of the Chinese community in northern Thailand, Manchu Village collectively funded the construction of Guanyin Temple to construct a collective field that showcases the memory of traditional Chinese belief culture. A villager who understands the Buddhist scriptures regularly, often holds ceremonial ceremonies for the surrounding residents to pray for disaster relief, and later built a temple on his own land. The two temples are private and public, interweaving the belief space of community collective activities and private individual activities. The remnants of the Dian-Burma Kuomintang include a large number of Hui people, both military combatants and members of the horse gang. These Hui people followed the troops to the north of Thailand. At the beginning of the construction of the village, a mosque was established to inherit the Islamic faith and the Muslim social interaction model. Only when the Hui and Han people marry will the phenomenon of “religious encounter” of two beliefs in a family or a person arises, and they face the problem of reformation or religious adaptation. More often, Islam and other religions in the community have their own affairs. The Taiwan authorities are inextricably linked to the Chinese villages in northern Thailand, and their religious culture has also affected this area. In the 1990s, the “consistency” listed by the Taiwan authorities as a cult spread in northern Thailand and inevitably spread to Manchu Village. Consistent Tao borrows some teachings of Confucianism, Taoism, Buddhism, Christianity and Islam to worship the supreme god “Promise Mother”; emphasizes the “three-phase robbery” and believes that it is currently in the “last robbery”. Consistently preaching by means of granting relief funds, it envelops a large number of poor villagers to teach. Believers can only eat eggs rather than meat, the religion is also called “egg church” in northern Thailand.

Before the founding of the People’s Republic of China, the Christian faith in Southwest China was very popular. China Inland Mission has spread to most parts of Yunnan, especially in central Yunnan, northern Yunnan, and western Yunnan. In the Liberation War, the Great Leap, the “Democracy Reform” and the Cultural Revolution, Christians in the border areas constantly moved out and entered Chinese villages in northern Thailand. Most of evacuated foreign missions escaped to Southeast Asian countries, in Thailand and Myanmar and they continued to preach to these Chinese who had migrated from Yunnan. After the founding of the People’s Republic of China, China Inland Mission moved its headquarters to Singapore and renamed it as The Overseas Missionary Fellowship. Priests came to northern Thailand to teach mountainous nations. The remnants of the

[5] When the Revolution of 1911 overthrew the imperial system, “Heaven, Earth, Emperor, Ancestor and Teacher” was changed into “Heaven, Earth, Country, Ancestor and Teacher”. Each house set a “Heaven, Earth, Country, Ancestor and Teacher” sign in Yunnan communities in northern Thailand and in Taiwan.

KMT recruited a large number of Yunnan ethnic minorities who fled on the Yunnan-Myanmar border, including many Christians. They also forced to marry local ethnic minority women as wives. Therefore, the Chinese village including a large number of ethnic minority population become a key target for China Inland Mission in northern Thailand. The Chinese in Thailand traditionally migrated from Guangdong, Fujian, Hainan, and other places along the southeast coast of China, who were mainly preached by The Baptist Church. Currently, the Baptist Church and the China Inland Mission are jointly shepherding among Yunnan Chinese from northern Thailand. After the Chinese Liberation War, the Baptist Church began to pay attention to the remnants of the Kuomintang from Yunnan to Northern Thailand. Around 1975, Baptist seminary students at Bethel Sacred Word College in Bangkok went to the refugee village of the Kuomintang remnants of Chiang Rai province. In 1984, Bethel Holy Path College moved to Mae Sai City, Chiang Rai Province, focusing on mission to Yunnan Chinese from China and Myanmar. The Baptist Theological Seminary first entered Manchu Village for missions. Later, the China Inland Mission settled in Manchu Village to set up a student center depending on Manchu High School and entrust students from other villages who come here to gospel ministry.

2. Development and Inheritance of Christianity in Manchu

In the 1970s and 1980s, mission groups in southern Thailand, Singapore, Taiwan, and Hong Kong began to enter the region for short-term missions and condolences with the ending of wars in northern Thailand. In 1975, Bethel Theological Seminary bought land, built a church, sent missionaries and supported Christians who had been converted in the village. Later, various mission groups of foreign churches followed. In 1981, Hong Kong Nian En Church and Ling Guang Chinese Church sent the students to study short-term missions in the northern Thailand. Among them, a young couple from the Lin Family came to the Manchu to serve as a missionary mission in 1984 and 1985 respectively. In a Theravada Buddhism country, they preached to some drug users in a male-dominated community with strong family values and traditional beliefs. In order to overcome multiple minority languages barriers, the couple of missionaries studied the local customs to Yunnan on vacation specially. They were responsible for receiving visiting groups and short-term mission teams from all over the country; and participated in the training of Chinese missionaries retreat in Thailand. After six or seven years of hard work, the number of believers in the Manchu Church has steadily increased, the management and operation have entered the track, and the faith has become more solid.

In 1991, the Lins' husband and wife contract expired and returned to the Hong Kong's Association. The pastoral matters of the church were handed over to the local Chinese Pastor Wang and his wife. After more than ten years of steady development, the Manchu Village Church suffered a tremendous change in 2004 and split into two churches due to the rivalry for authority. Pastor Wang also lost the right to manage the church. In 2000, the Manchu Village School added a high school department and started to recruit children from surrounding Chinese, but the school's boarding conditions and management level both worried parents. In 2005, Pastor Wang bought land next to the Manchu Village and planned to build a Student Center, which was completed in 2007. This Student Center mainly provides board and lodging for students from other villages who come to Manchu Village for high school, fulfills parental care duties, and spreads the gospel to students. In fact, there

were many Student Centers in Chiang Rai, some of which provide lodging and boarding for college students and high school students, including some Christian-centered Student Centers. In 2016, when I was investigating in Chiang Rai Province, most Student Center charged five or six thousand baht per person for board and lodging. Because the Manchu Student Center is located in the countryside, the surrounding rents are cheap and free of accommodation fees. Meals are only charged at 2,800 baht per month. Morning and evening meals are provided from Monday to Friday, and three meals are provided on Saturday and Sunday. Most of the younger generations in the Chinese village in northern Thailand work in cities such as Bangkok, Chiang Mai, and Chiang Rai, and send their children back to hometowns. The children are taken care of and educated by their grandparents. These children do not get good family education at home, and they lack a group of moral constraints. The Student Center is like a big family, with Pastor Wang and his wife as parents. The Manchu Student Center has a fixed time for Christian activities. It prays at 6 a. m. every day to explain a Bible; it meets on Saturday and Sunday nights to sing hymns and share testimonies of growth; 10 a. m. on Sunday is a normal service. The gospel was spread to boarding students and cultivated their awareness of Christian faith through these Christian activities. There are more than 30 boarders in the Manchu Activity Center, including Chinese, Aka, Yao, Miao, Lisu, Wa, Lahu, and Thai students. The Manchu Student Center has become a local multi-ethnic youth gospel training center.

3. Manchu Multi-religious Coexistence and Christian Church Split

The management system and community structure contribute to Manchu Village's multiple religions. These remaining troops include regular soldiers from Guangxi and Guizhou, local armed forces in Yunnan, and ordinary people who migrated from Yunnan. In addition, the troops forcibly married local ethnic minority women at the borders of Yunnan, Myanmar, Thailand, and Laos, forming a group with a very complex ethnic and religious background. The military system and the patriarchal social structure ensure the collective cohesion and cultural unity of this group of "foreign and isolated troops". Therefore, most families in the Manchu village generally worship "Heaven Earth Emperor Teachers", and have established a collective Guanyin Temple to inherit traditional Chinese religious culture. The villagers' turbulent migration experience and life course have virtually "held all together" into a "fate community". Meanwhile, they refined their tolerance for multi-ethnic and multi-religious cultural differences. The Manchu Village used collective assets to build mosques for Hui villagers, and reformed the religion during marriages with the Hui people. After the Self-governing Council evolved into the board of directors of the charity Shantang, the mosques, Christian church managers and ordinary followers who were enthusiastic about community public welfare undertakings were added to the board of directors. At present, the imam of the Manchu mosque has not entered the board of directors, but a mosque organizing committee is a member of the Board of Directors. The pastor of Christ Church works for the Board of Directors and actively serves the community charity.

Around 2014, a split occurred in the church. Some believers came out, bought land to build churches, and organized church services independently. As early as 2005, Pastor Wang and his wife came out of the Manchu Village church and built a student center, no longer involving in the church affairs. This had shown the deep problems of church management. Although the church was built by locals, the outside pastor was hired to serve. But the Deacon Committee formed by the believers in

the village controls the daily management of the church. Therefore, although the church is an independent legal person, it inevitably “embeds” the social structure of the Manchu village and has lost its autonomy to some extent. Pastor Wang was sent by Bethel Holy Word College to build a church in Manchu Village and went to central Thailand to take charge of the gospel work of the mountain people. The management of the church is handed over to the more prestigious elderly soldier Christians in the village, reflecting the extension of the community authority structure within the church. However, these prestigious Christians did not have a deep religious foundation, which caused the church to fall into stagnation. When the Lins’ husband and wife presided over the teaching affairs in the Manchu Village, they simply focused on cultivating Christians with enthusiasm and deep roots as church leaders. But these believers are at the lower level of the community’s authority structure, and are regarded as “little people”. They have no knowledge and lack leadership skills. Therefore, there is a rift between the authority structure of the church and the community structure. In 1991, the Lins’ husband and wife returned to Hong Kong after the expiry, and Rev. Wang and his wife took over the church again. Because this group of elderly soldiers with prestige and shallow foundation of faith still have a greater influence in the church, it is difficult for Pastor Wang to really take charge of church affairs, and he can only do so. In 2014, the church grew from more than 20 people to more than 100 people. The relationship between religious authority and powerful Christians in the community was more complicated, and finally led to irreconcilable conflicts. The real reason for the split of the Manchu church is the conflict between the authority of the church and the structure of the community authority.

IV. Manchu Village Presents the Status of Sino-Thai Chinese Christian Exchanges

Chinese schools are continually run to inherit Chinese culture by Chinese in the northern Thailand. Before the establishment of diplomatic relations between China and Thailand, the Thai Chinese School in northern Thailand completely used the teaching materials of Taiwan in accordance with the syllabus of the Taiwan authorities. With the peace of northern Thailand, Yunnan Chinese have acquired Thai status and their living conditions have improved, giving up their will to study in Taiwan. After the establishment of diplomatic relations between China and Thailand, China increased its assistance to Chinese language teaching in Thailand and expanded the influence of Chinese culture by selecting volunteers for Chinese language teaching and establishing Confucius Institutes. Some Chinese schools in northern Thailand began to abandon the education system in Taiwan and accepted education assistance from China.

Chairman Liu, the board of Directors of Manchu Shantang, was very excited about the two issues. Firstly, the textbooks used by Chinese School in northern Thailand are in traditional Chinese. He said: “Due to simplified characters in the mainland, there is a distinction between traditional and simplified Chinese characters. We are always using traditional Chinese characters.” This reflects their identification towards Taiwan and the People’s Republic of China. Liu continued: “After Lee Teng-hui’s coming to power, he reduced the number of Chinese students to Taiwan. Lee Teng-hui is Japanese and he advocated Taiwan independence.” The Chinese, escaping to Thailand from Yunnan

support one China. The complexity of the cultural inheritance and identity of ethnic Chinese in northern Thailand has brought uncertainty to Sino-Thai Christian cultural exchanges.

The ethnic involvement of the Chinese in northern Thailand and the history of Christian beliefs have a special effect on the Sino-Thai Christian exchanges. Most northern Chinese are moved from Yunnan, China, and have a natural sense of identity with their hometowns. They have always maintained political, economic, demographic, and cultural connections with Taiwan, which will inevitably affect the Chinese national identity and their national identity. In the process of finding a place to live, they acquired Thai nationality and finally integrated into Thai society. The first group of Christians in the Chinese Village in Northern Thailand had converted to God in their hometown in Yunnan. After moving to Thailand, they reconnected with the Overseas Mission of Christ (OMF, formerly known as the Inland Mission Association). Baptist churches, a very influential one on the southeastern coast of China (including Hong Kong and Taiwan) and Southeast Asians, have also spread gospel in Yunnan and then in the northern Thailand. It was only in 1973 that the People's Republic of China resumed diplomatic relations with Thailand. Especially with China's Opening-up and Reform Policy, the Chinese churches in northern Thailand entered the borders of Yunnan in China. It is the interaction between Chinese Christianity in northern Thailand and Yunnan superficially, but it is actually interactive chain of Christianity in Yunnan, Thailand, Singapore, Taiwan, Hong Kong, and Southeast China. So, the Christian cultural exchange in a Chinese village in northern Thailand presents the Chinese cultural ties between China and the Southeast Asia.

中文题目：

泰国北部华人基督教信仰与文化交流研究：以清莱府满村为例

李守雷，昆明学院，昆明经济科学发展区浦新路2号，650214，昆明市，云南省，中国，Tel. 18487258647，Email: shouleili123@163.com；

徐绍仙，Chiang Rai Rajabhat University, 80 Phaholyotin Rd Muang, 57100, Chiang Rai, Thailand, Tel. 18214191914, Email: xushaoxian90@gmail.com

摘要：华人社区满村在融入泰国社会的过程中实现了民间自治权威与国家行政权威的相互协作。满村逐步接受了泰国文化，对泰国形成强烈的国家认同；同时继续传承中华文化，维持着华人认同、故乡的追忆和对中国的国家认同，但多种认同发生了裂变。伊斯兰教、基督教、佛教、一贯道和家堂等多种信仰共存于社区；但基督教会分裂并没有影响社区的统一性和凝聚力。满村基督教的传播和发展呈现了泰国与东南亚、中国东南沿海、西南边疆的宏观互动链。

关键词：泰国华人；宗教和谐；基督教

教会历史与
中西社会
Church History
in the West and in China

“Neutrality is Impossible”: Nationalism, Unequal Treaties and the National Christian Council of China, 1925—1926

Marina Xiaojing WANG

(Centre of Mission and Global Studies, VID Specialized University Norway)

Abstract: This article takes the National Christian Council of China (NCC) as a case study. By examining the responses from various stakeholder both mainline Chinese Protestants and western mission within the NCC to the campaigns for the abrogation of the unequal treaties during the period of 1925—1926, it aims to reveal the tension and interaction between Christian missions, Chinese churches and the nationalist discourse. This article argues that although both Protestant missions and Chinese churches were in general the beneficiaries of the “toleration clauses” of the unequal treaties and were aware of the necessity of drawing a clear borderline with the treaties, the two parties viewed the matter from different standpoints. To the majority of the missionary societies associated with the NCC, it was a diplomatic matter to be solved through formal negotiation between the governments. Whereas to most of the mainline Chinese Protestants, it had developed into a fundamental factor causing not only Christianity’s unfavourable position in Chinese society, but also China’s backwardness and “humiliation.” Considerably influenced by the nationalist discourse, they ardently engaged themselves in the campaigns to abrogate the unequal treaties, individually or as a group. Specific Chinese socio-political context and the nationalist discourse contributed significantly to the divergence of views. The NCC, incorporating both sides, was obliged to make a prompt response to the treaty issue and struggled to find common ground among the cooperating bodies.

Key Words: Unequal treaties; nationalism; National Christian Council of China; Chinese churches; Christian missions

Author: Marina Xiaojing WANG, Post-doctoral Research Fellow, Centre of Mission and Global Studies, VID Specializes University, Engelsminnegata 16, Kannikgården, 4008 Stavanger, Norway. Email: marina_xj_wang@gmail.com

Jiang Menglin (Chiang Monlin 蒋梦麟), president of Peking University (1919—1927) and minister of education of the Republic of China (1928—1930), once commented on China’s encounter with Christianity as follows:

During the nineteenth century, Christianity ganged together with the commercial activities that relied on the patronage of military powers. This made Christianity, once a religion advocating to “love your neighbour as yourself,” an agent of western aggression in Chinese people’s mind. The Chinese gradually formed an impression that ... Jesus Christ arrived in China on a cannonball. ^[1]

[1] Jiang Menglin, *Xi chao* [Tides from the West], (Shenyang: Liaoning jiaoyu chubanshe [Liaoning Education Press], 1997), 2.

The “patronage of military powers” refers to a series of wars and conflicts between the Qing empire and western powers in modern Chinese history, such as the Opium Wars (1839—1842 and 1856—1860), and the consequent treaties since 1842, for example, the Treaty of Nanking (1842), the Treaty of Wanghia (1844), the Treaty of Tientsin (1858), the Convention of Peking (1860) and the Boxer Protocol (1901), etc. Those treaties guaranteed western powers the fixed tariff rate of five percent *ad valorem* and extraterritoriality, which immunised foreigners from Chinese jurisdiction. With the growth of nationalist sentiments in the early twentieth century, the above treaties were labelled “unequal” by Chinese nationalists, condemning that they were placed against China’s will in a weaker position by western military powers and strengthened the privileges and rights of the nationals of the powers.^[2] Throughout the twentieth century, the phrase “unequal treaties (*bupingdeng tiaoyue* 不平等条约)” has become one of the most frequently appeared phrases in the discourse of Chinese nationalism and has occupied “a central position in the Chinese collective memory of the nation’s humiliating experience.”^[3]

As a term closely related to modern Chinese nationalism, the topic of “unequal treaties” has attracted much scholarly attention. For the treaty issue in the Republican era, many studies have been done from the angles of political, legal and diplomatic history, and international relations.^[4] Nonetheless, few have specifically focused on the perspectives of Christian missions and Chinese churches at that time, who, as one of the actual beneficiaries from the treaties, became the main target of the Anti-Christian Movement and the nationalist campaigns for the termination of the unequal

[2] Edmund S. K. Fung, “The Chinese Nationalists and the Unequal Treaties 1924—1931,” *Modern Asian Studies*, vol. 21, no. 4, (1987), 795-796. For instance, Sun Yat-sen claimed in his article “Zhongguo neiluan zhi yin (The Causes of China’s Civil Strife)” in 1924 that, “What are the unequal treaties? To put it simply, they are our ‘slave contracts.’ ... If we are still reluctant to revitalise our national spirit, to restore concessions, customs and extraterritorial rights and to abolish all the unequal treaties, China would no longer be a nation of the world and we Chinese nationals of the world no more.” See Sun Yat-sen, “Zhongguo neiluan zhi yin [The Causes of China’s Civil Strife],” in Qin Xiaoyi, ed., *Guofu quanji* [Collected Works of Sun Yat-sen], vol. 3, (Taipei: Zhongguo Guomindang wenhua chuanbo weiyuanhui dangshiguan [Kuomintang Archives & History Museum], 1989), 528-534.

[3] Dong Wang, *China’s Unequal Treaties: Narrating National History*, (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2005), 1.

[4] For example, Thomas David Reins, “China and the International Politics of Opium, 1900—1937: The Impact of Reform, Revenue, and the Unequal Treaties,” PhD diss., Claremont Graduate University, 1981; Dong Wang, “The Discourse of Unequal Treaties in Modern China,” *Pacific Affairs*, vol. 76, no. 3, (2003), 399-425; idem, *China’s Unequal Treaties*; Li Yumin, *Jindai Zhongguo de tiaoyue zhidu* [Treaty System in Modern China], (Changsha: Hunan shifan daxue chubanshe [Hunan Normal University Press], 1995); idem, *Zhongguo feiyue shi* [A History of the Abrogation of the Treaties in China], (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju [Zhonghua Book Company], 2005); idem, *Jindai zhongwai guanxi yu zhengzhi* [Modern Sino-Foreign Relations and Politics], (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju [Zhonghua Book Company], 2006); Tang Qihua, *Bei “feichubupingdeng tiaoyue” zhebi de Beiyang xiuyue shi* [Treaty Revision Campaign of the Beijing Government, 1912—1928: Out of the Shadow of the “Abrogation of Unequal Treaties”], (Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe [Social Sciences Academic Press], 2010); Hou Zhongjun, *Jindai Zhongguo de bupingdeng tiaoyue: guanyu pingpan biao zhun de taolun* [Unequal Treaties in Modern China: Discussions on Criteria], (Shanghai: Shanghai shudian chubanshe [Shanghai Bookstore Publishing House], 2012); Fung, “Chinese Nationalists and Unequal Treaties,” 793-819; J. Y. Wong, “The Limits of Naval Power: British Gunboat Diplomacy in China from the Nemesis to the Amethyst, 1839—1949,” *War & Society*, vol. 18, no. 2, (2000), 93-120; Kevin Herrick, “The Merger of Two System: Chinese Adoption and Western Adaptation in the Formation of Modern International Law,” *Georgia Journal of International and Comparative Law*, vol. 33, (2005), 685-703; Phoebe Chow, “Parliament and the Problem of China, 1925-7: Priorities, Preoccupations and Stereotypes,” *Parliamentary History*, vol. 29, no. 3, (2010), 358-375; Alison Adcock Kaufman, “In Pursuit of Equality and Respect: China’s Diplomacy and the League of Nations,” *Modern China*, vol. 40, no. 6, (2014), 605-638; and Pasha L. Hsieh, “The Discipline of International Law in Republican China and Contemporary Taiwan,” *Washington University Global Studies Law Review*, vol. 14, no. 1, (2015), 87-129.

treaties in the 1920s.^[5] As one may have observed in the above quote from Jiang, the role of Christianity played in China's "century of humiliation" had gradually been fixed in the early twentieth-century nationalist discourse with the rhetoric of "unequal treaties" acting as a catalyst. Apart from some of their early attempts before the signing of the American Tientsin Treaty in 1858, in which the "toleration clause" was incorporated, Christian missions, consciously or unconsciously, entered China under treaty protection over missionaries' rights of residence and travelling, land leasing, church building, evangelism, as well as the personal safety of both missionaries and Chinese converts. Christianity thus became intertwined with the treaties and western military powers, at least in the eyes of Chinese nationalists. A study on the involvement of Christian missions and churches in the twentieth-century treaty issue, and particularly their responses to the campaigns for abolishing the unequal treaties, would provide the reader with an integral picture of the socio-political context that Christianity in China faced and the dynamics of Chinese Christians' search for the "selfhood" of the church. It may lead to a broader examination of the complex relationship between Christian missions, native churches and nationalism in modern Chinese history.

This article takes the National Christian Council of China (NCC), a representative and advisory body among most of the mainline Protestant denominations and organisations in China since 1922, as a case study.^[6] It examines the responses from various stakeholders "both mainline Chinese

[5] Studies on this theme include Paul A. Varg, *Missionaries, Chinese, and Diplomats: The American Protestant Missionary Movement in China, 1890—1952*, (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1958); Li Chuanbin, *Jidujiao yu jindai Zhongguo de bupingdeng tiaoyue* [Christianity and the Unequal Treaties in Modern China], (Changsha: Hunan renmin chubanshe [Hunan People's Press], 2011); and Kim Ki-young, "Zhongguo jiaohui feichu bupingdeng tiaoyue de lishi guocheng kaocha [An Investigation on the Unequal Treaty Abrogation Movement of Chinese Christian Church]," *Yichun xueyuan xuebao* [Journal of Yichun College], vol. 35, no. 5, (2013), 108-111. Grounded in solid primary sources, Li's book examines the evolution of the relationships between Christianity and the unequal treaties from the Opium Wars in the 1840s to the founding of the People's Republic of China in 1949. It exhibits in detail the attitudes of various stakeholders, including missions and Chinese Christians, as well as Chinese nationalists and governments, to the treaty issue through different time periods, and lays the foundation for further research on the subject. Other relevant works scatter in the studies on the Anti-Christian Movement of 1922-7, mission schools, hospitals and other properties in China, and the history of Christianity in twentieth-century China. The majority of the studies on this theme focus on the late Qing period, addressing issues such as missionary cases, missionaries' rights under treaty protection and missionaries' roles in Sino-foreign relations. For instance, George E. Paulsen, "Missionary Criticism of the Toleration Clause in Reed's Treaty of 1858," *Monumenta Serica*, vol. 34, (1979—1980), 65-76; Zhang Li and Liu Jiantang, *Zhongguo jiao'an shi* [A History of Missionary Cases in China], (Chengdu: Sichuansheng shehuikexueyuan chubanshe [Sichuan Academy of Social Sciences Press], 1987); Chen Caijun, "Chuanjiaoshi Bi Zhiwen, Bo Jia yu zhongmei 'wangxia tiaoyue' de qianding [Elijah Coleman Bridgman, Peter Parker and the Signing of the Treaty of Wanghia]," *Aomen lishi yanjiu* [Studies in the History of Macao], no. 4, (2005), 111-114; and Wang Zhongmao, "Wanqing tianzhujiaohui zai neidi de zhichanquan shulun [A Study on Catholic Missions' Rights of Property Purchase in the Late Qing Period]," *Qingshi yanjiu* [The Qing History Journal], no. 3, (2007), 87-94. A thorough review of the existing scholarship can be found in Li Yumin, Li Chuanbin and Liu Limin, *Jindai zhongwai tiaoyue yanjiu zongshu* [Literature Review on the Studies of Modern Sino-Foreign Treaties], (Changsha: Hunan renmin chubanshe [Hunan People's Press], 2011).

[6] It should be noted that opinions on the treaty issue varied among different Protestant communities in China. This article focuses on mainline Protestantism. Responses from indigenous Christianity are beyond the scope of this article. Indigenous Protestant communities, such as the True Jesus Church, did manifest a sense of nationalism in their opposition to western Protestant establishment. Nonetheless, as Lian Xi indicates, this nationalistic sentiment, to a large degree, often failed to transcend its "more immediate sectarian interests" and was adopted as a rhetoric to legitimate their separation from western Protestantism, yet it lacked a social dimension to connect itself with the more general anti-imperialist trend in Chinese society. See Lian Xi, *Redeemed by Fire: The Rise of Popular Christianity in Modern China*, (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010), 14. Additionally, even within mainline Protestantism, there was no consensus being reached concerning the treaty issue. Protestant fundamentalists in general considered the engagement of the liberals (in their view, for example, the National Christian Council of China) in social movements and nationalist campaigns as an act of meddling with politics.

Protestants and western missions” within the NCC to the campaigns for the abrogation of the unequal treaties during the period of 1925—1926. Mainline Protestantism was often accused of being the agent of western intrusion in the discourse of “unequal treaties.” In the meantime, a large number of missionaries and mainline Chinese Protestant intellectuals and elites showed a high degree of social engagement throughout the first half of the twentieth century. The NCC, in particular, paid great attention to the search for the relevance of Christian religion to Chinese society. The exploration of its involvement in the treaty issue opens a window showing the tension and interaction between Christianity and Chinese society. This article argues that although both Protestant missions and Chinese churches were in general the beneficiaries of the “toleration clauses” of the unequal treaties and were aware of the necessity of drawing a clear borderline with the treaties, the two parties viewed the matter from different standpoints. To the majority of the missionary societies associated with the NCC, it was a diplomatic matter to be solved through formal negotiation between the governments. Whereas to most of the mainline Chinese Protestants, it had developed into a fundamental factor causing not only Christianity’s unfavourable position in Chinese society, but also China’s backwardness and “humiliation,” against which they were convinced that they, as Chinese citizens, should fight. Specific Chinese socio-political context and the nationalist discourse contributed significantly to the divergence of views. The NCC, incorporating both sides, was obliged to make prompt response to the treaty issue and struggled to find common ground among the cooperating bodies.

The Rhetoric of “Unequal Treaties” in the Early Twentieth-Century Nationalist Discourse

As mentioned previously, the term “unequal treaties” has played a key role in the state narrative of the so-called “national humiliation,” a perception which was firstly constructed and introduced by the government in response to the Japanese Twenty-one Demands in 1915 and later inherited and reinforced by the ruling authorities throughout the twentieth century. Yet to the majority of the Chinese, as Wang Dong points out, the term “lacks a clear and unambiguous meaning” and there is “no agreement about the actual number of treaties signed between China and foreign countries that should be counted as ‘unequal.’”^[7] The invention of the term “unequal treaties” was closely related to the socio-political climate in the early Republican era.

According to Wang Dong, the term had not been used during the nineteenth century. To the Qing emperors and officials, criteria for judging what “equal” or “unequal” was may have differed from our present-day standards and understanding based on the development and wide acceptance of international law. Following the introduction of a number of modern concepts into China, such as state sovereignty, autonomy and inequality, sensibility to sovereignty, tariff autonomy and extraterritoriality was gradually manifested among high ranking officials since the late Qing period (the 1870s).^[8] Zhang Jianhua argues that it was in 1906 that for the first time Sun Yat-sen brought forward the term “unequal treaties (*bupingdeng zhi tiaoyue* 不平等之条约)” in his criticism on the

[7] Wang, *China's Unequal Treaties*, 2.

[8] Wang, “Discourse of Unequal Treaties,” 401-402.

Qing government that, "The Manchu government, with poor diplomacy, signed a series of unequal treaties with foreign countries."^[9] Nonetheless, it should be pointed out that, instead of opposing western powers, the ultimate target of Sun's adoption and propagation of the concept of "unequal treaties" prior to the 1911 Revolution was to portray the Qing government as a cause of China's backwardness in order to challenge its legitimacy and overthrow its rule.^[10]

It was not until the mid-1920s that Sun Yat-sen once again started to draw a connection between the nationalist revolution and the term "unequal treaties," with the aim of boosting the collective patriotism of the Chinese and legitimating his revolutionary activities. In January 1924, the phrase "the abrogation of the unequal treaties" appeared in the Manifesto of the First Guomindang (GMD) National Congress.^[11] Since then, the nationalist revolution and the appeal for the termination of the unequal treaties were officially bound together. It is noteworthy that the term "anti-imperialism" was also incorporated in the party's political agenda at the congress.

Yet a dominant narrative of China's "humiliating" past had not been established in the early twentieth century, or at least had not been generally acknowledged and accepted. Unlike the revolutionaries, the ruling Beiyang government (1912—1928) treated the treaty issue as a diplomatic matter. It tended to seek a solution through formal diplomatic channels for negotiation and treaty revision under the system of international law. Meanwhile, it protected Christian missions and complied with the treaties. In spite of being in a weak position and experiencing failure at the 1919 Paris Peace Conference when western powers denied China's quest for reclaiming the former German treaty territory of Shandong, diplomats, such as Gu Weijun (Wellington Koo 顾维钧), Wang Zhengting (C. T. Wang 王正廷) and Yan Huiqing (W. W. Yen 颜惠庆), were able to negotiate "considerable room" for bargaining with the powers. They become the first to challenge the legality of the treaties and the conventional interpretation of international law.^[12] Examples can be found in the signing of several equal treaties and agreements between China and western nations, such as the Agreement Regarding the Restoration of the State of Peace between Germany and China (1921), the Sino-Soviet Agreement of 1924 and the Treaty of Commerce between the Republic of China and the Republic of Austria (1925), as well as the cancellation of the Belgian Treaty of 1865 (1926).

Nonetheless, the rise of both the GMD and the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) and the first United Front formed between them in 1923 made the Beiyang government the main target of their political struggles and the nationalist revolution. Under the influence of the Soviet Russian Bolshevik theory of world revolution, nationalist movements and party ideology, both the GMD and the CCP based their revolutionary strategies on the discourse of anti-imperialism and anti-warlordism.^[13] The rhetoric of "unequal treaties" was adopted by both parties to oppose their common enemy the internationally recognised yet essentially powerless Beiyang government. By highlighting the

[9] Zhang Jianhua, "Sun Zhongshan yu bupingdeng tiaoyue gainian [Sun Yat-sen and the Concept of Unequal Treaties]," *Beijing daxue xuebao (zhexue shehui kexue ban)* [Journal of Peking University (Philosophy and Social Sciences)], no. 2, (2002), 119-120.

[10] Hou Zhongjun, "Jindai Zhongguo de minzuzhuyi yu bupingdeng tiaoyue: jiyu Sun Zhongshan geming lilun yu shijian de taolun [Modern Chinese Nationalism and Unequal Treaties: A Case Study of Sun Yat-sen's Revolutionary Theories and Practice]," *Renwen zazhi* [The Journal of Humanities], no. 3, (2013), 70-71.

[11] Fung, "Chinese Nationalists and Unequal Treaties," 799.

[12] Tang, *Beiyang xiuyue shi*, 49-173; Wang, "Discourse of Unequal Treaties," 404.

[13] Wang, *China's Unequal Treaties*, 72.

“unequal” nature of the treaties and China’s traumatic past of being bullied by western imperialists through the treaties, they successfully stirred up public opinion to portray the Beiyang government, who endeavoured to revise treaty relations with western countries through a peaceful negotiating approach, as the traitor of the nation. In the meantime, by calling for the “unconditional termination” of the unequal treaties, the GMD and the CCP intended to advertise themselves as the nation’s saviours.^[14] The discourse of “unequal treaties” was utilised to foster a political culture of mass mobilisation for their revolutionary motives and legitimate their political establishments.^[15]

Nationalist sentiments reached the peak after the May Thirtieth Incident (also known as the Nanking Road Incident) in 1925, when the British Shanghai Municipal Police in the international settlement of Shanghai shot thirteen Chinese students dead during a student protest. The treaty issue was once again caught in the eye of the storm and was brought up by Chinese nationalists in expounding China’s weakness and social illness. The abrogation of the treaties was therefore deemed “the only way to free China from semi-colonialism.”^[16] This general mindset was demonstrated in the Manifesto of the National Student Union:

Why do we have to be subject to the “law” of the concessions? We all know that this is because of the unequal treaties. Concessions and extraterritoriality are the products of the unequal treaties. Chinese people shall never enjoy freedom if the unequal treaties remain.^[17]

It should be noted that although the slogan of “the abrogation of the unequal treaties” quickly gained popularity after the May Thirtieth Incident and continued to be an effective means for political propaganda and mass mobilisation, it lacked feasibility in actual application. Just as jurist Zhou Gengsheng (S. R. Chow 周鯁生), one of the key figures in introducing the theory of international law to Republican China, pointed out that,

We [Chinese people] are launching campaigns to call for abolishing of the unequal treaties every day. However, the majority of us may not even know what treaties are unequal and how to abolish them.^[18]

Besides the nationalists’ advocacy of treaty abolition, a few voices stood by the Beiyang government’s diplomatic approach towards comprehensive treaty revision. For example, journalist Hu Lin 胡霖 once commented from a diplomatic point of view that,

[14] Ibid., 68.

[15] Wang, “Discourse of Unequal Treaties,” 423.

[16] Long Chi, “Feiyue yundong yu jiuqi jinian [The Treaty Cancellation Movement and the National Humiliation Day],” *Xiangdao* [The Guide], no. 170, (1926), 7.

[17] “Xuesheng zonghui dui hu cansha gongxue an xuanyan [Manifesto of the National Student Union on the Nanking Road Incident],” *Minguo ribao* [Republican Daily], 4 June 1925.

[18] Zhou Gengsheng, “Bupingdeng tiaoyue de feichu wenti [The Issue of the Abolition of the Unequal Treaties],” *Chen bao* [Morning Post], 29 September 1925.

There are a good number of fervent patriots who are advocating the abolition of the unequal treaties instead of treaty revision. They have no idea that a treaty cannot be removed unilaterally by one party, unless one has prepared to start a war. On the contrary, both parties need to fulfil their duties as the treaty was signed with a mutual agreement under international law. ^[19]

However, the above voices had been drowned in the vociferous cry for treaty abolition, which had gradually dominated the nationalist discourse owing to both the GMD and the CCP's vehement advocacy. As Wang Dong points out, whether to promote the unconditional termination of the unequal treaties had become "the dividing line between revolution and counter-revolution, and between good and bad." ^[20]

The discourse of "unequal treaties" reflected and further strengthened the nationalists' quest for "national salvation (*jiuguo* 救国)" through restoring China's sovereignty and autonomy from western imperialists internationally and ending warlords' warfare to regain unification internally. This dual claim became vocal at the climax of Chinese nationalism in 1925. The Treaty Cancellation Movement not only flourished nationwide, but also reinforced the ongoing Anti-Christian Movement (1922—1927) with a clearer and intensified revolutionary cause. Christianity, being closely associated with the unequal treaties, was the vanguard of western imperialism and cultural aggression.

The link between Christianity and imperialism served as an indispensable part of the twentieth-century nationalist discourse. It helped Chinese nationalists to visualise the abstract image and imagination of the concept of "imperialism." By singling out the "others," they defined who they were and what they belonged to. As Michael Murdock argues, the GMD found it an effective means of expanding "top-down influence" over other organisations and unifying revolutionary efforts through portraying Christian missions and churches as the "common enemy" of all anti-imperialist groups. ^[21] Additionally, in the eyes of the revolutionaries, Christianity was a "relatively safe target" for their anti-imperialist campaigns. Trying to avoid violent confrontations with the more formidable foreign political, military and economic components in China, the GMD chose the Christian enterprise as an alternative to maintaining its anti-imperialist platform. The Anti-Christian Movement was thus incorporated into the party's larger anti-imperialist agenda and gradually dominated revolutionary anti-imperialist activities. ^[22]

Responses from Mainline Protestantism the Case of the NCC

"There is no need of this further protection"

The day after the May Thirtieth Incident, the Chinese members of the NCC executive committee

[19] Zheng Zhi, "Hu'an jiaoshe yu zhongwai guanxi zhi genben de gaishan [Negotiation on the Nanking Road Incident and the Fundamental Improvement of the Sino-Foreign Relations]," *Guowen zhoubao* [China News Weekly], vol. 2, no. 27, (1925), 1-2.

[20] Wang, "Discourse of Unequal Treaties," 412.

[21] Michael Murdock, "Poor-man's Anti-imperialism? The Anti-Christian Movement and the Political Value of Cultural Target for Revolutionary Activity, August 1924-June 1925," *Jindai Zhongguo Jidujiao shi yanjiu jikan* [Journal of the History of Christianity in Modern China], no. 3, (2000), 70-76.

[22] *Ibid.*, 62-77.

based in Shanghai held a special meeting to discuss the appropriate reaction to the incident. Several actions were taken afterwards, including urging editors of foreign and Chinese newspapers “to be careful in presenting facts of the incident” and addressing an official letter to the Shanghai Municipal Council on 8 June 1925 to appeal for the appointment of a special commission of enquiry on the incident, in which Chinese members should be included. In the meantime, the executive committee began to draft the “Message of the National Christian Council to the Christians in China,” which was later published in *the Bulletin of the National Christian Council*. The “Message” regarded the unequal treaties as one of the “external causes” resulting in the current situation and called for removing those causes. Overall, the “Message” was composed in a rather strong political vein, bringing together the two identities, Chinese and Christian, by claiming that,

Christianity, patriotism, and good citizenship are not necessarily opposed to each other. ... We are not dealing with that kind of narrow and selfish patriotism and citizenship which is really un-Christian and of which we see so much around us. To us, a Christian should be the highest type of patriot and the noblest example of citizen. ...

What about the long accepted principle that the Church should not meddle with politics? We must agree that the Church should not meddle, if by that we mean for the Church to seek to control the government or actually to interfere with its function. ... On the other hand, if political powers violate any or all of the Christian principles of life, should the Church remain silent and passive? ...^[23]

Behind the “Message” lay the eagerness of the leading Chinese Protestants to clarify the church’s standpoint and deliver a Christian response to a national crisis. The “Message” perfectly reflected Chinese Christians’ struggle in the face of the tension between Christian religion and Chinese nationalism at that time.

Prior to the May Thirtieth Incident, a few NCC Chinese members had started to pay attention to the treaty issue and the dilemma of Christianity in the nationalist discourse, such as Luo Yunyan (R. Y. Lo 罗运炎), Liu Tingfang (Timothy Tingfang Lew 刘廷芳) and Wu Leichuan (Woo Lei-chuan 吴雷川).^[24] Luo Yunyan, in particular, conducted a comprehensive study on the extraterritoriality and pointed out that the extraterritoriality “found no basis in international law but was made between the more powerful nations and the weaker one.” Based on the legal concept of “*rebus sic stantibus*” (Latin; things standing thus), which stipulates that a treaty may be withdrawn where there has been a fundamental change of circumstances, he deemed that the extraterritoriality should be “revised or abolished.”^[25]

[23] School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS) Library, Special Collections, CBMS 350, “Message of the National Christian Council to the Christians in China,” *The Bulletin of the National Christian Council*, no. 15, (1925), 1-3.

[24] They delivered speeches or published articles on the treaty issue on many occasions. See Luo Yunyan, “Lieqiang zai Zhongguo de zhiwaifaquan wenti [The Extraterritoriality of Western Powers in China],” *Xinghua* [Chinese Christian Advocate], vol. 22, no. 1, (1924), 4-9; Liu Tingfang, “Zhongguo jidutu aiguo wenti de pingyi [Patriotism of Chinese Christians],” *Shengming* [Life Monthly], vol. 4, no. 8, (1924), 1-5; Wu Leichuan, “Duiyu zai zhishijie xuanchuan Jidujiao de wojian [Some Thoughts on Advocating Christianity among Chinese Intelligentsia],” *Shengming*, vol. 5, no. 1, (1924), 2-7.

[25] Luo, “Lieqiang,” 4, 7-8.

Although studies and discussions on the treaty issue in Christian circles had been made (mainly by Christian individuals) as early as in the 1910s, stimulated by the foundation of the Republic of China, it was not until 1925, when nationalism gradually reached its peak, that heated debates on and campaigns for the abrogation of the unequal treaties occupied the mainline Chinese Protestants' minds. Wang Zhixin 王治心, church historian associated with the Methodist Episcopal Church South and professor of philosophy at Nanking Theological Seminary, took the initiative to call for the launch of the campaigns for abrogating the unequal treaties among Chinese Christians in early 1925, suggesting that:

1. The NCC call a conference of delegates of Protestant churches in China to organise an association for abolishing the unequal treaties and extraterritoriality.
2. Christians in China take united action to issue a joint declaration to the world.
3. Chinese Christians make a plea to western churches for support. ^[26]

On the same day of the incident, Wang, together with other eighty-six Chinese Protestants in Nanjing, initiated an association for advocating the termination of the unequal treaties to make known to the public the attitudes of "real Christians" and the "spirits of pacifism and egalitarianism" based on Christian doctrines. The association aimed at 1) "promoting the abolition of the unequal treaties through verbal and literary propaganda;" 2) "calling for support and assistance from western Christian organisations;" and 3) "conducting comprehensive study on the unequal treaties and the cases of treaty cancellation in other nations." ^[27] Following their action, large numbers of Chinese Protestants in Nanjing, Nanchang, Guangzhou, Wuxing, Hengshan and Danyang issued manifestos to advocate treaty abolition. Their sympathies to the victims of the May Thirtieth Incident directly gave rise to their determination to terminate the unequal treaties. ^[28]

By that time, the executive committee of the NCC had come to realise the urgency and necessity of responding to the nationalist cry for solving the treaty issue and thus, taking advantage of being a national Protestant organisation, actively engaged in studying and discussing the treaty issue. Its standing committee on international relations, with Zhao Zichen (T. C. Chao 赵紫宸), renowned theologian, Christian writer and educator, serving as its chairman in 1925—1926, allocated its work into two sections: a Shanghai section to carry on the existing work of promoting the study of international affairs and a Beijing section to investigate the way how to gain better international understanding. The Shanghai committee, whose members included Gu Ziren (T. Z. Koo 顾子仁), associate general secretary and student executive secretary of the Chinese Young Men's Christian Association (YMCA) National Committee, conducted research and published books and pamphlets on the subjects of tariff autonomy and extraterritoriality, etc. Meanwhile, the Beijing committee,

[26] Wang Zhixin, "Jidutu ying shouxian faqi feichu guoji bupingdeng tiaoyue de yundong [Christians Should Initiate the Treaty Cancellation Movement]," *Xinghua*, vol. 22, no. 12, (1925), 20.

[27] "Zhonghua jidutu feichu bupingdeng tiaoyue cuchenghui yuanqi [The Origin of the Chinese Christian Association for Abrogating the Unequal Treaties]," *Xinghua*, vol. 22, no. 21, (1925), 16-18.

[28] "Hengshan Zhonghua Jidujiao hu'an houyuanhui chengli [The Formation of the Chinese Christian Association of Reinforcement to the Nanking Road Incident in Hengshan]," *Tongwen bao* [Chinese Intelligence], no. 1163, (1925), 4.

whose members included John Leighton Stuart, president of Yenching University, drafted resolutions with regard to the “toleration clauses” and extraterritoriality in November 1925 and urged the NCC executive committee to adopt “as its action and publish over its own name.”^[29] Although the executive committee declined such a proposal, for it was not supposed to make any official statements without consulting the desires of its constituency, some Chinese leaders of the NCC voiced their opinions on the subject on many occasions publicly.

In June 1925, Cheng Jingyi (C. Y. Cheng 诚静怡), secretary of the NCC (honorary secretary, 1922—1924; full-time secretary, 1924—1926; general secretary, 1926—1933), responded to the May Thirtieth Incident in his article “The Tragedy of May 30th.” The article is collected in the archives of the Conference of Missionary Societies in Great Britain and Ireland, which may imply its wide circulation in missionary circles at the time when it was drafted. Speaking of the question of how to maintain an international friendship, Cheng pointed out that a key factor was to “remove international barriers,” that is, foreigners’ special privileges granted by the unequal treaties:

The unequal treaties that hinder international friendship are strong, they are deeply rooted. If they are removed it will not only affect the sovereignty of China but will benefit the whole world. Since the church takes the attitude of not interfering with government or politics, naturally it is not in a position to take part in a discussion as to how the treaties should be amended or what the procedure should be. The point at which the church is directly concerned in the unequal treaties is the protection of preaching and believing the doctrine. Is not the principle of “freedom of faith” plainly stated in the constitution of the Republic of China? ... Since the rise of the anti-Christian movement all the young people of this country aim at this target, the duplicate protection given to Christianity by the unequal treaties. They call Christianity a foreign doctrine, and Christians, foreign followers. They even consider them to be slaves of imperialism and capitalism. ... Moreover, to whatever country Christianity goes, it has its own unimpeachable principles, which touch people’s hearts with power, and give them boundless blessing; naturally there is no need of this further protection.^[30]

Cheng’s above words indicated that the protection under the unequal treaties was a fundamental factor causing the unfavourable position of Christianity in China. Speaking with a determined tone on the issue of the unequal treaties, Cheng made his position clear to both western missions and Chinese Christians.

Not only Cheng Jingyi, Yu Rizhang (David Yui 余日章), chairman of the NCC and one of the two Chinese citizen representatives to the Washington Naval Conference of 1921—1922, also made an official statement on the subject in his chairman’s address at the fourth annual meeting of the NCC on 13-20 October 1926:

[29] SOAS, CBMS 348, The National Christian Council of China, Annual Report 1925-6, 121-123.

[30] SOAS, CBMS 396, C. Y. Cheng, “The Tragedy of May 30th,” 4.

The second question is: "Should we uphold the Toleration Clauses of the unequal treaties or be in favour of giving them up?" It is difficult for us to understand why this can ever become a serious question. In the face of the national movement to abrogate the unequal treaties, why are we perplexed, disturbed, and worried? Does Christianity have to depend upon such extraordinary and extraneous protection for its propagation and power? Even if we were to grant that such protection was necessary when Christianity was introduced into China over one hundred years ago, does Christianity need it now? Religious liberty was enjoyed by our people before and is now written into the Constitution of our Republic. ...

The Chinese people are divided by many things, but they are absolutely united in the national movement to abrogate the unequal treaties, including the Toleration Clauses. These treaties are doomed to go at an early hour, never to re-appear. Instead of giving way to doubt, worry and fear, the Christian Movement in China should in its own way support and hasten the fulfilment of the aspirations of the Chinese people in this regard. The Movement should rejoice over the fact that Christianity shall soon shake off the shackles which have heretofore been looked upon as special protection, and make its appeal freely on its own merit. Such an appeal will be irresistible. ^[31]

Considering the positions of the above two figures in the NCC and their fame in Christian circles, both nationwide and internationally, their attitudes, to a large extent, may have reflected a general stand of the NCC Chinese members and further guided the opinion of the church.

Besides the work of the committee on international relations, a number of the NCC Chinese members, such as Cheng Jingyi, Zhong Ketuo (K. T. Chung 鍾可托), secretary of the NCC, Luo Yunyan and Zhu Jingnong (King Chu 朱经农), Christian educator, etc., held two meetings in Shanghai on 3 and 10 December 1925 to discuss the issue of the "toleration clauses," with the purpose of forming some concrete views on the subject to be presented by Cheng and Zhong at the Conference on Extraterritoriality, which was scheduled to be held in Beijing on 18 December. ^[32] Discussions mainly focused on the following questions: 1) "Are the toleration clauses compatible with Christian doctrines?" 2) "What would happen if churches continue to enjoy the protection under the toleration clauses?" 3) "Is the existence of the toleration clauses necessary, since religious freedom has been guaranteed in the Constitution of the Republic of China?" 4) "If the existence of the toleration clauses is unnecessary, how to abolish them?" 5) "Are the special privileges granted by the treaties beneficial or harmful to Christian missions?" 6) "Should Christian missions in China rely on the treaties or the friendship with the Chinese?" 7) "Shall the toleration clauses be incorporated

[31] SOAS, CBMS 348, NCC Annual Report 1925-6, 7-8.

[32] "Jidujiao jiaoyujie xin yundong: quxiao tiaoyue zhi yundong [New Movement in Christian Educational Circles: The Treaty Cancellation Movement]," *Zhonghua jidujiao jiaoyu jikan* [Chinese Christian Education Quarterly], vol. 1, no. 4, (1925), 92-93; "Jiao xun; qiyi, Zhongguo zhibu; chuanjiao tiaoyue taolunhui jilu [Church News; 1. China; Minutes of the Meeting for Discussing the Toleration Clauses]," *Xinghua*, vol. 22, no. 49, (1925), 29-31; "Jiao xun; qiyi, Zhongguo zhibu; chuanjiao tiaoyue taolunhui di'erci huiyi jilu [Church News; 1. China; Minutes of the Second Meeting for Discussing the Toleration Clauses]," *Xinghua*, vol. 22, no. 50, (1925), 31-33.

again in the new treaties?” and 8) “What would happen to Christianity in China if the toleration clauses are to be incorporated again?”^[33]

Based on the above discussions, the NCC sent out a questionnaire of fourteen questions regarding the “toleration clauses” to Chinese Christian leaders in each province in February and March 1926.^[34] By October 1926, 275 replies to the questionnaire were received. Based on the replies, the NCC summed up that oppositions to the cancellation of the “toleration clauses” were chiefly on the ground of two aspects; firstly, churches should not interfere with politics; and secondly, churches were still in need of the protection under the “toleration clauses,” especially during a time when the socio-political situation in China was unstable.^[35] Nonetheless, the above oppositions weighted a minority of mainline Chinese Protestants. According to the 275 replies, 60%—75% of Chinese Protestants’ attitudes towards the abrogation of the “toleration clauses” were determined:

That the “toleration clauses” are incompatible with the teachings of Christianity, and further that even if they were not, they are no longer needed and by implication, not desirable; and that in order to do away with them a formal declaration, voluntarily made, by missionaries and (or) Chinese Christians, signifying their willingness to see them abolished, would be of value.^[36]

Additionally, according to the report of the standing committee on international relations (1925—1926), a number of Chinese churches, for example, the North China Congregational Union and the Guangdong Divisional Council of the Church of Christ in China, even went further and stated their positions that: “All Christians should stand for the abolition of unequal treaties.”^[37]

It is important to note that many articles and manifestos published in the Chinese language did not generally distinguish between “toleration clauses” and that of “unequal treaties,” and often used the latter to refer to both. Opinions among mainline Chinese Protestants concentrated, to a large extent, on the abrogation of the unequal treaties. This may have been largely owing to the awkward

[33] “Jidujiao jiaoyujie xin yundong,” 92-93.

[34] The fourteen questions included: 1) “Shall the Church express its opinion in regard to politics”? 2) “Are the Toleration Clauses compatible with the teachings of Christianity”? 3) “Is there any necessity for the existence of the Toleration Clauses, since religious freedom has been provided in the Constitution of the Republic of China”? 4) “How to help abolish the Toleration Clauses”? 5) “Shall the Toleration Clauses be incorporated again in the new treaties between China and the foreign nations”? 6) “If re-incorporated, shall it be done on a reciprocal basis”? 7) “After the Toleration Clauses have been cancelled, how are we to meet the difficulties”? 8) “Shall Church properly be exempted taxation”? 9) “Regarding the custodianship of Church properties”? 10) “Shall the Christian bodies be registered by the Chinese government”? 11) “Are the six articles of the regulations (promulgated by the Ministry of Education, Peking) regarding the registration of foreign-financed schools objectionable”? 12) “Do the private schools have freedom of teaching religion”? 13) “Shall non-Christians serve on the directing boards of various Christian bodies”? and 14) “Shall the Church cooperate with bodies of other religions with a view to asking the Chinese government to provide for just and equal treatment toward all religions”? See SOAS, CBMS 350, “Christianity and the Treaties: Summary of the Chinese Replies to a Questionnaire Regarding Toleration Clauses, etc.,” *The Bulletin of the National Christian Council*, no. 20, (1926), 11-14.

[35] “Zhongguo jiaohui duiyu chuanjiao tiaoyue wenti zhi yijian [Opinions of the Chinese Church on Toleration Clauses],” *Zhonghua gui zhu* [China for Christ], vol. 63, no. 4, (1926), 2.

[36] SOAS, CBMS 348, NCC Annual Report 1925—1926, 124-5; “Jidujiao jiaoyujie xin yundong,” 90-94.

[37] SOAS, CBMS 348, NCC Annual Report 1925—1926, 124.

situation in the nationalist discourse brought to the church by the equal treaties.

Notably, some Chinese Protestants' appeal for abolishing the equal treaties reflected how widely and deeply the discourse of "unequal treaties" and the socio-political atmosphere penetrated and affected all corners of society. One prominent example can be found in the Manifesto of the Baptist Convention in Guangdong and Guangxi provinces. The Manifesto adopted Sun Yat-sen's anti-imperialist claims and nationalist revolutionary theories. It condemned the unequal treaties to be a violation of both humanism and the "Christian spirit of equality, liberty and fraternity (*pingdeng* 平等, *ziyou* 自由, *bo'ai* 博爱)." [38] It is worth noting that Guangdong province and its capital city Guangzhou (Canton) had served as a base for both Sun's revolutionary campaigns since 1895 and the newly launched nationalist revolution (1924—1928). In addition, the Republic of China Military Academy (Whampoa, 1924) and the national government of the Republic of China (Sun's rival government, which was founded in 1925) originated in Guangzhou. Moreover, even the "Christian spirit of equality, liberty and fraternity," which the Manifesto claimed, resembled Sun Yat-sen's interpretation of the idea of "nationalist revolution (*guomin geming* 国民革命)" and his political doctrine of the "Three Principles of the People (*sanmin zhuyi* 三民主义)." Sun referred to one of the slogans—*Liberté, Égalité, Fraternité*—of the French Revolution of 1789—1799 in his writings and brought forward the vocabularies of "*ziyou, pingdeng, bo'ai*" correspondingly. [39] Though attempted to condemn the unequal treaties from Christian perspectives, the Manifesto of the Baptist Convention demonstrated a strong influence of Sun's nationalist revolutionary propaganda in the Guangdong region.

In the face of a series of national crises and attacks against Christian churches in China, it was almost impossible for the Chinese members of the NCC not to be affected by the political atmosphere. As a national Protestant institution, the NCC and its member churches and societies maintained the link with the West. This led to severe criticism from Chinese nationalists. Mainline Chinese Protestants thus endeavoured to demonstrate their Chinese identity by taking a stand on social and political events.

"It was fatal not to act."

Meanwhile, missionary societies, including those associated with the NCC, were obliged to take action to state clearly their positions. By late 1925, all the mainline Protestant mission boards in Great Britain and North America had adopted resolutions individually and through the Missionary Conference of North America and the Conference of Missionary Societies in Great Britain and Ireland in October and December 1925 respectively. Take the Conference of Missionary Societies in Great

[38] "Jidujiao liang guang Jinxinhui daibiao dahui dui bupingdeng tiaoyue xuanyan [Manifesto of the Baptist Convention in Guangdong and Guangxi Provinces on Unequal Treaties]," *Zhen guang* [True Light], vol. 25, no. 12, (1926), 73.

[39] Qin Xiaoyi, *Guofu quanji*, vol. 1, 67, 223.

Britain and Ireland, which represented twenty-two British Protestant missions in China,^[40] as an example, its standing committee urged all its members to take “common action” to evince their standpoints concerning the treaty issue. The memorial of the standing committee to the British government dated 7 December 1925 showed that all the twenty-two missions were in general agreement in “welcoming the action taken by the [British] Government in carrying out the Washington [Naval Conference of 1921—1922] engagements, and entering upon a comprehensive revision of the Treaties which at present regulate the position of foreigners in China.” In addition, they bespoke their readiness in accepting the “modification of extra-territorial rights as shall open the way to their eventual abolition.” This was along the same line with the view of the majority of Chinese Protestants of the NCC. Having said that, the missions also expressed their hope that the Chinese government would not “curtail those rights now enjoyed by missions and missionaries.”^[41]

In order to reach a “general agreement” and to pass the above resolutions as their “common action,” missionary societies had to take into account a number of factors. As revealed in the correspondence, the British missions faced a series of pressure and challenges, not only from Chinese society and Chinese Christians, but also from their American fellow workers and their own compatriots. For instance, after the Missionary Conference of North America made public their stand on the treaty issue on 2-3 October 1925, Kenneth Macleannan, secretary of the Conference of Missionary Societies in Great Britain and Ireland, wrote to Harold B. Rattenbury of Wesleyan Methodist Missionary Society, member of the NCC business committee of 1925—1926, indicating the urgency of making know the British missions’ position.

I have been struck with the unanimous mind that it is not right to throw the responsibility for a decision of this kind on the missionaries in the field, as any division of opinion on the matter there would be immediately known to the Chinese and would react unfavourably on the missions. ...

The difficulty is that unless societies give expression to their views before the Conference [Conference on Extraterritoriality on 18 December 1925] meets, they will be misunderstood and misrepresented in China. As you know the American societies have passed very explicit resolutions on the subject and it will be represented in China that the British societies are not in sympathy with the American view and accordingly are opposed to any revision of the treaties. The situation is full of difficulty.^[42]

[40] The twenty-two British Protestant missions included: Baptist Missionary Society, British and Foreign Bible Society, China Inland Mission, Church Missionary Society, Church of England Zenana Missionary Society, Church of Scotland Foreign Mission Committee, Church of Scotland Women’s Association for Foreign Missions, Friends’ Foreign Mission Association, London Missionary Society, Mission to Lepers, National Bible Society of Scotland, Presbyterian Church of England Foreign Mission Committee, Presbyterian Church of England Women’s Missionary Association, Presbyterian Church in Ireland Foreign Missions, Religious Tract Society, Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, United Free Church of Scotland Foreign Mission Committee, United Methodist Church Missionary Society, Wesleyan Methodist Missionary Society, Wesleyan Methodist Missionary Society Women’s Auxiliary, YMCA and YWCA.

[41] SOAS, CBMS 396, Memorial by the Standing Committee of the Conference of Missionary Societies in Great Britain and Ireland on the Proposed Revision of the Existing Treaties between Great Britain and China, 5-6; Qing Feng, “Guanyu chuanjiao tiaoyue wenti zhi zhongxi yijian [Opinions of Chinese Churches and Western Missions on Toleration Clauses],” *Zhen guang*, vol. 25, no. 9-10, (1926), 19-25.

[42] SOAS, CBMS 396, K. Macleannan to H. B. Rattenbury, 22 October 1925.

The British missions took cautious steps on the treaty issue as if treading on thin ice. They felt the pressure and necessity of taking the “right” side in the heat of the nationalist campaigns. Moreover, the American missions’ prompt and definite response in urging “the early revision of the treaties with China” and “the abolition of extraterritoriality in China at an early date,” as well as their claim for no more “distinctive privileges for missions and missionaries” granted by the “toleration clauses,” had put British missions in an unfavourable position.^[43] Rattenbury’s reply also expressed the discontent with their American fellow workers:

Apparently America has as usual acted on her own and that puts us in an awkward predicament. Well; she is always doing that and we probably shall be reduced ultimately to acting on our own or we shall suffer for it. American psychology and British differ in a good many ways. Personally I believe that China is suffering now a good deal for her Americanisation.^[44]

Based on his experience and observation in the actual mission field in China, Rattenbury then expressed his perception of the circumstances that missions and churches faced in his letter that,

No one of us living out there was unaware that ... the real thing wasn’t anti-foreignism at all but a political re-shuffle. ... I personally am much more concerned that what action is taken should be right than that we should be rushed into action at the tail of America just because it was fatal not to act.^[45]

The concern of “what action is taken should be right” may have implied the British missions’ consideration of the interests of their government and other stakeholders while declaring their own views. As indicated in Maclennan’s memorandum, the British missions got “considerable misunderstanding and mis-conception” from their own compatriots with regard to their resolutions concerning extraterritoriality and missionary privileges under the treaties:

There has been an assumption amongst some missionaries in China, and almost entirely on the part of the foreign community, that the Missionary Societies have urged the simpliciter abolition of extra-territoriality.^[46]

Maclennan tried to clarify the resolutions by stressing that missionary societies “would welcome the abolition of the present articles relating to extra-territoriality and the substitution for them of

[43] SOAS, CBMS 350, “Extraterritorial Jurisdiction Discussed by Representatives of Mission Boards in America,” *The Bulletin of the National Christian Council*, no. 16, (1925), 15; Qing Feng, “Guanyu chuanjiao tiaoyue wenti,” 13-19.

[44] SOAS, CBMS 396, H. B. Rattenbury to K. Maclennan, 23 October 1925.

[45] *Ibid.*

[46] SOAS, CBMS 396, Memorandum by Mr. Maclennan with reference to the Resolutions passed by various British Missionary Societies on the present situation in China, March 1926.

such provisions for the administration of justice and the protection of life and property of British nationals as may be similarly mutually agreed upon in equal conference between China and Great Britain” on condition that “the interests of missions and missionaries are concerned.” He affirmed that the mission boards only expressed their views on their behalf, and nothing in the resolutions went beyond the British government’s stance:

I have pointed out how careful the Societies have been to make explicit that they are acting on behalf of the Missions only. They are quite aware of other interests involved, but they have not presumed to offer any suggestion with regard to extra-territoriality as it may affect others than missionaries. That is entirely a matter for the British Government and those concerned.

I have further pointed out that the resentment among our own compatriots in China with reference to the action taken by the British Missionary Societies appears to be based partly on the ground that the Missions may embarrass our Government by venturing to express opinions concerning matters that have already been entrusted to accredited representatives of the Government for discussion with the Chinese Government. We are able, however, to say that the British Government have cordially welcomed the expression of opinion given by the Missionary bodies.^[47]

Overall, the respective resolutions of the twenty-two British missions showed that, although they were willing to give up the legal rights which rested upon “existing treaties, and in particular upon the so-called toleration clauses,” and welcomed “the abolition of the present articles relating to extra-territoriality” so far as the missions’ interests would be taken into account, considering the unequal treaties as a whole, they tended to favour “a comprehensive revision of existing treaties.”^[48] This reveals a divergence in attitudes between missions and Chinese Protestants. Even though missionary individuals may have had different opinions, the British missions as a whole acted publicly in accordance with their government’s position.^[49]

Moreover, in respect of the attitudes of missionary agencies (societies) in China, the NCC standing committee on international relations reported that there were “some few” regarding the

[47] Ibid.

[48] SOAS, CBMS 348, NCC Annual Report 1925—1926, 126-7; CBMS 396, Memorial by the Standing Committee of the Conference of Missionary Societies in Great Britain and Ireland on the Proposed Revision of the Existing Treaties between Great Britain and China, 5-6, 11-16.

[49] For example, Newton W. Rowell, Canadian politician, Methodist missionary leader and a member of the Versailles Treaty Conference of 1919, expressed his personal view to Maclennan that, “Foreign Traders may justify their position in reference to the Treaties on grounds of national or commercial expediency, and may ask the protection of the powers in carrying on their trade. We may not sympathize with them in their attitude. It appears to me that the Missionary Societies stand on an entirely different basis and if they cannot carry on the work without the protection of the foreign powers, one must question then whether the work should be carried on.” See SOAS, CBMS 396, Memorandum by Mr. Maclennan with reference to the Resolutions passed by various British Missionary Societies on the present situation in China, March 1926. It should be pointed out that, as revealed in missionary correspondence and reports, attitudes of individual missionary societies and the general positions of the Conference of Missionary Societies in Great Britain and Ireland and the Missionary Conference of North America varied, not to mention those of missionary individuals. This requires further detailed and nuanced study.

issue of the unequal treaties not to be “the concern of the church or missions and can be safely left in the hands” of their governments.^[50] Though the committee claimed that the number of the missionary agencies who were in full sympathy with the action of their mission boards was “greater” than that of those who adopted a different position, this implied the fact that not all the missionary agencies were on the same page with their home boards.^[51]

Given the various opinions between mission boards, missionary agencies in China and native Christians, the NCC needed to balance the diverse views and find common ground among its cooperating members. During the year 1925—1926, it was reported that the NCC office was “flooded” with “letters reporting meetings held and actions taken by missionary organizations in Great Britain, America and China” and statements from various Protestant communities all over China. A good number of missions and Chinese Christian groups “repeatedly urged” the NCC itself to take a “definite” stand on the subject and to issue a statement on behalf of its constituency. Meanwhile there were those who were against the idea of making an official pronouncement and those who disapproved of abandoning the special privileges.^[52] At first, the council was hesitant to issue a statement given the lack of adequate information about the general opinion of Chinese Protestants and a consensus among missionary societies. Nonetheless, as Gu Ziren and the committee of international relations pointed out at the annual conference of 1925—1926,

People all over the world were waiting to know what the NCC would say. Christians ought to express themselves on such a question of right or wrong. Neutrality is impossible.^[53]

The NCC eventually adopted the resolutions proposed by the business committee as its formal statement:

1. That the Christian Church and Christian Missions should preach the Gospel and perform Christian service in China upon the basis of religious liberty freely accorded by the Republic of China, and that all provisions in the treaties with foreign countries for special privileges for the churches or missions should be removed.
2. That the present treaties between China and foreign Powers should be revised on a basis of freedom and equality.
3. That we are glad of the steps already taken towards this end by the Governments concerned and trust that they may persist in their efforts till satisfactory results have been achieved.
4. That whatever were the historical circumstances which led to the present state of

[50] SOAS, CBMS 348, NCC Annual Report 1925—1926, 128.

[51] *Ibid.*, 128.

[52] *Ibid.*, 68-70, 123; CBMS 350, “Christianity and the Treaties,” *The Bulletin of the National Christian Council*, no. 17, (1925), 4.

[53] SOAS, CBMS 348, NCC Annual Report 1925—1926, 70.

affairs, its speedy remedy is now the joint responsibility of Chinese and foreigners and that in this task we need the spirit of persistent forbearance, understanding, and love on both sides. ^[54]

The statement indicated that certain progress had been made concerning the issue of the unequal treaties since May 1925; both the Chinese and foreign members of the NCC had reached an agreement on the removal of the special privileges for Christianity in China. Nevertheless, it was rather a compromise between Chinese Christians and western missions, for the desire of large numbers of mainline Chinese Protestants for treaty abolition had not yet been achieved.

Even so, the active engagement of the NCC Chinese members in the campaigns for abrogating the unequal treaties evoked criticisms from some missions, one of which was the Lutheran Church of China (Chung Hua Hsin I Hui):

It is rather to our regret to point out that plans and activities of the Council for the service of the Church herself have been far too scanty in comparison with the vigorous push of such movements, as the Anti-Narcotic, the Betterment of Labor, and the Crusade against Gambling, Prostitution, and Polygamy. Furthermore, the Council is now planning to engage itself in the campaign of the abolition of Toleration Clauses and the "Unequal" Treaties. This is to expose itself to the suspicion that it is meddling in political matters, and consequently it would seem that the Council has already gone beyond its limit. ^[55]

Moreover, on 7 April 1927, a critical letter from thirty-two missionaries accused the NCC of causing division by its political actions:

It [the NCC] has endeavoured to determine the policy of the Missions and Churches in China; and has repeatedly put forth pronouncements in regard to political matters on its own authority without ascertaining the wishes of the co-operating bodies. ... For these reasons it has lost the confidence of a large part of the Missionary Body and we are making this protest against its being considered as representing our views and opinions. We regard its recent policy and methods as dangerous to and subversive of the best interests of the Churches in China. ^[56]

This further indicates the divergent standpoints and perspectives between some missions and Chinese Protestants.

[54] Ibid, 40-41 (my emphasis); "Jidujiao xiejinhui dui bupingdeng tiaoyue zhi xuanyan [Manifesto of the National Christian Council of China on Unequal Treaties]," *Qingxin zhong* [Pure Heart Bell], no. 2, (1926), 85-86. The business committee of the NCC in 1925-1926 consisted of Zhao Zichen (chairman), Liu Tingfang, H. B. Rattenbury, John Leighton Stuart, Jia Yuming (Chia Yu-ming 贾玉铭) of Presbyterian church, Logan H. Roots (Protestant Episcopal Church Mission) and C. G. Sparham (London Missionary Society), etc.

[55] SOAS, CBMS 348, NCC Annual Report 1925-1926, 53.

[56] SOAS, CBMS 348, The National Christian Council, A Five Years' Review 1922-1927, 31-32.

Conclusion

By reviewing the forge of the discourse of "unequal treaties" in early twentieth-century Chinese society and examining the diverse responses to treaty cancellation from mainline Protestantism, this article demonstrates that abolishing the unequal treaties had never been simply a legal matter in modern Chinese history. It served as an effective means for various parties to oppose their political rivals, legitimate their authority and government over the nation, unify national identity and foster patriotic loyalty. It helped the nationalists gain victory in China's political landscape and became a dividing line between patriots and traitors and between the nation's saviour and imperialist invader. This discourse had also considerably influenced Christian communities in China. As revealed by the case of the NCC, both western missions and Chinese churches, in a way, were obliged to take action under political and nationalist pressure. Although no consensus had ever been reached either among mainline Chinese Protestant communities or in missionary circles, on the whole, missions' sympathies were with their governments, and their actions could hardly go beyond their governments' positions, which inclined to solve the problem through diplomatic negotiation on comprehensive treaty revision. Whereas mainline Chinese Protestants, in general, ardently engaged themselves in the campaigns for the abrogation of the unequal treaties, individually or as a group. The rising tide of Chinese nationalism and the intensified socio-political circumstances compelled them to take sides and attest their support for their compatriots. Though being hastened to make an official declaration. The NCC attempted to find balance among various interests and desires of its constituency. Yet it neither met the expectation of a good number of Chinese Christians for manifesting their determination to abolish the unequal treaties, nor did it please certain missions given the high degree of its social (or even political) involvement.

In addition, this article exhibits that although Christians' interests in the subject had emerged at the beginning of the Republic, they concentrated during the period of 1925—1926. Prior to the Anti-Christian Movement, much attention was paid to church growth and evangelism. It was not until the mid-1920s, particularly after the May Thirtieth Incident in 1925, when the nationalist cry for treaty abrogation was made vociferous, that mainline Protestants found themselves at the centre of the storm and began to respond to the treaty issue on a large scale. Discussions then gradually lost steam in 1927—1928, when the national government of the Republic of China made Nanjing the capital and reunified China. Once it became the ruling party, the GMD's attitude to the treaty issue and international relations began to thaw.^[57] Meanwhile, the Northern Expedition of 1926—1928 and the resultant damages it brought to the missions and churches along the routes made both missionaries and Chinese Christians once again concern about their safety without treaty protection. The dynamic shift in focuses revealed a close interaction between mainline Protestantism and the changing Chinese political climate.

On the other hand, this article attempts to point out that mainline Chinese Protestants were not entirely passive in the face of socio-political pressure. There were those who took the initiative in

[57] Wang Zhenfu, "Neiwei maodun: Wusa hou Guomindang de feiyue yandong yu celüe [The Guomindang's Public Speeches and Strategy on the Abrogation of the Unequal Treaties]," *Shehui kexuejia* [Social Scientist], no. 12, (2010), 149.

responding to and participating in the Treaty Cancellation Movement. Others, from the NCC Chinese leadership to its member churches, openly expressed their determination to reject any further protection under the “toleration clauses.” Instead, they endeavoured to gain legal status under the Constitution of the Republic of China. Those mainline Chinese Protestants earnestly expressed their “Christian patriotism” and demonstrated the Chinese identity of the church. It is interesting to note that some of them tended to adopt a nationalist narrative, consciously or unconsciously. Further, discussions from the perspectives of Christian doctrines and ethics added a new dimension and volume to public discussion and engagement in resolving the treaty issue in terms of the understanding of the concept of religious freedom and the principles on international relations.^[58] The mainline Chinese Protestants’ concerns on the subject were not solely political, just as Christian social activist Zhang Xueyan 张雪岩 stated in 1943:

The recent abrogation of the unequal treaties and the signing of the new ones owed to China’s political and military efforts rather than the truth and justice advocated by Christian faith. We Christians, no matter in the West or in China, should feel ashamed.^[59]

[58] For instance, following as the Manifesto of the Chinese Christian Treaty Cancellation Movement in Guangzhou declared, the movement was launched out of the convictions that: 1) The abrogation of the unequal treaties was part of the national liberation movement and was supported by humanists all over the world. It was compatible with the Christian spirit of equality among all countries, races and nations; 2) The unequal treaties violated Christian doctrines and international law and made Christian missions and churches above the China law; and 3) The church should be grounded in the Christian faith and truth but not in the treaty protection. See “Guangzhou Zhonghua jidutu feichu bupingdeng tiaoyue da yundong xuanyan [Manifesto of the Chinese Christian Treaty Cancellation Movement in Guangzhou],” *Xinghua*, vol. 23, no. 27, (1926), 9-11. Similar expression can also be found in the declaration of the Chinese Christian Association for Abrogating the Unequal Treaties. See “Cuchenghui yuanqi,” 16-18.

[59] Zhang Xueyan, “Bupingdeng tiaoyue zhi feichu yu Jidujiao zai hua zhi qiantu [The Abrogation of the Unequal Treaties and the Future of Christianity in China],” *Xiejing yuekan* [The National Christian Council Monthly], new series, no. 1, (1943), 14.

中文题目：

中华全国基督教协进会与废除不平等条约运动(1925—1926)

王晓静,挪威 VID Specialized University 博士后研究会。Email:marina_xj.wang@gmail.com.

提 要:本文以中华全国基督教协进会为研究个案,通过考察协进会之成员教会与传教差会在 1925—1926 年间对于废除不平等条约运动的态度与回应,展现二十世纪上半期民族主义话语下,教会、差会与中国社会之间的互动与张力。本文认为,尽管作为传教条款受益者的西方差会与中国教会已然认识到与“不平等条约”划清界线的迫切性与必要性,双方看待条约问题的态度与观点却不尽相同。于差会而言,条约问题实属外交范畴,且涉及西方其他在华团体的利益,差会的公开表态始终规范于母国政府的外交决策框架之下。然而,对于大多数华人信徒来说,不平等条约的签订,不单是导致基督教在华被视为西方帝国主义侵略先锋之尴尬处境的根本原因之一,更是近代中国“屈辱”、“落后”的症结所在。虽遭民族主义话语排斥,却亦深受其影响:不少信徒主动发起或参与到废约运动中,力求表明自己的国民身分认同与“基督教爱国主义”精神。中西新教团体不同取态的背后,反映出双方处境、立场的差异。二十世纪二十年代中国社会政治气候及民族主义话语在其中发挥重要作用。

关键词:不平等条约;民族主义;中华全国基督教协进会;中国教会;传教差会

Study on the Interaction of the Sinicization of Christianity and the Reconstruction of Cross-border Ethnic Minorities' Cultures in Yunnan^[1]

Zhiying GAO and Donglei WANG

(Yunnan University and Yunnan University of Finance and Economics, Kunming, Yunnan Province, P. R. China)

Abstract: The Sinicization of Christianity, which is the developing strategy and practice to make Christianity adapt to Chinese culture. It corresponds to the Christianization of Chinese ethnic minority people who believed in Christianity. From the perspective of cultural interaction, borrowing and blending, the study explores the motivation, process and characteristics of the interactive development between the localization and contextualization of Christianity in Yunnan ethnic minorities' areas and the Christianization of ethnic minorities' cultures by historical combing and synchronic comparison. Mostly between Christianity and ethnic minorities' traditional cultures had experienced from the estrangement, and coexisted with each other and blending process, and finished the Christian from "in" to the transition of "again", so as to realize the Sinicizational characteristics of the regional, national, but also make the border ethnic cultural reconstruct.

Key Words: Yunnan ethnic minorities; Sinicization; Christianization; Interactive development

Author: Gao Zhiying, Professor, PhD, Center for Studies of Chinese Southwest's Borderland Ethnic Minorities of Yunnan University. Tel: 13888072229 Email: 2296054891@qq.com Wang Donglei, Vice Professor, PhD, School of International Languages and Cultures of Yunnan University of Finance and Economics. Tel: 15887015580 Email: 1609766878@qq.com

I. The Origin of the Topic

Just as Zhuo Xinping said, It is necessary for foreign religions such as Buddhism, Christianity and Islam to be Sinicized in China. Only through this process can they develop in China and become local, subdue, socialized, acculturated and understood culturally by people.^[2] Therefore, President Xi Jinping pointed out: "we must adhere to the orientation of Chinese religion." Christianity in the border ethnic areas of Yunnan has spread out by the end of the 19th century till now. It has been a

[1] Project Fund; National Social Science Major Bidding Project in 2017; Research on Rural Christianity under the Background of Christianity Sinicization in China (Project No. :17ZDA231); The Research Project of National Religious Affairs Administration in 2020: Research on the Christianity Sinicization Practice and Existing Problems of Cross-border Ethnic Minorities in Yunnan. (Project No. : FX2004D); The Top-ranking Ethnological Disciplinary Construction Project of Yunnan University.

[2] Zhuo Xinping, Sinicization: The Only Way to Renew Christianity in China, China Ethnic News, August 6, 2014. 2018 National Social Science Fund Project, Research on the Multi-religion Interaction in Regions between Southwest China and the Neighboring Countries and its Influence on the Construction of the "Belt and Road" (No. 18CZJ027)

long period for four to five generations of missionaries who came from foreign countries at the beginning and to the local missionaries latter, they all have advanced in the exploration of the Sinicization of Christianity. From regional, national localization to the local (re-local) practice of Christianity in Yunnan border ethnic minority areas of China. Because of there are many ethnic minorities who believed in Christianity and they do have the relatively high proportion of believers, combined with the issues of the prominent diverse traditional ethnic minorities' cultures and the large number of cross-border ethnic minorities, the study on the Sinicization of Christianity of ethnic minorities in Yunnan can provide empirical cases for the study on the Sinicization of Christianity in China as well.

Although several scholars have noticed the parallel between The Sinicization of Christianity and the Christianization of minority cultures for a long time,^[3] but after a period of study, they tended to the study on the cultures of ethnic minorities and unidirectional influence of Christianity.^[4] There are a few scholars begin to pay close attention to he interaction between Christianity and Social development in Yunnan in recent years.^[5] In general, Christian Sinicization is realized by three ways of integration which integrated into Chinese culture, the Chinese Nation and China's society and three modes of Identification which identified the Chinese culture, Chinese nation and China's society.^[6] The integration and identification of Chinese culture are the most important issues. Ethnic Minorities' cultures are indispensable to Chinese culture; The ethnic minorities are also important parts of the Chinese nation and Chinese society, The relationship between Christianity and Yunnan ethnic minorities' cultures is an inevitable and important issue on the study of Christianity Sinicization in China. We need to Integrate the previous research and the author's follow-up fieldwork investigation, take the border ethnic minorities which have the largest population and the widest distribution in Yunnan as the research respondents, Through the dual-perspectives of adaptation, developing history and cultural changes of Christian cultures of ethnic minorities in Yunnan, it will be helpful to construct a theoretical system of the interactive relationship between Christianity and border ethnic minorities, especially for cross-border ethnic minorities.

II . An Overview of the Interactive Development between The Sinicization of Christianity and the Cultures of Yunnan Border Areas Ethnic Minorities

According to the fieldwork investigation, when the foreign missionaries who came from

[3] Qian Ning, The Spread and Influence of Christianity in Yunnan Minority Society, Studies of World Religions, Vol. 3, 2000.

[4] Han Junxue, the Christian and the ethnic minorities in Yunnan, Yunnan People's Publishing house, 2000; Zhang Xiaoqiong: The Influence of Modern Christianity in Some of Ethnic Minorities' Cultures in Yunnan, Journal of Southwest University for Nationalities, 2001; Gao Zhiying: The Development of Sino-burmese Christianity during the First Half of the 20th Century, The World Religious Cultures, Vol. 4, 2010.

[5] Zhang Jiancheng: Research on the Sinicization of Ethnic Minorities' Christian Cultures Acculturation in Yunnan, Guizhou Ethnic Studies, Vol. 7, 2006; Gao Zhiying, Study on Christianization and Localization of Christianity of Lisu and Nu Ethnic Minority in the Northern Boundary of China and Myanmar, International Journal of Sino-Western Studies, Vellikellontie 3 A 4, 00410 Helsinki, Finland, 2017.

[6] Gao Zhiying, Study on Christianization and Localization of Christianity of Lisu and Nu Ethnic Minority in the Northern Boundary of China and Myanmar, International Journal of Sino-Western Studies, Vellikellontie 3 A 4, 00410 Helsinki, Finland, 2017.

European and American Protestant denominations set foot on Yunnan firstly, which is a land with obvious cultural diversities.^[7] At the very beginning of spreading the Gospel to all the ethnic minorities in Yunnan, it also began the contact with various paganism and different cultures in Yunnan, and tried to gain a foothold and development through localization and indigenization. Since then, the traditional culture of Christianity and ethnic minorities has been in both mutual exclusion and mutual absorption, and each has been constantly absorbing the cultural elements from the other for mutual development.

1. The Beginning of Christian Localization and Christianization of Yunnan Ethnic Minorities before 1950s

The spread of ethnic Christianity in Yunnan before 1950s can be come down to two modes. Firstly, foreign missionaries took the initiative to preach in ethnic minority villages. This is more common in Lahu, Hani, Dulong, Wa, Yi and other ethnic minorities; secondly, it is the initiative acceptance of foreign missionaries and Christianity by ethnic minority people. This is more prominent in some Jingpo and Lisu areas, such as Guangshan jingpo people take the initiative to accept Christianity as their religion in Longchuan, Dehong.^[8] For example, the Lisu and Nu ethnic minorities in Fugong (formerly called Bijiang County) invited the first generation of native Lisu missionaries who were sent by foreign missionaries from The Gospel hill (Gengma) to Lushui to their villages.^[9] However, there are different forms of acceptions of Christianity in different border areas of the same ethnic minority. For example, the Christianity of Lushui and Fugong Lisu people, they accepted Christianity passively, while the Christianity of Gongshan and Original Bijiang Lisu people was accepted actively.^[10] However, whether it is active introduction or passive acceptance, ultimately, all roads lead to Rome and basically through the following ways of (means, strategies) to achieve the purpose of preaching: (1) to offer medical treatments; (2) to help the poor ; (3) to open schools; (4) to create the written characters; (5) to translate original Christian books; (6) to train the native missionaries; (7) to change the traditions and customs of ethnic minorities; (8) to protect the parishioners from local authorities' oppression at an appropriate time. The previous government and investigators^[11] who gave the small favors to tempted the local ethnic minorities to join the churches.^[12] As a result, some ethnic minorities who have been marginalized politically and economically in the mainland for a long time have begun to show the trend of Christianization.^[13]

[7] According to the statistics of Yunnan Annals of Religion & Christianity (Yunnan People's Publishing House, 1990, pp. 231-239), there more than 20 Christian denominations and a lot of organizations which split from them.

[8] Ma Juli, Study on Cross-border communication of Christian Belief of Jingpo People in China-Myanmar Border areas; Based on a Case in Guangshan village of Longchuan.

[9] Gao Zhiying; The Development of Sino-burmese Christianity during the First Half of the 20th Century, The World Religious Cultures, Vol. 4, 2010.

[10] According to the author's interview with Barbi, the grand son of Morse, the first foreign missionary in Gongshan on July 2, 2017, Denver, USA. In 1936, the Morses' missionary house in Weixi was destroyed by a mudslide. They were welcomed by the believers in Gongshan where they built a thatched house and church for the priest's family to settle down.

[11] According to ethnic survey data in the 1950s and 1960s.

[12] See China's ethnic survey of the Yunnan ethnic minorities in the 1950s and 1960s, and Qin Heping's paper on the History of The Spread of Christianity in Southwest Ethnic Minorities' Areas, Sichuan Ethnic Publishing House, 2003.

[13] See Lv Daji, He Yaohua, Ed. , Zhang Qiaogui. Chinese Original Religious Materials Series, Lisu Volume, China Social Science Press, 2000.

From the Nujiang River to Baoshan, Dehong, Lincang, Pu'er and Honghe border areas, the seeds of Christianity were sown, laying the basic outline for the formation of the border Christian culture areas in Yunnan.

By the 1940s, It was recorded that Christianity had well influenced on Lisu ethnic minority people of the border areas. Because of the frequent visits of missionaries, what they dressed were neater in their daily lives, they prayed to God before they had meals, and their dwellings were neater than before, portraits of Jesus, Mary, or other biblical stories were also hung on the wall where the family ancestors used to be there. Ethnic minority people went to worship on Sundays. They celebrated Easter and Christmas instead of the original sacrifice and belief in various ghosts and spirits and changed the marriage and funeral ceremonies. They kept merit such as honesty, obeyed the message of the preacher and give up their addiction to smoke and drink, etc. I have seen that in border counties, there were masses that cannot be summoned by magistrates to solve problems, but they could be summoned by the missionaries to do so. Therefore, those people who believed in God have come to be known as parishioners.^[14] After analyzing the border ethnic minorities process and outcome of Christianization, we found that it is a process of cultural adjustment in which Christianity contradicts and repels the primitive religion and traditional culture of minority groups both on the level of religious belief, but it has borrowed and absorbed each other to a certain extent on the level of culture. Therefore, it is necessary to distinguish between the connotation and the extension of religious belief and religious culture in the study, so as to discover the subtle relationship between the unity and separation of belief and culture. Only then can we understand the essence of the adaptation of Christianity in Yunnan ethnic minorities' areas.

Then look at the writings created by foreign missionaries for ethnic minorities. The writings of the Old Miaos, created by the English Methodist missionary Gregory Bergli, The old Lisu writings were created by Fu Nengren, a missionary of the British Inland Missionaries, and Bartow, a missionary of the Karen nationality of Myanmar, The eastern Lisu writings by Australian missionary Wang Huai ren, Zaiwa writings which created by French missionary, William, Jingpo writings which were created by American Baptist missionary Cusson and O. Hanson, Wing Man Sang, an American Baptist missionary, created the Lahu and Wa writings, [Bartow, a Karen missionary, also created writings of Lahu.] Black Yi's writings were created by British Australian missionary Zhang Erchang. The Riwang writings (Dulong writings) were jointly created by the American missionary Joshua Mores and Bajidou Tiqigi of the Dulong ethnic minority in Myanmar, etc.^[15] These writings are called Christian writings. But what we should not ignore is the new cultural carrier of their writings, intonations, vocabularies, grammars and meanings combined with the western Latin alphabets. Therefore, the creation of ethnic minorities' writings was not a single act of foreign missionaries, but actually it was contribution of native missionaries, and even the common believers who participated in it, so as to create writings on the basis of ethnic minorities' cultures. In other words, the Christian writings pursued by foreign missionaries was not a written system composed of

[14] Zhang Zhengdong, Social Investigation Report of Yunnan Lisu Ethnic Minority in Gongshan and Fugong, Library collection of Southwest Institute for Nationalities, 1985.

[15] Yunnan Annals of Religion & Christianity, Yunnan People's Publishing House, 1990, pp. 263-265.

Latin letters or other letters completely separated from ethnic minorities' culture, but a combination of them both.

Taking the creation of Lisuwritings as an example, the process of the co-creation of Lisu writings by Fu Nengren and Bartow was to learn Lisu writings and Lisu culture and explore how to blend the Lisu writings system with Christian culture, so as to become the carrier of spreading Christianity. "He wrote down their pronunciations on the paper, and they stared at him in amazement. Someone complained, He's taken our words and we have nothing to say. From then on, Fu nengren could write down more than four hundred words in alphabetical order. Fu nengren studied harder on Lisu dialect and wrote down the Lisu words. He wanted to invent his own spellings to represent the different syllables with English letters. Yuba (Bartow) was a 23-year-old young man who come from Karen, Myanmar. He could spoke English and Lisu dialect fluently. He played an important role in creating the Lisu writings. Bartow was a very smart man. He wore the same clothes as the Lisu people, lived with them, and was loved by Lisu people, as if he were one of them. He could speak Lisu writings better than me (Fu Nengren).^[16] It can be seen that Fu Nengren and Bartow represented western culture and Lisu culture respectively, because of the common belief in Christianity, they worked together, created Lisu writings, and spread of Christianity extensively.^[17] In addition, We should not underestimated the importance of the first generation Lisu missionaries. It can be found that the creators only paying attention to the Lisu writings for promoting the spread of Christianity, while ignoring the process of learning Lisu writings and Lisu culture. It has also ignored the contribution of Bartow, a quasi-Lisu people, only Fu Nengren's contribution could be recognized, not to mention the importance of Lisu priests and elders in creating and perfecting the Christian writings. Thus, the Christian elements contained in Lisu writings became the only thing which could be seen, and the Lisu cultural elements have been ignored or covered up. Furthermore, the reason why there are so many kinds of ethnic minorities Christian writings, which are mostly created by foreign missionaries, due to the different ethnic minorities and their different cultures. In other words, during the process of localization, the Christianity has absorbed so many different ethnic minorities cultures in creating writings. It can be seen that if the Christian writings of these ethnic minorities without the spread of Christianity and the efforts that foreign missionaries make, there were no ethnic minorities' writings and cultures either.

In addition, on the one hand, it has always been believed that foreign missionaries stipulated that "Genesis is not allowed to be told", but on the other hand, in the reconstruction of "Christian myths" of border ethnic minorities, It is also the transplanting and reconstruction of Christian culture and ethnic minorities' cultures. For example, there is an old legend happened in Baoshan and Dehong, many ethnic minorities people lived there; the Jingpo people, Han people and Dai people are three brothers of the same ancestor, They were engaged in mountain farming, planting paddy fields and studying, serving as officials in the interior. After entering the ethnic border areas, the missionaries saw off the legend in order to settle down, saying that the Jingpo people, Lisu people, Han people and

[16] Eileen Crossman, *Mountain Rain: A New Biography of Fu Nengren*, Translated by Ruan Chaozhi, 1989, Propaganda Press, pp. 28, 61, 52, 105.

[17] Chen Jianmin, *The Writing Creation Activities of Missionaries in the Southwest Minorities' Areas*, *Religious Studies*, Vol. 6, 2010.

foreigners were four brothers born to the same mother. The foreigner was the eldest and left home. The eldest has a knack for making planes, and now he's coming back.^[18] It hallowed the creation of a close relationship with foreign missionaries, meanwhile, it connected with the non-written (once, but later lost) story of an ethnic minority,^[19] and realized the dynamic integration of ethnic minorities' traditional cultures and Christian culture.

Even in fairystories, which were full of extreme prejudices against foreign missionaries, the minorities' cultures still revealed that the foreign missionaries had played an important role in the reconstruction of Christianization. For example, the story of how to use cowhide rope to measure the size of land which you wanted to purchase, it was said in the story of Naxi people and Lisu people in Weixi county,^[20] and Jingpo people in Dehong.^[21] Once the foreign missionaries bought a piece of land the size of a whole cowhide from local ethnic-minority leaders, After cutting the leather into string to measure the size of the said land, they found the size of land is much larger than the size of a whole piece of cowhide. In fact, the story of cowhide, cowhide rope and the measurement of land had existed for long time before the arrival of foreign missionaries. Therefore, the story just transplanted the historical facts of the tense relationship between traditional ethnic minorities to foreign missionaries, which shows that this kind of cultural reconstruction has not left the soil of the traditional culture of ethnic minorities.

According to the so-called Ten Religious Rules and Doctrines stipulated by foreign missionaries, they do have in Lisu, Nu, Dulong, Jingpo and Lahu ethnic minorities areas.^[22] In the later investigation, it was found that it was not prescribed by foreign missionaries, it was summarized, and abide by the different minorities' clergies during the process of Christianity development.^[23] By strengthening the difference between believers and non-believers to enhance the cohesion of believers.^[24] The reason lies in Christianity based on a land with a strong cultural atmosphere of primitive religions. Only by reactionary cultural separation from primitive religion can the masses of believers be united in The Christian church. If we take the Ten Religious Rules of the Lisu, Nu and Dulong in particular, the primitive religions of Christianity and ethnic minorities are both replaced and absorbed in terms of faith and culture, form and content. The only one can believe is God, they do not believe in other ghosts at the same time, they use the Lisu writings Ussa to represent God, Ni to

[18] Yin Mingde, *Reconnaissance of the Northern Boundary of Yunnan Province*, 1933, p. 93.

[19] Tao Yunkui, *Lisu Ethnic Minorities in Biluo Snow Mountain*, p. 402.

[20] The Ilya's oral account and Hong Jun's records; *The Spread of Christianity in Gongshan*, selections of Cultural and historical data of Nujiang compiled by The Committee of Cultural and Historical Data of Nujiang, Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference, Dehong Press, 1994, p. 1104.

[21] Liu Yangwu, *The Spreading of Christianity in Jingpo Ethnic Minorities' Areas*, Assembly of Ethnic Minorities in Yunnan of the Second Mission of the Central Visiting Mission (Vol. 1), Yunnan Nationalities Publishing House, 1986, p. 293.

[22] See Zhu Fade, *History of Christianity in West Yunnan*, (Internal data), Han Junxue. *Christianity and Yunnan Ethnic Minorities*. Yunnan People's Publishing House, 2000.

[23] According to author's interviews with many old local preachers, none of them has ever been able to explain the process by which foreign missionaries formulated the Ten Rules and Doctrines. On July 2, 2017, according to the interviews with Barbi Morse, priest Feng Rongxin in Nujiang, lincang and priest Li Dexue in lincang, those Christian rules and doctrines were not regulated by foreign missionaries in one time, during the process of Christianity, gradually formed a few relatively common rules and doctrines, the entries for national beliefs and customs, as well as missionaries and believers.

[24] According to the author's interviews with reverend Jesse, Reverend Bobby and Reverend Peter on July 2, 2017 in Denver, USA.

represent devil, they did not change the old pot (Lisu writings), but filling it with the Christian new wine. Secondly, on the cognition of the worshiped God, Christianity is not used to replace the primitive religions, but to resist the invasion of various kinds of “Ni” by the God who is considered more powerful. Therefore, Christianity is only used as a powerful tool to deal with various supernatural forces. This is not a complete denial of primitive religions, but in fact juxtaposes Christianity with primitive religions. That is, institutional Christianity against various gods of non-institutional primitive religions. ^[25] It was particularly apparent that in the areas of which are remote, high frequency of natural disaster happened frequently, and low level of productivity. So, in a sense, it is not so much that the border ethnic minorities have converted from the primitive religions to Christianity as that they have found a force or a tool against the Gods of the primitive religions. So, that is why some ethnic minorities, such as the Lisu people, and some of Jingpo people who accepted Christianity actively. The root cause lies in what they were already overburdened under the severe natural pressure and social pressure both. They had to find an aid of religious power to oppose to the other religious power, and restore out an influential system of the Christian faith, ceremonies, and interpretation ethnically and locally.

Moreover, smoking and drinking is not allowed, in order to reinforce the distinction from non-believers on the one hand, on the other hand, they used the beverage such as honey water which was favored by mountainous ethnic minorities' people, and so as to the buckwheat pancake (Qiaobaba) to conduct the rites of passage to strengthen their identities. ^[26] It reminds people of the local traditional food—buckwheat pancake with honey soaked, so it feels like the traditional secular food which was transferred to the sacred space of the Christian church. The believers cannot sing and dance, meanwhile, they were compiling hymns in Lisu writings, taking the Lisu proverb into account, salt and singing is necessary, Lisu people could not live without them! and when they were singing the hymns, they developed their music talent incisively and vividly, and formed the Lisu style, Nu style hymns and the ways of multi-vocal chorus. So that the Christian faith, cultures and Lisu, Nu traditional cultures are not separated from each other. Because of the rich people could have the privilege to kidnap a wife (actually they own cattle, and cattle is compensation to his deed of kidnapping the other people's wife), and the poor can't afford to marry a wife. There are prohibitions that stipulate marriage should be monogamous and without dowry, the redistribution of women and money in the minority society tends to be balanced. This is the adaption of Christian culture to the minorities' culture of sharing. Therefore, it can be said that what matters is not whether the “Ten Canon Rules” of Christianity are created by foreign missionaries or not, but that these Canon rules and doctrines are the complete embodiment of the localization of Christianity and the Christianization of ethnic minorities in Yunnan.

Overall, even though Lisu, Nu, Jingpo, Lahu people were prominently affected by Christianity, but only about 20% of them converted to Christianity, and the ratio of the rest of the Wa, Dulong,

^[25] Gao Zhiying, *The Interpenetration of Christianity and primitive Religions of Ethnic Minorities on the Border of Yunnan*, July 8, 2015, Annual Conference of World Religions in Finland.

^[26] That is to say, the Lisu, Nu and Dulong ethnic minorities in the border areas of Yunnan province use the ethnic minorities' writings for the ritual of eating holy meal, including preaching, praying, singing, eating holy meal (baba) and drinking sugar water (honey water).

Hani, Yi and other devotees is much more lower, so before the 1950's, it was still in the beginning period of Christianity Sinicization among the Yunnan ethnic minorities in border areas.

2. The Superincumbent Sinicization of Christianity in Yunnan from the 1950s to the early 1960s

As a matter of fact, as early as the 1920s, under the background of upsurge of anti-imperialism and patriotic movements, a few areas in Yunnan Province broke out local anti-Christianity movement cases. But, the process of the Christian church becoming self-supporting was slow and at the same time very incomplete.^[27] Moreover, in the frontier ethnic areas, there are few self-support movements within the church. Although the Yunnan-Tibetan Christian Church broke away from the Christian Church of China in 1936, it was not the local priests and believers who did it, but the American missionary, John Morse, for his unwillingness to obey orders that would allow him to escape the war and return to the United States. Moreover, the Missionaries cut off the financial aid, but did not fundamentally change the nature of “foreign religion”. Therefore, only the Three-self Patriotic Movement in the 1950s was a superincumbent Upsurge of Christianization in the border areas under the national power.

In 1950, leading by Wu Yaozong, the Christian Patriots in Shanghai issued a declaration on the Reform of Christianity in China, proposing the proposition of getting rid of the control of imperialists' forces and running their own churches independently. In 1954, the first National Christian Conference was held in Beijing and the China Christian Three-Self Patriotic Movement Committee was founded formally. From then on, Chinese Christianity embarked on the patriotic road. From the inland to the border areas, the churches also began the “self-administer, self-support and self-mission” patriotic movements in Yunnan. Firstly, they expelled foreign missionaries out of China's territory, the churches which founded already are not branches of European and American churches any more in Nujiang, Baoshan, Dehong, Lincang and Pu'er. To make the vertical management system transformation from Yunnan border area Christian churches-European and American churches to Yunnan border area Christian churches-China Christian Three-Self Patriotic Movement Committee. Secondly, churches were managed by local ethnic pastoral staff, Some ethnic-minority pastors who supported the leadership of the Chinese Communist Party and were actively engaged in socialism construction were recommended to Christian and political leadership positions,^[28] all missions are also carried out by native and ethnic missionaries. The churches were no longer dependent on foreign churches economically; they explored adaptations to local conditions. In short, the church was able to manage itself as a result of its independence from the imperialist Christian management and missionary system. In order to achieve self-administer, they had to carry out economic self-support and self-mission, and finally realized the transformation from the churches managed by various denominations of European and American Christianity to the local and national “patriotic” churches.

The establishment of self-administer, self-support and self-mission patriotic congresses at the provincial and local levels is another Sinicization movement with a relatively longer duration. On the basis of the development of the self-administer, self-support and self-mission Christian reform movement in Yunnan, many areas have successively established new church organizations—the Self-

[27] Yunnan Religions and Christianity, Yunnan People's Publishing House, 1995, p. 228.

[28] The first generation of intellectuals of the border ethnic minorities were from the Christian schools, some of them were trained by the CCP as cadres of their own ethnic minorities in the early days of the China's liberation.

administer, self-support and self-mission Christian Patriotic Movement Committee, It was also a sign of the gradual sinicization of Christianity from Kunming city to the border areas. From 1955 to 1957, Kunming, Dehong, Lancang county of Pu'er, Dali successively established "self-administer, self-support and self-mission" patriotic organizations, in July 1963, was formally founded in Yunnan province, Christian "self-administer, self-support and self-mission patriotic movement committee", Sun Shouxin served as the chairman, Zong Bang (Jingpo), Wu Zhonglie (Miao), Zhang Xiuzhou and Yue Xiang (Lisu) served as the deputy directors.^[29] It was the first gathering under the banner of "Patriotism" of the venerable priests of the various ethnic groups in Yunnan.

The Chinese people, who had been enslaved and oppressed by European and American powers since the Opium War, needed to unite all industries, all classes and all ethnic groups with patriotism after they finally won the great victory against imperialism and feudalism in 1949. In particular, Christianity, which has been described as flying over on imperialist shells,^[30] and needed to be "patriotic" and to be done with imperialism. In this way, the core word of "patriotism" in the structure established under the background of the Sinicization of Christianity at that time objectively defined the different truths of The Christian church under the control of foreign missionaries. Therefore, it showed obviously political tendency, so many former Christian studies before 1950s had got into the logic of "patriotism" and "non-patriotism", thus, it led to catch more attention to Christian ethnic minorities border areas and European and American "Christian" imperialist background, rather than the native ethnic minorities' cultural elements, and possibilities and meanings of foreign missionaries for training the native missionaries to realize the Sinicization of Christianity, which resulted in the unfair treatment to some native missionaries and believers, prompting some of them flee to Myanmar, some of them contacted with each other secretly, some of them abandoned their Christian belief for good.^[31] Therefore, since the development of Christianity in border ethnic minorities areas has been interrupted periodically, it also means the interruption of the localization process of Christianity.

But looking back to the history, during the 1950s to 1960s, the "Self-administer, self-support and self-mission" patriotic movement lasted a short time, but is of great significance in the history of Yunnan Christianity. It has made a transition from the control of foreign missionaries Christianity to the local native Christian pastoral staff management, it means that Christianity has stepped onto the stage of Sinicization of Christianity with the transformation of China's society. In other words, it was the response and practice of various regional and ethnic minorities' churches which formed the first short-term Upsurge of Sinicization of Christianity in China.

3. The Localization of Christianity and the Development of Christianization of Ethnic Minorities in Yunnan Border Areas Since the 1980s

From 1980s to 1990s, it was the period of Christian recovery and rebound in Yunnan. With the

[29] According to the textual research of priest Jesse in Nujiang, Yue Xiang was another name of priest Yue Xiu, a native ethnic minority people of Li Wudi, Fugong County, whose Lisu's name was Y0-Xu on the records of Yunnan Religion and Christianity, Yunnan People's Publishing House, 1995, p. 268.

[30] Jiang Menglin, Tides from the West—A Chinese Autobiography, Taipei Central Daily, 1957, pp. 3-4.

[31] Gao Zhiying, Sha Lina, Religious Demands and Cross-Border Flows—A Case Study of Ethnic Minorities Who believed in Christianity in the Cross-Border Areas of China and Myanmar, World Religion Studies, Vol. 3, 2014.

rapid growth of Christian believers and church spots, the interaction between Christian culture and ethnic minorities' cultures has been changed from being natural to being conscious, from being passive to being active.

From the perspective of development of Christian architectures in Yunnan border ethnic minorities' areas, people have noticed that Christian churches are the most magnificent and eye-catching architectures in this area, but they have ignored the local and national adaptation of Christian architectures in keeping the paces with the times. In the 1980s, most ethnic minorities' border areas still live in thatched shelters, bamboo shelters or wooden shelters, the churches were just the same, such as Lisu inheritance of Stilt shelters with thousand feet,^[32] which were quite different from the spires and frosted glass decorated churches of western Christian styles! But the differences showed the features of the "localization" of Christianity in the ethnic minorities' areas in Yunnan—to spread Christianity in the traditional architectural space of ethnic minorities. Moreover, the features of localization could keep the pace with the times: By the 1990s, the government had implemented the "elimination of thatched houses" project, the houses were covered with asbestos shingles and walled with wooden boards and the church followed the same architectural style; At the end of the 20th century, the project of revitalizing the border and enriching the people has been implemented. The villagers' houses were covered by iron roofs and hollow brick walls, and the church buildings were also covered by flat roofs. In recent years, when most families in rural areas built "western-style mansions", the style of churches also has been changed. With increasing number of believers and the development of economy, the churches became larger and more magnificent. It can be seen that the changes of the Christian buildings of ethnic minorities in the border areas of Yunnan had been transformed from thatched cottages to small houses and become more and more integrated with the actual economic and cultural development of villages under the national poverty alleviation policy, which could be regarded as a manifestation of the localization of Christianity. The church has become not only the most important religious ceremony space in the village, but also an important center for weddings and other common activities, and even a landmark of the Christian village. Therefore, Christian architecture is superior to the houses both in size and height. It was not "delocalization", but it is a kind of materialized form of the assimilation between the localization of Christianity and the Christianization of ethnic minorities, behind it are the changes and developments of economy, culture and church in minorities villages under the ethnic and religious policies of CCP.

Singing and dancing in Yunnan border minorities' areas has been an important identity tag for Christian believers for a long time. It was said that when foreign missionaries first came to do missionary work, "no singing folk songs and no dancing folk dances" become the religious discipline, believers just sang hymns at that time, and dancing was forbidden as well. Many devout believers in the middle and the old age have obeyed foreign missionaries' discipline for a long time. Even when

[32] Because of the high mountains deep waters and steep cliffs in in Nujiang, It was hard to find a piece of flat land to build a house, Lisu and Nu people first learned to erect the stakes along the slopes of mountains, and then at the height of more than one meter, they piled the wooden boards or bamboo woven mats as the floors or the walls of the houses. With their sons who grew up and prepared to get married, their houses would be next to the ancestors' houses with the same architectural style of building the new houses as their ancestors. We could see many of thatched houses in rows there, commonly known as thousand-foot houses.

writer was investigating in Nujiang in 2010, an old preacher said: “The platform is the sacred place of God. How dare you dance around it?^[33]” But in fact, many Lisu and Nu churches had organized various recreational activities in the three major festivals at that time, and the dance with body movements which were similar to the sign writings, and mixed with some ethnic minorities’ dancing movements. If the traditional religious power of the church is relatively strong, they just danced outside of the church; but in the nascent church, they danced on narrow platform simply. The music and songs were far beyond the range of traditional hymns, many new “hymns” were from Burmese devotees dancing movements which were used to please God. At the beginning, only the female believers who can dance, while the male believers just play musical Instruments, male believers were not allowed to take part in the dancing. But later on, more and more men, women and children joined the church dancing team, and there were special “dancing teachers” who went from church to church to teach dancing. The churches also prepared special rooms for whom practicing dancing together and finally held dancing competitions after the three major festivals or bible training classes. Thus, You can see the on the broadening platform under the church cross, devotees of all ages, men, women and children performed a variety of folk and even modern dances, from dumbbell-style hymns to folk dances. It was a localization of Christianity rather than a transformation from the sanctity of Christianity to the secularism, which attracted more and more people get into the church by this means. Because not only the Lisu, Nu and Dulong ethnic groups in Nujiang, but also the Jingpo, Lahu and Hani ethnic groups who believe in Christianity all have a strong interest in singing and dancing, singing and dancing has become an important means to attract people to believe in Christianity. In the Christmas of 2016, the author investigated the Christmas parties held in Mengding of Gengma and the Christian Church of the county. The folk dances of Lahu, Lisu, Dai, Wa and Han were performed in the evening party, as well as modern dances and children dances, accompanying with western musical Instruments, and cucurbit flute; Both solo pop songs and choral hymns were performed as well. The dancing accompaniment music includes both the main songs and love songs composed by ethnic minorities and non-religious people in Myanmar or in the border areas of China, as well as the accompaniment music of modern dance and hip-hop dance. There are as many as seventeen or eighteen festivals in evening party. The dancing team of believers and the dancing team of non-believers take turns to perform on the stage, which becomes the liveliest place in the area that night. It was just a manifestation of ethnic unity and social harmony in border ethnic minorities’ areas. It can be said that the special space of church has created a culture which was composed with a large quantity of Christian ethnic minorities’ songs and dances. Fortunately, for example, pastor Jesse in Nujiang and Pastor Pete in Lincang supported the integration and development of believers actively. Pastor Jesse organized church guitarists to participate in the white guitarists singing “Gongshan Love Song” in the celebration of Gongshan County, which became a story for a while. At the same time, Pastor Peter played the guitar with the church as the symbol of the Christian identity and the cucurbit flute as the symbol of the Lahu ethnic minority, committing himself to the work of the inheritance of Christianity and ethnic minorities’ cultures at the same time, winning a good reputation

[33] According to the author’s interview with the elder priest C of Lisu ethnic minority in Luzhang town, Lushui County on February 10, 2010.

in the local politicians and missionaries.

What is particularly noteworthy is that after the church choir packaged with “Lisu Peasant Choir” and “Lisu Peasant Red Song Chorus”, it went out of the church and stepped on the stages of various singing celebrations. Lisu “farmers chorus” of Nujiang in 1995, has stepped on the stage of the Golden Rooster Award and Hundred flowers Award which was organized by government in Kunming city, they were neither Christians, nor professional singers, but barefoot farmers, wearing ethnic minorities’ costumes, they were genuine “farmers chorus”, and can hardly speak Chinese, they were the believers who were trained in churches chorus. Yang Yunji, the leader of chorus, he recommended some of Lisu farmer singers from different villages and churches, were trained in harmony of singing and finally performed the world-famous four parts melodrama Auld Lang in Lisu writings, and the hymn-Hallelujah, what they performed had made the artists from all over the world move to tears and caused a sensation. After that, they performed in Beijing and other places for many times, and the performers were also believers who were diluted out of their identity as believers.^[34] This interpretation of Christian songs in the Lisu four-part chorus is a perfect representation of the “localization” of Christianity and the Lisu culture. In recent years, the Lisu Farmers’ Revolutionary Chorus has been established. Lisu writings experts translated the “revolutionary songs” into Lisu writings, and then the artist would be compared in 4 songs, and then teaching the believers to sing in churches.^[35] They sang hymns in churches, and sang revolutionary songs when they were going out of the church and participating in governmental organized activities. They had won many awards as well, and the videos were widely spread on the Internet, and made a big difference. The process of singing traditional Lisu folk songs to Christian hymns, and then to the combination of revolutionary songs, can be a symbol of the localization of Christianity and the Christianization of ethnic minorities’ cultures. To seize the opportunity survival and development in responding to the national mainstream consciousness. This was the survival wisdom of the localization of Christianity in Yunnan border ethnic minorities’ areas.

In the border ethnic minorities’ areas of Yunnan, ethnic musical Instruments were once excluded from the church, thus musical Instruments had become a symbol of identity distinction between Christian believers and non-believers. The musical Instruments used in the church ranged from accordion, pedal organ and later drum set, electronic organ and piano, etc. It has been a standard of the church from small to large scale. Therefore, Chinese and western musical Instruments in the church can be said to serve different purposes. However, since the 1980s, guitar has been accepted by them both. Yunnan has a 4,060-kilometer borderline with Myanmar, Vietnam and Laos, and nearly 20 ethnic minorities live across the border areas. When the wind of reform and opening up blows across the border areas, guitars, which are extremely popular in Myanmar, you could take them everywhere easily, the prices of buying them and learning how to play are considerably cheap, and flood into the border areas from the ports and the routed of flow of the ethnic minorities’ people. In church activities, the Nu, Dulong, Lisu, Lahu and Jingpo churches were filled with hymns which were accompanied by guitars. Due to the influence of films such as *The Roadside Guitar Team*, the guitar

[34] According to the author’s interview with Yang Yunji at his home in Liuku on January 29, 2015.

[35] According to the author’s interview with Pastor Feng Rongxin at Kunming Theological Seminary on July 15, 2017.

was also fashionable among non-Christians. Many young people in the villages almost owned one, and some local girls and young women also joined the guitar team. On the one hand, the proportion of the foreign Lisu, Nu, Dulong, Jingpo and Lahu believing in Christianity is higher than that of the same ethnic minorities lived in China, so most of the guitar accompaniment songs were related to Christianity. On the other hand, from the development trend of Christianity, there are more and more ethnic minorities Christian believers in the border areas. In recent years, even among the Han, Dai and Hui ethnic minorities, some of them had converted to Christianity. In this way, a large number of Christian and non-Christian guitarists who came from domestic and foreign countries could get together. Because of they have got the common interest in guitar, non-believers would like to participate in church parties and believers could participate in singing and dancing activities outside the church as well. Here, the guitar is no longer the identity of the border minorities' Christians, but also become a national musical instrument which is popular in the border ethnic minorities' areas. Thus, the ethnic minorities' cultures related to the guitar have been wonderfully combined with the Christian culture. For example, the male and female Lahu guitar teams performed on CCTV for many times. The teams composed by both believers and non-believers, it did not just represent Christianity, it represented the Lahu people as well.

The investigation showed that the Christianization of ethnic costumes is another manifesto of the localization of Christianity in Yunnan ethnic minorities' areas. The author has traced the Lisu and Nu ethnic minorities' people in Nujiang for a long time, and found that their ethnic costumes have become a must for believers to worship and celebrate Christian festivals. On weekends, Lisu and Nu believers dressed on holiday costumes and walked into the church. On the three major holidays of Christianity, such as Christmas, Easter and Thanksgiving, believers would dress in bright ethnic costumes everywhere inside and outside of churches. Thus, Christian gatherings had become competition of colorful ethnic costumes. Believers dressed on beautiful, clean and neat ethnic costumes to express their piety to God, and during this process, the ethnic costume culture is also inherited. On Wednesday night, if there is no time for you to dress up and go to the church, you may take an traditional ethnic Lisu cross-shoulder bag with you and put your bible and hymn books into it. In other words, when the Lisu bag is brought to the body of a devotee on Wednesday, Saturday, Sunday and religious festivals, it indicates that it is time for believers gathered in churches. Moreover, it is certain that the bag contains Christian reading materials, so the Lisu bag has the function of identifying its devotees with the Lisu ethnic costume culture. The author has investigated in Myitkyina areas in 2010 for the first time, taking with a Lisu bag, and found a church which written in Lisu writings, because of the Lisu bag, the author accomplished her investigation task under the help of and Myanmar Lisu people successfully. A Lisu college student who was a disciple walked with me at that time, taking a Lisu bag with him, and there were some Christian reading books in it. The people who took such a bag with him or her could easily integrated with the Lisu compatriots in Myanmar, thus Lisu bag is a symbol of identifying the identities of Lisu people. In the Lahu areas, along the border of Yunnan province and Southeast Asian countries, Lahu bag is a gift of the Lahu people, because it is often used to hold Christian reading books, thus it is also a symbol to identify the Lahu people and Christian believers.

New Rice Festival is a traditional festival of the Lisu, Nu, Lahu and Jingpo ethnic minorities.

When millet is ripe, every family and village celebrated the festival to thank the gods for their blessings and harvest. The introduction of Christianity, especially in recent years, has added a lot of Christian elements to the New Rice Festival. It is organized by the church, and the ceremony is held in the church, with preaching, singing and dancing, just like a Christian ceremony. Each woman carried on her back a basket filled with golden grain and seasonal fruits, arranged in rows in front of the platform like a grand exhibition for celebrating the fall harvest. In fact, the villagers, the believers who gave thanks to God for their good harvest. Therefore, it can be said that the new Rice Festival of these ethnic minorities is no longer the New Rice Festival in the traditional meaning, but the product of the localization of Christianity and the reconstruction of the border ethnic minorities in Yunnan. In addition, there are cultural elements of each other in other traditional festivals and Christian festivals of the ethnic minorities in the border areas. For example, Lisu, Nu and Dulong ethnic minorities celebrated Christmas in churches, the churches took turns for hosting celebrations for each year, and everyone brought their own gift to ease the burden of the hosts. This is just the same as the traditional festival celebrated in villages (families), which plays an important role in the construction of social relations in public areas.

III. Discussion and Thinking

The reasons for exclusion: Is it because of Faith or Fighting for their living space?

From the historical analysis and synchronal comparison of the relationship between the “localization” (localization and situation) of Christianity in Yunnan border ethnic minorities’ areas and the “Christianization” of ethnic minorities above, we can find out the process and characteristics of their interactive development.

First of all, the Sinicization of Christianity and the Christianization of China’s border ethnic minorities complemented with each other. It can be said that there is no Sinicization of Christianity without the Christianization of the ethnic minorities in China. This is just like the two sides of a coin, the researches stressed on only one side of coin is not comprehensive and objective.

Secondly, in different historical periods, the interaction and development of The Sinicization of Christianity in China and the Christianization of ethnic minorities are not completely synchronous, nor in deep feeling about each other and incompatible completely. On the Christian point of view, after experiencing the developing process of localization to re-localization, from the initial intention to highlight the distinction of the ethnic minorities’ primitive religions, to later trans-boundaries of each other; On the other hand, the culture of border ethnic minorities is constantly absorbing the elements of Christian culture to enrich its cultural content and form, and they even gave birth to some cultures with characteristics of both cultures. Therefore, the changes from nature to consciousness in The Sinicization of Christianity, and the changes from unconsciousness to consciousness in the Christianity of ethnic minorities’ cultures, which are the embodiment of their wisdom of survival, adjustment and development.

Thirdly, the relationship between Christianity and the traditional culture of ethnic minorities, including primitive religious beliefs, is quite different from each other to the degree of belief and

culture. If we took a general view, it will prevent them from seeking common ground while reserving differences and it was a barrier for religious harmony, ethnic unity and border stability.

Fourthly, the localization, scenization and indigenization of Christianity is the Sinicization of specific areas and specific ethnic minorities, while the Sinicization of Christianity is the localization in a broader space (scenization and indigenization). The differences between the two Spaces and ethnic minorities resulted in differences in commonness and individuality. Therefore, it cannot be generalized to refer to the localization of various ethnic minorities and areas with Sinicization, nor can it be generalized to the localization of nations and areas with Sinicization.

中文题目:

论基督教中国化与云南跨境民族文化重构的交互发展关系

作者:高志英,(1964.07—),女,教授,博士生导师,云南大学西南边疆少数民族研究中心,Tel:13888072229 Email:2296054891@qq.com;王东蕾,(1978.02—),女,副教授,博士,云南财经大学国际语言文化学院,Tel:15887015580 Email:1609766878@qq.com

摘要:“基督教中国化”,是基督教在中国社会场景里进行适应性文化调适的发展策略与实践。本文从文化互动与采借、交融的视角,通过对基督教在云南少数民族地区的“本土化”(在地化、处境化)少数民族宗教文化“基督教化”关联性的历史性理与共时性比较,探究二者间的互发展动因、过程与特点。认为基督教少数传统文化之间大都经历了从相互隔阂、排斥到相互并存、交融的过程,并完成了基督教从“在地化”到“再地化”的过渡,从而实现了颇具区域性、民族性特点的“中国化”,同时也使边境少数民族文化得到重构。

关键词:云南少数民族;中国化;基督教化;交互发展

比较宗教
文化研究
**Comparative Religious and
Cultural Studies**

Ancestors or Ghosts: the Cult of the Dead in a Bai Village in Southwest China

Xue YANG

(Yangzhou University, Jiangsu Province, P. R. China)

Abstract: When it comes to ancestor worship, the basic belief is that the spirit of the dead would affect their living family. However, the cult of the dead in a Bai village in southwest China shows deconstruction and moral reflection of ancestors. From the perspective of social relationships, people separate their ancestors from other families' ancestors who are also recognised as ghosts or uninvited guests. Besides, they divided their deceased relatives into ancestors and ghosts through cultural definition of a good death and bad death, thus they need a bridge rite to help the spirit of the dead in a bad death to be an ancestor. In regard to the netherworld, people wish their deceased relatives go to western heaven at the same time they regard them as suffering ghosts in hell because of their guilty during their lifetime. Moreover, the living family have an obligation to provide and help their dead release from suffering. By examining the attitudes and acts of distinguishing, transforming, and equating between ancestors and ghosts, this article further argues that the cult of the dead in Bai is not only an ethical act of obeisance but also an expression of ideal personhood and a belief in living family as the salvation of the dead.

Key Words: Ancestor worship; Ghosts; Popular religion; Southwest China; Bai

Author: YANG Xue, Yangzhou University, Address: No. 180 Si Wang Ting Rd, Han Jiang District, Yangzhou City, Jiangsu Province, P. R. China. Tel: 18252729369. Email: graceyangxue@yeah.net.

As an important tradition in China, ancestor worship is thought as a cultural background that cast a shadow over the family's structure^[1] and social personality^[2]. Based on field work of Chinese religion in Taiwan since the 1960s, some anthropologists find that there are two other acts of worship for gods and ghosts that have significance in peasant life except for ancestor worship. Among these, David K. Jordan first proposed that the worship of gods, ghosts, and ancestors are the least common denominator among Chinese religion^[3]. Besides, Stephan Feuchtwang claims that gods, ancestors,

[1] Maurice Freedman, "Ancestor Worship: Two Facets of the Chinese Case, in Maurice Freedman", eds., social organization: essays presented to Raymond Firth, (Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1967), 85-104.

[2] 许烺光 Francis L. K. Hsu, 《祖荫下: 中国乡村的亲属, 人格与社会流动》Zu yin xia [Under the Ancestors' Shadow: Kinship, Personality, and Social Mobility in China], 王芃 Wang peng 徐隆德 Xu Longde 译, (台北 Taipei: 南天书局 Nantian shuju [South Company]), 2001, 7-8.

[3] 焦大卫 David K. Jordan, 《神·鬼·祖先》shen gui zuxian [Gods, Ghosts, and Ancestors], 丁仁杰 Ding Renjie 译, (台北 Taipei: 联经出版事业股份有限公司 Lianjing chuban shiye gufen youxian gongsi), 2012, 188.

and ghosts correspond to bureaucrat, kinship, and strangers in social counterpart^[4]. He believes that this kind of religious system is a metaphor of the state authority; gods are rulers and judges; ghosts are the supplicants; ancestors are respected natives^[5]. Instead of regarding ancestors and ghosts as agnatic ascendants and everyone else, Arthur P. Wolf claims that a finely graded continuum that extends from ancestors and ghosts and it is the living's obligation rather than descent that determine who could be enshrined on altars as ancestors^[6]. In his observation in San-hsia town, Wolf finds between true ancestors and ghosts are people who contributed to one's line but were not members of the line and people who died as dependents of the line and have no one else to care for them^[7]. Thus, he concluded that ancestor worship is an act of obeisance by showing respect to those one owes obligations.

Based on the fieldwork of a Bai village in southwest China, this article argues that the cultural definition of a good death and bad death and the recognition of the afterworld also affect the distinction and identity of ancestors and ghosts. By contrasting people's attitudes in the family and the netherworld, this article further argues that ancestors, as well as the living individuals, are constructed and defined by culture.

The Introduction of Bai and a Bai village

As a minority nationality centred in Dali Bai Nationality Autonomous Prefecture (DAP) in Yunnan Province, the Bai has more common with the Han than other ethnic groups in southwest China. In the 1940s, Francis L. K. Hsu did his research in west town which was actually a Bai community affiliated to Dali and found people there amalgamated with the Han^[8]. In his book *Under the Ancestors' Shadow*, Hsu regards its culture as prototypes of ancestor worship in Chinese culture. After the ethnic classification project of the 1950s, especially with the development of ethnic tourism in 1990s, the Bai began to construct themselves as a distinguishing nationality from the Han. Nowadays, the trends to acculturation are more stronger than those against on the whole.^[9]

The data in this article are mainly from the interview and participant observation in the biggest village of Bai in DAP called Chou village, just 3.4 miles away from the west town where Hsu once lived. From Jan. 2013 to Jun. 2017, I lived in this village to do fieldwork for 406 days in total. Living under the same roof of a local family, I could easily see how a Bai family regard the spiritual beings in their daily life. Also, I attended most of the rituals and festivals in the village around a year and kept

[4] Stephan Feuchtwang, "Domestic and Communal Worship in Taiwan", in Arthur P. Wolf, ed., *Religion and Ritual in Chinese Society*, (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1974), 105-130.

[5] *Ibid.*, pp. 128.

[6] Arthur P. Wolf, "Gods, ghosts, and ancestors", in Arthur P. Wolf, ed., *Religion and Ritual in Chinese Society*, (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1974), 131-182.

[7] *Ibid.*, pp. 147.

[8] 许烺光 Francis L. K. Hsu, 《祖荫下: 中国乡村的亲属, 人格与社会流动》Zu yin xia [Under the Ancestors' Shadow: Kinship, Personality, and Social Mobility in China], 王芃 Wang peng 徐隆德 Xu Longde 译, (台北 Taipei: 南天书局 Nantian shuju [South Company]), 2001, 16-17.

[9] Colin Mackerras, "Aspects of Bai Culture: Change and Continuity in a Yunnan Nationality". *Modern China*, vol. 14, (1988), 77.

the pace with Bai villagers, which made me understand them deeper.

With a population of about ten thousand and a plantation of only 190 hectares, people in Chou village could not live on farming. Most men have to go to cities nearby as migrant workers in the building industry and leave women to take care of the family, do farm work and get involved in the tourism business. With Butterfly Spring located in the north of the village and ethnic folklore, this village is very famous for ethnic tourism in Dali.

Even though their religious activities inevitably become a tourist attraction, Chou villagers insist on their belief in real life. Almost all villagers claim themselves to be Buddhists while they worship gods from local tutelary spirits, nature deities, and characters in Confucianism, Buddhism, and Taoism in reality. The religious centre in the village is around a temple and two shrines. The gods in the temple are a combination of three religions, such as Sakyamuni of Buddhism, Supreme Lord Laozi of Taoism, Confucius of Confucianism, which they regard as kuan (high officials in central government). Whereas, they regard the gods of local tutelary spirits who once saved the village in two shrines as kuan (cadres in a small village), which means they protect them and take immediate charge of their welfare. According to specific time, they would worship these supernatural beings to supplicate clean and peace for their families' sake in their houses, village, foothill, and lakeside.

Unlike gods, the supernatural governor, ancestors and ghosts are civilian classes and they are also in the charge of gods as the living. Local dead could scarcely become a god because villagers thought they are powerless, which is in accordance with Hsu's description that ancestors are benign^[10]. Although he saw the heterogeneous attitudes that people towards ancestors, Hsu regard ancestors as a prevalent culture and focus on its influences on social personality. Nevertheless, ancestors are multi-dimensional in the family's perspective and the recognition of the afterworld in the Bai village.

The Social Classification of Ancestors and Ghosts Among Families

In Chou village, ancestors belong to a family rather than an individual, which is different from Wolf's observation in San-hsia town. People distinguished ghosts from their ancestors based on the scope of lineage and dead's master. Whether the dead are ancestors or not depends on their position in the patrilineal family. The deceased who are not belong to dead's masters are all ghosts.

There are two kinds of activities for ancestor worship in Chou village, which is based on lineage and families^[11]. Sometimes, larger lineages would divide into small segments to perform ancestor worship because of the ritual's capacity^[12]. In the Bai's festival to offer sacrifices to ancestors or life rites of a lineage member, lineage or segments would play an important part in ancestor worshipping. Nevertheless, the family is the basic unit to perform ancestor worship, and the immediate jural

[10] 许烺光 Francis L. K. Hsu,《祖荫下:中国乡村的亲属,人格与社会流动》Zu yin xia[Under the Ancestors' Shadow: Kinship, Personality, and Social Mobility in China],王芃 Wang peng 徐隆德 Xu Longde 译,(台北 Taipei:南天书局 Nantian shuju[South Company]),2001,209.

[11] The only ancestral hall in this village that has ever existed belongs to the Duan lineage, but it did not function as ancestral hall after the elimination of lineage authority in the 1950s.

[12] 何菊 He Ju,《仪式容量:当代宗族裂变的新模式》Yishi rongliang: dangdai zongzu liebian de xin moshi[Ritual Capacity: a New Pattern of Contemporary Lineage Segmentation Based on the Data of Duan Lineage in Zhoucheng, a Bai Village of Dali, Yunnan Province],《民族研究》Minzu yanjiu[Ethno-National Studies], No. 2,(北京 Beijing:社会科学文献出版社 Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe [Social Sciences Academic Press],2013),54-59.

superiors are more personal and individual than in the lineage's worship^[13]. Every morning, most families would begin a day with lighting three incense sticks for heaven, earth, and ancestors in their house. Besides, a family would visit the gravesite of ancestors in the third lunar month and tenth lunar month, venerate the dead from 1st to 13th in the seventh lunar month, releasing loach to get merits for ancestors in 23rd in the seventh lunar month and so on. Therefore, the distinguish of ancestors and ghosts are more clear and close in the family's perspective.

For independent family, the dead are ancestors to the dead's masters sizhu who are the deceased's immediate relatives and ghosts to other family members. The dead's masters include the deceased's sons, daughters-in-law, daughters, nephews, nieces, nieces-in-law, and grandchildren. Sometimes an ancestor would give a dream to a living master, such as his son, nephew, or daughters, asking some clothes or food. An informant said to me, "I had a cousin who died in this house. He had everything except shoes. My son told me the other day that he dreamed his uncle was digging stones without shoes, and blood was coming out of his feet. Then my son and his wife burned some straw sandals in ancestor worship day in the seventh lunar month." For a married woman, she should worship his husband's ancestors, and she still had an obligation to bring some paper clothes, paper money to show respect to his father's ancestors.

The dead is an ancestor for agnatic descent's family but a ghost to another family. If a relative or neighbours died, people in the same village would go to extend condolence. After that, they would burn a straw fire and go across it to drive away ghosts before entering his own family. Occasionally, people would go around stove god after showing respect to the deceased. As a sign of family division and family establishment, stove god also helps family drive away from the ghosts that do not belong to their family.

When confronted ghosts, Chou villagers look upon them as the other villagers' ancestors and treat them as uninvited guests. Villagers think that the dead spirit that does not belong to one's own family should be treated as a guest, because he may be the ancestor of others' family. If children cry all night long or a family member is depressed while the doctor cannot recognise the cause, it is said a ghost may accidentally enter their family—that need to call one's living soul back and send off the guest, which are obscure words of driving ghosts away from their house.

It needs several steps to see the uninvited guest off. A woman in Chou village had a stomachache and went to the hospital because of kidney stone. She still felt dispirited after that. Then her family went for asking a witch, and they were told that their neighbour's spirit tangled her and they need to take some rituals. Firstly, they asked the witch to burn some paper money for the king of hell in Dongyue Temple in Dali. Secondly, the witch helped call her soul back with rice, salt, tea, incense sticks, paper money, and an egg in the crossroad behind her house. When the egg in her hand is erected, it means the woman's living soul is coming back. This same egg would be eaten by the woman in the next day. Besides, the family burnt paper money and incense to stove god according to the witch's instruction. Last but not the least, her family prepared a table for the guest with three bowls of rice soup, two joss sticks, four paper clothes, an egg, a duck egg, a bowl of rice, four paper

[13] Maurice Freedman, "Ancestor Worship: Two Facets of the Chinese Case, in Maurice Freedman", eds., social organization: essays presented to Raymond Firth, (Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1967), 87.

bags filled with rice, salt, tea, and paper money. After showing respect and providing the feast to the guest, the host struck the peach tree branches and willow branches to drive the guest away. Through these rituals, they believed that they had called the living's soul back and driven away from the ghost who does not belong to their family.

In short, the distinction between ancestors and ghosts represents different families' relatives. In Bai village, it depends on the scope of dead's masters. Although people still honour their ancestors who are not of patrilineal descent, they would not write their name on their ancestral tablets. On this basis, the boundary between ancestor and ghost is a continuum from the paternal family having obligations to the paternal family having almost no obligations.

The Cultural Boundary of Ancestors and Ghosts in the Family

In addition to separating their ancestors from families, villagers also identify ancestors of a good death from ghosts among their family members, which mainly depend on the cultural definition. The difference between a good death and bad death shows the gap between the individual and the ideal expectation of family.

Good Death or Bad Death

Death is always as unpleasant as personal trauma. However, there are good death or bad death in public culture. Whether death is good or not depends on factors such as the age of death, the way of death, and the place of death. In Bai village, a good death of passing away means that a man died peacefully in his own house, in old age, and his eldest son's arms. After the funeral and a series of rituals held by the family, the deceased become an ancestor.

The real-life is always complex, and villagers have to face unexpected death in the village. Bad death means that the deceased died young, without descendants, and outside the family. In this condition, people thought the deceased would become lonely and wild ghosts [gu hun ye kui]. The word lonely means that the dead person has no descendants to worship him, and wild expresses that the deceased is not embedded in family structure.

If a child died, people regard it as the reborn of wandering and homeless ghosts in the hell. Chou villagers believe that if some wandering and homeless ghosts want some food and clothes, they would sneak away from hell and reincarnate in some family. As soon as they get some food and clothes, the children would die. In this situation, the relatives would send the coffin off quickly, and the funeral is also simple. The family would not write the children's name in the ancestral tablet. However, it is not to say villagers would not remember the dead. They just could not show kindness for the dead in the home and only venerating it in Jingwu Temple, an orphanage or asylum for pacifying the dead in Tsang mountain.

If young men or women died without married or have no descendants, their close relatives would write their name in their ancestral tablet and give provision for them. A man in Bai village worshipped his father's sister and brother who died in the 40s and 20s without descendants. He said, "I write my uncle's name and my aunt's name in my ancestral tablet because they are my family and did not die in their childhood."

If a man with descendants died outside the house, such as died from traffic or died of suicide, his name would be written in ancestral tablet while his coffin would not be placed inside the family house. Still, there are two situations. If the man died in the village, the coffin could be placed outside the family gate. If the man died outside the village, his coffin should not be placed inside the village and should be put in the roadside or field. In this situation, people would bury him in the mountain instead of in the cemetery. Although the name of the dead could be written in the ancestral tablet, the deceased would become a ghost. The dead were thought to have no family to give provisions for him and would become wandering and homeless ghosts just like beggars.

Bridge Ritual and Beggars' Day

If one died outside the house, the dead's spirit could not come into the house because of the family's threshold, a protection for a family from ghosts and evils. Almost every family in Bai village has some family members who died of bad death and thus became lonely manes or ghosts. It is unacceptable for the living descendants to think of their relatives becoming a wandering ghost outside their home. Bai society has a bridge ritual which could bring the wandering ghosts back home and become ancestors. Bridging is to help the spirits of relatives in bad death to cross the family's threshold to become ancestors. They would ask the Buddhist in the village to build a bridge on the threshold to help the deceased relatives return home to become ancestors and enjoy the incense of the descendants.

The Buddhist would build a bridge after sending the dead's body off. The bridge is made up of three upturned backless benches across the family's threshold like an arch bridge. The legs of the benches label four white or green papers written upper golden bridge, middle silver bridge, lower iron bridge, and the ninth rank bridge. All the children kneel outside the threshold, crying loudly for their father or mother to come back home. At the same time, the eldest son put a measure for the grain loaded with corn, a mirror, a towel, a comb, and a white streamer above the bridge covered by a piece of white cloth and move toward as the Buddhist instruct him. With the Buddhist chanting and guiding, the ghosts would come across the bridge, get food and clean up, and finally become an ancestor of this family.

After the bridge ritual, villagers would ask a sorcerer or witch assess whether their wandering ghosts coming back home. If it did not succeed, they would build a bridge for a second or even third time until their wandering ghosts come home.

Although people sometimes died in the home, whether his spirits stay in home or not is unsure. A young man who worked in Kunming city fell into a coma and was sent to his home in Dali. After one day and night, he died in his own home. His mother fell into great grief and also worried about his son's spirit, for she thought that maybe his son's soul had been lost when he fell into a coma in Kunming and thus did not remain in their home. Therefore, they ask the Buddhist to hold a bridge ritual, and they felt a little comfort after that.

Besides, people also plead the king of hell for their relatives who died abnormally to ease their guilty. People believe the ruler of hell would show mercy to the ghosts on his birthday in lunar March 28th. The days from 27th to 29th in lunar March are also called Beggars' Day because there are hundreds of beggars and handicapped people who rely on begging gathering outside the Dongyue Temple in Dali. When Bai villagers bring incense, paper clothes, and money to the temple and cry for

their dead who died abnormally, they would also give beggars money and rice along the way. The temple is full of crying and grief because people think their ancestors are also suffering from pains and hungry like the beggars and the disabled.

Whether the dead are ancestors or ghosts to their descendants, depend on cultural definitions. The cultural view of a good death and bad death divides the deceased family members into ancestors and ghosts, which reflects the ideal individual in Bai that a man should be embedded in the family relationship and his house from birth to death. According to the ideal personality, people have to accept that their beloved could not become ancestors in their home. At the same time, Bai society allows people to hold a bridge ritual and bring the ghosts back home to be ancestors. Moreover, they can ask forgiveness of guilty for their ancestors who are not at home in places such as Jingwu Temple and Dongyue Temple, reflecting the flexible interaction between cultural frameworks and individual practices.

Becoming a Ghost to Hell in the Funeral

From the perspective of the family, people distinguish ancestors and ghosts. However, when it concerns the imagination of afterworld, they tend to mix ancestors with ghosts. In desire, villagers wish their dead to go to western heaven, while they thought them as ghosts to go to the hell in practice, which was also found by Hsu^[14].

As soon as an older man died in his eldest son's arms, people would take a series of religious activities to comfort both the dead and the living. From the time of death to the time of bringing out the coffin, the family would prepare the way for the deceased from the world of the living to the world of hell.

For the living, some people inform this event to their lineage and people in the same village group, and these people would extend their condolence and help hold the funeral before sending the dead off. At the same time, people help decorate a funeral space in the main hall of the house and take out the white linen from the coffin. In the following several days, the main hall is a place for the coffin and the mourning people.

In Bai villagers' view, when a man died, his spirit and soul still exist and would start a journey to hell. The day before sending the body off is time to send his spirit off. At about 18 o'clock after dinner, all the sons, daughters, nephews, and nieces are mourning for the dead and wearing white linen. They kneel before the coffin and a Buddhist guide them on how to behave. The Buddhist chant the funeral oration near the crossroad, a bridge, or a temple and shrine, with all the relatives kneeling down and women crying. It is to notify the gods of bridge and roads to open the way of the dead to the hell. At the same time, it provides a chance of rehearsing for the relatives to ensure that they may perform rightly in another day.

Regarding death as being arrested by servants in hell which is like a jail, people take measures to

[14] 许娘光 Francis L. K. Hsu,《祖荫下:中国乡村的亲属,人格与社会流动》Zu yin xia[Under the Ancestors' Shadow: Kinship, Personality, and Social Mobility in China],王芃 Wang peng 徐隆德 Xu Longde 译,(台北 Taipei:南天书局 Nantian shuju[South Company]),2001,135.

help their dead. With a handkerchief on the face of the dead, the son would plug a silver ingot into the jujube and then put it into the mouth of the dead because they think all the property of the dead would be plundered by the servants of the hell. With hidden silver ingot in the jujube in the mouth, the servant in the hell would not notice so that the dead man could keep some property. When the dead feel thirsty in the way to the netherworld, he could spit out the jujube and use the silver ingot to change a soup with Mengp'o who is a female pedlar in the netherworld. As soon as the dead drink the soup, he would forget all the things in the past.

Before going into hell, the dead would assure their family's memory for him. From the day of death to the day of sending coffin off, the immediate relatives of the dead would make rice porridge within the head of a pig, pettitoes, and chicken claw for the dead after midnight. The children of the dead would bring the rice porridge outside the gate and kneel crying for their mother or father, with burning joss sticks and paper money. There is a terrace in the hell from which the dead could see his house at last glance. When the dead see his sons and grandsons hold a rice porridge is crying for him, he would feel comforted.

To ensure the journey to hell, the relatives also prepare the luggage for the dead. It is a straw mat with the dead's daily necessities, such as clothes, shoes, wash supplies, pillow, cane, ashtray, etc. People would roll up it and put it in the threshold against the gate, with men's in right and women's in left. In the day of sending off the coffin, the sons in mourning would bring this luggage out and burn it in the place of farewell at about 4 a. m.

Except for the luggage, the family would make a bowl of rice called begging bowl for the dead as food in his way. The eldest grandson would take charge to hold the begging bowl in the funeral rite. Villagers said the dead would be hungry all the time without the begging bowl, "my uncle died of hungry in the 1960s, and we sent him off without the begging bowl because we were all short for food. After then, the witch told us that she saw this ancestor of us have no food every day. In west town, we are also told the same information about the hungry uncle by a wizard."

Besides, the eldest grandson also needs to hold a white streamer with the Chinese characters "Namah Amitabha the Western Heaven Guide Promotes the Body and Spirit of xxx" [南无阿弥陀佛 西方极乐世界接引导师提拔亡人 XX 之形魂]. Although it is written that the dead are going to the western heaven, villagers regard it as the pass to the hell, "the begging bowl is the food on the way, the straw luggage is for camping, and the streamer is the permit letter of introduction. If you are arrested by the servants in hell, you must have food, equipment, and the pass. If you do not have this three, you will become wandering ghosts." To prepare these three things is the responsibility of the relatives.

People send the coffin off in the day of divination after the feast at about 12—13 o'clock. As soon as the coffin is brought off, the eldest son would come back and walk three times around the hall, and then throw some coins backwards to send away the ghosts in the funeral hall. In the procession, the funeral band is in ahead, followed by the generation of grandsons holding colourful streamers, then the Tongjing Fellowship^[15] who are playing the music of lament, and after them are the man, the sons and nephews of the dead who bend over a piece of white linen tied with the coffin.

[15] A religious organization mainly consisted of older men in Bai society.

After the coffin is daughters-in-law, nieces-in-law, daughters, nieces and women villagers in sequence. The immediate women should cry louder to show their sorrow and love. In the way to the tomb, the sons-in-law and nephews would offer sacrifices on the route of the procession. In the place of the farewell, the immediate relatives and women go back to the funeral home while the other men help lift the coffin to the tomb. What's more, the relatives would bring meals to the tomb and burn the paper money for the dead for three days.

After sending coffin off, relatives would ask the Buddhist to chant for the dead the next day. In 12—13 o'clock, the men and women of the clan would go to the shrines to worship the local god. Because they think when a man died, he is going to see the local god and the local god would send the dead to the king of the hell. This day is also for commemorating and pacifying the soul of the dead in the house.

In the following lunar March or lunar October which is the month for worshipping the dead, the relatives should go to the cemetery to make a meal and dine with the dead just like he is alive. In the following first lunar June 13th, the clan would get together to burn some provisions for the dead and ask the Buddhist to chant for the dead and then go to worship the local gods. For three years the sons would live in mourning. And after that period, the sons would hold a ritual to get off the mourning. They would invite the clan and friends and ask the Buddhist to chant for the dead, with worshipping the local god in the afternoon. After this ritual, his mourning period is over, and he could go everywhere he wants. It's also a period that the dead is fading away from their living world and become a family's ancestor.

When a man died, people thought that he would have a journey leaving home for the hell and thus it is unpleasant but unavoidable. Except for preparation in the funeral, they would have to assure their dead that they would always provide and remember them after that. Through remembering activities, the deceased is not really departed with them and there are connections between the descendants and ancestors in hell.

Salvation From Living Family for Ghosts in the Netherworld

Regarding ancestors and ghosts as the same in the netherworld, people in the Bai village would provide and remember them in the same way. From 1st to 15th in lunar June, Bai people regard this half a month as ghosts' vocation in the hell and their ancestors would come back home during this time. In the morning of lunar June 1st, scriptures mother (jingmu) of Lotus Pond Fellowship would get together in the local shrines to chant the scriptures of opening the gate of the hell to help pick up their ancestors. At the same time, villagers in houses clean up the ancestral tablet and put it in the main hall with some offerings like fruits and flowers. In the evening of this day, every family in Chou village would make dinner for inviting their ancestors from hell to come into the home to spend holidays. Generally, the hostess of a family would bring the dinner outside the gate and kneel to invite ancestors, accompanying with the host and children burning incense sticks and paper money. They will call their ancestors name and welcome them to come back home.

Both the ancestors of good death and ghosts of bad death would be provided meals in the

following 14 days. The family would take every meal to ancestral tablet first, and then they begin to eat themselves. In every odd number evening (that is June 1st, June 3rd, June 5th, June 7th, June 9th, June 11th), the family would burn some paper clothes and paper money in the house calling their ancestors to come to get provisions. Besides, villagers also go outside the house and burn paper clothes and paper money for their relatives who could not enter the house for bad death and became the wandering ghosts. Just as an old man puts it, “if a family has some members who died outside the house, and the dead could not go back home and then become wandering ghosts. So from 1st to 15th in lunar June, the family would burn some paper money and paper clothes and bring some food for these ghosts outside the gate. Even though the ghosts did not belong to the family, we consider that maybe they belong to our neighbours or other families. So every family would burn the provision outside the gate even some family do not have members died outside the house. Just like a beggar come to our house, we would give some to him. If the dead could not come back to their home, they are very pitiful. We all would do like this.”

When concerning to distinction of one family's relatives who died outside their house and other family's ghosts, there are conflict behavior about provision. Some people would spread a circle with lime powder and then burn offerings inside it. They said it is to keep their ancestors of bad death from other ghosts to get the provisions. Some villagers are against these behaviours, “our ancestors are also ghosts and the line would not only block the other ghosts but also block our ancestors.” Almost in all rituals concerning ancestors worship, people would benefit the ancestors both inside and outside the house, and others' ancestors which could be called guests or ghosts.

When it comes to June 13th (for the dead from the last year to this year) and June 14th (for all ancestors) in lunar, villagers will not wander outside the house in the evening because the ancestors' vocation is over and it is time for them to come back to the hell. With so many provisions, they could not carry up and may catch somebody to help them. Therefore, villagers would stay at home or coming back home earlier than ever in case of being caught by other family's ancestors. If someone is tangled by the ghosts, he would lie in bed feeling cold and could not speak because his spirit and soul was caught to carry provisions. In this situation, people have to find a witch to call his soul back as soon.

Besides, people believe their ancestors or ghosts are suffering from punishment in hell. So they would help them to ease punishment by doing good deeds and pleading to the King of the Hell (yan wang ye). In the legends of hell, people who have no guilty would go to the western heaven and people who have guilty would be brought to hell to be on trial. In reality, villagers said there are no people who are good enough to go to heaven.

Therefore, people usually do not pray to their ancestors because ancestors are just ghosts which rely on the living family to provide them instead of bringing blessings. People tend to think there is no hotel and restaurant in the hell, and the dead may feel afraid and lonely, what they depend on are the living family's provisions and comfort.

In a word, ancestors and ghosts are regarded as the same in the public perspective, but different in people's relationship. On the one hand, people wish their loved ones who have departed to go to Western Heaven. With good intentions, the family members hold a series of rites to help the dead transforming into an ancestor. On the other hand, what they act in the ritual exposed that they

thought the deceased was going to the hell as a ghost. They pretend their loved ones to be in Heaven as ancestors, while they acted that their loved ones are in the hell as ghosts. In this sense, ancestors and ghosts are the same.

Family is not only a place that provides food and clothes regularly for ancestors but also a mediate for ancestors' salvation to the gods in hell. It sounds like through death, people leave the family to the jail instead of western heaven. Therefore, ghosts are also ancestors and ancestors are beggars; what they want are just food and clothes. If they have a perpetual family to provide them, they would be pacified; otherwise, they are beggars for another family.

Conclusion

The clarification and identity between ancestors and ghosts in Bai village illustrates ancestors are also under the shadow of culture which defines both the living world and afterworld. From the perspective of the family, one family's ancestors are another family's ghosts or guests and it is the family as dead's master that provide food and clothes to ascendants. Besides, whether the deceased is an ancestor or a ghost to one's family, depend on the death is good or not in Bai culture. Although people would still honour their relatives who died as bad death, they thought them as lonely and wild ghosts that need to transformation into real ancestors by bridge ritual. Nevertheless, a family is not only the harbour of the living but also the dependent of the dead. In regard to the netherworld, however, people mix their ancestors with ghosts in hell. In the funeral, they wish their ancestors go into western heaven in desire while they regard them as ghosts go to hell in practice. Through the provision and good deeds, the family could alleviate ancestors' suffering. The multi-dimension of ancestors in Bai village illuminates the contradictory attitudes toward death among the Bai and also in general Chinese culture.

中文题目:

祖先或鬼: 中国西南白族的死亡观

作者: 杨雪, 扬州大学社会发展学院, 讲师; 通讯地址: 江苏省扬州市邗江区四望亭路 180 号, 中国。电话: 18252729369, 电子邮件: graceyangxue@yeah.net

摘要: 相信去世亲人的灵魂存在并影响在世子孙, 是祖先崇拜信仰的基本观念。而在中国西南的大理白族村落, 当地人对亲人去世后成为“祖先”还是“鬼”的问题上态度暧昧。在社会关系方面, 人们从宗族和家庭角度区分了“祖先”与“鬼”; 在文化中, 人们根据死亡情况区分了家族中符合文化期待的“好的死亡”的“祖先”, 以及不符合文化理想而“死得不好”的“鬼”, 但后者仍可借助“搭桥”等仪式由“鬼”进入家庭成为“祖先”。在死后世界认知方面, 人们一方面希望自己的“祖先”前往“西天极乐世界”, 但在丧葬仪式中又将其看作“鬼”前往地狱受生前罪行的惩罚, 需要在世亲人在纪念仪式中供给衣食、积德减罪。白族村民对“祖先”与“鬼”的区分、转化与混同, 体现了中国西南白族的祖先崇拜不仅是一种礼仪表达, 也是理想人观的呈现, 并彰显出后世子孙对于“祖先”的救赎意义。

关键词: 祖先崇拜; 祖先; 鬼; 家庭; 白族;

The Cham ritual of Padmasambhava in Tibetan Buddhism

BAIMACUO, GELINLANGJIE

(Southwest Minzu University, Chengdu, Sichuan Province, P. R. China)

Abstract: This paper discusses the origins of Cham or ritual dance in Tibetan Buddhism, structure, and components of the Cham ritual of Pamasambhava. The first part of the paper explains the Cham ritual dedicated to Padmasambhava and its three main sections: the ritual of making offerings and reading scriptures; the performing of the ritual dances; and the empowerment of Padmasambhava, known as “Light of the Lotus”. The second part of the paper gives some details of the Padmasambhava Cham, which takes place on the ninth and tenth days of the eleven day ritual, with the Cham on the ninth day known as kya’cham and that on the following day as the dngos gzhi. The Padmasabhava Cham has eighteen parts and one of these parts has seventeen sub-sections, so all together there are thirty-seven parts performed on the tenth day.

Key Words: Cham; Ritual; Padmasambhava; Tibetan; Buddhism

Author: BAIMASCUO (Padma’tsho 白玛措) Ph. D. is a Professor at the Philosophy Department of Southwest Minzu University in Chengdu, China. Her areas of research and teaching include Tibetan Buddhism, ritual studies, gender issues, and Tibetan monasteries, and as well as the education of Buddhist nuns in Tibetan areas. This article is belong to the project of “The international impact of Tibetan Buddhism: a case studies of Ningma Lineage” (supported by the State of Social Sciences, 2016—2022-16BZJ014), and the project of “The main philosophical tenets of Ningmal” (supported by the Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities, Southwest Minzu University, Grant 2020PTJS03005). Email: tshopadma@hotmail.com; GELINLANGJIE (Geleg Namgyal 格林郎杰) MFA, is a faculty at the Arts Department of Southwest Minzu University in Chengdu, China. His area of research and teaching is minority arts and choreography. Yihuanlu nan siduan, Chengdu, Sichuan, China, 610041. Email: geleg1014@163.com.

The Cham or dance ritual dedicated to the Indian scholar Padmashambhava is performed nowadays on the tenth day of the sixth Tibetan month in almost all monasteries of the Nyingma school, and even in some monasteries of the Sa skya and Bka’ rgyud schools. It continues as a traditional ritual, but it has changed as compared to the original form, with additional sections added to incorporate new historical meanings.

Padmasambhava was an Indian Buddhist scholar, translator and practitioner in the eight century who was central in assimilating Buddhism deeply into Tibetan culture. As important as he may have been as a historical person in Tibetan culture, his significance is even greater in his role after death as he was transformed into a spiritual figure incarnated in statues, paintings, temples, rituals, and texts as a second Buddha, an incarnation of the Bodhisattva of compassion, Avalokitesvara, and an emanation of the Buddha Amitabha. One aspect of this cult of Padmasambhava is the sacred masked dances performed in Tibet each year in his honor.

The paper is based on Tibetan literature and on my own field work in Kathog in Eastern Tibet during the year of the monkey. It analyzes the origin of the ritual dance, the structure and significance of the ritual dance, and includes an illustration of the Cham ritual. I attempt to explain the reason, appearance and tradition of devotion to Padmasambhava through the Cham ritual as it is conducted at present.

The origin of the Cham ritual

The full name of the Cham ritual of Padmasambhava is “The Mask Dance on the 10th Day of the Festival of the Guru” (Gu ru tshes bcu dus chen gyi cham), since the festival is held from the first to the eleventh days of the fifth or sixth lunar months, while the formal Cham is performed on the tenth. Thus, while the ritual culminates on the tenth, it is in fact a lengthy process over many days.

Many people focus on just the formal part of the dances, and overlook the overall eleven-day process which is essential to fully understand the nature and function of this pan-Tibetan ritual.

There are three texts in particular which discuss which dates the devotional rituals for Padmasambhava should be performed. One is the Padma bka’ thang (莲花遗教), a gter ma or “revealed text” that was discovered by Au rgyan gling pa (邬金林巴), a gter ton or “treasure revealer” in the 14th century. The second is the Slob dpon chen po pad ma’ byung gnas kyi rnam thar pa gsal bar byed pa’i yi ge yid ches gsum ldan (《大阿闍黎莲花生传·三信具足》), written by Taranatha (多罗那他) in the 16th century. The third is the Phur ba rig gsum (三类金刚撅), a commentary within the Phur ‘grel’ bum nag (金刚撅释疏汇), said to have been composed by the consort of Padmasambhava, Ye-shes-tsho-rgyal (益西措嘉), in 8th century. It is also discussed in the Tshes bchu’i mdzad ba rjes dran (初十事业祈请纪念文) by the famous 19th century Nyingma scholar, ‘Ju mi pham’ jam byangs rnam rgyal rgya mtsho (局·麦彭降阳朗杰加错). In these accounts we find that the birthday of Padmasambhava is said to be the 10th day of the sixth lunar month. It is on this day each year that Nyingma monasteries celebrate “The Mask Dance on the 10th Day of the Festival of the Guru” as a way of commemorating the birthday and in order to make special prayers to Padmasambhava.

The same texts give Padmasambhava’s birth year as the wood monkey year, and as a result there is a particularly elaborate celebration that occurs every twelve years in the year of the monkey, with a more elaborate version every sixty years when the wood monkey year occurs. The celebration at Kathog Monastery in 2004 took place in a wood monkey year, and so was a special event witnessed only once every sixty years.

In general, Cham is referred to in Tibetan texts as rdo rje ’cham, or “Vajra Cham”, a phrase which signifies its tantric character. It is a form of ritual involving masked dance and is only found in Tibetan Buddhism. Its central part involves, on the inner or invisible level, a contemplative dance in which the dancer makes specific gestures that are referred to as rgya phyag or “symbolic seals”, known in Sanskrit as mudra, that represent the pure body, speech and mind of the dancer’s yid dam or tutelary deity in the tantric traditions. The dance, performed by monks, is described in these texts as having the goals of transferring negative emotions into the virtue of practice, and of transferring suffering and the cause of suffering into the cessation of suffering and path of Dharma, such that the

merit of happiness and wisdom is increased. In particular, these texts consider that these practices reveal the unification of samsara and nirvana, or the unity of appearance and emptiness.

Externally, the gestures and movements made by the masked and costumed dancers are considered to be rendering the purity of the Buddhas, the Bodhisattvas, and the tantric deities into visible form that can be perceived by the lay people who gather in great numbers each year to watch them. We can thus say that the Cham ritual displays or illustrates the deep meaning of the Dharma as understood in Tibetan Buddhism.

To explain the nature of the Cham ritual, I consulted a text entitled *Rdo rje gar 'cham gyi cho ga'i gtam ye shes rol ba'i rgyan ches bya ba bzhugs* (《智慧妙音——话金刚法舞仪规》^[1]) or “The Ornament of Wisdom Sound: Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance”, which was written by the treasure finder *gter ston'Jam dbyang dpal bzang* (伏藏师降央华让(—1554)). According to this text, there are eight important elements that make up the ritual: self-nature, interpretation, classification, function, analogy, scripture, practice and result. From these eight elements we can understand the meaning of the Cham.

The first one, *Ngo bo*^[2] means *rang gzhin* or “self-nature”, refers in this context to the central meaning or inherent nature of the ritual. According to my interpretation of the text, the Cham is a method to comprehend the unification of samsara and nirvana because ultimately all phenomena appear pure in their essence on both levels; from the perspective of complete or highest wisdom, they are unconditioned and ultimate. The ritual dance presents the particular perception of the tantric tradition; it unites the worldly life of samsara with the reality of nirvana to show the true meaning of tantric and the reality of the Pure Land, indicating that all lay people can acquire the capacity of wisdom.

Secondly, *Nges tshig*^[3] means *'grel bshad*, meaning “explanation” or “interpretation”, provides descriptions of the different postures or *rnam 'gyur* generally used in Tibetan forms of dance. The text lists nine of these, which, as in most dance literature, are categorized as “the nine splendid postures”: charming, martial, kind, brave, calm, ugly, horrible, laughing, and ferocious. The text also divides the main postures in the performance of the Cham into two categories: the *gar*, the posture of the hands, and the *'cham*, the posture of the feet. It explains that it was for this reason that the Vajra 'Cham used to be known as *gar 'cham*, abbreviated to *'cham*, or *rdo rje 'cham*.

In the Cham forms of Tibetan dance, it is explained that the postures and gestures of the dancers in a dance that is about a Buddha or Bodhisattva represent the body, speech and mind of that Buddha or Bodhisattva.

The third element or aspect *isdbyed ba*^[4] or “classification”, which is a discussion of the different types of ritual dance. Originally, there were two types, *Bka' ma* and *gter ma*. *Bka' ma*, literally “oral transmission”, refers, in the Nyingma tradition, to teachings or traditions from primary Buddhist tantric texts that have been passed on by word of mouth. This form of Cham is created on the basis of tantric texts such as the *Dpal ldan sgyu 'phrul dra ba rtsa ba'i rgyud* (《圣妙幻网根本

[1] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound: Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, 《智者妙音——话金刚法舞仪规史》降央华让大师生著, By'Jam dbyang dpal bzang, 白玉寺藏书(以下相同).

[2] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound: Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p28.

[3] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound: Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, 'Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p28-29.

[4] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound: Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, 'Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p29.

续)), the Dpal ldan sgyu 'phrul dra ba rtsa ba'i bshad rgyud (《圣妙幻网疏续》), the 'Jig rten 'das mdo (《世间解脱经》) or the He ru rgyal po (《甚要黑若嘎》), which were transmitted by Skal ldan rgyal po dza (尕丹嘉波扎) to four masters who were said to have had understanding of "illusory emanation" (sgyu 'phrul 幻网). They in turn established rules for the dance practices and passed them on successively to the seventeenth century translator Ao rgyan smin grol gling du lo tswa ba dharma shris ras (乌金梅卓林的达玛希日(1654—1718)). That translator then created the Khrag 'tung he ru ka'i rtsa ba rdo rje'i gar 'chams (愤怒尊黑鲁嘎根本金刚法舞) or "the Cham dance of the Vajra root of the blood-drinking Heruka", which includes the practice of dgra po'i phrin las (愤怒事业) or "the activities of the wrathful", a way of illustrating the action known as "vanquishing and defeating" (dgra bgegs bsgral ba 降服). The cutting up of the gling ga or effigy found in many current versions of Cham also comes from this tradition, and was included in a contemporary performance at Kathog. According to other tantric texts such as the Dpal sangs rgyas mnyam sbyor (《等合佛》) and the Zla gsang tig le sogs kyi dgongs pa kun mkhyen rong zam pa chen po (《月密心要之遍知大桥》) established the Cham of the Ra to bcu drug ge mchod gar (十六供养天女荟贡). At Kathog, there are the Cham of Gtum rngam of the diety Heruka, the Cham of Tshogs las and 'Jam dpal phyag rgyas zil gnon of cutting the gling ga are also performed^[5]. These versions of Cham come from the Bka' ma, or oral transmission.

The other type of Cham is created on the basis of gter ma or "hidden treasure". The ritual of the Padmasambhava Cham was created by Gu ru chos dbang (1212—1273) and then developed two traditions: the Zhwa nag ma or "black hat" version and the Rta dkar ma or "white horse" version^[6]. The former is an extended version of the Tshe bcu yi Cham which was first performed at the monastery of Sne'u gdong rtse near Lhasa and then transmitted to the Kham area, and specifically to the monastery of Dpal yul by Kun mkhyen Chos kyi 'byung gnas. The Rta dkar ma tradition is based on a compressed version which was performed for the first time at the monastery of Thub bstan rdo rje brag, and then brought to Kathog by Mi bskyod rdo rje.

The fourth element, dgos ched or "function"^[7], refers to the actions performed in the course of the Cham. In his history of Cham, the treasure finder Gter ston' Jam dbyang dpal bzang wrote that "All sentient beings have the three pure doors of the true nature of the mind (Tathāgatagarba), just as sesame itself has oil. Thus the Vajra Cham unifies the object, the method, and the result of purification." According to the explanation given in the text, the object of purification is the impure person who "owns" attachment to desire, and who holds "I and my" in their hands with clinging quality of the ego (bdag'dzen); the path of purification is the body, speech and mind of the wisdom of the yidam, and the result of purification is the perfect accumulation of positive karma and wisdom in the present moment. Thus, appearance the visual forms of phenomena and action are the mudra of the yidam; the sound and words are the speech of the Yidam. According to 'Jam dbyang dpal bzang, in the Vajra Cham the fundamental viewpoint is the meditative realization that samsara and nirvana are one, while the action is the meditative realization that the mudra, the sound and the pure view become one.

[5] Baimacuo 白玛措, A study on the devotional practice of Padmasambhava in Tibetan Buddhism 《藏传佛教莲花生信仰研究》, Tibetan Publishing House, Beijing, 2007, p159, p167-168

[6] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound; Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, 'Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p29.

[7] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound; Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, 'Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p30-31.

The fifth element is *dpe* or analogy^[8], a number of which are offered to explain different practices within the Cham. The posture assumed by the Yidam in the Cham is compared to that of a king being welcomed by his subjects. When we see the retinue of the Yidam in the dance section known as the or “dance of the retinue”, the dancers are said to represent the ‘*khor gyi*’ ‘chams attendants of a king who move around him “like the graceful twinkling of lights”. In the section known as the “dance of the messengers”, the performers are like soldiers arriving at the front with fierce and angry emotions; in the offering cham, they are like the daughters of the Yidam dancing with a graceful and slender posture. The others are described as being like a roc circling in the sky, lions shaking their manes, tigers roaring in the forest, and powerful eagles spreading their wings. The dancers’ chests are described as symbolizing the four great continents of every world, their waistlines are like spinning wheels, and their feet are supple like cotton and leaves.

The sixth aspect, *lung* or text^[9], refers to explanations of the Vajra Cham that can be found in texts from the Bka’ ma tradition. The three texts cited by ‘Jam dbyang dpal bzang are the Thabs kyi zhags ba’i rgyud, the Dpal gsang ba’i snying bo and the Ye shes rngams glog. These are used to demonstrate the nature of cham in the Bka’ ma texts.

In the Thabs kyi zhags ba’i rgyud, it is said that performance of the mudras, and the assumption of the brave and fierce postures should be understood as being those of a person who is liberated from the three realms, who is certain to succeed in practice, and who will obtain enlightenment as a Buddha. The Dpal gsang ba’i snying bo is cited as saying that the words and sounds used in the ritual are similar to those of a wonderful offering, while; the mudras and the physical postures of the performers are the same as the achievement of the highest and most ferocious Yidam; the chanting is the same as the successful achievement of the practice of Dharma. As for the Ye shes rngams glog, it is quoted to say that all the mudras and postures in Cham are to be understood as forms of liberation from the three realms, and that the dance performers should give the impression of floating free in the sky without obstacles. The actions of the Cham, the “Dharmamudra” or “gesture of Dharma”, are described as the best form of practice of liberation from the three realms and of achieving Buddhahood and other attainments, just as poison can be used in medicine to destroy poison. The Cham of Padmasambhava is also a practice which follows the theory and the teaching of the Buddha, and which in its mudras, postures and sounds show the body, speech and mind of the Yidam, and is the best way to practice the Dharma.

‘Jam dbyang dpal bzang’s discussion of practice, the seventh element which is *dnegos gzhi lag len*^[10], gives details about the practical implementation of the Cham, in particular those relating to the performance space and to the performer. The space used for the dance must be flat and formal. The performer or actor should be an adept, with perfect understanding, the view of the unification of samsara and nirvana, and with knowledge and action that are distinguished from those of an ordinary person. In the performance, the adept reveals the mandala of the Yidam, which means he achieves the pure body, speech, and mind of the true nature mind of Yidam. Performers are divided into three

[8] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound; Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, ‘Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p31

[9] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound; Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, ‘Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p31-32

[10] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound; Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, ‘Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p32-33.

levels of ability and capacity^[11]. Those with the highest capacity have actions and postures as pure as those of a Yidam; they have the view and confidence of the nature of the Cham. Those who are of middling ability have grasped the facts relating to the Cham and have practiced and meditated on the mudra of the Yidam, so that they are able to understand the three doors and the nature of samsara and nirvana. Those of inferior understanding and weak ability use the Cham to gain profit, which inevitably results in damage to the real meaning, purpose and nature of the Cham ritual.

Practical instructions are also given in the text on the how the dance should be performed. Here, the standard advice about dance is given, the head should be held firmly, the steps should show peace and happiness, and so on. There are thirteen demands of a performer, with three principal aspects: first, the posture of the upper body should be upright and unafraid, the waist should spin, the feet should be lithe, and the legs and arms should be fluid. Secondly, movements of the arms towards the inside, should avoid beating the chest while motions in an outward direction should show strength and control like wielding a horse whip. Third, the performance of the Cham should follow the way defined by the master and the performers should not draw upon their own interpretations.

The last of the eight elements, the 'bras bu or result^[12], expounds upon the fruit of the Cham. Results are divided into two—those that can be proven from tantric texts and those that can be deduced from treasure texts. Those from the first category claim that even a single posture embodying the wisdom of Yidams in the Cham performance will bring liberation from the three realms if completed as a form of offering, and many forms of communal karma are easy to mature and ripen. By completing the posture we can remove suffering from our body and can purify the impure body, bring the Dharmakaya body to maturity, and we can achieve the Vajrapani result in the inner energy, the Bodhicitta mind, in the central wisdom channel.

In another text in the Bka' ma tradition, the Mdo dgongs'dus (集经) it is said that reliance on the six postures will free sentient beings from the six types of being, while reliance on the six songs and literal will liberate one from the six consciousnesses, the six senses and sense-objects. In the Lama dgongs'dus (上师开许集经), a text from the treasure tradition, it is written that "if the postures of the Vajra Cham are performed according to the teaching of the yogis, then all will receive the blessing of the Yidam and gather the Wisdom Dakinis in order to increase power and merit."^[13] Many other treasure texts, like the Lam dgongs'dus, claim that the Vajra Cham will improve one's good karma in this world. The masters created the Vajra Cham to reveal and practice the meaning of Dharma as well as to pray to the Buddha, the Bodhisattvas, the Yidams, the Wisdom Dakinis and the protectors to bless and protect sentient beings, to achieve good karmic results and to increase worldly merit.

The Cham ritual of Padmasambhava, the Gu ru tshes bcu dus chen gyi cham, (初十莲师羌姆法会) is an example of Cham which can be understood in terms of these eight important elements. It has been carried on from generation to generation and allows us an opportunity to carry out research into the nature of Cham, and the Bka' ma and Gter ma texts allow us a glimpse into the origins of this ritual.

[11] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound; Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, 'Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p32.

[12] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound; Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, 'Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p34.

[13] The Ornament of Wisdom Sound; Explaining the Ritual of the Vajra Dance, 'Jam dbyang dpal bzang, p34.

The structure of the Padmasambhava Cham ritual

The structure of the Cham ritual of Padmasambhava, the Gu ru tshes bcu festival, involves two key structural elements: space and time. In terms of space, the ritual is conducted both inside and outside the main hall of the temple: the main offerings, the construction of the mandala, and the reading of texts are conducted inside the main hall, while the ritual dance and the dbang or empowerment are conducted outside. In terms of time, the ritual is divided under four phases: six days for the ritual offering, two days for the textual reading, two days for the actual Cham, and one day for the empowerment. These spatial and temporal aspects unite to constitute the form of the ritual. Within the ritual itself, there are the four main components: the tshogs- mchod (the ritual of offering), reading the text of Bla ma gsang ' dus, the Vajra Cham, and the Padmasambhava empowerment known as Padma 'od 'bar or “the light of the lotus”.

1. The offering ritual

The prayers to Padmasambhava include primarily a special offering ritual named tshogs mchod, which literally means “the offering of groups”. It is also called the gu ru cho ga or “Guru ritual” and is held over the first six days.

Its inner meaning stems from it being a ritual practice based upon the three bodies or forms of the Buddha. The three bodies need to be understood from two perspectives. The first is based on the general Mahayana principle of the Buddha's three bodies—usually called the Dharmakaya, the Sambhogakaya, and the Nirmanakaya, which refer respectively to the Buddha's inner realization of the nature of reality, his splendid manifestations in the pure lands, and his historical emanations in the world in various forms to assist sentient beings.

The second perspective is based on tantric practice, which identifies the three bodies with the three doors (sgo gsum) of existence—body, speech and mind. In one treasure text, Padmasambhava is described as saying that these three can be contemplated through the three tantric roots^[14]—the teacher or bla ma, the tutelary deity or Yidam, and the female spirit or Dakini. Specific images or objects that represented these three tantric roots are placed in the Cham mandala, and offerings are made to them.

During the ritual in Kathog, two important mandalas were constructed, one in the assembly hall of the monastery and one in the nearby bshad grwa or institute attached to the monastery. The mandalas are not painted by sand but were created by the placement of various offering items, small mandalas, the images of three roots, and a canopy or parasol (gdugs) on the top of the mandala. The mandala is three-dimensional and made up of four squares, each one smaller than the one below. Zhal zas or offerings of sweets, biscuits and fruit are placed on the first and second squares, and a sman gdor or offering cake, and an arrangement of purified water and butter shaped into petals, are placed on the third level. The three images representing the Lama, the Yidam and the Dakini are placed on the fourth level, and the multi-colored canopy is placed on the top.

There are two traditions for representing the three roots, one associated with the monastery of Rdo rje brag and the other with Smin grol gling; the practice at Kathog belongs to the former kind,

[14] The three tantric roots is the practice of Rtswa gsum (རྩ་མཚན་གྱི་རྩ་གསུམ་三根本合修法).

while at Dpal yul, the monks follow the Smin grol gling practice. At Kathog, the representation was in the form of a small stupa made from barley flour and decorated with petals and cloud designs made from butter. The Lama is shown by a jewel on a lotus, the Yidam by a vajra on a lotus, and the Dakini by a half-vajra on a knife shaped like a half-moon. In the mandala, the symbol of the Yidam is placed in the middle, with the Lama to its right and the Dakini on its left.

2. Reading the scripture of Bla ma gsang 'dus

After these six days of the offering ceremony, there are two days for reading the text known as the Bla ma gsang 'dus or “the Secret Assembly of Lamas”. At Kathog, monks started reading at seven in the morning and continued until six each night. It takes three hours to read the whole text once through. Following the three-hour chanting of the scripture, the ritual master (chog dpon) and ritual master assistant (chog dpon gyon pa) take the vajra (rdo rje), the ritual dagger (phur ba) and a small black triangular cloth for use in cutting the effigy (gling ga). The effigy is dealt with in a kind of fire ritual (homa, 护摩), in which the external act of destroying it signifies using wisdom to destroy one's own internal afflictions and demonic curses, according to the text. Monks with whom I spoke at Kathog also told me that the gling ga symbolizes afflictions, evil, and demons.

The text claims that if the body, speech, and mind of a person involved in the prayers are completely pure, then the corresponding actions of the ceremony will be pure, and all afflictions and curses will be eliminated.

After cutting the Ling-ka with the vajra, the dagger and a ritual sword with a vajra on its hilt, the two monks offer the food to the Buddha, the Bodhisattvas, the Yidams and the Lama (Padmasambhava). Then they give the food and drink to the protector of the world and of the beyond. At the end of the ritual of Bla ma gsang 'dus, which takes place in the hall, a Lama who that year has been awarded the status of Khan po recites a speech in praise of the great 19th century Nyingma scholar, 'Ju mi pham'jam dbyangs rnam rgyal rga mtsho. I was told that this is a tradition at Kathog, with the speech delivered each year by a newly appointed Khanpo during the Gu ru tshe bcu ritual.

3. The Vajra Cham of Padmasambhava

After these initial eight days of ritual preparation, the Cham of Padmasambhava is performed. The Cham lasts two days and takes place, on the ninth and tenth days of the overall ritual.

These sacred dances have been traditionally performed in Nyingma monasteries since the thirteenth century. Since it was first created by Gu ru chos dbang in the thirteenth century, two main performance styles of the Padmasambhava Cham have evolved, as we noted before, called the “black hat” (zhwa nag ma) and the “white horse” (rta dkar ma) forms, based respectively on, the monastic practices at Smin grol gling and Rdo rje brag. The style described here is the white horse form from Rdo rje brag Monastery. A detailed explanation of the rta dkar ma form of the Cham will be given later in the paper (see section part III).

4. The empowerment of Padmasambhava

The dbang or empowerment of Padmasambhava is given on the last day outside the hall, in the same place where the Cham will be performed later. It follows a text known as the Gu ru pad ma 'od'bar dbang chen, or the “Great empowerment of the light shining from the Lotus Guru”, a treasure text revealed by Rin'dzin glung gсар snying po (1625—1692), and is one of many tantric empowerments that can be given as part of rituals relating to Padmasambhava.

The empowerment is required, according to the text, for a practitioner who wishes to go on to “creation stage” (skyes rim), or to the “perfection stage” (rdzogs rim) practices. If he or she has meditated on and visualized Padmasambhava before, the empowerment will lead to ’bras bu or “results”, and to what are called the “four empowerments”,^[15] or, if he or she has not yet done so, they will “plant the seed of good affinities”.

In terms of most ordinary Tibetans who come and receive the empowerment, the perceived benefit is related to his or her wishes and to their future rebirths, for which they seek protection and happiness from Padmasambhava and from the sprul sku or reincarnated Lama; the “inner” or esoteric meanings of the empowerment are probably not known to the lay followers.

In 2004, there were about four thousand monks and believers who received the empowerment outside the assembly hall. About six thousand other people stood in line along the mountain road leading up the mountain to the monastery. Each year, the sprul sku who gives the empowerment is assisted by a different group of Lamas (the term here refers to those monks who have completed the three year retreat, as well as those who are recognized as sprul sku). In 2004, the empowerment was given by a sprul sku from Yunnan, while a group of four monks carried a box containing artifacts left by Kathog su du rin po che and a canopy or parasol. Other monks carried a bell (dril bu), texts, a small statue of the Buddha, a vajra, a phurba and a vessel (bum pa). After giving the Empowerment in the main area outside the assembly hall, the group of Lamas and monks went by car to the end of the line half way down the mountain and gave the empowerment to the lay believers one by one. This took five hours. After that, the ten thousand devotees disappeared and Kathog monastery regained its ordinary air of calm and tranquility.

The Basic Structure of the Vajra Cham of Padmasambhava

Generally there are two forms of this Cham: the skya ’cham and the dngos gzhi. The first is performed without masks and without costumes; the dngos gzhi is the formal performance of the Cham, in which masks and costumes are worn. The masked dance lasts two days, with the skya ’cham performed on the first day and the dngos gzhi on the second day. Much of the performance is the same on each of the two days, but at Kathog 16 sections were shown on the first day, which is seen as a preparation for the full performance of the 36 sections on the second day. The performers on the first day, without masks or costumes, show great concentration and a serious demeanor in order to demonstrate the purity of the “three doors” and the appropriate state of mind and spirit.

The Cham of Padmasambhava has eighteen sections, with one section having eighteen sub-sections. Rather than describe each section, I divide the Cham into four key phases in order to point out the general principles of the dance. As with most forms of Cham, there are four main parts of the liturgy: first, the marking and cleansing of the place and the making of the offering; secondly, the Cham of the

[15] The four Empowerments are the Empowerment of body, speech, mind, and precious word. There are different functions and benefits for each of them, such as sku dbang to achieve the ability of influence and accomplish the reincarnation body; gsang dbang to gain the capacity to explain the Dharma and the power of vanquishing and defeating; tig dngang to receive the sman ngag of mind from Padmasambhava; and tshig dngang to plant the seed of achievement of Buddhahood and the complete wisdom (the “wisdom of Dharmadatu”) through the “Great Perfection” (rdzogs pa chen po) prac

protectors; thirdly, that of the two forms of the Yi-dam; and fourthly, the Cham of the Lama. The historical and cultural sections and the songs of the villagers can be counted as a fifth part^[16].

1. Marking and cleansing the site of the Cham and making the offering

Religious dance in Tibetan Buddhism has the function of purifying the worldly realm. Before the main part of the Cham begins, in order to invite and welcome the Yi-dams, the Lama and the protectors into the performance area, it is considered necessary to purify that space and to give offerings to them. The performers use the “mudra of the Yidams”, a set of gestures and postures, to do this symbolically. Four of the 18 sections of the Padmasambhava section belong to this part of the ceremony. The first is the Cham of the Funeral Grounds (dur khro 尸陀林), which features performers with skeleton masks who symbolically cleanse or purify the space. Second is the Cham of the Drink-Offering or Libation (gser skyems 饮甘露舞), performed by ten monks wearing golden hats with peacock feathers and holding vajra daggers (phur ba 厥) and skull bowls (thod pa 头骨碗) to offer the “nectar” (bdud rtsi) the Yidams. This is followed by the Cham of Marking Boundaries (mtshams gcod 断魔除障), which is performed by fifteen monks representing other-worldly protectors (‘jig rten pa’i srung ma 世间护法), wearing black masks with dark hair and skulls on the crest of the mask; these masks ensure that all wishes will be satisfied, and signify that these protectors are full of wisdom. The purpose of this part is to remove all the obstacles from the performance space and to expel any demons from the area so as to properly welcome the Buddha, the Bodhisattvas and Padmasambhava. The performers wield daggers to show their fierce and courageous nature. Before the end of this Cham, after the purification procedure has been completed, other monks mark out the dance area by drawing a line of flour on the ground. The fourth of these sections is called “the Cham of the Lion’s Roar” (seng ge sgra sgrog 狮子吼). It is performed by fourteen monks wearing the wrathful masks with red hair ornamented with white skulls, who wield daggers and vajras. It represents the use of the Dharma to purify the minds of people and to arouse the correct viewpoint. These four Cham sequences purify the space and delineate it, and at the same time purify people’s minds and clear up their unconventional opinions.

2. The Cham of the Protectors

The concept of “protection” has a long history in Buddhism. For example, in the Sutra of Infinite Life (无量寿经) and the Abhidharmakosa-sastra (阿毗达磨俱舍论), protection has two meanings: specifically, to shield and maintain positive ways of practice for particular practitioners and more generally, to support and endorse the teachings of the Buddha.

In Tibetan religion, the notion of “protectors” underwent a major expansion, as a whole new set of spiritual figures were classified into two kinds of protectors: the worldly protectors and the transcendent protectors. The transcendent protectors are understood to be liberated from Samsara, and thus are seen as possessing great compassion and wisdom. The worldly protectors reside within the world of sentient beings and among local people and places, and offer protection for their daily life and religious practice.^[17]

[16] Padma'tsho (Baimacuo), A Study on the Devotional Practice of Padmasambhava in Tibetan Culture. Tibetan Publishing House, Beijing, 2007. 147-190

[17] Padma'tsho (Baimacuo), The Structure of Guru Vcham Ritual of Kathog Monastery in the Kham Area, China Tibetology, CSSCI, Beijing, No. 1, 2014, 138-144.

In the Padmasambhava Cham, there are five sections that each deal with one or other of these two forms of protection. The first one is called the Cham of the Four Doors (sgo bzhi 四护法), referring to the four protectors at the door of the mandala; this relates to the worldly protectors of the Cham. It is performed by four monks who wear red masks and carry vajras and skull bowls. They come to the site of the Cham and spinning quickly to the sounds of horn, drums and the chanting of the monks, reveal their power to protect the Dharma and its practitioners.

The second of these five sections is the Cham of the Transcendent Protectors ('jig rten las 'das pa'i srung ma 出世间护法). The performers in this Cham have two aspects, calm and fierce, representing protectors who have passed beyond this world and been liberated from Samsara. This Cham includes within it the Cham of Keng chen bcu drug (骨骼护法), which is performed by twelve monks wearing masks with white skulls on their crests, who are divided into two groups to dance. This sequence has two procedures: first, the twelve monks walk around an edifice made of wood, with three floors, that is placed beside the performance area to symbolize the bzang mdo dpal ri or palace of Padmasambhava. Then they dance in the main area, running around the performance space. At this point in the Cham, lay members of the audience light firecrackers, creating much excitement in the crowd.

The third of the protector section is the Cham of Bskul pa (激励护法), which is performed by ten monks wearing hats with peacock feathers, copper mirrors, and colored streamers. These indicate that their minds are bright and can dispel the blindness of the people, and that protectors belong to the Transcendent Protectors, and use their wisdom to confront depravity and overcome evil. The peacock feathers signify the cleansing of poisons and symbolize purity and calm.

The Cham of Bsgral pa (救度护法) is then performed by eight monks in fierce red masks, indicating that they are Transcendent Protectors who save human beings from suffering, bring them to the pure place of the Buddha and the Bodhisattvas, open their minds to unconventional ideas and opinions, and enlighten them with the truth. It is followed by the Cham of Lhag ma (拉麻) or "residue", a term which refers to the concept that all the deities of the four directions share the remaining evil body^[18]. It is performed by two monks in wrathful masks, one red, the other blue, whose intricate movements represent the two emanation bodies of each of the 28 deities in each of the four directions, a total of 112. At Kathog the two dancer-deities offered the nectar made from the remains of the body, that is considered evil but which was in principle originally pure, to all four directions' deities. This Cham completes the protection part of the Padmasambhava ritual.

3. The Cham of the Yidams

In the Tibetan dictionary, the *Dung dkar tshig mdzod chen mo* (2002), "Yidam" (本尊) is defined as the main tutelary deity or meditative deity assigned to an individual practitioner as the focus of their contemplative practice and devotion. These can be peaceful or wrathful manifestations of the Buddha. The first syllable means mind or consciousness (yid), while the second means to manage or administer (as in *dam skyong*) or to restrict (*dam bsgrags*). Thus the Yidam is understood as not simply an external deity, but as a revelation of internal Buddhahood. So the masked dance of the Yidam is centrally about the posture and seals or mudras of the pure body, speech, and mind of the

[18] The remaining evil body means the remaining body of effigy (gling ga) which symbolizes afflictions and obstacles.

Buddha. There may be a different view for most lay people, for whom the Cham is principally a performance in which the deities and protectors attend symbolically to them personally there and then, and at which the act of witnessing the masked dances is believed to clear up negative karmic effects and to bring them merit and success.

The Cham of the Yidams (Yidam 'cham) has two main sections, one which features the Yidams themselves, in both peaceful and fierce forms, and one which features the retinue of the Yidams. In the Padmasambhava Cham, each of them has five sub-sections or subsidiary Chams.

(1) The Cham of Yidams. Firstly, the Cham of the Yidams themselves, which starts with the Cham of Descent of Blessings (byin 'bebs 欣拔) and shows the Yidams in their peaceful aspect. Performed by 13 monk-dancers wearing hats with images of the five Buddhas, this Cham symbolizes the wise Buddha coming to give blessings and to eradicate the cause of the suffering that afflicts all sentient beings. It is followed by the Cham of Gtum rngam (忿怒尊), a representation of the Yidams in wrathful form, performed by twenty monks who represent Yidams and wear gold, red and blue masks. They take vajras and skull bowls and slowly revolve around the altar-stage. This part is taken from the Buddhist text^[19], and refers to an account of a ferocious Yidam, led by Heruka who methodically conquered evil in a majestic way.

The third of these dances is the Cham of Tshogs las (施身法舞), which is performed by 12 monks wearing fierce red masks and holding the vajra and skull bowls. This represents the offering of their own bodies to show compassion, revealing that a pure and kind mind is the most important element in practice, and helping to arouse the notion of Bodhicitta. During this Cham, a gling ga is cut up by Cham dpan, the main Yidam. The last of these five dances, the Cham of 'Jam dpal phyag rgyas zil gnon (文殊胜印法舞) or "Suppressed by the Mudra of Manjushri", is then performed by 29 monks wearing golden masks and wielding vajras and skull bowls, representing twenty-nine Yidams and protectors, as well as the Bodhisattva Manjusri and his consorts, and the Five dhyani Buddhas and their consorts, among others. This dance includes members of the Yidams' retinues wearing animal masks. They are described as using a fierce demeanor to remove evil, defend the rule and the truth, emanating in many forms to protect the Dharma and its practitioners.

(2) The Cham of the Yidams' Retinue. The second group of dances in this section of the ritual is known as the Cham of the Yidams' 'khor ba (眷属) or retinue. It includes the Cham of Rlung'tshub gnyis (两旋风) or "two whirlwinds", which is performed by two monks wearing fierce masks. Its meaning is similar to that of the Dgu bskor gnyis (十八圈^[20]), but the image of the whirlwind further reinforces the idea of upholding justice and dispelling evil spirits through its ability to revolve and sweep away all evil. It is followed by the Cham of Shwa gyag gnyis (鹿牛二者) or "both cow and deer" is then performed by a performer wearing a deer's head mask and one with a bull's head mask to symbolize the power and force of the retinue of the Yidams. In Bon monasteries this Cham is also performed, but it shows a protector of Tsan^[21] coming to the worldly protector to educate people not to kill.

[19] Buddhist text is the Bka' ma text, or oral transmission, which discussed in the part I of this article.

[20] Padma'tsho (Baimacuo), A Study on the Devotional Practice of Padmasambhava in Tibetan Culture, Tibetan Publishing House, Beijing, 2007, 162.

[21] Baimacuo, The Presentation of Bon Cham Ritual of Songpan, Collected Papers of Research on National Religious Studies, Edited by Chengyuping, Sichuan Minzu Publishing House, July 2003, 79-86.

4. The Cham of the Lama

The word Lama, as in the phrase bla la med pa, means incomparable, the excellent one or the supreme one. Generally, a Lama describes a lam ston mkhan, one who can lead the way to truth. In the ritual of Gu ru tshes bcu, this incomparable guide is Padmasambhava, the focal point of the ritual, as opposed to the skya'chams or dances performed on the first day' of the Cham.

In the Padmasambhava Cham, the Cham of the Lama is composed of eighteen subsidiary sections or dances. These can be divided into three parts: the Cham of the eight manifestations of Padmasambhava, the Cham of the five dhyani Buddhas and their consorts, and the Cham that tells history including debates and villagers' songs.

The first of these, the Cham of the eight manifestations of Padmasambhava, reflects the achievements of Padmasambhava and shows the function or nature of each manifestation through the performer's appearance and the instruments he holds. For example, the Cham of Gu ru nyi ma'od zer or "The Sunlight of the Guru" is performed by one monk wearing a fierce mask with a hat adorned with five skulls, holding the kha Tam (trident) and a bronze mirror. It refers to a story about Padmasambhava confronting some non-Buddhists who were in their way to sell alcohol: Padmasambhava blocked their way and drank their five hundred buckets of alcohol in one second. When they asked him to pay them, said he replied that he would repay them at sunset, but then, assuming the aspect of He rug ga (hakrasamvara), he then held the sun stationary for seven days and seven nights in order to convince the non-Buddhists convert. The dance is intended to represent the compassion and wisdom of the Guru, his love for sentient beings and his determination to remove their ignorance and to accomplish unselfish actions.

Another of the subsidiary dances in this sequence is the Cham of Gu ru seng ge sgra sgrogs, the "manifestation of the Lion's Roar of the Lama". This is performed by two performers holding vajras and skull bowls. It symbolizes Padmasambhava's ability, like a as the howling lion, to convert non-Buddhists and demons and to educate and liberate all sentient beings who are caught in the cycle of existence. The Cham of the Five Dpal bo (Dakas) and Dpal mo (Dakinis), their consorts shows the importance of the practice of understanding the role of the five dhyani Buddhas and their consorts, a practice which is seen as having been passed on by Padmasambhava to his students for them to inherit. Again, for most lay Tibetan the main meaning of this Cham series would be that it shows that Padmasambhava has come to that place and has given blessings to the believers.

This completes the four main sequences of the Padmasambhava Cham—those of cleansing and offering, of the protectors, of the Yidams, and of the Lama. Within these four sections there are specific dances, each of which has to be studied in each version of the ritual. We might find, for example, that there is no Cham of the Lama in the Cham of the Yul lha or local deities, but one will always find the Cham of marking and cleansing the performance area, the Cham of the Protectors, and the Cham of the Yidams. The Cham of the Lama is unique to certain rituals and is performed at certain monasteries and at certain times.

5. Other Sections: Historical and cultural sequences of the Cham

As we have seen, 'Jam dbyang dpal bzang maintained that the Cham is derived from Buddhist sutras and from treasure texts. But changes in culture in more recent times have led to changes in the Cham, including the addition of some new content, an increase in the importance of the role of history

and the results of increased contact between Han Chinese and Tibetans. So now the Padmasambhava Cham has a third origin; that of local history and culture. This can be seen in from the Cham of the Lama in this version of the ritual; it includes the Cham of Chos rtsod (辩经) or “religious debate”, which refers to the particular form of Buddhist study in the Tibetan monastic tradition and reflects its cultural significance. The other Cham is Rtsal rtse (杂技) or “acrobatics”, and Rgya dpon (清朝官员表演) or “Qing dynastic officers show”, which reflects the extent of cultural exchange and interaction in local history. Another Cham, called Tshogs glu or “group song”, includes a villager who sings folk songs in praise of Padmasambhava and of the tenth day of the festival.

At the end of the Padmasambhava Cham, all the monks, nuns and many of the lay believers follow a group of monks who take different instruments to complete one cycle of the Bzang mdo dpal ri palace. They then return to the performance area and walk as a Nor bu dga' 'khyil ^[22] design, an auspicious sign that represents the fulfillment of happiness and wealth, as well as symbolizing impermanence and transformation. The entire day-long Cham finishes with the nor bu dga' khyil amid the sound of the Tibetan horn and the blowing of conches.

Conclusion

The Padmasambhava dance ritual can be seen in terms of its religious function or as a social process. As a belief system, it is a process in which relationships are constructed within the community and within the religion; the performance of the ritual creates a relationship between the ritual and the believers; and between believers and Padmasambhava, the Buddha and the Bodhisattvas. At the same time new relations are formed between lay people and the monastic community, with on the one hand lay people achieving satisfaction of some sort as a result of the ritual and on the other hand, with the monastic community transforming the function of religion. All of these relationships are achieved through the process of ritual and within the belief system.

These are aspects of belief in Padmasambhava are conveyed or achieved in the Cham through a series of signs, actions and objects. First, the ritual of offering and the Cham link Padmasambhava to the believers at the same time as achieving the transmission of meaning and power, in the Buddhist sense. The Cham and the ritual process structure a precise system of belief and communication, a clear hierarchy from the ritual practitioners to Padmasambhava, and through him to the Buddha and the Bodhisattvas, and through them to the community of Tibetans or other believers.

The ritual practitioners include a reincarnated Lama, a Khenpo or abbot, a Chog dpon or ritual master, and the musicians, dancers and so on. They cross the boundary between the sacred and the secular worlds and are given the capacity of communication between the sacred and the human.

On the one hand, the ritual produces satisfaction in the minds of the believers as a result of watching and participating in it, and because it creates an opportunity for them to support the monastic community. Actions such as the chanting of the mantra of Padmasambhava and the performance of prostrations to him and to the Buddha or the Bodhisattvas during the Cham embody

[22] Padma'tsho (Baimacuo), A Study on the Devotional Practice of Padmasambhava in Tibetan Culture. Tibetan Publishing House: Beijing, 2007. 190.

the commitment of the devotees, for whom the watching of the ritual will help remove obstacles from their lives, and assist in the accumulation of merit and virtue for their future lives, as well as the fulfillment of aspirations. On the other hand, the Cham demonstrates the main ideas in exoteric and esoteric Buddhist teaching, such as the importance of developing compassion, eliminating heretical thinking and transforming erroneous views so as to acquire correct understanding.

The ritual consists of a series of external signs and symbolic concepts that represent communication between humans and the supernatural, and between the lay people and the monastic community. These signs include the text that are chanted, the items used in the offering ceremony, the instruments used by the dancers, and ritual actions such as prostration, mudra, the burning of incense and circumambulating. Those signs and ritual acts all have symbolic meanings which transmit religious meanings from the monastic community to the lay people.

This enhancement of communications between the monastery and the neighboring villages creates an atmosphere of social unity, bringing together religion and society. In some parts of the ritual, villagers also take part alongside the monks in the performance—this happens, for example, in the Cham of *tshogs glu* or “group song”, in which a villager sings a song, and the discipline-master of the monastery goes on behalf of the monastery to present a *bka’ rtags* to the villager. In the Cham of the eight emanations of Padmasambhava, villagers stand behind Padmasambhava holding the banner and at other times they light firecrackers. In addition, villages near the monastery contribute to the ritual by supplying tea, milk, yogurt, butter and herbs to the monks and nuns, and they voluntarily work and cook in the kitchen, which has become a traditional custom. This again helps construct a traditional and organic sense of community between the monastery and local villages. Therefore the tradition of the ritual of *Gu ru tshe cu* achieves the function of religious and social communication.

Bibliography:

Tibetan References:

《zhizhe miaoyin—jingang fawu yigui shi》Jiangyang huarang dashi, baiyu Monastery material

《Gatuo si guru renboche jingang fawu quben》Gatuo Monastery material

《Babang si guru renboche jingang fawu qubu》Babang Monastery material

《Lianhua yijiao》Fuzang dashi erjin linba juezang Sichuan minzu chubanshe, 4, 1987

《Lianhua sheng zhuan》:《Tongzhou》Nima weise &《sanxin zhuan》Duoluo nata, Sichuan minzu chubanshe, 7, 1989

《Ningma jiaofa shi 》, Cuoru cilang, Minzu chubanshe, 1989

Chinese References

《Mizong zhuanji——mizonggailun》, Xiandai fojiao xueshu yekan,

Dacheng wenhuachubanshe, Mingguo liuhsiba

《Ningma benzun shengqi jiaoshou: wuer shuangyun minghui lunyao shi》, Jiachu renboche chuanshou, translate by danzeng shanhui fari, Miaoyin foxue yeshu, 12, 2000

中文题目:

藏传佛教中的莲花生金刚法舞

作者:白玛措, 博士, 教授, 博士生导师, 西南民族大学哲学学院。长期藏传佛教及文化的研究与教学, 注重典籍与现实的结合, 著有《藏文化中的莲花生信仰研究》。在《中国藏学》、《宗教学研究》及 A&HCI 等刊物上发表论文数十篇, 如:“藏传佛教在美国传播的田野考察”、“当代藏族尼众新教育体系的调查研究”等。此论文属国家社科项目“宁玛派国际影响及趋势研究”(项目号 16BZ014) 以及西南民大少数民族基地课题“宁玛派哲学性”研究(项目号 2020PTJS03005)。四川成都一环路南四段 16 号, 邮编: 610041, 邮箱: tshopadma@hotmail.com; 格林郎杰, 艺术硕士, 西南民族大学艺术学院专任教师。国家艺术基金项目获得者, 作品《梦·“宣”》获得国家级、省部级奖项。出访交流 20 多个国家。多次担任国事活动文艺演出的导演、编导。多次担任全国少数民族汇演、全国少数民族运动会、中央电视台春节晚会的篇章导演、编导。四川成都一环路南四段 16 号, 邮编: 610041, 邮箱: geleg1014@163.com.

摘要:论文通过寺院文献与实地研究, 阐释了藏传佛教金刚法舞仪式的起源以及莲花生大师羌姆的结构与程式。论文首先分析了羌姆法会为期十一天的整体结构: 荟供与诵经、金刚法舞仪式、“莲花光”灌顶; 其次, 论文分析了莲花生金刚法舞程式的过程结构, 同时说明了“嘉羌”和“果毅”的意义, 以及三十七个程式的结构。

关键词:金刚法舞仪式; 莲花生; 藏传佛教

书评与通讯

Reviews and Academic Reports

Religion in Social Classification and Social Orders: A Study of Catholicism in A Tibetan Village in Yunnan

Mengyin HU

(Zhejiang University of Finance and Economics, Hangzhou, Zhejiang Province, P. R. China)

Abstract: This article attempts a new perspective upon Catholicism in a Chinese Tibetan village, Cizhong of Yunnan Province. The article reviews the discussion on social classification by Durham and Bourdieu, and argues that Catholicism, together with the other local religion—Tibetan Buddhism— functions as a social classification inside the village. Catholicism, as well as Buddhism, involves a whole set of rules for the practice of daily life, that are followed by villagers in Cizhong. By this social classification, the village achieves harmony under a reasonable order. The article, based on months of fieldwork, argues two things: First, how Catholicism has become a “local” religion; and second, how the social classification functions in village affairs. The former focuses on historical material and reveals that Catholicism has gradually transformed to a “native” religion, in some sense, during the past century after it was brought there by French missionaries. This transformation can be seen in the change of missionaries’s image in local legends and villagers’ narrative. The latter is based on current empirical material from fieldwork and demonstrates that villagers have created a new order out of the two sets of practices, one rooted in Catholicism and the other in Tibetan Buddhism, to manage social affairs and sustain balance or harmony in the village. Though the tension between the two religions still exists, a new order that shifts delicately between the two is practiced in most situations like funerals.

Key Words: Tibetan village; Catholicism; Practicing rules; Social classification

Author: HU Mengyin, Ph. D. Lecturer in Department of Social Work, Law School, Zhejiang University of Finance and Economics, Hangzhou, Zhejiang Province, P. R. China. Email: zephyra0520@163.com

When discussing Christianity, or more specific, Catholicism in China, a popular perspective is how a foreign religion manages to replace or fuse with indigenous believes and finally emerges as what we can see at present^[1]. The analysis mainly focus on the struggles between Christians and local villagers, and sometimes the conflicts or negotiations involving country elites and central government from Ming dynasty to PRC nowadays^[2]. Anthropologists may concern about the adoption of indigenous rituals and concepts in Christians, and the remodeled narratives of Christianity. Others take political perspective into consideration, including seeing Christianity and missionaries as varied forms of foreign invasion, sometimes the more dangerous one as conversion to Christianity is equivalent to abandonment of Chinese identity (duo yige jidutu, shao yige zhongguoren). In mainland China’s literature, this vague hypothesis has been the dominant

[1] Wu, Fei, *Oracles on Heads*, Hong kong: Daofeng Press, 2001.

[2] Zhang, Xianqing, *Government, Clans and Catholicism*, Zhonghua Press, 2009.

and prevailing discourse for quite a long time after 1949 with a extreme constructed duality of Christianity and “Chinese religions”. However, as any concepts involving “China” or “Chinese” are difficult to define^[3]. “Chinese religions” itself is a complex compound consisting of Taoism, Buddhism, and enormous local deities. So to avoid the mire of the duality discourse, a possible perspective may be understanding Christianity or Catholicism in the context of local society instead of constructed ideology. Thus this article studies Catholicism in a Tibetan village of Yunnan province with less Chineseness but its own indigenous religious tradition as Tibetan Buddhism mixed with Dongba belief and worship of mountain Gods. The focus is to discuss what kind of existence the Catholicism is in that village, how it gradually gains its locality in the historical view and how it functions in social affairs as a social classification in religious scale. These discussions in this article may not involve much of the Catholic villagers’ understandings and narratives of Catholic belief and the remodeled cosmology but attempt to the analysis of the practice of Catholicism integrated into the social classification.

Catholicism In Cizhong

Cizhong is a typical Tibetan village in Yunnan today that almost all villagers speak Tibetan in everyday life and nearly 90% of them have the ethnic identity as Tibetan on their formal ID card (shenfenzheng)^[4]. But in fact Cizhong has multiple ethnic groups, which are Tibetan, Naxi, Lisu, Bai, and Nu, and the two main groups are Tibetan and Naxi. According to a Naxi informant of mine, Liu Wengao, Cizhong village was a “pure Naxi” (chunchunde Naxizu) village before Tibetan rushed into it with foreign Catholic missionaries. I have heard a story about “forty Tibetan families” as the ancestors of the Tibetan group in Cizhong which confirms Liu’s story that the Tibetan in Cizhong have a strong connection with Catholic Missionaries. Though the story may not be seen as a precisely historical text, it may some how explains the real connection between Catholicism and Tibetan villagers in the village today.

Cizhong village consists of six natural villages with the lowest percentage of 50 to the highest percentage of 100 Catholics among population. The biggest and main village on the plain beside Lanchang River has 70% of its population as Catholics and the Catholic Church is also located there. The Church was first built in 1866 by missionaries Jean-Baptiste Goutelle and Josphe Pierre Chauveau from Paris Foreign Missions Society and then burn down in the disturbance of 1905. After the disturbance was repressed the Church was rebuilt with a huge sum of compensation from Qing government. Since then Cizhong has gradually become in key position of the whole missionary activities in north-western Yunnan and in Tibetan.

Also from that point began the story of Forty Tibetan Families as it can be confirmed missionaries brought Catholic believers into Cizhong with them and inhabited around the Church. With the abundant lands sold to missionaries with the Church at a extreme low price by local Chieftains, the catholic believers each was distributed some squares of land and settled there ever

[3] Shepard, John, Rethinking Sinicization: Processes of Acculturation and Assimilation, State, Market and Contextualized Ethnicities, Jiang, Bin; He Cuiping, 2000.

[4] Wei, Leping, Memory and Identity: Research on Livelihood, Social Organization and Culture Icon in Cizhong Village in Northwest Yunnan, 2001.

since. It may be exaggerated that the Naxi aboriginals were six families while Tibetan migrants were forty families thus Cizhong soon turned into a Tibetan village as we see today, but one thing can be sure is that the massive Tibetan Catholic migrants changed the population constitution greatly and the obvious primordial transformation of Tibetan Group and Catholicism started from then on while there might already be some Tibetan residents in Cizhong before 1906.

Today in Cizhong village, the distinction between Catholicism and Tibetan groups is vague. Rather, religion seems strongly tied with families and lineages, in the situation that most of the villagers claim themselves as Tibetan instead of Naxi and both Tibetan and Naxi Catholic believers can be found in Church. The situation is the same in another religion of Cizhong village—Tibetan Buddhism where both Tibetan and Naxi believers are found. In my fieldwork, if I went into a house and asked whether they are Christian or Buddhists, what I can know is that the people in that house are all Christian or Buddhists while whether they are Tibetan or Naxi remains unknown. That means families and lineages are classified into Catholicism and Buddhism rather than the ethnic identities.

I describe the Catholicism and Buddhism in Cizhong as in a steady equilibrium, where the dynamics of conversion is following quite simple rules—always be consistent with the family you live in. In another word, the only conversion happens when you marry into a family with different belief, which is often the case today. Every villager in Cizhong, whether he is a Catholic or Buddhist told me “one family should stick to one belief, otherwise the difference will cause struggles all the time and that’s a bad thing”. When getting married, bride and groom should agree on which belief they need to stick on if any conversion is needed. And as many other cases in a lineage, the remained belief does not depend on personal choice or will but the family tradition. Even today more and more young couples choose to leave the village and live separately from their parents, they still choose the belief as one marry into another’s family. In Cizhong, whether a wife marries into her husband’s family or other way around depends on specific situation with little restricts or social depreciation while the former is still more common case.

This rules not only applies to local villagers but also people married into Cizhong from other villages. One thing should be mentioned here is that Catholicism is actually very unique in that area as Tibetan county in Yunnan. Not far away from Cizhong is Deqin County and Shangri-la is on the other side of the mountain, both places with Buddhism prevailing and quite a number of important temples and Tibetan monks. As for people married into Cizhong, they are almost all Buddhists in their original families. But when they came to live in Cizhong, they followed the rules of conversion here and several did converted to Catholicism and go to Church every Sunday now. Father Yao at Cizhong Church introduced them to me as pious new believers while other villagers, in some cases even themselves, describe the conversion no different from other marry-conversions.

One thing I may pause and highlights here is that villagers hardly speaks of doctrines or theology concepts of Catholicism with me but they repeatedly emphasize the importance to follow the rules here to make sure I understand their meaning and the serious attitude they have towards belief. They hardly talked about Jesus Christ or God Father or Saint Maria, even in very religious occasion such as Sunday Mass or celebration of Assumption Day. But them speaks with me in a very serious tone that they should prepare masses for their dead parents or the whole family do the same rituals when needed. They get their identity and the whole set of rules about appropriate practice from

parents just like their blood, name, or even life. They change it in situations that the rules demonstrations for the general good. Though I can't find any literal text about these rules, every villager seems quite familiar with them and willing to share it with me.

The rules are not only adopted by Catholic villagers. As a matter of fact, Buddhist villagers also share the same logic, while concrete and details practice or rituals may differentiate. The logic I mention here is about the valuation of certain initial parts of life as well as the importance to practice the detailed rules well to achieve similar goals. In other word, how religion should be practiced and what the finally aims are the same for both Catholic and Buddhist villagers. In that sense, if we take Tibetan Buddhism as the indigenous or native religion, I have to argue that Catholicism in Cizhong is nothing like a bunch of people somehow connected with Pope they never met or Saints in history but rather a native religion as well. With a clear entrance during 1866—1906, the process of how Catholicism became native is open to be discussed.

Localizing of Catholicism

To discuss the process of the localizing of Catholicism in Cizhong, I want to begin with another legend about the slaughtered missionaries during the disturbance in 1905. The process involves multiple aspects including political, economical, and religious through history. So I will approach that point through the change of images of missionaries and foreign Fathers to reveal how Catholicism is adopted by local villagers and gain its locality.

When the disturbance busted in 1905, the angry monks armed with knives and swords surrounded the original Church. They wanted to cracked down the Church and killed all the French missionaries in it. At that time, local Tibetan Catholic villagers helped missionaries to escape and hide in the mountains. Monks found out and offered high price for the location of the missionaries for they could not find them. One day a Tibetan Buddhist boy played in the mountain woods noticed the cabin with a foreign and ran back home to tell his parents. The family heard about the generous reward offered by monks and chieftains so they sold the information to them. Then the missionary LePeirre-Marie Bourdonnec got caught and executed together with the Catholic villager who helped the missionary to hide. At the execution, the missionary asked to read the bible one more time. The monks and chieftain mocked but permitted, and the missionary took out the bible with him and teared it up while reciting. When finished, he told the monks it is time to send him back. So the monks cut his head off but white milk instead of red blood outflow from the neck. When villagers stole back the head and body, them were not rotten at all even it was end of June and the weather was quite hot.

In that myth text, we may find quite a number of metaphors in it, like the imitation of Jesus by the missionary, and the milk indicates some similar description about the land of Canaan. But what is more essential here is that the image of missionary is not a victim but a victor. This reverse is quite common in Bible literature. But when it is applied into the myth among Tibetan villagers, we can see this reverse is vital in the localization of Catholicism. That is to say the reverse of missionary represent the reverse of existence of Catholicism in Cizhong village. In the myth, the anger and hostility are clear and indicate the alienation and negative imagination towards a foreign group. But in

the reverse discourse and narrative, the anger and hostility transform into superior power and perseverance symbolized by immortal. So the power and perseverance are signs of protection, which a great and powerful dominant can provide. We can understand this metaphor as the disturbance was soon repressed by Qing government under the pressure of France. Thus French missionaries removed the prestige and power owned by Chieftains and monks, even Qing government, and became the new dominant here. The unreasonable transaction between chieftains and missionaries over lands for new Church strengthened this vague impression. After the failed rebellion, Tibetan villagers chose to surround to this new chieftain as they used to do before. Thus, emerges the image of villagers who protected the missionary and stole the corps back. In that way they differentiate their image from the chieftain and monks as the alliance and followers of the missionary—the new chieftain in real life.

The new chieftain image was not just a social imaginary only existing in scholar's discourse. The villagers in Cizhong describe the foreign Fathers in the Church in the same way they write about a chieftain. When I was talking to someone aged Catholic villagers who actually met with the Fathers and clearly remembered the contact, they have told me Fathers are sometimes very harsh on them but sometime help them with no intention of reward. Xiao Jieyi, maybe one of the most aged Catholic believers in Cizhong told me about things happened between Father Andre (Georges Andre) and his family. Xiao said his family was close to the Church, quite familiar with several Fathers and Sisters their. His father helped Father Andre to look after the horses at the backyard and lived there. Father Andre was a very strict person and scold Xiao's father a lot. One winter, they argued about horses' feeding again and the irritated Father Andre throw the whole family out of Church. Freezing cold outside with no food or water, the family only depended on the support from other villagers blinding the angry Father to survive. Finally, when Father Andre calmed down, the family went back to live in the church and that was the next spring already. But when Xiao grew older, about his adolescence time, Father Andre was quite fond of him for he was smart and well-behaved. So Father Andre sent him to church school to study Chinese, Latin and theology, which was a very precious chance for local villagers to get high education at that time, and wanted him back in the missionary work.

There are many similar descriptions on Fathers and missionaries, as villagers need to do housekeep work in the Church, farming work in the lands and vineyard, and helped to serve the feasts on festivals. Fathers and missionaries may scold or yield at villagers but also treated people they favored generously. More importantly, when a family suffered from hunger or illness, the Fathers would come and help. As a matter of fact, chieftains in other Tibetan areas in Yunnan also cared for the peasants when harvests is poor or the husband suffered seriously some disease. In social affairs, Fathers and missionaries also took the role of mediator and sometimes the judge in arguments inside the church. From these aspects, the new chieftain image was not just a concept, but also description of the real situation.

The new chieftain image can be initial in the localization of Catholicism in Cizhong. For those Buddhist villagers, they never shared a close relation with the Fathers or missionaries. On the contrary, they keep the subtle alienation with them, though open rebellion was out of consideration. They choose to surround and tacitly accepted the new chieftain. What they need to solve was that the negotiation between Catholicism group as they live in the same area. Total separation or alienation was something missionaries wanted but never did the villagers. Both Catholic and Buddhist villagers urged a remodeling of village society, which means everyday transactions, marriage exchange and

cooperation in social affairs such as rituals, funerals and public infrastructure constructions. As I have demonstrated in previous sections, Catholic villagers should not be seen as shaped and guided only by doctrines now, neither should they back then. Transactions and marriage guarantee the daily life possible and the cooperation in social affairs are based on the logic shared by all the villagers, like unprocessed death will compromise the safety of whole area, not only targeted people. In other words, even though Buddhist villagers do not share the same rules with Catholic people, they manage to endure the difference for the only reason that these affairs should not remain unprocessed.

To conclude, the localization of Catholicism went through two processes: one is that the Catholic villagers accepted Fathers and missionaries as new chieftains and followed the rules they set; the other is that Buddhist villagers negatively admitted the new chieftain with subtle alienation but endured the difference in detailed practice of the Catholic villagers to maintain affairs in mostly in the shared logic. The change of image of missionaries provides a glance at this extremely complicated process that won't be able to fully be represented in this article. But it still reveals the general two parts as summarized above of this localization and indicates how the disciplined and negotiated set of rules for everyday practice in Cizhong function in the village, which will be illustrated in the next section.

Religions in Social classification

When we observe and try to understand religion in social context, we are actually talking about how society is possible. Religion, whether admitting its transcendence or not, is embedded in society with other systems^[5]. Functional perspective that religion provides meaning and explanations, which are vital to human beings in social context, to subjects sounds cliché but remains its possibility to understand what kind of existence religion is. And in this article, I will focus on the practice of believers involved in social affairs and regard Catholicism as a set of rules for practice rather than a meaningful encyclopedia for philosophical questions. Detailed practice mingles with aboriginal logic and then reconstructs the social order in Cizhong in the process of localization of Catholicism and negotiation with Buddhism.

Religions in Cizhong, Catholicism and Buddhism, can be seen as a social classification. Involving Catholicism and Buddhism, the social classification however is not a contrast binary one since neither of the two holds the opposite understanding or description of the other. In fact, as I have presented in paragraphs above, Catholicism and Buddhism are two different sets of rules for everyday practice with the similar or even the same logic. But as several informants have implied that the tension between Catholic villagers and Buddhist villagers still exist and in my observation, the tension is transferred to the stigma of the present Father at Cizhong Church. So where does this tension come from if things can not be simply concluded as contrast binary? A possible answer may lie in the distinct between the ideal social condition of internal consistency and homogeneity and the practical approach by social classification.

The discussion goes back to the understanding of society^[6]. In anthropological studies, a tribe

[5] Geertz, Clifford, *The Interpretation of Cultures: Selected Essays*, New York: Basic Books, 1973.

[6] Brown, D. E. *Social Classification and History*, *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, Vol. 15, No. 4 (1973), pp. 437-447.

or society usually treated as homogenous with little attention on difference of groups inside^[7]. In China's context, the major ethnic group "Han" is a constructed homogenous concept since late 19th century^[8]. As most of the situation when we talk about nation-state, the same hypothesis emerges again. It is rather hasty to claim that this constructed concept is totally invent and is bluffed by some politicians for certain propose. We need a further thought on how we imagined our society before making judgements based on valuation. The homogenous society has be a long-lasting ideal picture of human society with the following assumptions as shared interest, intimacy by blood or possibility of fully understanding and communication. Practically, the internal consistency results in a more efficient and coherent system functioning. But as Cohen points out that the homogenous tribe or society never exists in human history, the ideal picture is always an impossible goal to achieve.

Without the basis of consistency or coherency, how the society functions in a heterogenous situation? The effort to regain order falls in the process of social classification. As Durkheim illustrated in "primitive classification", the importance of classification lies in the way classification is done^[9]. The specific meaning and implication of each category are not as important as the process of define the relation between each group. The rationalization and construction of order are exactly how people understand the relation between subjects involving themselves^[10]. The logic then used to explain every new object they have encountered or in other words, to classify them. Bourdieu then deepen the discussion by use "Habitus" to explain how social classification manage its way from mental and logical impulse to concrete social practice^[11]. When we take religions in Cizhong into the explanation by Habitus^[12], they fit the discussion of structured-structure and structuring-structure^[13]. But I will stay on the discussion why social classification can release the anxiety caused by heterogeneity and the urge for homogeny, and why Catholicism and Buddhism, or why religion functions as social classification rather than the more common ethnicity or social hierarchies

The possibility of classification to maintain social harmony largely depends on the reconstructed order in what scale fits the practical need of people. In that way the classic topic in anthropological studies about the native cosmology may be actually about the reconstructed order that aims to maintain some reasonable equilibrium as a replacement of the homogenous condition. The order mostly appeared in the interaction between different groups based on negotiation and adjustment of category relations. These relations are not ideological or abstract but with solid social background such as kinship, community or age. It will not be appropriate to see these social relations simply as derivatives of the abstract category relations but also the source to construct the abstract ones. People do not make up the ideal category and define their relations before they pick out relationships

[7] Cohen, Ronald, Ethnicity: Problem and Focus in Anthropology, *Annual Review of Anthropology*, Vol. 7, 1978, 379-403

[8] Dicotter, Frank, Global Science, National Politics and Assimilationist Discourse in Modern China, *State, Market and Contextualized Ethnicities*, Jiang, Bin; He Cuiping, 2000.

[9] Durkheim, Emile, *Primitive Classifications*, London: Cohen & West, 2009.

[10] Robbins, Derek, Classification in French Social Theory, *Theory, Culture & Society* 23(2-3), p. 42-43.

[11] Bourdieu, Pierre, *Outline of A Theory of Practice*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977.

[12] Bourdieu, Pierre, What Makes a Social Class? On The Theoretical and Practical Existence Of Groups, *Berkeley Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 32 (1987), pp. 1-17.

[13] Hu, Chunguang, Habitus, Practice and Social Space; Bourdieu's Theory of Social Classification, *Journal of Chongqing University of Posts and Telecommunications (Social Science Edition)*, Vol. 25, No. 4(2013), p. 120-128.

already existed in society as the representations. Rather, they construct the order out of the concrete social facts, in a way more like induction than deduction.

Back to our discussion on Cizhong Catholicism. I will use another example of the social affairs to present how Catholicism-Buddhism functions as social classification in Cizhong, which is a funeral of a Catholic mid-aged woman that I attend in the village.

Just like other villages in China, villagers in Cizhong all somehow connected with each other as relatives after so many years' marriages between Catholic families and Buddhist families. I got the news that a woman Catholic had passed away from Father Yao, and he permitted me to attend the three-day funeral. In Cizhong, when a man pass away, all his relatives need to come to funeral and inside the village, every family needs to send a person to night-watch on the first and second night before the burial on third day. I asked to attend the night-watch, but was politely refused by the family as they take this something only in the villagers. They asked me to attend the funeral at daytime with other relatives from other villages.

The woman was Catholic, so the whole set of rituals was charged by Father Yao. When I got the house the second boring, I was surprised almost every family was involved in the funeral and it is impossible to tell if they are Catholic or Buddhist. But when the mass began, suddenly all the Buddhist villagers ebbed to the peripheries of the yard and all Catholic villagers emerged to the center and started chanting.

After the mass was over, the people on the peripheries and center mingled again and no way to tell. The same situation happened on the burial rituals on the third day. And right before taking the coffin to cemetery, the periphery-center division appeared for another time, only that division was between close families or relatives and other villagers helping around.

That is just one case showing how Catholicism-Buddhism classification system functions in Cizhong. The periphery-center division is a delicate swift between detailed religious practice and the common logic for both the Catholic villagers and Buddhist ones. Someone passes away—death of a member of the community is one of the most urgent and essential social affairs that confronts the whole village. Typical process has to be done to erase the potential harm that the death might cause inside the village. Both Catholic and Buddhist villagers agree on this point of view and even adopting different practice rules, they need to finish the process together. Li Jinlong, a young villager told me a story that he experienced to convincing me about the doom that death may bring:

There was once some guy died in a car accident, fallen from the highway to the abyss. It was more convenient to take his body across the main part of village to the cemetery on the hill. They ignored the old warnings about never taking corps across the village and buried him. Since then 8 more people died of various reasons that year and all the villagers felt the doom they were caught in. So both Catholic and Buddhist villagers invited Fathers (Father Yao hadn't arrived at that time) and monks to fight the evil. I remembered Father to spread holy water house by house and monks chanting at the center of the village. Not sure whose solution finally worked, anyway no one died for the rest of that year.

Though other villagers told me not to buy Li's story because it's children's horrible stories with no facts can prove that. Anyway, they still keep asking the Father or Monks from other village to pure their new car to exile any possible devils on it that may cause car crush. Proper rituals for dead ancestors are also important even they emphasize that they are the same as the caring for them when

they are alive. Death is a remarkable compact towards individual relationships and social structures. That is why funeral is no doubly one of the most important social affairs in Cizhong village.

During the process of funeral, different practices are adopted so the periphery-center division exists. Villagers are all very aware of how the shift works when context changes—ritual for classified practice and other part for united village. In other affairs, even in the marriage conversion mentioned at the beginning of this article, the periphery-center division also appears, although may in different forms or ways. The classification in Cizhong falls into religions has its own historical context, including the strong existential recognition of missionaries that the difference between sets of rules for practice rooted in religion was too obvious and strengthened repeatedly by missionaries and Fathers. As well as the missionaries, central government's religion policies after 1949 shaped the separation between Catholicism and Buddhism with the absence of missionaries and Fathers since. The ethnic policies favoring Tibetan ethnic group may account for the deliberately indistinct on ethnic identities of Tibetan and Naxi in Cizhong. We can not affirm the religious social classification can be traced back to a or several specific reasons, but the point is that Catholicism, together with Buddhism, works as a practical system to reconstruct a reasonable social order to manage affairs and sustain equilibrium, with the acculturation of skills to endure and swift between different sets.

Conclusion

As I have argued in the above sections, Catholicism brought in to the village by missionaries gradually gains its locality in Cizhong and functions as social classification to provide a practical and reasonable social order in case of social affairs. What remains undiscussed is that whether this is the only social classification in Cizhong village. Even ethnic identities are no longer the case, what about lineages? One thing can be sure is that the religions in Cizhong are closely connected with lineages. In another word, the diversity of categories inside a religion is about lineages and families. During the depression between 1956—1980, all kinds of religions were abolished there. Both Catholicism and Buddhism continued to survive through lineages and families, from parents to children, from husbands to wives.

Another thing is that as I analyze the situation of Cizhong at present, things there are actually changing rapidly. What I do not mention in the previous discussion is how the Catholic as well as Buddhist belief continue on the younger generation. Like many other works on Christianity transformation from elder generation to younger generation have noticed, more and more young villagers start to rethink their belief and the set of rules for practice they inherit from their parents in the context of modernity and secularization. Even inside the village, the social lifestyle has changed a lot since visitors and strangers rush into it, which is a quite common phenomena at other places in Yunnan and Tibetan. The particular situation of Cizhong may change, the phenomena we need to explain remains the same: What kind of existence of Christianity is in Chinese society? And the perspective that religion functions as social classification waits for more resonance on the classic but general topic of how society is possible. Also in China's literature, the hypothesis of contrast duality between Christianity and Chinese Religions needs to be modified for any possible further discussion around Christianity in China.

中文题目:

社会分类和秩序中的宗教——对云南藏区一个天主教村落的考察

作者: 胡梦茵, 人类学博士, 浙江财经大学法学院社会工作系讲师。邮箱: zephyra0520@163.com。

摘要: 本文讨论的对象为云南滇西北藏区的一个村落中的天主教。文章回顾了涂尔干和布迪厄以降的社会分类的相关理论, 论证天主教和村落中的藏传佛教一起构成了村落内部的社会分类标准。天主教包括了一整套日常生活的实践规范, 藏传佛教也是如此。村民们遵循这些实践规范, 并且通过确定彼此的社会类别归属, 使得村落产生了共同的秩序, 并实现了和谐共存。本文在田野工作的基础上对两个问题进行了讨论: 其一是天主教如何变成了“地方”宗教的; 其二是这套社会分类规则如何在村落的日常事物中发挥效力。前者依赖于历史材料, 论证了天主教是如何在进入当地的一个多世纪的时间中逐步转化为“本地的”宗教。这个转化过程可以有当地传说以及村民的叙事中传教士形象的变迁看出。后者基于当下的田野材料, 论述了当地村民如何从两套实践规则中创造出新的社会秩序, 以保证村落性的事务得到处理。尽管宗教类群之间仍有张力, 但在诸如葬礼等仪式场合, 两套时间规则仍可以完成有效的切换。

关键词: 藏区; 天主教; 实践规则; 社会分类

Christianity and the Change of Marriage Style of Lisu People in the Northern Part of the Border between China and Myanmar

—Taking K Village of Nujiang as an example^[1]

Lina SHA¹, Han CAO²

(1. School of Sociology, Yunnan Minzu University, Kunming;

2. Institute of BCIM Relations, Dehong Teacher' College, Dehong)

Abstract: The changes in the marriage modes of Lisu people on the northern border between China and Myanmar from marriage by capture, elopement, interchurch marriage to internal and external marriage is a result of the “rational” choice of Christianity throughout history. It is a two-way fusion process between Christianity and traditional culture of Lisu people, which reflects the development track of Lisu society. Taking the introduction and development of Christianity as an entry point, this paper examines the marriage change of Lisu people in K village of Nujiang, with the aim to provide a research perspective for further understanding the localization of cross-border ethnic Christianity.

Key Words: Northern border between China and Myanmar; Lisu; Christianity; Change of marriage style; Survival wisdom

Author: 1. School of Sociology, Yunnan Minzu University, NO. 134 One two one Street, Wuhua District, Kunming, Yunnan, China, 650031, Email: 450654408@qq.com; 2. Institute of BCIM Relations, Dehong Teacher' College, Lahuai Village, Mangshi, Dehong, Yunnan, China, 678400, Email: caohan2013@gmail.com

As one of the traditional marriage customs of the Lisu people, marriage by capture is a demonstration of the courage and economic strength of the groom, which therefore results in the highest “marriage fee”. After Christianity was introduced into Nujiang Lisu area along the north border between China and Myanmar in the first half of the 20th century, missionaries made the “Ten Rules of Marriage”, according to which believers of Christianity were not allowed to marry non-believers, nor to “accept the bride price”. Thus, traditional marriage customs, such as marriage between cross-cousins, marriage by capture, elopement and engagement between babies, were gradually replaced by interchurch marriage. After 1950, with the enactment of relevant Chinese laws

[1] Fund Projects: 2017 National Social Science Fund Major Bidding Project, Research on the Problems of Rural Christianity under the Background of Sincization of Christianity in China (No. 17ZDA231); First-class Discipline Construction Project of Ethnology of Yunnan University; 2020 Project of National Religious Affairs Administration, Research on the Practice of Sincization of Christianity of the Cross-border Ethnic Groups in Yunnan and the Existing Problems (No. FX2004D); 2018 National Social Science Fund Project, Research on the Multi-religion Interaction in Regions between Southwest China and the Neighboring Countries and its Influence on the Construction of the “Belt and Road” (No. 18CZJ027). 项目基金: 2017 年度国家社科重大招标项目“基督教中国化背景下的农村基督教问题研究”(项目编号: 17ZDA231); 云南大学民族学一流学科建设项目; 2020 年国家宗教事务局招标科研项目“云南跨境民族基督教中国化实践及其存在问题研究”(项目编号: FX2004D); 2018 年国家社科基金项目“中国西南与周边国家交界区域多元宗教互动及其对‘一带一路’建设的影响研究”(项目编号: 18CZJ027).

and regulations, Lisu people in Nujiang had completely abandoned the custom of marriage by capture and “engagement between babies”. Between 1957 and 1978, a rift in the Christian faith broke the rule of interchurch marriage. Since 1980, with the revival of the Christian belief and the development of the society, interchurch marriage and elopement coexisted.

The changes in marriage modes of Lisu people on the northern border between China and Myanmar from marriage by capture, elopement, interchurch marriage to internal and external marriage is a result of the “rational” choice of Christianity throughout history. It is a two-way fusion process between Christianity and traditional culture of Lisu people, which reflects the development track of Lisu society. Taking the introduction and development of Christianity as an entry point, this paper examines the marriage change of Lisu people in K village of Nujiang, with the aim to provide a research perspective for further understanding the localization of cross-border ethnic Christianity.

K village is located on the west bank of Nujiang Gorge between Biluo Snow Mountain and Gaoligong Mountain in Hengduan Mountains. Standing at the western foot of Biluo Snow Mountain, K village expands vertically from the Nujiang River to the platform. The whole village has jurisdiction over 7 natural villages, which are inhabited by more than 2000 villagers. Among them, the majority are Lisu people. Nu and Dulong people are of a small proportion. They use the Lisu language because they are unable to speak their own languages, and their culture and livelihood are no different from those of the local Lisu. Christianity was introduced into the Lisu area of Myanmar and China in 1902, and then into K village in 1930. At present, more than 75% of the people in the village are Christians. There are four churches and about 20 fixed clergymen in the village.

The materials used in this paper are all from field investigations conducted by the author in K Village of Nujiang and several Lisu villages on the northern border between China and Myanmar over the years. The names in the cases have been technically handled, not their real names.

I. Unequal marriage relationship: the Lisu traditional marriage customs like marriage by capture which use “cattle” to calculate the betrothal gifts.

Historically, the Lisu people mostly practiced monogamy, but there were a few examples of polygamy. At the beginning of the 20th century, before Christianity was introduced into the Lisu region on the northern border between China and Myanmar, the Lisu had traditional marriage customs such as cross-cousin marriage, marriage by capture, elopement, engagement between babies and levirate marriage. Among them, the custom of marriage snatching represents the courage of the marriage snatchers, which is also a cultural custom to show economic strength. Marriage by capture Lisu called “**FO ZI: VU**” (Tough grab), also known as “**ᄃ: M ᄃ: VU..**” (rob women), emphasized the custom has “mandatory” and inequality.^[1] The ones who were captured are usually young, beautiful and hard-working women. Women there were categorized as married (widows included) and unmarried. Before 1950, if a Lisu man was able to rob a woman——especially a married one——as his wife, he could gain great face in the village because it shows that he has more guts than other men.

However, there is a price to pay. The “compensation money” to be paid to the woman’s family or

[1] 木劲松, Mu Jinsong: 《福贡傈僳族婚姻习俗》Fugong Lisu Marriage Customs, 载《福贡文史资料选辑》(第二辑) An Anthology of Fugong Literature and History (II), 1990, P133.

the original husband's family is several or a dozen times higher than the normal bride price, and the number of cattle ranges from four to a dozen. "Cattle" is divided into "live cattle", which are the living cattle, and "dry cattle", which usually means iron tripods, iron pots and machete and other tools. The K village, which is the main field this paper investigates, still had the custom of snatching marriage before the 1950s. At that time, there was a song called "Coaxing girls" in the Lisu area of Fugong county. It went like this: " = (Translation: If you marry the man you like, if you start a family with the man you like. When you are in confinement, you eat rat meat and drink amaranth rice wine. If you marry me, if you marry me." [2]) The song implies that the economic conditions of the bride snatchers are often better than those of the woman's lover or her husband's family.)

Before 1940, both Adon and his two brothers (the Lisu) from K village had captured other people's wives. Consequently, their wealth was lost to the women's ex-husbands' families as a "kidnapping fee", leading the family which previously enjoyed good economic status to poverty. Adon had kidnapped two wives. His first wife was also from K village. He had no wife at that time. To prove his courage, Adon capture a married woman from his village as his wife. After marriage, Adon compensated his wife's parents with five cattle. He only had one cow at home then and he borrowed four from relatives and friends. After his wife gave birth to a daughter, Adon joined the army during the Anti-Japanese War. His wife was abducted by another man in the village. According to the custom of the local Lisu people, Adon's family received 15 cattle from the man, and they were used up by his two brothers. When Adon returned home in early 1941, the brother of the man who had captured his wife gave him a scalper as a gift. In fear of revenge by Adon, his wife and her new husband fled to Myitkyina, Myanmar at the news of his returning home. They did not dare to go back to the village until Adon returned home for the second time (in 1941). To express regret, the couple treated Adon to an "apology meal", to which Adon had to go because it was almost impossible for the three to live in the same village and not to encounter each other. This meal would make later encounters less embarrassing. While Adon remained single and was regarded as "incapable of finding a wife", he was sent to Puli as head of the town in 1943. In order to prove his ability to find a wife, he robbed a married woman as his wife in Puli. According to the local wedding custom, he gave eight "live" cows and four "dried" cows to the woman's former husband as a "washing fee". [3]

Adon was able to capture married women twice in a row, not only because of his own courage, but also because of his family's economic conditions and his identity. He was an educated man graduating from a local village normal school [4] when he first captured a wife. Moreover, he had two elder brothers who "dare to capture married women" to set "the example", which paved way for his marriage by capture. In addition, during 1935—1937, Adon joined the Kuomintang Army in Dali, Kunming, Mengzi and Qujing, and he had experience in recruiting new soldiers in Lijiang, Dali and

[2] 政协福贡县文史资料编辑室编印 The Fugong County Literary and Historical Data Editing Room of the CPPCC :《福贡文史资料选辑第》(第五辑)An anthology of Fugong literature and history (v), 1994, P70.

[3] 政协福贡县文史资料编辑室编印 The Fugong County Literary and Historical Data Editing Room of the CPPCC :《福贡文史资料选辑第》(第五辑)An anthology of Fugong Literature and History (v), 1994, P2, P60-62.

[4] 政协福贡县文史资料编辑室编印 The Fugong County Literary and Historical Data Editing Room of the CPPCC :《福贡文史资料选辑第》(第五辑)An Anthology of Fugong Literature and History (v), 1994, P 1, P84.

Chuxiong. In 1941, He returned to his hometown and became the first Lisu official there. As a result, he was one of the most influential people in K village and even Nujiang at that time, and his reputation spreaded to the Lisu region in northern Myanmar. Although the family savings were small due to the marriages of his two elder brothers and the death of his parents, he had some social connections. So, one day in 1943, as head of the town, he took a group of young and strong boys to help him in broad daylight, and robbed a local man's wife as his wife in the Nujiang's Puli town. He and his helpers used sacks to abduct a woman who was planting rice in paddy fields. After grabbing the woman, Adon took three shots (copper gun) in the village where his office located. After the success of the marriage by capture, he made use of blood and social relations together to pay "fees for marriage by capture". Through the marriage, Adon won the respect of officials and locals, and his job was transferred from Puli township to Zhanghua township^[5], the nearest village to his hometown.

In fact, foreign missionaries had introduced Christianity to K village as early as 1930, and some people had been converted, but the well-informed Adon said he was "not interested in Christianity".^[6] Therefore, the "Ten Provisions" of Christianity on marriage did not restrain Adon, and his second marriage was still obtained through marriage by capture.

The fact that it requires not only courage but also good economic and social status of a man determines that marriage by capture could not be a common practice among the Lisu. The most popular way 1950 years ago was to marry the daughter of aunt's (the sister of father or mother) daughter, which mainly relied on the blood relationship and quasi kinship. For example, it was said in Lisu language that "A: NYI, M ɿ: RU" or "M YO M ɿ: RU". Men became quasi blood-related "brothers" after drinking wine mixed with blood, and their children were going to get married, or to settle engagement between babies, which was known as "cradle engagement"^[7] in Lisu language. Elopement should be a form of marriage adopted by Lisu young men and women in pursuit of free love and free marriage after the society had developed to a certain stage. By disobeying "arranged marriages by parents", it challenged the authority of parents. Normally in history, young men and women would obey their parents' arrangement of marriage, but there were some who went against the wishes of their parents, and found their spouses, which was called "ɿO ɿE, ɿE" by Lisu people, meaning to elope. Elopement is usually a marriage in which the lovers, for various reasons, are unable to get married and take the means of running away or stealthily abducting a woman to live in the man's home.

If marriage by capture is a "flagrant" and "compulsory" act, then "elopement" is usually a phenomenon in which two people voluntarily decide their life because of their free love. They express their love by elopement. A "elopement song" circulating in the Nujiang area in the first half of the 20th century goes like this: "Come with me so you can drink water you don't have to carry, Run with me, I'll give you rice and you don't have to pound. Come with me, I'll let you wear clothes and you do not need weaving. Come with me and I'll show you the mirror. . ." This is a song the young men and women used to sing when eloping. It is also a tune used by a man to "cajole" his beloved woman. The

[5] 今怒江州福贡县上帕镇。Today's Fugong County Shangpa township.

[6] 政协福贡县文史资料编辑室编印 The Fugong County Literary and Historical Data Editing Room of the CPPCC :《福贡文史资料选辑第》(第五辑) An anthology of Fugong literature and history (v), 1994, P81-84.

[7] 木劲松, Mu Jinsong:《福贡傈僳族婚姻习俗》Fugong Lisu marriage customs, 载《福贡文史资料选辑》(第二辑) An anthology of Fugong literature and history (II), 1990, P133.

lyrics emphasize that the woman's financial situation will generally improve if she elopes with the man. Although this is a "love story" made up by the man to get the woman he wants, it also reveals the importance of economic factors in marriage.

Inequality in marital relationship as is shown in marriage by capture, "cradle engagement", engagements between babies, cross-cousin marriage, levirate marriage, gave rise to elopement between young men and women of the Lisu nationality. Since what has been done cannot be undone, even if their parents object it, they have no choice but to agree in order to protect girls' reputation. Though the woman's parents have reasons to ask for more betrothal gifts from the man, however, most of those who chose elopement were either men with low incomes or orphans who could not afford to get married. Therefore, the betrothal gifts would be a compromise between the two families after some "bargaining". There are some men who do not give any bride price because of poverty. In this case, the relationship between the newly-married couples and the brides' parents is usually in an awkward state, and some even do not meet each other for ever.

It can be seen that in order to pay for the expensive "fees for marriage by capture", families which used to be rich may fall into poverty, or even go bankrupt. Thus, it is impossible for men with neither the ability nor the financial foundation to keep their wives, and some men can only watch their wives being snatched away by others. Elopement, which emerged as a result of the inequality in traditional marriage customs such as cradle engagement and cross-cousin marriage, also requires a payment of bride price. And there were people who escaped from parents' arranged marriages. In a word, the economic factors and unequal marital relationship of traditional marriage customs made it possible for the Christians idea of "equality for all" to spread, which paved way for Christianity to enter the Lisu area of China and Myanmar.

II. Marriage relationship "under God's grace": The introduction of Christianity and intra-Christian Marriage among Lisu Christians

The relationship between men and women is unequal in the Lisu's traditional marriage style like marriage by capture, prenatal betrothal, "cradle engagement", and cross-cousin marriage. Marriage by capture is more like men's "wishful thinking". If a man wants woman, he could simply capture her. Women do not seem to have a say in it. As in the case mentioned above, Adon captured two married women successively, but the captured had no right to protest, as if they were merely a "property" of their husbands' or their parents' families. Moreover, after the capture, the marriage snatcher negotiates with either the woman's husband or her parents, rather than the woman herself. Inequality also exists in such traditional marriage customs as prenatal betrothal, cradle engagement and cross-cousin marriage. According to their customs, payments could be made with cattle, which include "live cattle" and "dry cattle". If a family cannot pay the dowry at one time due to poverty, it will be paid by their future generations until it is paid in full.

After Christianity was introduced into the Lisu area of China and Myanmar, the missionaries stipulated that "believers can't accept bride price when they get married" and "marriage should be based on mutual love",^[8] etc., which partly contributed to the conversion of Lisu people to

[8] 《M I: MI 10: 1》,怒江傈僳族自治州基督教三自爱国运动委员会印 Nujiang Lisu Autonomous State Christian Three Self Patriotic Movement Committee Seal, 1988, P40-42.

Christianity. Therefore, from the beginning of the 20th Century to 1956, intra-religious marriage became the main marriage form for Lisu Christians on the northern border of China and Myanmar, enriching the types of marriage forms of Lisu people in China and Myanmar.

“The Ten Provisions” on marriage was made clear in the Christian theological chrestomathy “《M:MILO:7》”, which is popular in Lisu churches in China and Myanmar in the first half of the 20th century and after 1980:

1. The Christian man and woman to be married must love each other;
2. Christians cannot marry unless they love each other voluntarily;
3. Christians should not marry aunt’s daughter;
4. Minors cannot get married. The minimum age for marriage for a man should be 20 years old and for a woman 18 years old;
5. It is better for Christians not to have bride price;
6. Christians cannot marry non-Christians;
7. The Bible says that faith and unbelief cannot be married because they cannot be yoked together (2 Corinthians 6:14-18);
8. A Christian cannot give his daughter to marry a non-Christian because “what has a believer to do with an unbeliever?” (2 Corinthians 6:14-16);
9. Now after believing in Jesus, we sing hymns and pray to praise Usa (God);
10. A bride should not cry in her marriage. ^[9]

To sum up, “the ten provisions” on Christian marriage in the Lisu area of China and Myanmar mainly emphasize the following: First, marriage is free and a couple can only get married on the basis of love and voluntariness. The regulation is against the traditional marriage custom of the Lisu such as “prenatal betrothal” and “cradle engagement”. The missionaries made the point because they thought the traditional Lisu marriage form was “problematic” or even “uncivilized” because of its unequal relationships. Second, the minimum age for marriage. The foreign missionaries noticed that Lisu men and women normally get married at a young age, usually between 14 and 18. ^[10] Third, Christians can’t marry non-Christians, nor can they accept bride price. Before 1950, the betrothal gifts of the Lisu nationality were generally expensive, and if the parents can’t pay them off, their descendants will have to do it. In the early 20th century, a ban on bride prices attracted some young men of the Lisu to convert to Christianity, especially families that could not afford to pay for a bride price. Fourth, celebrating marriage by singing hymns, praying and speaking the Bible. While the provision doesn’t explicitly state that the Lisu must abandon traditional marriage customs after they believe in Jesus, it does point out that Christians do not do the “bride crying”, which is one of the Lisu traditions. The missionaries classified the customs related to the Lisu’s traditional culture into the scope of “old customs” or “old self”, so they stipulated that they should celebrate marriage by singing hymns, praying and preaching, which implied the subconsciousness of transferring the Lisu culture from the traditional culture to the Christian culture. However, rather than completely

[9] 《M:MILO:7》,怒江傈僳族自治州基督教三自爱国运动委员会印 Nujiang Lisu Autonomous State Christian Three Self Patriotic Movement Committee Seal, 1988, P40-42.

[10] According to the author investigation, today, there are still early marriages in The Lisu region of China and Burma.

denying the traditional culture or fully copying the Christian culture, the changes of marriage customs of Lisu Christians are selective to some extent.

In the first half of the 20th century, the Lisu people who converted to Christianity strictly observed religious rules and doctrines in real life, and regulated individuals, families and the church with them. One of them was intermarriage within the church. The tradition of interchurch marriage continued until the early 1980s. Taking several cases of internal marriage in different periods in K village of Nujiang and other Lisu villages as examples, we discuss the relationship between the spread of Christianity and internal marriage of Lisu nationality.

Since 1930, the missionary team represented by Madao min (Morison), an American missionary of the Church of God, introduced Christianity to the Lisu area of Fugong, Nujiang, and intra-religious marriage became a way of marriage for the Lisu Christians there. A man named J, living in a village across the river from K village, converted to Christianity under the influence of Ma Daomin and others. In 1941, the local clergyman served as a matchmaker, and sent a marriage proposal letter^[11] to the J's lover for J. "Dear XXX, in the Lord, I would like to have you as my wife. Will you marry me?" The proposal letter is usually written in the Lisu language, expressing the man's wish to marry a wife and hope that the woman could marry the man as his wife according to the will of "Usa" (God). Written by a member of the clergy such as a Mapa^[12] or a deacon or a liturgy in the church to which the man belongs, the proposal letter is handed to the clergy of the church to which the woman belongs, who then sends it to the woman's home. Before sending the letter, the matchmaker (priest) should contact the clergy members of the church to which woman belongs in advance and ask them to inquire about the woman's situation and wishes. If the woman agrees to allow the man to propose marriage, the matchmaker (Mapa) of the man will bring the man and several of his immediate male relatives (father, uncle) to the village where the woman lives to propose to her. When proposing, the man explains why he came, then hands the letter to the woman and waits for her reply. If the woman agrees on the spot, the engagement begins. The engagement process is mainly to discuss the date of marriage, the required bride price and banquets, etc. The engagement matters can be decided on the same day or discussed later. Part of the engagement process is to "educate" the bride-to-be and the groom-to-be to love each other and live in harmony after getting married, and not to "complain" to their parents just because of minor conflicts.

After the woman agreed, the clergy held a wedding ceremony for J and his fiancée in the church, Ma Daomin being one of the witnesses. The wedding was celebrated with hymns, sermons and prayers. When praying for the bride and groom, Ma Daomin held their tightly clasped hands, meaning that with the blessing of God and friends, the couple will accompany each other for life. According to J, there was no exchange of gifts between the bride and the groom, and Lisu language in both oral and written forms were used throughout the whole process.

On the wedding day, the bride's family invited the whole village to do "Lajado"^[13] at the groom's home. J's family treated them with pork, honey water and broth. At that time, not many

[11] It, in Lisu language, means to deliver letters, refers to send proposals of marriage.

[12] Mapa, in Lisu language, is a term applied by the Lisu people to clergymen and clergymen of the church.

[13] "La Jiaduo" was originally meant to drink tea. When the Lisu Christians invited friends and relatives to the wedding, they used "La Jiaduo" as a reference, which is equivalent to a guest in Chinese. It is a euphemism for "banquets" by the Lisu.

people in Fugong believed in Christianity, but all the Christians in J's village attended his wedding. Few non-Christians would go to the church to attend a wedding. As J's family was very poor at that time, he did not send "Ran Mei Pu"^[14] to the wife's family except for a linen blanket to his mother-in-law. When he returned to his mother-in-law's home^[15] three days after the wedding, he did not give them a pig, but pieces of pork as a gesture. Both J and his wife's families are Christians living in the same village, so her parents did not ask for a bride price. J said: "If it wasn't for the grace of God, I would have had a hard time getting a wife."^[16] Because of poverty, J did not provide each of his wife's relatives and friends with a dustpan meal^[17] for the wedding banquet, but instead divided them into groups of five or six, each group sharing one dustpan meal.

Ahci of K Village and his wife's marriage in 1956 is an intra-Christian one. Ahci had suffered from diarrhea and fever since he was born in 1938. At the time, his parents believed in the Lisu traditional religion, which was mainly animistic. Because medicine was scarce, they tried to cure the child by calling in Nipah (the traditional priest in the Lisu people) to offer sacrifices to the devil. But even after using up the family's pigs, chickens and sheep, Ahci did not get better. When he was five or six months old, his parents sold their cows in order to go to the Nipah who was more skilled in witchcraft in another village for help. Halfway through, they met Ma Daomin, who was preaching around K village. Knowing this, Ma Daomin put his right hand on Ahci's head and prayed for him. Then he took some western medicine and gave it to Ahci. He advised Ahci's parents not to go to the Nipah to offer sacrifices to ghosts, reassuring them that "God will heal the child." After a while, Ahci's disease went away unexpectedly. Since then, his parents converted to Christianity, so did Ahci. Later, his father died of illness, leaving the young Ahci with his mother. When he was about 15 years old, he learned about the Bible and Lisu language from the local clergy, so he had a certain understanding of Christianity. At the age of 18, with the help of the church, he married a woman (Christian) from his village. Naantali, the first Lisu priest in Fugong trained by Ma Daomin in the first half of the 20th century^[18], served as a witness at their wedding ceremony and prayed for them. Because Ahci's family did not have any savings, he did not give bride price to his wife's parents. On the wedding day, Ahci invited 20 or 30 friends from the church for a simple meal. He did not give his wife a promise fee.^[19]

If in the first half of the 20th century, Christians in the Lisu region of China and Myanmar didn't need bride price for marriage, then after 1980, there were cases of giving and receiving gifts in this

[14] "Ran Mei Pu" means bride price.

[15] Lisu said, It is *Mai Lai Mu* in Lisu language.

[16] From August 5 to 6, 2012, the author interviewed with J in Muguja village, Fugong County, Nujiang State.

[17] Lisu said *Z, d V: C E*. It is customary for a man to send a dustpan meal to each wife's relatives and friends when Lisu get married. The dustpan rice is corn rice or rice, which is covered with 10—20 pieces of lump meat, each lump weighing 20—30 grams. Dustpan rice has two kinds, one kind is to immediate family members, one is for general friends and relatives, the former said *YI. C E*. (yi jin), namely the root, pointed to relatives, including her parents bilateral immediate relatives; The latter said *WU. 1: (wu e)*. The former carries twice as much food as the latter when it is divided into dustpans. Therefore, the wedding day to send a dustpan meal contains the blood relationship, marriage, the relationship with the village, friends and other social relations.

[18] 朱发德主编 Zhu Fahde:《滇西基督教史》The history of Christianity in western Yunnan, 怒新出(2007)准印字第 20 号 Nujiang New issue(2007) Mo. 20, 2008, P106, P351-352.

[19] It is *Ni pu yan* or *Ni pu pu* in Lisu language, the former thought as token of promise a piece of cloth, which specify the promise fee.

region. The Ahci couple had seven children. Two of the sons died young, and now one son and four daughters are alive. His five children were married from 1985 to 1998 in the form of intramural marriage. In 1985, Ahci's son, Ahke, married Ahmi, a village girl who was the granddaughter of pastor Natany. In 1986, the eldest daughter Ahna (20) married Ahyon (22) from another natural village in the same village. Later, the second, third and the fourth daughter married Christian men from the same village. When the eldest daughter got married, her husband Ahyong's family gave her 150 yuan as a "ran mei pu" and 40 yuan as a promissory fee. On the wedding day, Ahyon's family slaughtered a big bull, four or five big pigs to entertain her relatives and friends. They also prepared "yi jin" dustpan rice for both her father's and mother's immediate families, and "wu e" dustpan rice for her other relatives and friends. On the day of betrothal and the day of returning to the bride's home, a big fat pig^[20] was sent to her parents'. The bride's family sent a pig to Ayon's family as a return gift, which was given to his relatives and friends by his parents. When the third and second daughters got married, they received a "Nepupu" of 30 yuan, and a "Ran mei Pu" of 200 yuan for their parents. When the fourth daughter got married, her "Nepupu" was 100 yuan, and the "Ranmeipu" was 200 yuan.

For Ahci's grandchildren, "promise fees" and betrothal gifts have increased. From 2000 to 2019, the six of Ahci's grandchildren got married within the church in accordance with Christian protocol. His eldest grandson got married at the age of 16 in 2000, but his wife eloped with others, so he had to divorce her. When he got married again in 2004, he gave his fiancée 200 yuan as a promise fee and 1,000 yuan as a bride price. During the wedding, he killed three pigs and gave one to wife's family. In 2008, when the second grandson got married at the age of 16, he intended to give his fiancée 400 yuan as a promise fee, but ended up giving 1,000 yuan as required by her parents. The wedding cost a total of 18,000 yuan. When Ahni (the second daughter of Ahci's eldest daughter) got married at the age of 20, her husband gave her 1,000 yuan as a promise fee, and 4,000 yuan as bride price to her parents. When Ahhu (the eldest son of Ahci's eldest daughter) got married in 2012, he gave 2,000 yuan to his wife as promise fee and 6,000 yuan to her parents. Ah Kong (the eldest daughter of Ahci's fourth daughter) got married in 2019 at the age of 20, the legal age for marriage stipulated by the state. Ah Kong received 2,000 yuan from the groom as a promise fee and 20,000 yuan as a bride price for her parents.

In the above cases, J and Ahci began to believe in Christianity in the 1930s. Ahci's sons and daughters, daughters-in-law and sons-in-law began to believe in Christianity after 1979, and his grandchildren believed in Christianity under the influence of their parents and grandparents. There is a certain "familial inheritance". All his children and grandchildren followed the rules of intermarriage in the church. Compared with the Lisu Christians, who followed the "tradition" of the intra-Christian marriage before 1956, changes have taken place in terms of promise fees and bride price since the 1980s. For example, the church set a limit of 200 yuan for bride price^[21] in the early 1980s. However, the amount has been incrising since 1990s, especially after 2000, reaching over ten thousand yuan in 2019. Changes have also occurred in wedding customs. The most remarkable one is that the bride and

[20] After taking out the pig intestines, send the head, limbs, liver, heart, lung and other organs together with suet.

[21] On June 3, 2020, the author interviewed Sasa, the second daughter of Ahci in K village in Nujiang, Yunnan.

groom, who used to wear the traditional Lisu dress throughout whole wedding process, would now put on a wedding dress at the wedding banquet, which the author has noticed ten years before while investigating in Lisu area in Mymmar. In recent years, Christian couples in Nujiang Lisu area also wear wedding dress or Hanfu on their wedding day. The third change is the dustpan meal given to the bride's parents and relatives, which becomes a piece of raw pork now. As the price of pork rose in the past two or three years, grass carp or carp bought in the market are also used, but are still divided into "Yijin" and "Wu e". By comparing the marriages of the four generations of Ahci's family in K village, we find that the local Lisu Christians have followed the tradition of internal marriage, but not completely in accordance with the "Ten Commandments of Marriage" stipulated by missionaries in the early 20th century. In fact, there was no such rule as "no dowry" after the 1980s. On the contrary, bride price and promise fees generated by intra-marriage among Christians in different historical periods vary, and are showing an increasing trend over time. In addition, the Lisu believers who converted to Christianity in the first half of the 20th century strictly followed the "Ten Commandments of Marriage" stipulated by the missionaries in the Lisu area of China and Myanmar when they got married, but held a "tolerant" attitude after 1980.

The marriage of J and the four generations of the Ahci's family in the above case seems to be conducted entirely in accordance with the Christian ceremony, but in fact, such ceremonies and procedures as marriage proposal by the matchmaker, engagement, banquet, and returning to the wife's home, are nothing but a continuance of the Lisu people's traditional marriage custom. What differs is that the role of matchmakers and witnesses played by the venerable elders of the family or the village who were eloquent and accomplished in music and traditional religion is now served by clergymen. Another difference is that the singing of folk songs and worship of ancestors (sacrifice) becomes preaching, singing hymns and praying. The object of praying for bless has also changed. Drinking alcohol has been replaced by drinking honey water and tea. It can be said that despite the change of people's religious belief, the symbolic meaning of rituals and customs remains unchanged. The greatest change in marriage customs in the early period when Christianity was introduced into the Nujiang was that marriage between Christians did not require a bride price. Besides rituals and ceremonies were the simplified, though their significance or purpose remains the same.

The introduction of Christianity changed the Lisu custom of calculating the bride price by cattle. When Christianity entered into the Lisu area on the northern border of China and Myanmar, Lisu intra-Christian marriage was conducted in a simplified way without bride price, because it was done according to "God's grace". The bride's family did not ask for any bride price. A meal with relatives and friends of both families would suffice. Lisu Christians believed it was Usa's will that united a man and his wife. So as long as they liked each other and were willing to marry each other, no bride price can be accepted. This was prescribed by the missionaries. When J got married, he did not give his wife and her parents a promise fee or a bride price, but he had prepared dustpan meals which indicated his closeness with relatives and friends. To some extent, treating different groups of people as "brothers and sisters" (members of the church) has eliminated people's differences in identity and status. It could be safely said that the most significant feature of intra-Christian marriage is that it has changed the unequal marital relation in the Lisu traditional marriage customs into a relatively equal one.

III. Marriage Transition from Intra-Christian Marriage and Intra & Extra Christian Marriage

The period between 1957 and 1978 witnessed a vacuum of Christian belief in the Lisu region of China. As a result, the rule of intra-Christian marriage was broken. After 1980, with the recovery of Christian faith and social development, intra-Christian marriage coexisted with elopement and other marriage forms. Previously we have presented several cases of intra-Christian marriage. Next, we will continue to take village K as an example to discuss the local transition of marriage customs from intra-Christian marriage to coexistence of intra-Christian marriage and extra-Christian marriage.

Lisu Christians had observed the “Ten Provisions” from the beginning of the 20th century to 1956. However, the practice of intra-Christian marriage among Christians was interrupted between 1957 and 1978. Although the Christian faith was restored after 1980, the ecclesiastical rules of intra-Christian marriage prescribed by the missionaries had suffered a blow. Influenced by the China’s Reform and Opening Up, some Lisu Christian girls in Nujiang married local non-Christian men, mostly by way of elopement. Difference in religious belief was the main reason for elopement in this period. In most of the cases, it was Christian girls who married non-Christian men. Most of those who eloped were in a romantic relationship and had had sex with each other before eloping. Lovers who fail to win their parents’ permission for marriage also chose to elope. After elopement, the man would take the girl to her parents’ home to apologize. Usually a requirement of betrothal gifts would be made, but some parents did not want any. Around 1990, some Lisu Christian girls married men from other provinces like Shandong, Henan, Hubei and Zhejiang and followed them there. Since it was very difficult for them to return to their parents’ home again from such far-away places, the men’s families would offer several thousands of RMB as betrothal gifts to show their gratitude for the girls’ parents. And there were some girls who were sold to other provinces by human traffickers. Thus, the problem was whether parents should accept or ask for betrothal gifts? According to the church rules, Christians were not allowed to accept betrothal gifts, not to mention taking the initiative to ask for them. So parents who had accepted betrothal gifts were required to make a public confession to God, the clergy and other church members afterwards. This was a constraint imposed by the church with respect to intra-Christian marriage, the purpose of which was to regulate and unite church members.

The parents who had accepted betrothal gifts were convicted, and were not allowed to shake hands with the clergy, take communion, be baptized, preach, lead a chorus or pray for others in the church during conviction. If they fell ill, others could not pray for them either. Some “Marpa”s were disqualified as a result of accepting thousands of RMB as betrothal gifts from their sons-in-law in other provinces. To some extent, such punishment had consolidated and strengthened the “Ten Provisions on marriage” recorded in the “M I M I LO: 7”. However, the clergy of Lisu ethnicity in China and Myanmar seemed to have misinterpreted some of the provisions. For instance, what “Rule 5” said was that it was better not to accept betrothal gifts, but what was practiced at the grass-root level churches was “betrothal gifts are banned”. The missionaries’ intention was to reduce believers’

financial burden, but the practice was vastly different from Lisu people's traditional marriage custom. Due to local economic development and people's growing open-mindedness in Lisu area, Lisu Christians in Nujiang started to accept betrothal gifts by the end of the 1980s and especially the beginning of the 1990s. They believed that betrothal gifts were a gesture of gratitude for parents' rearing and support. It had aroused many discussions among churches and their believers at the beginning, and some parents even got convicted for accepting betrothal gifts. But later as time went by, the church turned a blind eye to it. For instance, Ah Yong from village K got married according to Christian protocol in 1986. He gave the bride RMB 40 as a token of love, and gave RMB 150 to her parents as betrothal gifts. In addition, he slaughtered a cow and four or five pigs to treat her relatives and friends to dinner, and gave each of them an extra meal to take away. At that time, Ah Yong was the first man in village K to slaughter a cattle for a wedding since the restoration of Christian faith in the 1980s. The wedding was a grand one combining the traditional wedding custom of Lisu ethnicity with Christian rituals. After the wedding ceremony in the church, Ah Yong and his wife went to the local authorities to apply for a marriage certificate. Three days later, accompanied by the best man and the bridesmaid, the couple visited the bride's parents, bringing a pig, 4 packets of brick tea^[22], 1 bag of sugar^[23], several packets of milk powder^[24] and other gifts. The betrothal gifts Ah Yong gave his parents-in-law seemed not to be a staggering sum, but in fact the cost was huge. This was different from the situation in the early 20th century when intra-Christian marriage did all things without betrothal gifts.

Ah Yong has three sisters and all of them believe in Christianity. Two of his younger sisters eloped in 1990s because their parents did not allow them to marry non-Christian men. For Christians, elopement was a disgrace. So when the two men came with the girls to "apologize", Ah Yong's parents demanded a dowry of 2,000 yuan each. In the end, they gave 1000 yuan, a bag of white sugar and a bag of milk powder instead. Since the eloped could not get married in the Church. So the two couples did not hold wedding ceremonies, nor did they entertain their relatives and friends, which was money saving. If the ceremony was conducted according to Christian etiquette, a man only needed to give a woman 150—200 yuan RMB as dowry. Two years after the her sister's elopement, Ah Yong's youngest sister married a non-Christian man in Zhejiang Province, whom give her parents 7,000 yuan as bride price. Because all three daughters (Christians) were married to non-Christians and two of them chose to elope, Ah Yong's parents were punished by the local church. They were not allowed to make public prayers in the church for three to four months, or to shake hands with the clergy during religious services. Besides, they had to make confession in the church from time to time, so that the church could pray for "forgiveness of sin" for them on the grounds of their honesty and sincerity. It was not an honor to be convicted by the church. Therefore, parents would often remind their children and the church its members to marry Christians. However, there were a small number of people who would violate the "regulations" and elope or marry non-Christians.

[22] The weight of pork was more than 50kg.

[23] There were 4 pieces of brick tea in each bag.

[24] A bag of white sugar weighed about 40kg. .

Ahci, who has been mentioned previously, had a granddaughter named Xiao Xiao. While working in Zhejiang Province, her aunt who was living there introduced her to a local Han nationality, a non-Christian man. The two fell in love and got married in 2008. According to the local Han custom, the man's family gave Xiao Xiao a set of gold jewelry and a dowry^[25] to her parents in Nujiang. Her parents built a new house with the bride price. Asa, another granddaughter of Ahci's, fell in love with a non-Christian man. They used to visit each other's parents together during the Spring Festival before getting married, which according to the local tradition was a "bashful" behavior. However, since Asa and her boyfriend were highly educated and had passed the legal age for marriage, her parents believed that they could treat marriage rationally. Moreover, they were all good children in the eyes of their parents and financially independent. Therefore, their parents respected their choices. As for bride price, Asa's parents had requirements. In addition to a bride-price of over 100,000 yuan, they asked Asa for an extra 100,000 yuan as a reward for bring her up and paying her tuition fees from primary school to university, which they believed that they deserved.

One of Ahci's grandsons, Ahde, fell in love with a girl at college. He brought his girlfriend home after graduation while his parents were away. He denied being in love when his parents who had learned about it planned to make engagement for him. After all, he had just turned 20, and was uncertain about his future. There are a group of people in K village who have found a job after graduation from junior college or polytechnic school since 1990s. Most of them were Christians when they were young, but stopped going to the church and for various reasons after working. They neither eloped with their lovers nor held church wedding ceremonies, but instead they got married by getting engaged first and then holding a wedding ceremony. Their wedding ceremonies were usually held in the village or in the city. And the main purpose was to entertain relatives, friends and colleagues. If it was held in the city, they would no longer prepare the "dustpan rice" for the woman's relatives and friends. Instead, 8—10 people who attended the wedding would sit at the same table and eat together, and no sugar-sweetened water or broth was provided. The host of a wedding ceremony has also changed from the clergyman to the leader from their working units. This kind of wedding is obviously influenced by Han culture and modern trends. In the future, rural college students like Asa and Ahde will also get married by following the same procedure of holding a wedding ceremony after getting engaged, during which the details of the ceremony such as whether to follow the traditional or a modern one will be negotiated between two families. That is to say, in addition to intra-Christian marriage and elopement, there is a new marriage fashion for the Lisu Christians in K village, which combines tradition with modernity.

Today, though the church's "rules and regulations" about marriage do not change, but life has changed, or to put it in another way, has become more inclusive. For example, if a Christian marries a non-Christian, they cannot be married in a church and the clergy will not host the wedding for them. However, as long as the believer comes to the church to confess his/her sin after marriage, they will be convicted for a period ranging from 4 or 5 months to 1 year. When the conviction is over, the deacon or Mapa will pray for him/her for the "forgiveness of sin", after which they will be recognized by the church again, and will be viewed as being no different from other believers again. However,

[25] Xiao Xiao and her parents did not disclose the exact amount of the bride price.

the church does not pursue those who do not confess. What's more, as their income increases, it is no longer surprising for Christians to get married with bride price. In Lisu people's opinion, bride price is a way in which the groom's family expresses gratitude to the bride's parents for caring and bringing up their daughter-in-law. From the 1990s to now, the bride price of the Lisu Christian marriage has increased from dozens of yuan to tens of thousands of yuan today. For Christians, bride price is not the most important. What is important is that they can invite a priest to write a proposal letter for them, propose marriage to their beloved, hold the wedding ceremony in the church with the consent of both the girls and their parents, and become husband and wife in the name of Usa. The whole process from marriage proposal, engagement to wedding is witnessed by the clergy of the church, relatives and other members of the church, which enhances the sense of ceremony and sacredness of the wedding. Hence there are relatively few divorces, because "Usa" (God) does not allow believers to divorce. This type of marriage is what most Christians aspire to and pursue because it brings a sense of honor.

In recent years, as more young people in village K go to university, the number of people working in the state system also increases. Although most of them believed in Christianity when they were young, they do not go to church after leaving their hometown for school or work. Parents and local churches show great tolerance for this group of people, not requiring them to marry Christians.

During the follow-up investigation in Myitkyina from 2010 to 2019, the author also found changes in the marriage mode in Lisu village M from intra-Christian marriage to coexistence of intra-Christian marriage with elopement and other extra-Christian marriage. There has been intermarriage between the Lisu Christians in Myanmar and Buddhist believers, Islamists, and Han folk religious believers in Theravada. The author has attended many weddings of Lisu Christians in Myanmar. Compared with those in China, Lisu Christians in Myanmar pursue a stronger sense of ceremony as far as wedding is concerned. They attach great importance to the significance of Usa (God) in marriage. At the same time, they also pay great attention to wedding commemoration and have the habit of taking wedding photos. The wedding venue includes home and a number of locations inside and outside the church. The main ceremony of the wedding is completed in the church. After the ceremony, the newly-wed couple get their marriage certificates from the priest who marry them in the church, on which the priest, the bride, the groom and their parents will sign their names. The marriage certificates issued by the church have been authorized by the local government, so they have the same legal significance as those issued by the government. They are written in both Burmese and Lisu characters, and a stub of the issued certificate would be kept in the church. During the wedding ceremony, the priest will stress the importance of Usa (God) in marriage and the sanctity of marriage through preaching, praying and fellow believers' singing of blessing. The parents and elders of the bride and groom will also emphasize the role of Usa in marriage when offering their advice and wisdom. In short, in a solemn and joyous wedding service, the couple and the Christians present once again review the Biblical story of Usa's creation of the world and human beings through the sermons of the priest. At the church wedding, the bride and groom are wearing Lisu costumes while the bride wears a bridal veil. After the wedding, the young people followed the bride and groom to join in the fun. The bride in her wedding dress and the groom in his suits will attend the wedding banquet, and distribute wedding candies to guests. During the banquet, there will be bands singing. The whole

wedding process will be recorded by photos and videos.

In the process of proposal and betrothal, the Lisu traditional marriage custom still continues. For example, non-Christians need to invite “Zi: MO:” (matchmaker) in the marriage proposal, while Christians ask clergymen to be matchmakers. Although the people they hire are different, their role as a matchmaker throughout the ceremony remains the same. For another example, different from non-Christians’ drinking alcohol and dancing “guangqing” (Lisu dance) in the wedding ceremony, Christians drink white sugar water, milk, coffee, broth, eat pilaf with hand, sing hymns, sermons, prayers, and dance holy dances. Lisu people who believe in traditional religions have an ancestor worship ceremony when they get married, and Christians replace the ancestor worship ceremony with praying and praising Usa.

Conclusion

There are many reasons for the marriage change of Lisu nationality in the northern part of the border between China and Myanmar. Social development, economy, education and the change of marriage and family concept all affect people’s choice of marriage. Among them, the introduction of Christianity in the first half of the 20th century had a great impact. The spread of Christianity changed the traditional marriage customs of Lisu nationality, such as marriage by captures, cross-cousin marriage and engagement between babies. Instead, it is replaced by intra-religion marriage, but it is not the only marriage mode for Lisu Christians. The rational choices made by the Lisu people in the Christian faith in different historical periods can be investigated from the perspective of changes in the marriage mode. The author believes that this is one of Lisu’s survival wisdoms and it is a way for them to adapt to social development. It is also a manifestation of the localization of Christianity in the northern border between China and Myanmar. The process of marriage transition, from marriage by capture, elopement, intra-religion marriage to intra and outer-religion marriage, is a process of two-way adaptation and integration of the traditional culture of Christianity and Lisu people. It has also blended the country’s social development at the same time. It provides a research perspective and helps us to further understand the significance of the localization of Christianity in cross-border ethnic areas.

中文题目:

基督教与中缅北界傈僳族婚姻方式的变迁——以怒江 K 村为例

作者:沙丽娜, 云南大学民族学与社会学学院民族学博士生, 云南省昆明市翠湖北路二号, 650091, 电话: +86-150-8712-8-195, 邮箱: 450654408@qq.com; 曹韩, 德宏师范高等专科学校孟中印缅关系研究所副教授, 云南省德宏州芒市拉怀村, 678400, 电话: +86-152-8722-1-208, 邮箱: caohan2013@gmail.com.

摘要:从抢婚、私奔、教内婚到教内外婚并存的婚姻方式变迁历程, 是中缅北界傈僳族在不同历史时期对基督教的“理性”选择的结果, 亦是基督教与傈僳族传统文化之间的双向融合过程, 折射出傈僳族社会发展轨迹。本文以基督教的传入与发展作为切入点, 考察怒江 K 村傈僳族的婚姻变迁, 为跨境民族基督教本土化提供一个研究视角, 有助于我们进一步认识跨境民族地区基督教本土化的地方性意义。

关键词:中缅北界; 傈僳族; 基督教; 婚姻方式变迁; 生存智慧

Becoming a martyr in China: The Steyl Missionary Father Paul Buhl (1902—1944)

Prelate Prof. Dr. Helmut Moll

(The Archdiocese of Cologne, Germany)

To counteract oblivion, Pope John Paul II. (1920—2005) initiated a comprehensive reappraisal of the Christian victims of violence in the 20th century. The German Bishops' Conference took up this idea and asked the author of this article to compile the German Martyrology, together with 170 experts. The two-volume magnum opus "Witnesses for Christ. The German Martyrology of the 20th Century" is available since 2019 in its seventh, revised and updated edition.



Father Paul Buhl (1902—1944)

In his Post-Synodal Apostolic Exhortation *Ecclesia in Asia* of November 6, 1999, Pope John Paul II. directed attention to the blood witnesses who, especially in the 20th century, had a special significance. In the course of the centuries, the Asian continent has given the Church and the world a multitude of these heroes of faith, and in the heart of Asia resounds the great hymn of praise: "Te martyrum candidatus laudat exercitus". This is the hymn of those who died for Christ on Asiatic soil in the first centuries of the Church, and also the joyful shout of men and women of a less distant past, saints such as Paul Miki, Lorenzo Ruiz, Andrew Dung Lac, Andrew Kim Taegon, and their respective companions. May the numerous martyrs of Asia, old and new, always keep before the Church of their continent what it means to bear witness to the Lamb in whose blood they washed their robes and made them white (cf. Rev 7:14)! May they always be indomitable witnesses to that fact that Christians are always and everywhere called to proclaim nothing but the Cross of the Lord! Through the blood of the martyrs of Asia, may new life for the Church arise today and always in every corner of the continent" (n. 49).

Among the thousands of witnesses to the blood and faith of the 20th century, one of these "heroes of the faith" is the Steyl missionary Fr. Paul Buhl. His cradle stood in the small Upper Silesian village of Winau about three kilometers southwest of the city center of the metropolis of Opole. It was first mentioned in 1412, and in pre-Christian times there was a sacred mountain on this hill. During the Thirty Years War (1618—1648) the village was burnt down. In the 19th century the village had less than 300 inhabitants. Paul was born as the legitimate son of the farmer Johann Buhl (* 1862 Winau) and his wife Franziska, (family name before marriage: Skrzypczyk (* 1869 Bogutschütz) on March 11, 1902 in Winau. His older siblings were Josef and Johann, his younger ones Anastasia, Maria, Alfons, Franz and Robert; they were all born in Winau. His parents' fathers

also practiced the profession of farmer. Paul attended elementary school in the nearby village of Gorek; on April 22, 1911, he received First Holy Communion in Opole.

At the age of twelve, his parents sent Paul to the mission house of the Steyl missionaries in Heiligkreuz, not far from the Upper Silesian town of Neisse. This was the first mission house of the Steyl missionaries on German soil, founded in 1892 by St. Arnold Janssen (1837—1909), the founder of the Society of the Divine Word (SVD), after it had been recommended to the imperial government by the senior pastor in charge of Breslau, Prince-Bishop Georg Cardinal von Kopp (1837—1914). On January 31, 1892, Superior General Janssen acquired the “Schäferei” estate with a plot of 125 acres. In the school established here, classes began on October 16, 1892, with eight pupils. Its purpose was to educate young students at a private grammar school associated with a boys’ convict, to prepare them for a later missionary vocation. This mission house, which became the Provincial House of the German Eastern Province in 1927, grew from year to year, and in 1900 it already had 250 students. In 1904 there were 31 Fathers, 46 Brothers and 236 alumni living in the Mission House. During the First World War, the stream of wounded and sick who were treated and cared for in Heiligkreuz, which had been transformed into a military hospital, did not cease.

Obviously, Paul’s vocation to the religious life matured during this time, because after successfully completing his studies at the Lower Austrian Mission House of St. Gabriel in Mödling near Vienna, he decided to join the Missionary Society of the Divine Word. The mission of the risen Christ will have inspired him: “Go and make disciples of all nations; baptize them in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit, teaching them to observe all that I have commanded you” (Mt 28: 19-20; cf. Lk 24: 47-49; Mk 16: 15-16; Jn 20: 21). At the age of 19, Paul began the novitiate in the Missionary Seminary of St. Gabriel. Following the probationary period, during which the Order tested him and he tested the spirituality of the Order, came the period of temporary vows. He promised to live the Gospel-derived virtues of poverty, chastity and obedience in the community for a set period of time. Since he aspired to the priesthood, he underwent philosophical and theological studies at St. Gabriel. The definitive commitment to the Order took place in 1927 through perpetual vows. One calendar year later, Frater Buhl was finally ordained to the priesthood in the monastery church of St. Gabriel, after the lower ordinations, the subdeaconate and diaconate ordinations. At the same time, the new priest received his missionary appointment for China.

Pope Leo XIII (1810—1903) had already paid special attention to the expansion of the Chinese mission. In view of future local synods, he divided it into five regions in 1879. In addition, the pope issued methodological instructions to the missionaries to China in 1883. Finally, he expanded the hierarchy in China. A move away from Eurocentrism was also promoted by his successor, Pope Pius X. (1835—1914). Pope Benedict XV (1854—1922) set a new emphasis in his circular *Maximum illud* of Nov. 30, 1919, which built on Leo XIII’s circular *Sancta Dei Civitas* of Dec. 3, 1880. In it, the pope rejected any colonial mission and called for the formation of a native clergy. At the same time, he called for a willingness to magnanimously accept possible “blows of fate, hardship, ignominy, hardship and hunger, even cruel death, if it can only snatch a single soul from the depths of hell” (AAS 19, 1919, 450). In 1922, Pope Pius XI (1857—1939) established the Apostolic Delegation in Beijing. As reasons for this measure, the Pope cited his love for the Chinese people, the unification of missionary work and the new upswing of the missionary work. He appointed Archbishop Celso

Costantini (1876—1958) as the first Apostolic Delegate, who held his office from 1922 to 1933. In the period from May 14 to June 12, 1924, the first Chinese National Council was held in Shanghai, with special emphasis on the elimination of tensions between the foreign and Chinese clergy, the redivision of the mission territories, which had grown to 64, and the gradual transfer of the leadership of ecclesiastical jurisdictional districts to the Chinese clergy. Two years later, on October 28, 1926, six Chinese bishops could be consecrated by the Pope in St. Peter's Basilica.

The superiors of the Congregation for the Missions had designated the province of Kansu for Father Buhl. Therefore, the new priest set out from Europe and traveled to the East Asian country. At the beginning there was the necessary language study, which he completed at the Steyl headquarters in Yanzhou (Shandong Province). All missionaries, foreign as well as local, were to receive special qualification for their mission. The result of these efforts was not only a linguistically better trained missionary staff, but also an enrichment of sinological studies. A visible expression of this became the *Monumenta Serica*, published by the Steyl missionaries from 1935 to the present day.

Father Buhl's superior in the mission was the Austrian Steyler missionary Father Dr. Johann Frick (1903—2003), and his superior was the German Archbishop Theodor Buddenbrock (1878—1959), Steyler missionary like him. According to Fr. Frick, Father Buhl was a quiet, calm confrere, pious and dignified, not a spoilsport, respected by the superiors. One could talk well with him, especially about pastoral care. He never maliciously criticized the work of others and helped where he could. He was also a contented man as far as food and board were concerned. Although he attested to independent thinking, he was sociable and liked by everyone despite his health problems. Even Archbishop Buddenbrock was always accommodating towards Father Buhl.

In 1931, Father Buhl began his missionary work in Zhangye, which is in the Lanzhou diocese. Seven years later he moved to West Kansu in the Wuwei/Xixiang area. The missionary work was greatly hindered by the ever-advancing exercise of power by the Communists. The Sino-Japanese War (1937—1945) and the outbreak of the Japanese-American War in 1941 did the rest. In view of these circumstances, the mission was hampered, indeed in the Communist-occupied northern provinces it was not insignificantly destroyed by waves of bloody and bloodless persecution. On March 19, 1937, Pope Pius XI, in his encyclical *Divini Redemptoris*, strongly condemned the teachings of communism. "Many priests and religious—three-fifths of those who worked in China in 1940 came from abroad—had been killed, and most of the foreign priests and religious had been interned" (Rivinius, *Art. China* III. 2, in *Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche* 2 1994, 1061). Father Buhl also had to flee together with his confreres because of the advance of the communists. During the escape he did not have a single seizure, despite all the hardships and dangers. The group fled over the mountains to Xining, the capital of Qinghai province. The way was difficult, the pack was large. Fr. Johann Frick recorded in this regard: "Fr. Paul Buhl was with me, he was already older, had epileptic seizures. Later he came to Xixiang, where the good confrere had rest until the good Lord called him away after his typhoid illness. It was a real martyrdom for him, this epilepsy. However, some of the confreres did not take this illness seriously." Further it says: "Father Buhl probably already got [on the flight] the harbingers of a seizure, twitching with the lips etc". Then Fr. Trippner (they were classmates and compatriots) said to him: Paul, don't make me any stories; if you get a seizure, we can't take care of

you, we have to move on; and Buhl then actually did not get a single seizure. From this some concluded that it was probably not epilepsy. But who can judge that—at least not me! When he was with me in Xincheng, he once had a seizure at the beginning of Holy Mass; the altar boy ran away, two men jumped over the communion bench, caught him in their arms. The local sisters asked me to send him away; they could not have devotions when he was at the altar; they always had to look to see if he would fall over“(SVD Archives, Sankt Augustin)”. Father Buhl died in 1944 in Wuwei/Xixiang (Kansu Province) as a result of his flight from the communists. He was not 43 years old. The Polish priest and scholar Andrzej Hanich honored Father Buhl in his Opole Martyrology from 2009 as a blood witness of the Church.

中文题目：

在中国成为一个殉道者：Steyl 传教士保罗布赫尔神甫 (1902—1944)

作者：历史学教授赫尔穆特·摩尔博士, Representative of the Archdiocese of Cologne for Beatifications canonizations and Editor of the German Martyrology of the 20th Century, Cologne, Germany. Email: Helmut.Moll@erzbistum-koeln.de

《国学与西学：国际学刊》 (中英文双语半年刊)

投稿须知

《国学与西学国际学刊》(GUOXUE YU XIXUE Guoji Xuekan)创刊于2011年12月,由国学与西学北欧论坛(Nordic Forum of Sino-Western Studies)主办、赫尔辛基大学世界文化系宗教学中心、北京大学高等人文研究院世界宗教与普世伦理中心、与吉林大学文学院国学与西学比较研究中心协办之中英文双语学术期刊,整合北欧四国(芬兰、瑞典、挪威、丹麦)学者之力,每年于芬兰出版两期(六月及十二月出版)。栏目有:

“人学、神学与国学”(人学乃启蒙运动以来强调理性的学术,神学乃关于上帝及研究基督教的学术,而国学则指中国精神体系之研究);

“实践神学与中西教会和社会”(实践神学乃现实中基督教实践之研究,中西教会/社会乃指中国与欧美等传统上以基督教为信仰和精神体系的基督教会与社会);

“中西经典与圣经”(中西经典乃中国及西方的宗教、人文经典,而圣经则指基督宗教的圣典);

“教会历史与中西文明变迁”(教会历史乃基督教会之历史,中西乃中国与欧美等传统上以基督教为信仰和精神体系的社会);

“比较宗教文化研究”(比较宗教文化研究乃中国、欧美等西方国家的宗教与文化之比较研究);

“书评与通讯”(书评乃对主题为国学与西学的新书之述评,而通讯则指同样主题的学术动态与新闻)。

1. 本刊欢迎下列类型的稿件:(1)研究性论文(Research Articles):国学、西学研究、及国学和西学比较的原创性学术论文。(2)书评(Book Reviews):对近来出版的相关学术专著的评介。(3)会议综述和报道(Conference Reports):对相关学术会议的深入报道。

2. 本刊全年公开征稿,凡与本刊内容相关的学术论文均欢迎各界人士投稿,但内容必须是首次(特例另加说明)发表的原创性学术研究成果。

3. 中英文文稿均被接受。以中文投稿的研究论文需附英文摘要和关键词;以英文投稿的稿件需附中文的摘要和关键词。原则上,论文含注释中文稿件为8000至12000字为宜,论文含注释英文稿件以不超过12000字为宜,书评及会议报道每篇一般以3000字为限,特殊情况另论。

4. 研究论文的撰写格式及顺序如下:

(1)首页:中英文题目、作者联系方式(中英文姓名、职务及职称、通讯地址、电话、电子邮件等联系方式)。

(2)中英文摘要(各以200—700字为宜)、关键词(以5个词为限)。

(3)正文含注释(正文及注释撰写请勿透露作者的相关信息,引用作者本人的文献时请不要使用第一人称,中文稿件的注释请遵照《国学与西学:国际学刊》的《注释体例及要求》撰写)。

5. 来稿请寄打印清晰的稿件两份,并以电子邮件或其他方式寄交原稿件的Word文档的电子版一份。

6. 本刊在收到寄交的论文后,本刊编辑委员会先进行匿名初审,初审后再请两位同领域的学者专家复审,复审者意见不同时将邀请第三位学者评审;并于稿件收到后三个月内回复作者。逾期未接到通知者,可自行处理稿件。本刊概不退稿,作者请自留底稿。稿件随收随审,一经审稿通过即寄发同意刊出函告知作者。经决定采用的文稿,须依本刊体例修改论文格式,编辑部有权对稿件酌情删改(不

愿者请投稿时说明),且需作者亲校最后文稿,修改过后始由本刊编辑委员会另行决定与何期刊出。

7. 著作人投稿本刊,经收录刊登后,同意授权本刊再授权其他本刊接受之资料库进行重制,通过网络提供服务,授权用户下载、打印等行为,并可酌情修改格式。

8. 本刊所刊登的文稿,作者文责自负,一切立论不代表本刊观点,版权则归本刊所有。

9. 稿件已经刊登,本刊将于出版后赠送该刊物两本作为酬谢,不另付稿酬。

10. 本刊的征稿、评审、编辑与发行等事宜,皆依照《国学与西学:国际学刊》的“刊行及编审办法”办理。

11. 来稿或意见,请寄:

《国学与西学:国际学刊》编辑部 收

Vellikellontie 3 A 4,00410 Helsinki, Finland.

电子文档请寄至:ijofsws@gmail.fi

Tel. + 358-40-836-0793

www.SinoWesternStudies.com

International Journal of Sino-Western Studies *Notes for Contributors*

1. International Journal of Sino-Western Studies(IJS)is published semi-annually every June and December by the Nordic Forum of Sino-Western Studies (members from Finland, Sweden, Norway, and Denmark) and sponsored by the University of Helsinki, Peking University, and Jilin University. It covers areas in Humanities, Theology, and Chinese guoxue (National Studies), Practical Theology and Sino-Western Views on Church and Society, Chinese and Western Classics and the Bible, History of the Church and State in the West and in China, Comparative Religious and Cultural Studies, Reviews and Reports on Academic Conferences.

2. The types of work we prefer to publish:

a. Research Articles: Original articles related to the topics mentioned above.

b. Book Reviews: Reviews on books or articles that are related to our themes.

c. Academic News: In-depth reports on conferences or other academic news related to our themes.

3. IJS welcomes the submission of texts throughout the year; it is required that the text is original and has not been previously published.

4. The text can be written in Chinese or in English. An English article should have a Chinese abstract, and vice versa. The length of a Chinese article should be between 8,000 and 12,000 Chinese characters, including footnotes. An English article should have no more than 12,000 words, including footnotes. A book review or a report on academic news is usually limited to 3,000 words. Exceptions will be decided separately.

5. Articles should follow the following format:

a. Both a Chinese and an English title, the author's occupation, position, and contact information; see the Article Submission Cover Page.

b. A 200–700-word abstract and the maximum of 5 keywords in English and Chinese should be included.

c. Full information on publications should be included in the footnotes.

Footnotes must follow the style stated in our Footnote Format and Requirements. For the purpose of an anonymous review, please refrain from revealing the author's identity in the article; when citing the author's own work, please refrain from using the first person pronoun.

6. Please submit two paper copies of the article by mail and one in an electronic form through email. The electronic file should take the Microsoft Word format.

7. Article submitted to IJS will be peer-reviewed first by the editorial committee, then by two scholars of a relevant field, and if necessary a third scholar will be invited to review. The author will receive the decision within three months after submitting the article. The editorial committee has the

right to ask for a revision of an article and will thereafter decide whether the article will be published.

8. The author shall agree to authorize IJS the right to the reproduction of the article either electronically or in print.

9. The author is solely responsible for the content of the article, and any viewpoint expressed therein does not necessarily reflect the opinion of IJS. After publication, IJS reserves the copyright of the article.

10. The author will receive two copies of the IJS in which the article is published, no fees or royalties are paid to the author.

Please send your article or suggestion to:

Editorial Committee
International Journal of Sino-Western Studies,
Vellikellontie 3 A 4, 00410 Helsinki, Finland
Email with attachment to: ijofsws@gmail.fi
Tel. + 358-40-836-0793
www.SinoWesternStudies.com

注释体例及要求

Footnote Format and Requirements

一、总则 General Principles

1、采用页下注(脚注),从文首至尾依次加注。

Use continuous footnotes from the start to the end of your article.

2、一般情况下,引用外文文献的注释仍从原文,无须另行译出。

Use original literature when the reference is in a language other than the article, a translation of the citation is not required.

3、文章正文后不另开列“参考文献”。

Independent bibliography is not required.

4、所引资料及其注释务求真实、准确、规范。

Please use authentic, accurate, and standard literature references.

5、非汉语语言以英文为例。

We use English as an example of all the non-Chinese languages.

二、分则 Detailed Rules

1、专著 Monograph:

黄保罗 Huang Baoluo,《汉语学术神学》Hanyu xueshu shenxue [Sino-Christian Academic Theology],(北京 Beijing:宗教文化出版社 Zongjiao wenhua chubanshe [Religion and Culture Press],2008),155-159。

Paulos Huang, *Confronting Confucian Understandings of the Christian Doctrine of Salvation: A Systematic Theological Analysis of the Basic Problems in the Confucian-Christian Dialogue*, (Leiden & Boston: Brill, 2009), 88-89.

2、编著 Compiled works:

罗明嘉 Luo Mingjia、黄保罗 Huang Baoluo 主编,《基督宗教与中国文化》Jiduzongjiao yu zhongguo wenhua [Christianity and Chinese Culture],(北京 Beijing:中国社会科学出版社 Zhongguo shehui kexue chubanshe [Chinese Social Sciences Press],2004),155。

Miikka Ruokanen & Paulos Huang, eds., *Christianity and Chinese Culture*, (Grand Rapids & Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2010), 3.

3、译著 Translated literature:

麦克·阿盖尔 Maiké Agaiér,《宗教心理学》Zongjiao xinlixue [Religious Psychology],陈彪 Chen Biao 译,(北京 Beijing:中国人民大学出版社 Zhongguo renmin daxue chubanshe [The Press of Renmin University of China]),2005,30。

Fung Yulan, *A History of Chinese Philosophy*, tr. by Derk Bodde, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1952), 150.

4、外文稿件引用中文资料 Chinese literature in non-Chinese articles:

Liang Qichao, *Gushu zhenwei jiqi niandai* [The Genuinity of Chinese Ancient Books and their Dates], (Shanghai:Shangwu yinshuguan [The Commercial Press],1923),20.

5、文集中的文章 Articles in collections:

张敏 Zhang Min,“基督徒身份认同——浙江温州案例”*Jidutu shenfen rentong——Zhejiang Wenzhou anli* [The Personal Identity of Christians],张静 Zhang Jing 主编:《身份认同研究:观念、态度、理据》*Shenfen rentong yanjiu:guannian,taidu,lijū* [A Study on Personal Identity],(上海 Shanghai:上海人民出版社 Shanghai renmin chubanshe [Shanghai People’s Publishing House],2006),101-105.

Zhuo Xinping,“Comprehensive Theology: An Attempt to Combine Christianity with Chinese Culture”, in Miikka Ruokanen & Paulos Huang, eds., *Christianity and Chinese Culture*, (Grand Rapids & Cambridge:Eerdmans,2010),185-192.

6、报纸中的文章 Articles in newspapers:

曹曙红 Cao Shuhong,《信仰之旅 慈善之行——上海玉佛寺禅寺觉群慈爱功德会参访团西藏行纪实》*Xinyang zhi lü, Cishan zhi xing——Shanghai Fochansi Juequn ciai gongdehui canfangtuan Xizang xing jishi* [The Trip of Faith and the Travel of Charity],《中国民族报》*Zhongguo minzubao* [The Newspaper of Chinese Ethnic Minorities] (2011年8月23日),第5版。

David E. Sanger,“U. S. and Seoul Try to Ease Rift on Talks with the North,” *New York Times*, (11 June,2005).

7、期刊中的文章 Articles in journals:

李焯昌 Li Chichang,“跨文本阅读策略:明末中国基督徒著作研究”*Kuawenben yuedu celue:Mingmo Zhongguo jidutu zhuzuo yanjiu* [The Strategy of Readings in Chinese Christian Writings],《基督教文化学刊》*Jidujiao wenhua xuekan* [Journal of Christian Culture],No. 10,(北京 Beijing:中国人民大学出版社 Zhongguo renmin daxue chubanshe [The Press of Renmin University of China],2003),168.

J. R. Carrette,“Religion and Mestrovic’s Postemotional Society: The Manufacturing of Religious Emotion,” *Religion*,vol. 34,(2004),271.

8、会议论文 Conference papers:

田海华 Tian Haihua,“汉语语境中的‘十诫’:以十九世纪基督新教的诠释为例”*Hanyu yujing zhong de ‘Shijie’: Yi shijiu shiji jiduxinjiao de quanshi wei li* [The Ten Commandments in the Chinese Context],“第四届‘基督教与中国社会文化’国际年青学者研讨会”*Disijie ‘Jidujiao yu Zhongguo shehui wenhua’ guoji qingnian xuezhe yantaohui* [The Fourth International Young Scholar Conference on Christianity and Chinese Social Culture],(香港 Xianggang,香港中文大学 Xianggang zhongwen daxue [Chinese University of Hong Kong],2008年12月5-9日),3。

John Barwick,“Liu Tingfang, Chinese Protestant Elites, and the Quest for Modernity in Repu Xinping Republican China”, presented in “The 4th International Young Scholars’ Symposium on ‘Christianity and Chinese Society and Culture’”, (Hong Kong: The Chinese University of Hong Kong,5-9 December,2008).

9、学位论文 Dissertations:

刘家峰 Liu Jiafeng,《中国基督教乡村建设运动研究(1907—1950)》Zhongguo jidujiao xiangcun jianshe yundong yanjiu [A Study on the Movement of Chinese Christian Countryside Construction], (武汉 Wuhan:华中师范大学博士论文 Huazhong shifan daxue boshi lunwen [Ph. D. dissertation in Central China Normal University],2001),55。

Nathan C. Faries, The Narratives of Contemporary Chinese Christianity, (The Pennsylvania State University, PhD dissertation,2005),22.

10、互联网资料 Internet source:

<http://www.leeds.ac.uk/polis/englishschool/wilson03.doc>,2005-03-27.

11、重复引用 Consecutively repeated citations:

同上书,第19页。

Ibid., pp. 73-75.

12、转引 Quotation from a secondary source:

新疆档案馆档案政 Xinjiang dang'anguan dang'an zheng 2-5-140 [Xinjiang Archives. Politics],转引自木拉提·黑尼亚提 Mulati Heiniyati:《喀什噶尔瑞典传教团建堂历史考》Kashigeer Ruidian chuanjiaotuan jiantang lishikao [A Study on the History of Church Establishment in Kashgar by Sweden Missionaries],《新疆社会科学》Xinjiang shehui kexue [Social Sciences in Xinjiang],(乌鲁木齐 Wulumuqi:2002年第3期),64-65。

Stanley A. Erickson,“Economic and Technological Trend Affecting Nuclear Nonproliferation”,The Nonproliferation Review,vol. 8, no. 2,2001, p. 43,quoted from Michael Wesley,“It's Time to Scrap the NPT”,Australian Journal of International Affairs,vol. 59,no. 3,(September 2005),292.

13、华人姓名写法 Writing of Chinese personal names:

如果华人拥有外文名字,则按西文方式名前姓后,如:Paulos Huang;若只有中文名字,则按中国方式姓前名后,如:Zhuo Xinping 等。If a Chinese person uses the Westernized first name,his name can be written in this way:Paulos Huang;but if he ONLY uses the Chinese name,it must be written in the Chinese way,for instance:Zhuo Xinping,etc.

14、其他 Others:

河北省地方志编纂委员会 Hebei sheng difangzhi bianzhuang weiyuanhui [The Editorial Committee of Hebei Provincial Chorography] 编:《河北省志·宗教志》Hebei sheng zhi. Zongjiaozhi [Hebei Provincial Chorography. Religions],(北京 Beijing:中国书籍出版社 Zhongguo shuji chubanshe [Chinese Books Publishing House],1995),224。

U. S. Agency for International Development, Foreign Aid in the National Interest, (Washington, D. C.,2002),1.

International Journal of Sino-Western Studies

国学与西学 国际学刊

Sanovan Press, Vellikellontie 3 A 4, 00410 Helsinki, Finland.

Email: ijofsws@gmail.com. www. SinoWesternStudies.com/

OrderForm 订购单 (From Issue No. _____ to No. _____, 由第 _____ 期至第 _____ 期)

(Please tick your choice 请勾选) (Tax and postage included 含税及邮费)

Printed Version 纸质版

Region 地区	Asia (euro € or RMB ¥) 亚洲 (欧元 € 或人民币 ¥)		Europe 欧洲		Other Area 其他地区	
	Surface 水陆	Airmail 航空	Surface 水陆	Airmail 航空	Surface 水陆	Airmail 航空
Price for individuals (per year/2 issues) 个人(每年2期)	35 € (350 ¥)	40 € (400 ¥)	50 €	60 €	40 €	50 €
Price for individuals (2 year/4 issues) 个人(两年四期)	60 € (600 ¥)	70 € (700 ¥)	90 €	100 €	90 €	100 €
Price for institutions (per year/2 issues) 团体/机构(每年2期)	80 ¥ (800 ¥)	90 € (900 ¥)	90 €	100 €	80 €	90 €
Price for institutions (2 year/4 issues) 团体/机构(两年四期)	150 € (1500 ¥)	170 € (1700 ¥)	150 €	170 €	110 €	130 €

PDF electronic version 电子版订购单

Please pay the fee (in US dollars) to the Account below. Then please fill in this form and the webmaster will send you the full texts soon.

One Paper: 1 US \$

Five Papers: 3 US \$

All Papers of One Issue: 8 US \$

Method of Payment 付款方法

网上付款 [www. SinoWesternStudies.com/](http://www.SinoWesternStudies.com/) 全文购买 full-texts/

人民币账户: 中国建设银行长春市分行吉新支行 6227 0009 4256 0079 382 (账户名: Huang Paulos Zhan Zhu). International payment outside China: Bank Account: Nordea Bank, Helsinki, Finland, Account number FI44 1378 5000 1315 41. Paulos Huang, Sanovan Press Company.

Please send my journal to 期刊请寄至

Name 姓名 _____

Tel. 电话 _____ Fax. 传真 _____

Email 电子邮件: _____

Address 地址: _____